

**REPORT OF THE
PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
ON
THE REPORTS OF THE DIRECTOR OF AUDIT
ON
THE ACCOUNTS OF THE GOVERNMENT OF
THE HONG KONG SPECIAL ADMINISTRATIVE REGION
FOR THE YEAR ENDED
31 MARCH 2008
AND THE RESULTS OF
VALUE FOR MONEY AUDITS (Report No. 51)**

February 2009

P.A.C. Report No. 51

CONTENTS

		<u>Paragraph</u>	<u>Page</u>
Part 1	Introduction		
	The Establishment of the Committee	1	1
	Membership of the Committee	2	1
Part 2	Procedure		
	The Committee's Procedure	1	2
	Confidentiality undertaking by members of the Committee	2 - 3	3
	The Committee's Report	4 - 5	3
	The Government's Response	6	3
Part 3	Report of the Public Accounts Committee on Report No. 48 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits and Supplemental Report of the Public Accounts Committee on Report No. 47 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits [P.A.C. Report No. 48]		
	Laying of the Report	1	4
	The Government Minute	2 - 7	4 - 9
Part 4	Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2007 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 49) [P.A.C. Report No. 49]		
	Laying of the Report	1	10
	The Government Minute	2 - 46	10 - 26

CONTENTS

	<u>Paragraph</u>	<u>Page</u>
Part 5	Supplemental Report of the Public Accounts Committee on Report No. 49 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits [P.A.C. Report No. 49A]	
	Laying of the Report	1 27
	The Government Minute	2 - 4 27 - 29
Part 6	Committee Proceedings	
	Consideration of the Director of Audit's Report	1 30
	Meetings	2 30
	Arrangement of the Report	3 - 4 30
	Acknowledgements	5 30
Part 7	Observations of the Public Accounts Committee on the Report of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2008	1 31
Part 8	Chapter	
	1. Administration of the DesignSmart Initiative	
	A. Introduction	1 32
	B. Corporate governance and administration of the Hong Kong Design Centre	2 - 25 32 - 39
	C. Management of projects funded by the Design Support Programme	26 - 48 40 - 48
	D. Promotion of design by the Hong Kong Design Centre	49 - 55 49 - 51
	E. Administration of the Design Incubation Programme	56 - 61 51 - 53

CONTENTS

	<u>Paragraph</u>	<u>Page</u>
F. Overseas practices in the promotion of design	62 - 65	53 - 54
G. Conclusions and recommendations	66	54 - 63
2. Emergency ambulance service	1 - 2	64
3. Management of public markets		
A. Introduction	1 - 2	65 - 66
B. Usage of public markets	3 - 27	66 - 76
C. Market stall rentals and charges	28 - 38	76 - 79
D. Problem of stall subletting	39 - 50	80 - 85
E. Management of a public market in Kowloon	51 - 58	86 - 89
F. Planning of new public markets	59 - 67	90 - 94
G. Conclusions and recommendations	68	94 - 102
4. Reduction and recovery of municipal solid waste		
A. Introduction	1 - 2	103
B. Strategic management of municipal solid waste	3 - 13	105 - 109
C. Progress of municipal solid waste recovery	14 - 27	109 - 116
D. Implementation of domestic waste-recovery programmes	28 - 34	116 - 118
E. Implementation of non-domestic waste-recovery programmes	35 - 41	118 - 121
F. Conclusions and recommendations	42	121 - 126

CONTENTS

Page

SIGNATURES OF THE CHAIRMAN, DEPUTY CHAIRMAN AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE

127

CHAPTERS IN THE DIRECTOR OF AUDIT'S REPORT NO. 51 DEALT WITH IN THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE'S REPORT

128

Appendix relating to Part 1: "Introduction"

APPENDIX 1 Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region

129 - 130

Appendix relating to Part 2: "Procedure"

APPENDIX 2 Paper presented to the Provisional Legislative Council by the Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee at the meeting on 11 February 1998 on Scope of Government Audit in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region - 'Value for Money Audits'

131 - 133

Appendices relating to Part 3: "Report of the Public Accounts Committee on Report No. 48 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits and Supplemental Report of the Public Accounts Committee on Report No. 47 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits
[P.A.C. Report No. 48]"

APPENDIX 3 Progress update and indicative timetable for relocation of the Yau Ma Tei Fruit Market provided by the Food and Health Bureau in January 2008

134 - 135

APPENDIX 4 Letter of 7 January 2009 from the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation

136 - 137

APPENDIX 5 Letter of 29 January 2009 from the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation

138 - 142

CONTENTS

Page

Appendices relating to Part 4: "Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2007 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 49) [P.A.C. Report No. 49]"

APPENDIX 6	Letter of 23 January 2009 from the Secretary for Security	143 - 144
APPENDIX 7	Letter of 29 January 2009 from the Secretary for Development	145 - 146
APPENDIX 8	Letter of 22 January 2009 from the Director of Lands	147 - 148
APPENDIX 9	Letter of 30 January 2009 from the Secretary for Education	149 - 150
APPENDIX 10	Action plan of the English Schools Foundation as at September 2008	151 - 152

Appendices relating to Part 5: "Supplemental Report of the Public Accounts Committee on Report No. 49 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits [P.A.C. Report No. 49A]"

APPENDIX 11	Further progress made by the Hong Kong Tourism Board on matters outstanding in the Government Minute laid before the Legislative Council in July 2008	153 - 157
APPENDIX 12	Further developments and progress made by the Administration as reported in the Government Minute laid before the Legislative Council in July 2008	158 - 160
APPENDIX 13	Letter of 17 July 2008 from the Chief Secretary for Administration	161 - 167
APPENDIX 14	General Circular No. 8/2008 on "Governance of Government-owned or Funded Statutory Bodies"	168 - 176

CONTENTS

Page

Appendices relating to Part 6: "Committee Proceedings"

APPENDIX 15	Witnesses who appeared before the Committee	177 - 178
APPENDIX 16	Introductory remarks by the Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS, at the first public hearing of the Committee on Tuesday, 9 December 2008	179 - 180

Appendices relating to Chapter 1 of Part 8: "Administration of the DesignSmart Initiative"

APPENDIX 17	Letter of 9 January 2009 from the Chief Executive Officer, Hong Kong Design Centre	181 - 184
APPENDIX 18	Letter of 30 December 2008 from the Secretary for Home Affairs	185
APPENDIX 19	Letter of 7 January 2009 from the Commissioner for Innovation and Technology	186 - 188
APPENDIX 20	Letter of 22 January 2009 from the Commissioner for Innovation and Technology	189 - 190
APPENDIX 21	Letter of 2 January 2009 from the Director of Audit	191 - 192

Appendices relating to Chapter 3 of Part 8: "Management of public markets"

APPENDIX 22	Opening statement made by the Secretary for Food and Health at the public hearing on 9 December 2008	193 - 194
APPENDIX 23	Letter of 11 December 2008 from the Secretary for Food and Health	195 - 201
APPENDIX 24	Letter of 15 December 2008 from the Secretary for Food and Health	202 - 214
APPENDIX 25	Letter of 12 January 2009 from the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene	215 - 217

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
APPENDIX 26 Letter of 24 December 2008 from the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene	218 - 220
APPENDIX 27 Letter of 16 December 2008 from the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene	221 - 243
 <u>Appendices relating to Chapter 4 of Part 8: "Reduction and recovery of municipal solid waste"</u>	
APPENDIX 28 Opening statement made by the Secretary for the Environment at the public hearing on 16 December 2008	244 - 250
APPENDIX 29 Letter of 7 January 2009 from the Secretary for the Environment	251 - 252
APPENDIX 30 Letter of 6 January 2009 from the Assistant Director (Environmental Infrastructure), Environmental Protection Department	253 - 255
APPENDIX 31 Letter of 31 December 2008 from the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene	256 - 257
 ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	 258 - 261