

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(1) 732/08-09  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/3/08/1

**Panel on Environmental Affairs**

**Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality**

**Minutes of meeting**  
**held on Tuesday, 13 January 2009, at 8:30 am**  
**in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

**Members present** : Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP (Chairman)  
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP  
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

**Member absent** : Hon CHAN Hak-kan

**Public officers attending** : **For item II**

Dr Kitty POON  
Under Secretary for the Environment

Mr Carlson K S CHAN  
Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (3)

Mr W C MOK  
Acting Assistant Director (Air Policy)  
Environmental Protection Department

Miss Mary TSANG  
Assistant Director (Cross-Boundary & International),  
Environmental Protection Department

Miss Katharine CHOI  
Principal Assistant Secretary for the Environment  
(Energy)

Mr S W PANG  
Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Air Policy)  
Environmental Protection Department

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Becky YU  
Chief Council Secretary (1)1

**Staff in attendance** : Mrs Mary TANG  
Senior Council Secretary (1)2

---

**I. Confirmation of minutes**

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 448/08-09 — Minutes of the meeting held on  
10 December 2008)

The minutes of the meeting held on 10 December 2008 were confirmed.

**II. Work plan for the 2008-2009 session**

(LC Paper No. CB(1) 531/08-09(01) — Administration's paper on progress  
of measures under Pearl River  
Delta Regional Air Quality  
Management Plan to achieve 2010  
emission reduction targets

LC Paper No. CB(1) 531/08-09(02) — Administration's paper on  
Government efforts in addressing  
climate change

LC Paper No. CB(1) 531/08-09(03) — Administration's paper on progress  
of the review of Hong Kong's Air  
Quality Objectives

LC Paper No. CB(1) 531/08-09(04) — Paper on greenhouse gas emissions  
and their effects on global  
warming prepared by the  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
(updated background brief)

LC Paper No. CB(1) 547/08-09(01) — Paper on Pearl River Delta  
Regional Air Quality Management  
Plan prepared by the Legislative  
Council Secretariat (background  
brief)

LC Paper No. CB(1) 547/08-09(02) — Paper on review of Air Quality  
Objectives prepared by the  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
(background brief))

2. The Committee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).
3. The Administration was requested to -

Progress of measures under the Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to achieve the 2010 emission reduction targets

- (a) use a graph to show the progress of emission reduction of the four major air pollutants viz. sulphur dioxide, nitrogen oxides, respirable suspended particulates and volatile organic compounds in Hong Kong during the period between 1997 and 2007;
- (b) update Annex A by including the completion dates for the enhanced control measures, and the environmental/health benefits to be attained;
- (c) provide separate papers on the progress of measures to control emissions from the following sources, new initiatives/alternatives proposed by members or the affected trades which had been taken on board or rejected by the Administration, completion dates for these measures/initiatives/alternatives, and environmental/health benefits to be attained -
  - (i) Motor vehicles;
  - (ii) Ferries; and
  - (iii) Power plants.
- (d) provide a paper setting out the Administration's studies on the implementation of low emission zones, rationalization of bus routes, and bus-bus interchange schemes. To also include in the paper the proposed implementation time-tables and environmental/health benefits to be achieved.

Government efforts in addressing climate change

- (e) illustrate with an example on how energy-efficient installations could reduce electricity consumption of a building, the cost and savings to be achieved. This would help facilitate public understanding on how carbon auditing worked;
- (f) provide supplementary information on the types of greenhouse gases in Hong Kong, their emission levels and how these compared with the rest of the world;
- (g) advise whether interim targets would be set for achieving the Declaration on Climate Change, Energy Security and Clean Development announced by the Asia-Pacific Economic Co-operation of reducing energy intensity of at least 25% by 2030 (with 2005 as the base year).

4. On the progress of review of Hong Kong's Air Quality Objectives (AQOs), members noted that the Administration had commissioned a consultancy study in June 2007 to review the current AQOs taking into account the World Health Organization Air Quality Guidelines and the practice of overseas countries, and that an Advisory Panel comprising members from various sectors had been formed to steer

the review. Given that the consultants had held two public forums earlier and would hold another one before end February 2009 to solicit views from stakeholders, members considered it necessary for the consultants to brief the Subcommittee before holding the last public forum. It was also agreed that the Advisory Panel, academics and interested parties should be invited to exchange views on AQOs and their associated health implications.

### **III. Any other business**

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:40 am.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
5 February 2009

## Panel on Environmental Affairs

## Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality

**Proceedings of the meeting  
on Tuesday, 13 January 2009, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Confirmation of minutes</i>			
000001 - 000200	Chairman	The minutes of the meeting held on 10 December 2008 were confirmed.	
000201 - 000233	Chairman	Members noted the late submission of the paper on "Progress of measures under Pearl River Delta (PRD) Regional Air Quality Management Plan to achieve 2010 emission reduction targets", and agreed to include this in the discussion of the work plan for the Subcommittee	
<i>Agenda Item II – Work plan for the 2008-2009 session</i>			
000234 - 000645	Administration	Briefing on the progress of measures under the Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Management Plan to achieve 2010 emission reduction targets	
000646 - 001331	Mr LEE Wing-tat Chairman Administration	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat's concerns about the efficacy of emission reduction measures adopted by the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Government (HKSARG) and the Guangdong Provincial Government (GPG) in achieving the 2010 emission reduction targets as revealed in the mid-term review in 2004, and the high level of sulphur dioxide (SO<sub>2</sub>) emissions. He requested -</p> <p>(a) further efforts from the power companies in reducing emissions; and</p> <p>(b) more transparency from GPG in providing emission data, preferably on an annual basis</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) the regional air quality index was made available to the public on a daily basis through the Government website;</p> <p>(b) the emission inventory for 2003 was the first</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>ever emission data published by GPG in response to the mid-term review. It might not be possible for GPG to provide frequent updates in view of the complexities and resource implications of compiling the emission inventory for the PRD Economic Zone. Nevertheless, members' request would be relayed to GPG; and</p> <p>(c) GPG had been adopting additional control measures targeting at major emission sources in an attempt to achieve the emission reduction targets by 2010</p>	
001332 - 002400	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration Chairman	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's views -</p> <p>(a) need to maintain dialogue with GPG authorities on air quality control; and</p> <p>(b) need to apprise the public of the implementation timetable for the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) signed between HKSAR and National Energy Administration on the long-term and stable supply of liquefied natural gas (LNG) for use in power generation as well as the cost implications on the increased use of LNG</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) there was mutual cooperation on air quality control and progress made in taking forward the Regional Air Quality Monitoring was being monitored under the Hong Kong/Guangdong Joint Working Group on Sustainable Development and Environmental Protection;</p> <p>(b) it would look into the possibility of raising the share of natural gas for power generation from 28% to 50% following the signing MoU in August 2008;</p> <p>(c) there was a need to consult the public before mapping out the energy policy and strategy because the proposed increase in the use of natural gas for power generation would have major tariff and cost implications; and</p> <p>(d) it was not possible at this stage to provide an estimate on the cost arising from an increase</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>in the use of natural gas for power generation given the fluctuations in fuel prices</p>	
002401 - 002700	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration Chairman	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's concerns about the endless consultation without concrete timetables for introduction of various measures to improve air quality to protect public health</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) supporting infrastructure was required to implement measures to improve air quality, such as the provision of an LNG terminal on a neighbouring Mainland site; and</p> <p>(b) public consultation on the package of measures to improve air quality was essential with a view to reaching a consensus</p>	
002701 - 003737	Mr Jeffrey LAM Administration	<p>Mr Jeffrey LAM's enquiries -</p> <p>(a) whether there was close liaison with the Mainland authorities in achieving the 2010 emission reduction targets;</p> <p>(b) whether assistance would be given to those Hong Kong enterprises/industries intending to move their operations back to Hong Kong as a result of the tightening of environmental legislation in the Mainland and the economic downturn; and</p> <p>(c) whether the Administration had assessed the cost impact of requiring ferry operators to use cleaner fuels</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) joints efforts were made by both sides to meet the 2010 emission reduction targets and to assist Hong Kong owned factories to adopt cleaner production;</p> <p>(b) the increased number of days with clear sky could be attributable to a number of factors, including meteorological conditions, emission control measures being introduced by both sides, etc.; and</p> <p>(c) an inter-departmental working group had</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>been set up to study the switch to the use of ultra low sulphur diesel (ULSD) by ferries in Hong Kong</p>	
003738 - 005335	Ms Miriam LAU Chairman Administration	<p>Ms Miriam LAU's concerns -</p> <p>(a) there might not be a need to consult the public on each and every issue, particularly when the outcome was obvious;</p> <p>(b) it might not be cost-effective to promote the biodiesel market if the percentage of biodiesel to be blended with diesel was only 5%, contrary to the practice in overseas countries where a much higher percentage of biodiesel was blended. More research studies on the improvements to biodiesel should be carried out with reference to overseas experience;</p> <p>(c) environmental initiatives should be practicable. The proposed switch to the use of ULSD by ferry was impractical because ferry operators were experiencing financial difficulties under the present state of economy. A policy on the use of ULSD by ferries should be worked out in consultation with the Transport Branch of the Transport and Housing Bureau. The same also applied to the \$3.2 billion one-off grant to encourage car owners to replace their pre-Euro and Euro I diesel commercial vehicles with Euro IV models. The scheme was not well received because many vehicles owners in the trades were facing difficulties in continuing their operations, let alone replacing their vehicles. Consideration should be given to using the remainder of the \$3.2 billion to fund other more practical schemes to improve the environmental performance of vehicles</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) public consultation would be carried out on a need basis;</p> <p>(b) suppliers would have to be consulted on the specifications for biodiesel before introducing the enabling legislation;</p> <p>(c) an inter-departmental working group had</p>	



Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>been set up to conduct a trial on ferries using ULSD. Subject to the findings, a scheme would be drawn up to encourage ferry operators to switch to the use of ULSD; and</p> <p>(d) it was hoped that vehicles owners would make use of the one-off grant scheme to replace their polluting vehicles before the expiry of the extended period of the scheme</p>	
005336 - 005525	Mr CHAN Kin-por	<p>Mr CHAN Kin-por's views-</p> <p>(a) further extension of the one-off grant scheme was not advisable as those who could not afford to replace their vehicles would not do so even after the scheme had been extended; and</p> <p>(b) the Government should be more creative in its thinking and using public funding to keep the polluting vehicles off the roads, e.g., through buying back of the vehicle licences</p>	
005526 - 005929	Chairman Administration	<p>Chairman's request for -</p> <p>(a) a graph to show the progress of emission reduction of the four major air pollutants in Hong Kong during the period between 1997 and 2007; and</p> <p>(b) explanation on the basis upon which the Administration had confidence that it would be able to meet the emission reduction targets by 2010</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) it was confident that Hong Kong would be able to meet the 2010 emission reduction targets in view of the good progress made in reducing the three major pollutants. Emission of SO<sub>2</sub> from power generation was expected to be significantly reduced following the commissioning of desulphurization facilities; and</p> <p>(b) the use of ULSD by the industries would reduce SO<sub>2</sub> emissions by 3.5% while the use of Euro V diesel would also reduce SO<sub>2</sub> emissions by a significant extent</p>	<p>The Administration to use a graph to show the progress of emission reduction of the four major air pollutants during the period between 1997 and 2007</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
005930 - 011353	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration Chairman	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's views -</p> <p>(a) judging from the lukewarm response to the one-off grant scheme and the reduction in First Registration Tax for environment-friendly commercial vehicles, there might be a need for more creative measures to reduce roadside pollution;</p> <p>(b) efforts should be made to encourage the use of mass transport. Public consultation on the feasibility of imposing restrictions on vehicles entering busy districts during peak hours should be carried out; and</p> <p>(c) district councils should be further consulted on the proposal to rationalize bus routes</p> <p>The Administration explained that a number of measures to reduce roadside pollution, including the ban on idling vehicles with running engines, introduction of "low emission zone", rationalization of bus routes, and tightening of emission standards, etc were being considered</p>	<p>The Administration to provide a paper setting out its studies on the implementation of low emission zones, rationalization of bus routes, and bus-bus interchange schemes. To also include in the paper the proposed implementation time-tables and environmental /health benefits to be achieved</p>
011354 - 011831	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration Chairman	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's request for separate papers on the progress of measures to control emissions from the following sources, new initiatives/alternatives proposed by members or the affected trades which had been taken on board or rejected by the Administration, completion dates for these measures/initiatives/alternatives, and environmental/health benefits to be attained -</p> <p>(j) Motor vehicles; (ii) Ferries; and (iii) Power plants</p>	<p>The Administration to provide the information papers as requested</p>
011832 - 011954	Mr LEE Wing-tat	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat's reiteration on his concerns about the slow progress of measures to improve air quality</p>	
011955 - 012407	Ms Miriam LAU Mr LEE Wing-tat Chairman	<p>Ms Miriam LAU's views -</p> <p>(a) need to ascertain the practicality of measures, such as the switch to ULSD by ferries, and provide the necessary supporting facilities before implementation of these measures;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) need to encourage the use of mass transport and to promote "park and ride"; and</p> <p>(c) Members should set a good example by switching to mass transport rather than driving their own cars to work</p>	
012408 - 012628	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	<p>Ms Cyd HO's request for information on the environmental/health benefits to be attained through the implementation of various enhanced control measures to improve air quality</p> <p>Chairman's request for information on the amount of emissions reduced as a result of the implementation of the enhanced control measures</p>	The Administration to update Annex A by including the completion dates for the enhanced control measures, and the environmental /health benefits to be attained
012629 - 013033	Chairman Administration	Administration's briefing on Government's efforts in addressing climate change	
013034 - 013405	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	<p>Ms Cyd HO's request for -</p> <p>(a) information on the progress of the Clinton Global Climate Initiative (of which HKSARG was a signatory) in respect of climate change, such as provision of loans for installation of energy-efficient installations by building owners, the cost of which could be recouped from savings in energy consumption; and</p> <p>(b) information on the progress of measures to improve energy efficiency in public and private buildings in Hong Kong</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) it had been liaising with the City Director of the Clinton Global Initiative (CGI) in Hong Kong on taking forward relevant CGI initiatives;</p> <p>(b) the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department had been conducting energy audits for Government buildings; and</p> <p>(c) owners of private building would be able to apply for funding from the Environment and Conservation Fund (ECF) for implementing energy-efficient measures and conducting carbon audits</p>	The Administration to provide information paper on the progress of measures to improve energy efficiency in public and private buildings in Hong Kong

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
013406 - 013920	Mr KAM Nai-wai Chairman Administration	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's concerns -</p> <p>(a) whether issues, such as energy wastage of external lighting and building energy efficiency, which were not directly related to air quality should be followed up by the Subcommittee; and</p> <p>(b) efforts should be made to promote carbon audits in private buildings</p> <p>Administration responded that consideration would be given to briefing district councils and building owners on how energy-efficient installations and carbon audits could help achieve energy savings. Building owners would also be encouraged to engage relevant professionals to conduct carbon audits. A funding scheme would be established under ECF to subsidize building owners to conduct energy-cum-carbon audits</p>	
013921 - 014403	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's views that consultancy studies on certain new initiatives like regulation of external lighting and phasing out of incandescent light bulbs might not be necessary as reference could be drawn from overseas experience</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) studies on light pollution was considered necessary in view of the different perception on what constituted excessive lighting, and different means to tackle the problem; and</p> <p>(b) studies on phasing out of incandescent light bulbs was also required as alternatives would need to be identified before a phasing-out programme could be worked out</p>	
014404 - 014619	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	<p>Ms Cyd HO's views -</p> <p>(a) to facilitate public understanding on how carbon auditing worked, the Administration should illustrate with an example on how energy-efficient installations could reduce electricity consumption of a building and the cost and savings to be achieved; and</p>	<p>The Administration to illustrate with an example on how energy-efficient installations could reduce electricity consumption of a building, the cost and savings to be</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) a work plan on promoting carbon auditing in private buildings should be drawn up	achieved.
014620 - 014921	Ms Miriam LAU Administration	<p>Ms Miriam LAU's enquiries -</p> <p>(a) whether climate change was only measured in terms of reduction in energy intensity; and</p> <p>(b) whether interim targets should be set for the measures to control climate change</p> <p>Administration explained that it had embarked on a 18-month consultancy study on climate change in 2008 to assess its impact on Hong Kong, and to recommend suitable strategy to enhance adaptation and mitigation measures</p>	<p>The Administration to advise whether interim targets would be set for achieving the Declaration on Climate Change, Energy Security and Clean Development announced by the Asia-Pacific Economic Co-operation of reducing energy intensity of at least 25% by 2030 (with 2005 as the base year)</p>
014922 - 015124	Chairman Administration	Chairman's request for information on the types of greenhouse gases in Hong Kong, their emission levels and how these compared with the rest of the world.	<p>The Administration to provide supplementary information explaining the types of greenhouse gases in Hong Kong, their emission levels and how these compared with the rest of the world</p>
015125 - 015550	Chairman Ms Cyd HO Mr KAM Nai-wai	<p>Discussion on the work plan for the Subcommittee</p> <p>Chairman's suggestion that the air quality and its impact on health should be included for discussion</p> <p>Ms Cyd HO's suggestion that academics be invited to share their views on air quality and its impact on health, and how such impact could be quantified</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015551 - 020908	Chairman Administration Ms Cyd HO Mr KAM Nai-wai	<p>Discussion on the progress of review of Hong Kong's Air Quality Objectives (AQOs)</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) it had commissioned a consultancy study in June 2007 to review the current AQOs taking into account World Health Organization Air Quality Guidelines and the practice of overseas countries;</p> <p>(b) an Advisory Panel comprising members from various sectors had been formed to steer the review;</p> <p>(c) the consultants had organized two public forums in December 2007 and January 2008 to solicit views from stakeholders;</p> <p>(d) a third public forum would be held in February/March 2009 and the initial recommendations would be submitted to the Government for consideration; and</p> <p>(e) an extensive public consultation on the final recommendations of the review of the new AQOs would be held in mid-2009</p> <p>Ms Cyd HO's view that the Subcommittee should be able to discuss the preliminary findings and recommendations on AQOs with the consultants and stakeholders</p> <p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's opinion that a Subcommittee meeting should be convened as soon as practicable to allow for an exchange of views with consultants and stakeholders before the third public forum</p> <p>It was agreed that a Subcommittee meeting be convened in February 2009 to meet with the Advisory Panel, consultants, and academics as well as other stakeholders to exchange views on AQOs and its impact on health</p> <p>The Administration noted the request and stated that a meeting with consultants in February 2009 would be difficult since the report would only be ready after the final public forum. However, the Administration was prepared to report to the Subcommittee or the Panel as soon as the consultant completed its report.</p>	