

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1859/08-09
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/3/08/1

Panel on Environmental Affairs

Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality

Minutes of meeting
held on Thursday, 16 April 2009, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

- Members present** : Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP
- Member absent** : Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
- Public officers attending** : Dr Kitty POON
Under Secretary for the Environment
- Mr Carlson K S CHAN
Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (3)
- Mr MOK Wai-chuen
Acting Assistant Director (Air Policy)
Environmental Protection Department
- Mr PANG Sik-wing
Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Air Policy)
Environmental Protection Department
- Clerk in attendance** : Miss Becky YU
Chief Council Secretary (1)1

Staff in attendance : Mrs Mary TANG
Senior Council Secretary (1)2

I. Meeting with the Administration

- (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1257/08-09(01) — List of follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 19 March 2009
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 1257/08-09(02) — List of questions raised by Hon KAM Nai-wai (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 1257/08-09(03) — Administration's response to CB(1) 1257/08-09(01) and (02))

The minutes of the meeting held on 12 February 2009 were confirmed.

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).
3. The Administration was requested to -

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1057/08-09(01)

- (a) include in the "Baseline emissions in 2006" in Appendix II to Annex B the percentage of total emission reduced as a result of the full implementation of the Phase I control measures;
- (b) consider ploughing back the medical savings as a result of improved air quality to cover the anticipated increase in electricity tariff and bus fare arising from the increased use of natural gas for power generation and replacement of franchised buses respectively, such that these increases would not be passed onto consumers;
- (c) consider imposing penalty on service providers who insisted to use more polluting production methods despite the availability of cleaner options;
- (d) advise the implementation plan for the first two Phase I control measures, and whether incentives would be offered to encourage participation of the service providers and the public;

LC Paper No. CB(1) 1257/08-09(03)

- (e) advise the distribution of exceedances in Attachment 1 over a year and the effect of meteorological factors in this respect;
- (f) advise whether Attachment 1 had been worked out using air pollution indices from general monitoring stations and if so, this might not be able to truly reflect the impacts of air pollution on people who had to work

long hours at road side;

- (g) compare Attachment 2 with a city similar to Hong Kong;

Others

- (h) provide a written response to the joint submission from four academics from the Department of Community Medicine, HKU regarding the Consultant's preliminary findings of the Air Quality Objectives Review. To also arrange a meeting with the academics concerned with a view to narrowing any discrepancies;
- (i) optimize the benefit of the one-off grant of \$3.2 billion for early replacement of pre-Euro and Euro I diesel commercial vehicles, consideration should be given to extending the scheme to franchised buses and other types of vehicles, including motorcycles; and
- (j) advise the emission performance of the latest model of diesel private car and petrol car.

4. Members agreed to discuss the cost and benefits of controlling emissions involving replacement of vessels and franchised buses at the next meeting scheduled for 14 May 2009. The Administration was requested to provide information on the types of vehicles in the existing franchised bus fleets, their routings and replacement plans to facilitate discussion.

II. Any other business

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:25 am.

Panel on Environmental Affairs

Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality

Proceedings of the meeting
on Thursday, 16 April 2009, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I - Meeting with the Administration</i>			
000001 - 000305	Chairman	Introductory remarks	
000306 - 001510	Administration Chairman	Administration's explanation on its response to the follow-up actions arising from the meeting on 19 March 2009 (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1257/08-09(03)) Chairman's reference to the joint submission from four academics of the Department of Community Medicine, Hong Kong University (joint submission) (LC Paper No. CB(1) 1314/08-09(01))	
001511 - 002309	Mr CHAN Kin-por Administration Chairman	Discussion on the cost-benefit analysis of Phase 1 measures Mr CHAN Kin-por's enquiries - (a) whether the two Phase I measures with the highest cost-benefit ratings, viz. early retirement of polluting vehicles and use of ultra low sulphur diesel (ULSD) for local vessels, could be taken forward earlier; and (b) whether consideration could be given to mandating the early retirement of polluting vehicles through, say buying out these vehicles using the one-off grant for the early replacement of pre-Euro and Euro I diesel commercial vehicles which had a very low take-up rate Administration's explanation - (a) the cost-benefit analysis was	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>meant to facilitate prioritization in implementing mitigation measures. Before deciding on how best to bring the updating of AQOs forward, the Administration would conduct a three-month public consultation;</p> <p>(b) preparation was being made to launch a trial of local ferries using ULSD; and</p> <p>(c) it was not considered appropriate to use public funds to buy out the polluting vehicles from owners, particularly if they did not intend to continue with their business</p>	
002310 - 003632	Mr Jeffrey LAM Administration Chairman	<p>Mr Jeffrey LAM's views/concerns -</p> <p>(a) information on the progress of cooperation with the Pearl River Delta (PRD) Region on measures to improve air quality should be provided;</p> <p>(b) the air quality had not been much improved despite local and across-boundary efforts made in reducing vehicular and industrial emissions in view of the number of exceedances;</p> <p>(c) need to identify the periods in a year which had exceptionally high exceedances to facilitate analysis;</p> <p>(d) the cost-benefit analysis was not comprehensive as it had not taken into account the cost incurred by private undertakings; and</p> <p>(e) comparisons on the health impacts of pollutants should be made with other cities similar to Hong Kong</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) the expected number of exceedances if World Health Organization (WHO)'s Air Quality Guidelines were adopted, and the</p>	<p>The Administration to advise the distribution of exceedances in Attachment 1 to LC Paper No. CB(1) 1057/08-09(01) over a year and the effect of meteorological factors in this respect; and compare Attachment 2 with a city similar to Hong Kong</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>air quality results at the Tap Mun Air Quality Monitoring Station as set out in Attachment 5 to the paper had revealed that the local air quality was under the heavy influence of external emission sources;</p> <p>(b) the primary purpose of the cost-benefit analysis was to provide a systematic framework for assessing in very broad terms the relative cost-effectiveness of different proposed control measures. It had focused on the economic cost of the proposals to the community as a whole and as these proposals were at conceptual stage, the estimates on costs and benefits were subject to uncertainties and variations depending on the timing, implementation details, the market situations and the community's responses, etc.; and</p> <p>(c) it was confident that Hong Kong could achieve the 2010 emission reduction targets; and</p> <p>(d) both sides were now working on the post-2010 emission reduction targets</p>	
003633 - 004914	Ms Miriam LAU Administration	<p>Ms Miriam LAU's suggestions -</p> <p>(a) consideration should be given to using the \$3.2 billion one-off grant to subsidize owners of more polluting motorcycles to replace their vehicles, and to buy out the more polluting diesel commercial vehicles with a view to reducing the number of such vehicles on the roads;</p> <p>(b) incentives should be provided to encourage early replacement of franchised buses, the service life of which was 17 years;</p> <p>(c) the criteria for prioritizing Phase I</p>	<p>The Administration to -</p> <p>(a) include in the "Baseline emissions in 2006" in Appendix II to Annex B of LC Paper No. CB(1) 1057/08-09(01) the percentage of total emission reduced as a result of the full implementation of the Phase I control measures; and</p> <p>(b) optimize the benefit of the one-off grant of \$3.2 billion for early replacement of pre-Euro</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>measures should be based on emission reduction potential rather than cost-effectiveness; and</p> <p>(d) information on the percentage of total emission reduced as a result of full implementation of Phase I control measures</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) due to the relatively small amount of emissions from motorcycles, the \$3.2 billion one-off grant scheme had not included old motor cycles. To reduce their emissions, the Administration had been tightening the emission standards for newly registered motorcycles and had been monitoring the development on the emission control on in-use motorcycles;</p> <p>(b) early replacement of franchised buses was part of the package of improvement measures proposed by the AQO Review Consultant to improve air quality;</p> <p>(c) prioritization of control measures would not be easy given the need to take into account various factors such as emission reduction potential, cost-effectiveness, technical feasibility, impact on trades and public acceptance etc; and</p> <p>(d) the effectiveness of emission control measures in improving air quality would vary with the location and weather conditions</p>	<p>and Euro I diesel commercial vehicles, consideration should be given to extending the scheme to franchised buses and other types of vehicles, including motorcycles.</p>
004915 - 010407	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration Chairman	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat's views -</p> <p>(a) the Administration should respond to the joint submission from HKU, particularly to the adverse comments on the Environmental Protection Department (EPD)'s paper under LC Paper No.</p>	<p>The Administration to -</p> <p>(a) provide a written response to the joint submission from four academics from the Department of Community Medicine,</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>CB(1) 1257/08-09(03);</p> <p>(b) the data used by consultants were based on air pollution indices from general monitoring stations rather than roadside stations, the latter of which could more accurately reflect the actual impact of pollution on the commuting public and those working at the roadside</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) it would need time to respond the joint submission which was just received. At a glance, the allegation made by the four academics about inflation of exceedances of sulphur dioxide in Tap Mun was unfounded since the exceedances were compiled based on actual air quality monitored data. The alleged exceedances of the daily limit of PM10 contradicted the air quality monitored data of 2008, which showed no exceedances;</p> <p>(b) it was prepared to meet with the academics concerned to exchange views on air quality objectives (AQOs); and</p> <p>(c) in promulgating the air quality guidelines, WHO accepted the need for individual governments to set national standards according to their own particular circumstances. Based on available data, the number of exceedances would be very high if WHO air quality guidelines were adopted</p>	<p>HKU regarding the Consultant's preliminary findings of the Air Quality Objectives Review;</p> <p>(b) advise whether Attachment 1 to LC Paper No. CB(1) 1057/08-09(01) had been worked out using air pollution indices from general monitoring stations and if so, this might not be able to truly reflect the impacts of air pollution on people who have to work long hours at road side; and</p> <p>(c) arrange a meeting with the academics concerned with a view to narrowing any discrepancies.</p>
010408 - 010429	Mr CHAN Kin-por	Mr CHAN Kin-por's support for early replacement of pre-Euro and Euro I diesel commercial vehicles with Euro IV and V models	
010430 - 011416	Mr Jeffrey LAM Administration	<p>Mr Jeffrey LAM's views/concerns -</p> <p>(a) little progress had been made despite the various measures</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>taken to improve air quality;</p> <p>(b) an open approach should be adopted for public consultation on review of AQOs;</p> <p>(c) the rationale for adopting the Californian instead of European Union (EU) emission standards for diesel private cars</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) results from air quality monitoring stations in the PRD Region indicated improvements in air quality in respect of sulphur dioxide and particulates;</p> <p>(b) extensive public consultation on AQOs would be held with various sectors of the community before the Administration decided on the way forward; and</p> <p>(c) diesel private cars were allowed in Hong Kong so long as their emission performance in terms of respirable suspended particulates and nitrogen oxides was comparable to that of petrol cars.</p>	
011417 - 012025	Ms Miriam LAU Administration	<p>Ms Miriam LAU's requests -</p> <p>(a) a comparison between the emission performance of the latest model of diesel private car and petrol car since the pollutants emitted could be quite different; and</p> <p>(b) the party which should bear the cost for early replacement of franchised buses</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) a diesel private car could emit 14 times more particulates and seven times more nitrogen oxides than a petrol private car. The two pollutants were the major air</p>	The Administration to advise the emission performance of the latest model of diesel private car and petrol car.

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>pollution concerns at the roadside. Owing to the advancement of the diesel emission control technology, some diesel private cars could meet Euro V emission standards for petrol private cars. The relative emission performance of the latest models of the two types of private cars could be shown by comparing their Euro V emission standards ; and</p> <p>(b) whether the replacement cost of franchised buses should be borne by the Government, operators or consumers would be decided after the public consultation</p>	
012026 - 013505	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	<p>Ms Cyd HO's views -</p> <p>(a) the use of natural gas for electricity generation and the early replacement of franchised buses would improve air quality and hence reduce medical cost;</p> <p>(b) consideration should be given to ploughing back the medical savings to subsidize the anticipated increases in electricity tariff and bus fare such that these increases would not be passed onto consumers; and</p> <p>(c) penalty should be imposed on service providers who insisted to use more polluting production methods despite the availability of cleaner options</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the cost-benefit analysis mainly focused on the economic cost to be borne by the entire community with no distinction as to whether the costs should be borne by Government, operators or consumers. Besides, the cost and benefit of the emission control measures were not mutually</p>	<p>The Administration to -</p> <p>(a) consider ploughing back the medical savings as a result of improved air quality to cover the anticipated increase in electricity tariff and bus fare arising from the increased use of natural gas for power generation and replacement of franchised buses respectively, such that these increases would not be passed onto consumers;</p> <p>(b) consider imposing penalty on service providers who insisted to use more polluting production methods despite the availability of cleaner options; and</p> <p>(c) advise the implementation plan for the first two Phase I control measures, and whether incentives would be offered to</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>transferable; and</p> <p>(b) with the implementation of new AQOs and associated emission caps, the power companies would need to increase the use of cleaner fuels for power generation</p>	<p>encourage participation of the service providers and the public;</p>
013506 - 014005	Chairman Administration	<p>Administration's explanation on the public consultation on AQOs -</p> <p>(a) the Consultant completed the third public forum on 20 March 2009 to seek the views of the public on its initial findings of the review;</p> <p>(b) EPD would upload the Consultant's report onto its website upon finalization of the report which would set out the full details of the methodology and assumptions of the control measures; and</p> <p>(c) a three-month public consultation on the proposed AQOs would be conducted in the third quarter of 2009</p>	
014006 - 014509	Ms Miriam LAU Chairman Administration	Ms Miriam LAU's request for the Administration to arrange a meeting with the academics concerned	
014510 - 015300	Ms Cyd HO Chairman Administration	<p>Ms Cyd HO's view that only models which conformed with the latest emission standards should be used to replace existing franchised buses</p> <p>Chairman's remarks -</p> <p>(a) the cost and benefits of controlling emissions involving replacement of vessels and franchised buses should be discussed at the next meeting on 14 May 2009; and</p> <p>(b) information on the types of vehicles in the existing franchised bus fleets, their routings and replacement plans should be provided by the Administration to facilitate discussion</p>	