

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1642/08-09
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/TP/1

Panel on Transport

**Minutes of special meeting held on
Thursday, 11 December 2008, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo (Deputy Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon WONG Sing-chi
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
- Members attending** : Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
- Members absent** : Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

**Public officers
attending**

: Agenda item I

Ms Eva CHENG
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Francis HO
Permanent Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr YAU Shing-mu
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Alan WONG
Commissioner for Transport

Mr Don HO
Assistant Commissioner/Management and Paratransit
Transport Department

Mr Ken HUI
Chief Transport Officer/Planning /Taxi
Transport Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda item I

The Fraternity Association of N.T. Taxi Merchants

Mr HO Che-kan
Chairman

N.T. Taxi Owners and Drivers Fraternal Association

Mr NG Kwok-wai
Vice-chairman

N.W. Area Taxi Drivers & Operators Association

Mr WONG Wing-chung
Chairman

Sun Hing Taxi Radio Association

Mr CHAN Ming-sang
Chairman

Wai Yik HK, Kln & NT Taxi Owners Association Ltd.

Mr William LI Kwok-ying
Vice-chairman

Sun Hing Taxi Radio Service General Association

Mr CHAN Wai-ming
President

New Territories Taxi Drivers' Rights Alliance

Mr LEUNG Yee-weng
Chairman

Taxi Dealers & Owners Association Limited

Mr NG Kwan-sing
President

Association of Frontline Taxi Drivers

Mr LAM Kwai-keung
Chairman

Taxi & P.L.B. Concern Group

Mr LAI Ming-hung
Chairman

New Territories Taxi Operations Union

Mr CHAN Shu-sang
Chairman

Hong Kong Tele-call Taxi Association

Mr WONG Yu-ting
Chairman

Taxi Association Ltd

Mr IP Yiu-leung
Vice Chairman

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr Kelvin LEE
Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Ms Sarah YUEN
Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Miss Winnie CHENG
Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

I New Territories Taxi Fare Adjustment Application

Briefing by the Administration

(LC Paper No. CB(1)361/08-09(02))

- Administration's paper on
New Territories Taxi Fare
Adjustment Application)

The Secretary for Transport and Housing (STH) briefed members on the Administration's paper on the fare adjustment application made by New Territories (NT) taxi associations seeking to decrease fares for the hiring of taxis for long-haul trips and to increase fares for short-haul trips. She said that this was in line with the new policy on taxi fare structure which was "front-loaded" and thereafter on a varying descending scale of incremental charges. She added that in view of the NT taxi trade's strong aspiration for the proposed fare adjustment to take effect as soon as practicable, the Administration was actively working towards effecting the adjustment before the Chinese New Year.

Presentation of views by deputations

The Fraternity Association of N.T. Taxi Merchants

2. Mr HO Che-kan, Chairman of the Association, considered that the Administration should introduce legislative amendments to prohibit bargaining over fares in parallel with introduction of the new fare structure. He complained that although the NT taxi trade had reached a consensus on the proposed fare adjustment as early as August 2008, urban taxis were given the green light to adjust fares first. The fare differentials between urban and NT taxis so arising had made it difficult for NT taxis to compete with urban taxis in attracting long-haul passengers and affected the livelihood of NT taxi drivers whose income mainly came from orders to and from the airport. Although the NT taxi trade had expressed concern about the fare differentials in November

2008, the Administration had not taken any action to address their concern and dissatisfaction. He considered that the Administration should take responsibility for the blockade of the North Lantau Highway on 3 December 2008.

N.T. Taxi Owners and Drivers Fraternal Association

3. Mr NG Kwok-wai, Deputy Chairman of the Association, pointed out that although the NT taxi trade had applied for the proposed fare adjustment early, it had not been able to take effect in parallel with that for urban taxis and the fare differentials so arising had affected the business and livelihood of NT taxi drivers. He hoped that the proposed fare adjustment could take effect as soon as possible to rectify the situation.

*N.W. Area Taxi Drivers & Operators Association
(LC Paper No. CB(1)361/08-09(01))*

4. Mr WONG Wing-chung, Chairman of the Association, briefed members on the Association's views as detailed in its submission. The Association expressed reservations about the proposed fare adjustment for the reasons as set out in the submission.

Sun Hing Taxi Radio Association

5. Mr CHAN Ming-sang, President of the Association, said that he was speaking on behalf of some 90% of members of the NT taxi trade, including all types of taxi operators. The Association supported the proposed fare adjustment and considered that to enable NT taxis to compete with urban taxis, NT taxi fares should not be higher than those charged by urban taxis. There was also a need for fare adjustments for both NT and urban taxis to take effect at the same time.

Wai Yik HK, Kln & NT Taxi Owners Association Ltd.

6. Mr William LI, Vice-chairman of the Association, said that the Association supported the proposed fare adjustment for NT taxis and introduction of measures to prohibit bargaining over fares. He said that according to the survey conducted by the Association, the incomes of day-shift urban taxi drivers had increased as a result of implementation of the fare adjustment for urban taxis.

Sun Hing Taxi Radio Service General Association

7. Mr CHAN Wai-ming, Chairman of the Association, criticized the Administration for failing to ensure that the fare adjustments for urban and NT taxis took effect in parallel, thereby causing NT taxis to lose business to

urban taxis. He said that this had led to the blockade on 3 December 2008. The Association also considered that the existing procedure for taxi fare adjustments cumbersome and the process excessively long, which had prevented taxi fares from responding to the economic climate in a timely manner. The Association suggested that taxi fare adjustments should be permitted subject to the approval of the Commissioner for Transport (C for T) only.

*New Territories Taxi Drivers' Rights Alliance
(LC Paper No. CB(1)402/08-09(02))*

8. Mr LEUNG Yee-weng, Chairman of the Alliance, briefed members on the Alliance's views as detailed in its submission. He said that the Alliance had reservations on the new fare structure as it believed that fare reduction for long-haul trips could not curtail discount gang activities but would only affect the incomes for taxi drivers. Notwithstanding, since urban taxis had already adjusted fares according to the new fare structure, NT taxis could only follow suit, or else they would not be able to compete with urban taxis. It was, however, regretful that the fare adjustment application for NT taxis had not been implemented in parallel with that for urban taxis. It was also regretful that no progress had been made in legislating against bargaining over fares despite that many stakeholders had called for this since 2003.

Taxi Dealers & Owners Association Limited

9. Mr NG Kwan-sing, President of the Association, said that the Association supported the proposed fare adjustment for NT taxis. He said that business had already improved since the fare adjustment for urban taxis took effect. The Administration should therefore take forward the proposed fare adjustment as soon as practicable to address concerns about the fare differentials and confusion so arising. The Administration should also seek to tackle the conflicts between NT taxis and urban taxis arising from overlapping of their respective permitted operating areas.

Association of Frontline Taxi Drivers

10. Mr LAM Kwai-keung, Chairman of the Association, expressed opposition to the proposed fare adjustment. He said that taxis had to queue a long time at the airport before they could secure hire for a long-haul trip, and it would be unfair to taxi drivers that fares for long-haul trips would be cut. Moreover, the proposed fare increase for short-haul trips might lead to reduction in the number of short-haul passengers. He opined that the Administration should seriously examine the views of taxi drivers whose livelihood would be affected by the proposed fare adjustment, and ensure that the views of the taxi trade solicited could represent the interests of all types of taxi operators.

Taxi & P.L.B. Concern Group
(LC Paper No. CB(1)402/08-09(01))

11. Mr LAI Ming-hung, Chairman of the Concern Group, expressed support for the proposed fare adjustment and briefed members on the Concern Group's views as detailed in its submission. He considered that people who opposed to the proposed fare adjustment and caused the blockade of the airport were mainly taxi touters who worked at the airport and border checkpoints and taxi drivers belonging to discount gangs, etc. He also considered that the Administration's failure to adjust the fares of urban taxis and NT taxis at the same time was also a cause of the blockade. He further expressed strong dissatisfaction that force had been used to stop taxi operators from voicing their views during the blockade.

New Territories Taxi Operations Union

12. Mr CHAN Shu-sang, Chairman of the Union, urged the Administration to take forward the proposed fare adjustment as soon as practicable to enhance NT taxis' competitiveness and put an end to disputes within the taxi trade. He pointed out that taxi fares had not been increased since 1997 despite inflation and substantial increases in operating costs. Moreover, problems that might emerge after introduction of the proposed fare adjustment could be tackled during review of its implementation.

Hong Kong Tele-call Taxi Association

13. Mr WONG Yu-ting, Chairman of the Association, expressed regrets that many taxi operators had suffered income loss because of the Administration's failure to implement the fare adjustments for NT and urban taxis at the same time. He urged the Administration to take forward the proposed fare adjustment before Christmas, and to submit it to the Executive Council (ExCo) for endorsement as soon as practicable.

Taxi Association Ltd.

14. Mr IP Yiu-leung, Vice-chairman of the Association, expressed support for the proposed fare adjustment to enhance competitiveness of NT taxis and to curtail discount gang activities so as to restore a level playing field. Moreover, as shown in a pilot scheme, patronage would increase as a result. He urged the Administration to introduce the proposed fare adjustment as soon as practicable.

15. Members also noted the submission made by the Hong Kong Taxi Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)402/08-09(03)) tabled at the meeting.

Administration's initial response to deputations' views

16. STH explained that it would not be appropriate for the Administration to process the fare adjustment application from NT taxis before LegCo had completed the negative vetting of the subsidiary legislation for effecting the fare adjustment for urban taxis. She said that there had been divergent views in the taxi trade on fare adjustments. She pointed out that consensus over the fare adjustment applications submitted by urban taxis had not been reached within the sector until June 2008, whereas consensus over the application from NT taxis had not been reached within the sector until August 2008. She also pointed out that nearly 95% of NT taxi trips were short and medium-haul trips. Therefore, the present fare differentials between urban and NT taxis should not affect much the business of NT taxis, as the fare differentials only affected NT taxis in competing with urban taxis for long-haul passengers.

17. STH further said that the Administration had to follow the established procedure in introducing taxi fare adjustments, and legislative amendments in the form of a subsidiary legislation had to be introduced to effect the proposed fare adjustment in consideration of its impact on the general public.

Discussion

The new fare structure and request for effecting the proposed fare adjustment as early as possible

18. Mr Ronny TONG said that Members belonging to the Civic Party did not support the introduction of the new fare structure, i.e. "front-loaded" and thereafter on a varying descending scale of incremental charges, as it had not only failed to effectively curtail discount gang activities but had also led to discords within the taxi trade.

19. STH explained that the new fare structure had been carefully considered and was agreed upon by the majority of members of the taxi trade. Apart from dampening discount gang activities, the new fare structure also aimed at boosting the incomes of taxi operators. Its merit should not be judged simply by how effective it was in reducing discount gang activities.

20. Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed concern that the upward fare adjustment for short-haul trips under the new fare structure might adversely affect the income of a rentee-driver, as the number of passengers of short-haul trip might decrease whereas taxi rentals might still increase. The Deputy Chairman and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung also expressed concern whether the proposed \$2 increase in flagfall charge would be too much and deter short-haul passengers from taking taxis. STH responded that the proposed \$2 increase was the consensus of the taxi trade. However, members' views in this regard would be taken into consideration.

21. Ms LI Fung-ying recalled that it was in recognition of the Administration's undertaking that it would review the need for legislation to ensure payment of metered fares, and the majority view of deputations received that LegCo Members had supported the fare adjustment application from urban taxis. She pointed out that the effectiveness of the new fare structure in combating discount gang activities had, however, remained doubtful. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung said that as he understood, taxi operators had only reluctantly accepted the new fare structure, particularly the fare reduction for long-haul trips in view of its adverse impact on their income.

22. Mr Ronny TONG asked what other measures would be taken by the Administration if the proposed fare adjustment for NT taxis was not approved. STH responded that it might not be constructive at present to assume that the fare adjustment would not be approved and to discuss what should be done then. She pointed out that the present mainstream proposal represented the majority view of the NT taxi trade. She also invited members to note that the fare adjustment for urban taxis had boosted the incomes of drivers concerned as reflected by some of them.

23. Mr Ronny TONG said that he was not convinced of the Administration's explanation that the fare adjustments for urban and NT taxis could not be introduced in parallel, and pointed out that LegCo Members were always willing to co-operate with the Administration to expedite the enactment of any urgent legislative proposal where necessary. He sought the views of the deputations, especially those who opposed the current proposal, as to how NT taxis would be able to compete with urban taxis if they did not accept to also cut fares for long-haul trips. Mr LAM Kwai-keung said that the proposed fare adjustment was unacceptable as it would reduce taxi drivers' incomes. Mr WONG Wing-chung proposed that the fare adjustment recently approved for urban taxis should be scrapped.

24. Ms LI Fung-ying said that since NT taxis' competitiveness would be adversely affected under the present fare differentials between NT and urban taxis, there was a need to introduce the adjustment early. Moreover, the majority view of the deputations was in support of its early implementation. She enquired about the feasibility of effecting the proposed fare adjustment before Christmas. STH explained that the scale of fares for the hiring of taxis was specified in Schedule 5 to the Road Traffic (Public Service Vehicles) Regulations (Cap. 374 sub. leg. D) and was determined by the Chief Executive-in-Council (CE-in-Council), subject to negative vetting by LegCo. Under the established practice, the Administration would also need to consult the Panel and the Transport Advisory Committee (TAC) on any taxi fare adjustment application before submitting it to CE-in-Council for a decision. Notwithstanding, she undertook to expedite the process as far as possible to effect the proposed fare adjustment in mid-January 2009.

25. Ms LI Fung-ying strongly urged that instead of adopting the above established practice, special arrangements should be made to expedite the relevant procedures. STH responded that once support from TAC was secured, the Administration would take the first available opportunity to submit the relevant application to CE-in-Council. She added that the Administration had made efforts to expedite processing of the application, including requesting TAC to advance its next meeting.

26. Ms Miriam LAU stressed the need to expedite implementation of the proposed fare adjustment for NT taxis. She said that she had met with the NT taxi trade and noted that they accepted the new fare structure in order to stay competitive in the market. She suggested that the Administration should consider arranging the current application to take immediate effect upon gazettal. STH responded that the Administration would consider the suggestion and was working in this direction, as she noted that this also had the general support of members.

27. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung also urged the Administration to expedite processing of the fare adjustment application, with a view to enabling the NT taxi drivers to make more profits from the business bloom expected for them at Christmas and the Chinese New Year.

Legislation to ensure payment of taxi fares according to the meter

28. Mr Ronny TONG and Mr WONG Kwok-hing considered that the Administration should introduce legislative amendments to ensure charging of taxi fares by the meter. They pointed out that the new fare structure would not be effective in combating discount gang activities as it could not prevent these gangs from further offering discounts to long-haul passengers. Instead, it would only lead to cut-throat competition within the trade.

29. In response, STH explained that in considering whether to introduce such legislative measures, it was necessary to consider the enforceability issue and fairness to both passengers and taxi drivers. There was also a need to consider whether criminal penalty should be imposed and the proportionality of such penalty to the offence. It was also necessary to consider whether the measures would be too disruptive or harsh, and whether they would compromise flexibility. The Administration was of the view that it would be more effective to tackle the problem of discount gangs by suitably adjusting the fare structure to bring it in line with market conditions.

30. Mr WONG Kwok-hing requested the Administration to consider the proposal from the Motor Transport Workers General Union on setting up a committee comprising representatives from the government, the taxi trade and unions concerned to review and draw up recommendations for resolving

problems pertaining to taxi operation and fares. STH responded that the Administration would study overseas experience regarding the regulation of charging by the meter. The Administration would also engage the taxi trade through TD's taxi conferences to understand more their views and concerns. The outcome would be reported to the Panel in six months' time.

31. Pointing out that all deputations attending the meeting supported banning taxi drivers from charging less than the meter reading by legislation, Mr WONG Kwok-hing urged the Administration to introduce the legislation as soon as practicable without waiting for six months. STH maintained that it was necessary to study overseas experience and ensure that any new measures to be introduced would be reasonable and fair to drivers as well as passengers. It would also be necessary to consider whether passengers or drivers should be penalized in the event of failure to pay metered fares. Mr Ronny TONG pointed out the current policy of imposing no regulation on drivers' failures to charge by the meter had been unfair to those drivers who adhered to charging according to the meter.

32. The Deputy Chairman opined that the Administration should introduce legislation to prohibit drivers from accepting requests for discount from passengers in parallel with implementation of the new fare structure, in order to effectively combat discount gang activities. He pointed out that these activities not only upset the operation of the taxi trade but also created cut-throat competition in the trade. He said that discount gang taxi drivers often took orders on the phone while driving and this also posed a great danger to passengers concerned. He considered that provided that the taxi fare level was set at a reasonable level, members of the public would not oppose a policy to require payment of taxi fares according to the meter.

33. STH reiterated that the Administration would have to carefully consider the enforceability and other issues concerning the proposed legislative measures. The Administration would first look at the effect of the fare adjustment for urban taxis in reducing discount gang activities in the next six months. The Administration believed that the new fare structure would help reduce room for operation of discount gangs and restore order in the market. In response to Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung's enquiry, STH said that the review would cover both the NT and urban taxis. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung suggested that consultation with the trade should be conducted by launching the "one-taxi-three-votes" survey, i.e. collecting views from taxi owners, day-shift drivers and night-shift drivers of each taxi. STH pointed out that TD's taxi conferences were also broadly representative as they were participated by 16 taxi associations.

34. Ms Miriam LAU called for the early introduction of legislative measures to ensure payment of taxi fares according to the meter. She said that the crux of the problem was that drivers were not restricted under the law from

charging less than the meter reading. To plug the loophole, the Administration should make reference to overseas experience in enforcing relevant legislation and she believed that such legislation did not have to compromise flexibility for drivers and passengers to agree on a fare less than meter reading in special circumstances, e.g. in the case of a wrong routing. She urged the Administration to commence consultation with the taxi trade on the introduction of the legislative measures. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung also urged the Administration to consider introducing legislation against fare bargaining as soon as possible. He added that introducing payment of taxi fares by the Octopus Card could address the concern that sometimes passengers/drivers had no small change and might pay/charge an amount less than the meter reading.

35. STH reiterated that the Administration was studying the overseas experience in enforcing relevant legislation and would come up with recommendations on the way forward in the next six months.

36. At Mr Ronny TONG's invitation to comment on the introduction of legislation to ban drivers from charging less than the meter reading, Mr LAM Kwai-keung said that as the large majority of Hong Kong people were law-abiding, if the proposed legislative measures were in place, there should be no problem in enforcement and taxi drivers would also benefit from such measures.

37. The Deputy Chairman and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung opined that since the introduction of legislative measures to ensure charging by the meter had proved feasible in many major cities overseas, the Administration should pursue this option in parallel with implementation of the proposed fare adjustment for NT taxis.

The blockade and need to improve communication

38. Mr Ronny TONG said that he shared some of the deputations' views that the Under Secretary for Transport and Housing (USTH) had failed to properly handle the blockade of the airport on 3 December 2008. Mr Jeffrey LAM expressed regret at the blockade and called on the Administration to improve its communication with the taxi trade and also communication within the trade.

39. STH responded that the Administration had all along consulted the taxi trade through TD's taxi conferences to understand their views and concerns. She said that during the blockade, the Administration had addressed NT taxi drivers' grievances by requesting the Airport Authority (AA) to stop immediately disseminating the updated taxi fare tables. She further said that after receiving the call from Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung requesting USTH to contact Mr LEUNG Yee-weng, USTH had immediately discussed the

matter with TD. The Administration had come to the view that it was more appropriate for TD to follow up on the request mainly because TD had all along been in close communication with the taxi trade.

40. C for T supplemented that all along TD had communicated with the NT taxi trade mainly through regular taxi conferences participated by 16 taxi associations. TD also met with taxi associations which were not participants of the taxi conferences. TD had also set up a special team to liaise with the taxi trade. C for T said that he also had many opportunities to meet with taxi operators and listen to their views. He believed that these channels had worked well in ensuring smooth communication between the Administration and the taxi trade.

41. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung opined that the blockade could have been avoided had it been handled properly. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung said that when NT taxi drivers requested that the updated fare tables should be disseminated in other areas of the airport instead of at the taxi stand, prompt response should have been taken by the Administration/AA to accommodate their request instead of taking no actions. He pointed out that the NT taxi trade had as early as April 2008 warned the Administration of the consequential fare differentials if fare adjustments for NT taxis and urban taxis were not introduced at the same time. The Administration had, however, failed to address their concern or to expedite processing of the current application.

42. Pointing out that some 58% of taxi operators were rentee-drivers, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung opined that the consultation approach with the trade should be enhanced to ensure that the interests of rentee-drivers were represented and their concerns fully taken into account. In response, C for T said that taxi associations with a 200-membership were welcome to join the taxi conferences as participants.

43. Mr WONG Kwok-hing, the Deputy Chairman and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung said that in recognition of the conflicting interests of the various types of taxi operators, the Administration should consider conducting a "one-taxi-three-votes" survey in collecting opinions from the trade so as to ensure that the views of all types of taxi operators would be taken into consideration. Mr WONG Wing-chung and Mr LAM Kwai-keung said that the consultation exercises conducted by TD in the past had been ineffective, and urged the Administration to conduct the "one-taxi-three-votes" survey instead.

44. C for T responded that given the different interests of different operators of the taxi trade, efforts had been made to solicit the views of all stakeholders as far as possible, and to provide a forum for discussion to facilitate reaching of consensus. He said that he did not see there was a strong

and unanimous view that the present consultation mechanism was inadequate. He also pointed out that any changes to the mechanism should be made based on a clear consensus to be obtained first.

Concluding remarks

45. At members' invitation, the following representatives of deputations supplemented the following views –

- (a) Mr CHAN Shu-sang pointed out that since the fare adjustment for urban taxis had been implemented with success, and there was a consensus in the NT taxi trade in support of the proposed fare adjustment, it should be implemented as soon as possible. He also said that the pressure of the substantial increases in operating costs of the taxi trade over the years might not be adequately alleviated if the proposed \$2 increase in the flagfall charge was reduced to \$1;
- (b) Mr WONG Wing-chung opined that the fare adjustment for urban taxis was not a success;
- (c) Mr NG Kwan-sing cautioned against the conduct of a "one-taxi-three-votes" survey by highlighting the serious conflicts of interests within the taxi trade. He also opined that time should be allowed to assess the effectiveness of the new fare structure in combating discount gang activities; and
- (d) Mr LEUNG Yee-weng expressed support for early implementation of the proposed fare adjustment and the conduct of a comprehensive survey to consult all types of taxi operators.

46. The Chairman concluded that members in general had no objection to the proposed fare adjustment for NT taxis. He urged the Administration to consider the following proposals raised by members –

- (a) the Administration should liaise with TAC and ExCo, and expedite processing of the fare adjustment application under discussion;
- (b) the Administration should consider arranging for the relevant legislative amendments to take effect upon gazettal;

- (c) the Administration should consider conducting a "one-taxi-three-votes" survey when consulting the taxi trade; and
- (d) the Administration should consider introducing legislation to ensure charging by the meter as soon as practicable instead of six months later.

47. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:55 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
19 May 2009