

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)588/08-09
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Minutes of meeting on
Friday, 21 November 2008, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
- Member absent** : Hon WONG Sing-chi
- Public Officers attending** : **Agenda item IV**
Mr YAU Shing-mu
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Miss Shirley YUEN
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mrs Avia LAI
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing

Mr Henry CHAN
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing

Mr Albert YUEN
Assistant Commissioner/Bus and Railway
Transport Department

Miss Alice AU YEUNG
Principal Transport Officer/Bus and Railway
Transport Department

Agenda item V

Mr YAU Shing-mu
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Miss Shirley YUEN
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mrs Hedy CHU
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing

Mr Alan CHOW
Acting Assistant Director/ Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda item IV

MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL)

Mr Henry LAM
General Manager - KSL

Miss Maggie SO
Senior Manager - Projects and Property
Communications

Agenda item V

MTRCL

Mr Y T LI
Deputy Operations Director

Ms Ida LEUNG
Senior Manager – External Affairs

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Sarah YUEN
Senior Council Secretary (1)6

KWONG Kam-fai
Council Secretary (1)4

Miss Winnie CHENG
Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

I Election of Chairman

Ms Miriam LAU was elected Chairman of the Subcommittee.

II Schedule of meetings for the 2008-2009 session

2. Members noted the proposed meeting schedule tabled at the meeting and agreed that the regular meetings of the Subcommittee for the 2008-2009 session would be held once every two months. Special meetings would be held to discuss any urgent matters where necessary.

(Post-meeting note: a meeting schedule was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)264/08-09 on 25 November 2008.)

Action

III Discussion items for next meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)209/08-09(01) — List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(1)209/08-09(02) — List of follow-up actions

LC Paper No. CB(1)209/08-09(03) — Administration's paper on progress of railway projects under construction and design)

3. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting scheduled for Friday, 16 January 2009, at 8:30 am -

(a) Review of the Mass Transit Railway By-laws and North-west Railway By-laws; and

(b) South Island Line.

IV Progress update on Kowloon Southern Link (KSL) and coordination of public transport services arising from the commissioning of KSL

(LC Paper No. CB(1)209/08-09(04) — Administration's paper on progress update on KSL and coordination of public transport services arising from the commissioning of KSL

LC Paper No. CB(1)210/08-09 — Background brief prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat)

4. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

5. Mr Abraham SHEK declared interest as a non-executive Director of the Board of MTRCL.

6. The Under Secretary for Transport and Housing (USTH) and Mr Henry LAM, General Manager - KSL of MTRCL, briefed members on the latest developments of KSL and the Administration's plan to consult the District Councils (DCs) concerned about the proposed public transport service plan to tie in with the commissioning of KSL.

(Post-meeting note: a set of presentation materials was issued vide LC

Action

Paper No. CB(1)260/08-09(01) on 21 November 2008.)

MTRCL
Admin/
MTRCL

7. Members in general were concerned about the lack of provision of a pedestrian subway between Austin Station and China Hong Kong City (CHKC) to facilitate passengers especially those carrying luggage and going to CHKC. Members requested MTRCL to check past records and confirm whether the pre-merger Kowloon Canton Railway Corporation (KCRC) had undertaken to provide any such pedestrian linkage. The Chairman suggested that the existing pedestrian subway near to Austin Station should be extended to connect with CHKC, making reference to the existing pedestrian subway system connecting Times Square with Causeway Bay Station. In response to members' concern, the Administration and MTRCL agreed to explore measures to enhance the connectivity between Austin Station and CHKC, and revert to the Subcommittee.

Admin/
MTRCL

8. Some members considered it inconvenient for passengers at Austin Station going to Kowloon Station to have to walk through a footbridge at Jordan Road first, then enter the Elements Mall and walk up to Kowloon Station. The Administration agreed that MTRCL should explore room for enhancement to the pedestrian linkage facilities between Austin Station and Kowloon Station as far as practicable.

Admin/
MTRCL

9. In response to the Chairman's enquiry, MTRCL indicated that an overall plan showing the pedestrian linkage system connecting the Airport Express Line-Kowloon Station, the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link Terminus and KSL Austin Station would be worked out by the end of 2009. Members in general considered it too late. At the Chairman's request, MTRCL agreed to explore the possibility of providing the plan, or an initial draft first, to the Subcommittee for consideration on an earlier date.

Clerk

10. At Mr Albert CHAN's suggestion, the Chairman would write to seek the views of Yau Tsim Mong District Council (YTMDC) on the design of exits of Austin Station and to ask them if they had any particular views that it would like to bring to the attention of the Subcommittee for follow-up with MTRCL.

(Post-meeting note: the Chairman's letter dated 26 November 2008 to the Chairman of YTMDC and a submission made by individual members of YTMDC were issued vide CB(1)392/08-09 (01) and (02) respectively.)

11. Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed concern about whether the public transport service adjustment arising from the commissioning of KSL would include any changes to the existing bus services between North-west New Territories (NWNT) and Kowloon, particularly, bus routes 268B and 269B, which were the only two bus routes for NWNT residents traveling to and from South Kowloon. He requested to put on record that NWNT residents were

Action

very concerned about whether these two bus routes would be cancelled or their number of rides be reduced. He requested that prior consultation with relevant DC had to be conducted before introducing any changes to existing bus services affecting NWNT residents including these two bus routes.

Clerk

12. After deliberation, members agreed that this item should be further discussed and the Secretary for Transport and Housing (STH) should be invited to join the discussion. Members also agreed to conduct a site visit to Austin Station.

(Post-meeting note: the site visit was held on 13 December 2008 and, with the concurrence of the Chairman, Lo Wu Station was also covered.)

V Rail safety and installation of platform screen doors

(LC Paper No. CB(1)209/08-09(05) — Administration's paper enclosing a paper on rail safety and installation of platform screen doors provided by MTRCL

LC Paper No. CB(1)211/08-09 — Background brief prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat)

13. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Stations in the pre-merger KCR network

14. Members noted that, while MTRCL re-affirmed that it aimed to complete the Automatic Platform Gates (APGs) retrofit work at all the eight at-grade and aboveground stations of the pre-merger MTR system by 2012 as scheduled, the Corporation could not provide a timetable for completion of the installation of APGs at the East Rail (ER) Line stations. Members were strongly dissatisfied and reminded the Administration and MTRCL that when the subject was last discussed at the meeting on 4 May 2007, the pre-merger KCRC had informed members that a trial on Mechanical Gap Fillers was planned to commence at Lo Wu Station in February 2008 for completion by September 2008 and another five years would be needed to install APGs at all KCRC stations. In the light of the information provided, the Subcommittee had passed a motion at that meeting requesting the then KCRC to complete the installation of APGs by 2013.

Admin/
MTRCL

15. The Chairman requested the Administration to ascertain with MTRCL the new completion date for installation of APGs at the ER Line stations, if 2013 was confirmed no longer feasible.

Action

Stations in the pre-merger MTR system

16. In response to members' concern, MTRCL indicated that it aimed to complete the installation work at Heng Fa Chuen Station first and then to start installation at the remaining seven stations of the pre-merger MTR system, making reference to the experience of implementing noise mitigation measures at Heng Fa Chuen Station. Installation for all seven stations would commence in the second to fourth quarter of 2011 and be completed by 2012, with some completed before 2012.

17. Mr Andrew CHENG moved the following motion. It was seconded by Mr LEE Wing-tat, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Mr KAM Nai-wai.-

"本會強烈不滿及譴責政府與港鐵，未能履行承諾就安裝月台幕門工程提出具體的時間表，並強烈要求政府督促港鐵加快安裝月台幕門工程。"

"That this Subcommittee expresses strong dissatisfaction with and condemnation of the failure of the Government and MTRCL to fulfil their promise to provide a concrete timetable for the installation of platform screen doors; and strongly requests the Government to press MTRCL to expedite the installation of platform screen doors."(translation)

18. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Five members voted for and one member voted against the motion. One member abstained from voting. The motion was passed.

19. To allow time for discussion on this item, the Chairman decided to extend the meeting by 10 minutes.

20. After deliberation, members agreed to further discuss this subject and to invite STH to join the discussion.

Clerk

21. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:40 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
13 January 2009

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 21 November 2008, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Election of Chairman</i>			
000000 – 000108	Ir Dr Raymond HO Ms LI Fung-ying Mr Jeffrey LAM Chairman	- Election of Chairman	
<i>Agenda Item II – Schedule of meetings for the 2008-2009 session</i>			
000109 – 000252	Chairman	- Schedule of meetings agreed	
<i>Agenda Item III – Discussion items for next meeting</i>			
000253 – 000358	Chairman	- Matters to be discussed at the next meeting	
<i>Agenda Item IV – Progress update on Kowloon Southern Link (KSL) and coordination of public transport services arising from the commissioning of KSL</i>			
000359 – 001604	Chairman Administration MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL)	- Briefing by the Administration and MTRCL's PowerPoint presentation.	
001605 – 002003	Ir Dr Raymond HO MTRCL	- Ir Dr Raymond HO's enquiry and MTRCL's response that the existing temporary traffic diversion arising from the construction of KSL would cease upon the opening of KSL. - Ir Dr HO's enquiry about the provision of escalators, and MTRCL's reply that there would be provision of escalator(s) at each exit and also lift(s) at the station. The direction of the escalators would be adjusted to keep with the passenger flow at peak hours of the day.	
002004 – 002128	Ms LI Fung-ying MTRCL	- Ms LI Fung-ying's enquiry and MTRCL's reply that the the KSL project would be completed on schedule, and there would be footbridge/subway linking Austin Station with the neighbouring area.	
002129 - 002758	Mr LAU Kong-wah Administration MTRCL Chairman	- Mr LAU Kong-wah recalled that the pre-merger Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation (KCRC)) seemed to have given an undertaking that a subway	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>would be provided to link Austin Station to China Hong Kong City (CHKC) at Canton Road.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Administration's response that the pre-merger KCRC had undertaken to provide a pedestrian subway to connect the existing underground pedestrian walkway system, which was opened together with the commissioning of the East Rail Tsim Sha Tsui Extension, with the existing underground walkway (Peking Road Subway) linking the junction of Peking Road and Kowloon Park Drive with Canton Road. With that new pedestrian subway, passengers could reach Canton Road in about 9 to 11 minutes after getting off the East Rail at its East Tsim Sha Tsui Station. The new subway was under construction. - MTRCL's reply that the design of Austin Station did not include provision of pedestrian subway linking the Station and CHKC. MTRCL's agreement to check records on the undertaking given by the pre-merger KCRC. 	<p>MTRCL to provide further information (para.7 of minutes)</p>
002759 - 003341	Mr Ronny TONG MTRCL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr Ronny TONG's enquiry and MTRCL's reply that toilets would be provided inside Austin Station for use by passengers. - Mr TONG's further enquiry about the connectivity between Austin Station and the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) as well as Kowloon Station. MTRCL's reply that passengers after getting off at Austin Station could use the existing footbridge at Jordan Road to access the Elements Mall and then proceed to Kowloon Station of the Airport Express Line (AEL). Pedestrian subway(s) or footbridge(s) would be provided to connect Austin Station with WKCD. 	
003342 - 004107	Mr IP Wai-ming MTRCL Chairman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr IP Wai-ming's view that the design of Austin Station should include underground pedestrian subway system to facilitate passengers' walking up to the Canton Road area, as well as provision of walkway to facilitate passengers' access to Kowloon Station. 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - MTRCL's explanation that a lift would be provided at Austin Station, which could reach direct the footbridge at Jordan Road. This would facilitate passengers with luggage going to Kowloon Station. The Chairman's view that walkway such as travelators should be provided to connect Austin Station with Kowloon Station. - The Chairman's enquiry and MTRCL's reply that the overall plan on the provision of walkway to link up Kowloon Station, Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) Terminus, and KSL would be worked out by the end of 2009. 	
004108 - 004701	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration Chairman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr Andrew CHENG's view that the Administration should have ensured provision of extensive underground pedestrian subways, preferably with retail shops, to connect Kowloon Station, Austin Station, Canton Road and East Tsim Sha Tsui Station, as this was one of the areas with the highest pedestrian flow, in order to alleviate the overcrowded problem in street and create business opportunities. - The Administration's agreement that MTRCL would be requested to explore room for enhancement to the connectivity between Austin Station and Kowloon Station as far as practicable. 	Admin to follow up with MTRCL (para. 8 of minutes)
004702 - 005511	Mr KAM Nai-wai MTRCL Mr Abraham SHEK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr KAM Nai-wai's concern that there was a strong practical need for the provision of a pedestrian subway between Austin Station and CHKC and a walkway between Austin Station and Kowloon Station. - Mr Abraham SHEK's view that the development of underground pedestrian subway as suggested by members was desirable but might involve complicated issues such as private property rights and technical constraints, e.g. ducts had been laid by public utility companies underneath the pavement. His suggestion that consideration could be given to providing feeder buses to link Austin Station with Canton Road and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Kowloon Station.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - MTRCL's agreement to explore enhancing the design of Austin Station to facilitate its accessibility by residents nearby and connectivity with neighbouring area as far as possible. 	
005512 - 010146	Mr Albert CHAN MTRCL Chairman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr Albert CHAN's view that MTRCL should learn from the experience of the serious congestion often found at the exits of Tsim Sha Tsui MTR Station during peak hours and avoid recurrence of the same problem at the exits of Austin Station. His suggestion that the Chairman should write to Yau Tsim Mong District Council (YTMDC) to inquire whether they had any particular views and comments on the design of Austin Station. - MTRCL's reply that due regard had been given to the pedestrian flow and requirements of barrier-free passage in the design of the exits. In addition, YTMDC had been consulted on the design and a site visit to the Station had been arranged for YTMDC. 	The Chairman to write to YTMDC (para. 10 of minutes)
010147 - 010211	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr WONG Kwok-hing's concern about whether the public transport service adjustment in connection with the commissioning of KSL would include any changes to the existing bus services between North-west New Territories (NWNT) and Southern Kowloon, particularly, bus routes 268B and 269B. His view that NWNT residents were very concerned whether these two bus routes would be cancelled or their number of rides would be reduced. His request that prior consultation with relevant DC had to be conducted before introducing any such changes. - The Administration's reply that the Transport Department and bus companies would closely monitor changes in passenger volume of existing public transport service subsequent to the opening of KSL. Consultation would be conducted with Yuen Long DC should there be any changes that would affect NWNT residents proposed to be made to the existing public 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		transport service.	
010212 - 011701	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration MTRCL Chairman Mr Jeffrey LAM	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr LEE Wing-tat's query of the absence of a Master Layout Plan setting out the connectivity of Austin Station with other stations such as Kowloon Station and neighbouring area. His view that the Under Secretary for Transport and Housing should be responsible for overseeing the overall coordination. - The Administration's explanation that the planning and implementation of the KSL project and the XRL project were carried out at different times. Thus, the overall plan on the connectivity amongst the AEL, West Rail and XRL would be available only at the next stage after the opening of KSL. - The Chairman's request and MTRCL's agreement to explore the possibility of providing the overall plan, or at least an initial draft, to the Subcommittee as early as possible. Mr Jeffrey's expression of same concerns. - The Chairman's suggestion of extending the pedestrian subway near to Austin Station up to CHKC, making reference to the existing pedestrian subway system linking Times Square with Causeway Bay Station. The Administration's agreement to explore enhancing the connectivity between Austin Station and CHKC. 	<p>Admin/MTRCL to provide further information (para. 9 of minutes)</p> <p>Admin/MTRCL to consider the Chairman's suggestion and to follow up on the enhancement measures (para. 7 of minutes)</p>
011702 - 012931	Mr LAU Kong-wah Chairman Administration Mr Ronny TONG Ir Dr Raymond HO MTRCL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr LAU Kong-wah's reiteration of concern about the non-provision of any covered walkway between Austin Station and CHKC providing direct linkage between the two locations. - Members' decision to arrange a site visit to Austin Station. - Mr Ronny RONG's concern that passengers taking the East Rail would need to get on and off different railway lines in order to take AEL to the Airport. Ir Dr Raymond HO's concern that passengers' convenience had been neglected in the design of railway stations and supporting facilities. 	Clerk and Admin/MTRCL to make arrangements (para 11 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item V – Rail safety and installation of platform screen doors</i>			
012932 - 013441	Chairman MTRCL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - MTRCL's briefing on the progress of installation of the Automatic Platform Gates (APGs) and the trial on the Mechanical Gap Fillers (MGF) System at Lo Wu Station. 	
013442 - 014011	Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr WONG Kwok-hing's suggestion of installing APGs also at daytime so as to speed up the installation and his enquiry about the trial on the MGF System. - MTRCL's reply that daytime installation was not feasible due to practical constraints. The trial of MGF System at Lo Wu Station was expected to complete in the first half of 2009. In the light of the outcome of the trial scheme, MTRCL would actively consider the applicability of the MGF System at the remaining East Rail Line stations. 	
014012 - 015346	Mr Andrew CHENG Chairman Administration Mr LAU Kong-wah MTRCL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr Andrew CHENG's expression of strong dissatisfaction with the delay of the trial of the MGF System as the pre-merger KCRC had undertaken that it would be completed by September 2008, as well as with the lack of progress in the installation of APGs at East Rail Line stations. His reference to the relevant motion passed by the Subcommittee at its meeting on 4 May 2007 (paragraph 19 of the Secretariat's background brief). Mr LAU Kong-wah's enquiry of the current timetable for completion of installation of APGs at East Rail Line stations. - MTRCL's explanation of the technical issues involved as set out in its paper. Administration's explanation that it had urged MTRCL to complete the work as soon as possible and no delay should be allowed. - The Chairman's reminding the Administration that the trial at Lo Wu Station should have been commenced in February 2008 as previously informed by the pre-merger KCRC instead of mid-2008. Her request for the Administration to ascertain with MTRCL whether the installation could be completed in 2013 and, if not, the 	Admin and MTRCL to revert to Subcommittee (para.

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		targeted date of completion.	15 of minutes)
015347 - 020851	Chairman Mr Albert CHAN Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration MTRCL Ms LI Fung-ying	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Suggestion of Mr Albert CHAN that the Subcommittee should consider moving a motion to condemn the Government and MTRCL. - Members' expression of dissatisfaction with the unjustified delay in the completion of installation of APGs at East Rail Line stations and MTRCL's failure to abide by the relevant motion on the installation timetable as passed by the Subcommittee in May 2007. - Mr LEE Wing-tat's query of why the installation of platform screen doors at Kwai Fong Station could not be completed until 2012. MTRCL's explanation that the Corporation aimed to complete the installation at Heng Fa Chuen Station first and then to start installation at the remaining seven stations of the pre-merger MTR system, making reference to the experience of implementing noise mitigation measures at Heng Fa Chuen Station. - Ms LI Fung-ying's request for a time frame for the installation of APGs at East Rail Line stations to be provided if MTRCL estimated that the work could not be completed by 2013. MTRCL's failure to provide such a time frame. - Motion passed by the Subcommittee. 	Admin to follow up on the motion.
020852 - 021237	Mr Andrew CHENG Mr LAU Kong-wah Chairman	- Decision to hold a special meeting for follow-up discussion.	The Clerk to follow up with the Administration