

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1786/08-09
(These minutes have been seen by
the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of special meeting on Tuesday, 16 December 2008, at 8:30 am in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
- Members absent** : Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Sing-chi
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
- Public Officers attending** : **Agenda item I**
Miss Shirley YUEN
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mrs Hedy CHU
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr K M WOO
Assistant Director/ Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

Mr Albert YUEN
Assistant Commissioner/Bus and Railway
Transport Department

Miss Alice AU YEUNG
Principal Transport Officer/Bus and Railway
Transport Department

Attendance by invitation : **Agenda item I**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Y T LI
Deputy Operations Director

Dr Jacob KAM
Head of Operations Engineering

Ms Ida LEUNG
Senior Manager – External Affairs

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr KWONG Kam-fai
Council Secretary (1)4

Miss Winnie CHENG
Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

I Kwun Tong Line service disruption on 8 December 2008 and review of recent railway incidents

(LC Paper No. CB(1)398/08-09(01) — Administration's paper on MTR Kwun Tong Line overhead power system failure on 8 December 2008 and recent railway incidents

LC Paper No. CB(1)398/08-09(02) — Paper on MTR Kwun Tong Line overhead power system failure on 8 December 2008 and recent railway incidents from MTR Corporation Limited

LC Paper No. CB(1)431/08-09(01) Submission from a group of Tseung Kwan O residents)

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. Members noted the submission made by a group of Tseung Kwan O residents (LC Paper No. CB(1)431/08-09(01)) expressing concern about the Kwun Tong Line incident on 8 December 2008.

Briefing by the MTR Corporation Limited

3. With the aid of Powerpoint, the Head of Operations Engineering of MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) briefed members on the Kwun Tong Line service disruption incident on 8 December 2008 and the findings of investigation of the incident as detailed in MTRCL's paper (LC Paper No. CB(1)398/08-09(02)). The investigation identified that an Overhead Line (OHL) isolator, which should normally be locked in the closed position, was locked in the open position. A closed isolator connected two sets of overhead lines and was normally kept in the closed position to balance the voltage. However, the isolator concerned was left locked in the open position after the last maintenance on the night of 10 November 2008. The follow-up actions taken by MTRCL were also detailed in paragraphs 17 to 21 of the same paper.

4. Members raised the following major concerns at the meeting -

- (a) The fact that MTRCL had spent almost one hour to identify the cause of the incident on 8 December 2008 and passengers had been stranded on the train for about 45 minutes was unacceptable. Although a red alert was already issued at 7:30 p.m. that evening in anticipation of a

Action

delay in passenger service, the public was not notified of a service suspension between Kwun Tong and Tou Keng Leng Stations in both directions on the Kwun Tong Line until 8:13 p.m. Moreover, the deployment of emergency buses was only arranged afterwards;

- (b) MTRCL should have disseminated information to passengers in a timely manner in the above incident to facilitate their consideration of taking other modes of transport. MTRCL should review its arrangements of dissemination of information;
- (c) There was room for improvement in deployment of emergency feeder bus service in the light of the above incident;
- (d) There was a need to enhance the monitoring of outsourced maintenance activities of MTRCL as reflected in this incident in which the wrong position of the isolator was not detected until one month after the last check of the isolator concerned;
- (e) MTRCL should consider enhancement measures to ensure the standard of contractor staff met the required standard and their work quality.

Admin
MTRCL

5. To facilitate further discussion on this issue, the Administration and MTRCL were requested to provide the following information -

- (a) Outcome of the review of MTRCL's incident handling procedures, including the dissemination of information, detainment of passengers, and emergency bus deployment, as well as enhancements required for strengthening the equipment checking procedures of MTRCL;
- (b) Information on MTRCL's allocation of resources for service maintenance (including number and working hours of maintenance staff and comparison with their counterparts of railway networks of New York and London) as well as MTRCL's service outsourcing plan; and
- (c) Explanation of the mechanism to deal with incidents involving delays of less than 8 minutes but which had aroused public concern because of involvement of perceived safety issues.

Action

6. The Subcommittee agreed to further discuss the matter at the next regular meeting to be held on 16 January 2009.

II Any other business

7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:40 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
2 June 2009

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the special meeting
on Tuesday, 16 December 2008, at 8:30 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Kwun Tong Line service disruption on 8 December 2008 and review of recent railway incidents</i>			
000000 - 000216	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000217 - 000253	Administration	Introduction by the Administration	
000254 - 001502	MTR Corporation Limited	Briefing by the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) on the incident on 8 December and findings of investigation of the incident.	
001503 - 002402	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration MTRCL	Mr WONG Kwok-hing's expression of strong dissatisfaction with the long time taken by MTRCL to identify the cause of the incident on 8 December 2008 and failure of MTRCL to come up with improvement measures at this meeting. MTRCL's briefing on the contingency measures implemented during the incident on 8 December 2008. The Administration and MTRCL undertook to review the notification procedures, dissemination of information and arrangement of emergency feeder bus services.	
002403 - 003129	Mr Ronny TONG MTRCL Chairman	Mr Ronny TONG's concerns about the backup power supply and that it was not until the occurrence of the incident that the wrong position of the isolator was detected and why there was no routine checking to ensure that all isolators were in the correct position. MTRCL's advice that it was conducting a thorough check of all similar isolators and had introduced a new checking procedure and labeling system. New enhanced equipment checking procedures (e.g. enhanced inspection and strengthening of staff training) would be explored to help prevent the recurrence of similar incidents.	
003130 - 003930	Mr KAM Nai-wai MTRCL	Mr KAM Nai-wai's concern about the cause of the incident and what measures would be taken to prevent the recurrence	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>of similar incidents. He was also concerned about the improvements required for the provision of emergency feeder buses.</p> <p>MTRCL's advice that incidents related to human factors would be addressed by improvements in work procedures and strengthening of staff training. MTRCL added that a maximum of 250 emergency buses could be deployed under their agreement with the Public Omnibus Operators Association.</p>	
003931 - 004837	Mr Albert CHAN MTRCL Administration	<p>Mr Albert CHAN's expression of dissatisfaction with the Administration's failure to ensure that MTRCL had drawn up effective contingency measures in handling incidents. His request for information on the isolator inspection procedures and whether the design of this equipment was outdated.</p> <p>MTRCL's reiteration that MTRCL had introduced a new checking procedure and labeling system to ensure that all isolators were in the correct position. MTRCL's explanation that there were different types of isolators and the choice of which depended on practical needs. EMSD's advice that MTRCL would introduce a remote monitoring mechanism for isolators to prevent recurrence of similar incidents.</p>	
004838 - 005552	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration Chairman	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's concern that a total of 117 incidents had occurred in the past five months, 10% of which even lasted for over 30 minutes. He urged the Administration to step up monitoring of the performance of MTRCL and consider imposing penalties on MTRCL for the frequent occurrence of incidents and failure to make improvements. He was also concerned whether these were signs of aging of the railway system.</p> <p>Administration's response that it attached great importance to the maintenance of safety and reliability of railway services.</p>	
005553 - 010321	Ms LI Fung-ying MTRCL Chairman	Ms LI Fung-ying's expression of concerns about the need to improve the dissemination of information, provision of emergency feeder bus service and monitoring of outsourced services of	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>MTRCL.</p> <p>MTRCL's response that it would explore enhancing public announcement on trains and at stations, especially at interchange stations, during times of incidents.</p>	
010322 - 010846	Mr IP Wai-ming MTRCL Chairman	Mr IP Wai-ming's concern about arrangements of evacuation of passengers in the situation of train failure occurring in a tunnel and MTRCL's response.	
010847 - 011910	Chairman MTRCL	<p>The Chairman's view that MTRCL should conduct a thorough check of not only all the isolators but also other major equipment which required manual setting to prevent recurrence of similar incidents. She also expressed dissatisfaction with the long time taken to deploy emergency buses and what purpose the onset of the Red Alert served.</p> <p>MTRCL's response that members' views would be taken into consideration in their review of the checking and maintenance procedures to minimize the chance of human error.</p> <p>The Administration's acknowledgement that there was room for improvement in incident management by MTRCL.</p>	
011911 - 012705	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung MTRCL Chairman	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's criticism of MTRCL's ineffective handling of incidents request for information and MTRCL's agreement to provide requisite information.	MTRCL to provide information (para. 5 of minutes)
012706 - 020844	Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL Administration Chairman Mr Andrew CHENG Ms LI Fung-ying Mr IP Wai-ming Mr Albert CHAN	Members' reiteration of their concerns about MTRCL's failure to inform passengers of the incident in a timely manner, late emergency bus deployment, MTRCL's monitoring of its outsourced maintenance work, and the Administration's failure in monitoring MTRCL's handling of incidents. Mr Andrew CHENG's view that the Administration should invoke section 14 of the Mass Transit Railway Ordinance (Cap. 556) to impose financial penalty on the MTRCL for its ineffective handling of incidents. Members' request for further information and the Administration's agreement to follow-up on the request.	Administration and MTRCL to provide requisite information (para. 5 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item II – Any other business</i>			
020845 - 021000	Chairman	Members' agreement to further discuss the subject at another meeting.	

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
2 June 2009