

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(1)2586/08-09  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

**Panel on Transport**

**Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

**Minutes of special meeting on  
Thursday, 14 May 2009, at 4:30 pm  
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP  
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
Hon WONG Sing-chi  
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
- Members attending** : Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
- Members absent** : Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

**Public Officers  
attending**

**: Agenda item I**

Mr YAU Shing-mu  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Philip YUNG  
Deputy Secretary for Transport & Housing  
(Transport) 1

Mr WAN Man-lung  
Principal Government Engineer/Railway  
Development, Highways Department

**Attendance by  
invitation**

**: Agenda item I**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Malcolm GIBSON  
Head of Project Engineering

Miss Maggie SO  
Senior Manager - Projects and Property Communications

Choi Yuen Village Support Group

Mr CHU Hoi-dick  
Member

Individual

Mr IP Shui-lai

Designing Hong Kong

Mr Paul ZIMMAMAN  
Founding Member

Professional Commons

Mr Albert LAI  
Chairman

Individual

Mr HUNG Wing-tat  
Associate Professor of the Hong Kong Polytechnic  
University

Green Sense

Mr Roy TAM Hoi-pong  
President of Green Sense

Miss HO Ka-po  
Project Manager

Individual

Mr LEUNG Kai-chi

V-artist

Miss FAN Tsam-ue  
Executive Manager

Individual

Mr CHAN Wai-keung  
Yau Tsim Mong District Councillor

People's Planning Action

Mr WONG Ho-yin  
Member

Civic Party

Mr Tim WONG  
NTW Branch Chairman, Civic Party

Community Cultural Concern

Mr Keith AU  
Co-ordinator

Individual

Ms CHENG Siu-kei

Hong Kong Christian Institute

Miss WONG Mei-fung  
Project Secretary

Tai Wai Walled Buildings Concern Group

Mr LI Sai-hung

Heung Yee Kuk N.T.

Mr LAM Kwok-cheong  
Ex-officio Executive Councillor

Mr MAN Fu-wan  
Ex-officio Executive Councillor

Hoi Fu Court Friends of Harmony  
Neighbourhood

Mr SIU Chi-hang  
Secretary

Individual

Ms FUNG Yu-tak

Individual

Ms CHAN Kam-har

Individual

Ms YEUNG PO-hi

Sha Tin District Council

Mr YEUNG Cheung-li  
Sha Tin District Council Member  
Chairman of Traffic and Transport Committee

Individual

Mr TANG Kwai-yau  
Yuen Long District Councillor

Individual

Mr MAK Ip-sing  
Yuen Long District Councillor

Wang Toi Shan Concern Group on  
Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express  
Railway Link

Mr TANG Wai-ming  
Convenor

Mr TANG Yung-yiu  
Representative

The Student Union of The Chinese University  
of Hong Kong

Mr FAN Cheung-fung  
Vice-President (External Affairs)

HK Sustainable Agriculture Association

Ms IP Chi-kiu  
Consultant

Ms CHENG Shwke-ching  
Consultant

A Generation

Ms LEUNG Wai-man  
Representative

H.K. Railway General Union

Mr LO Tung-ki  
Vice-Chairman

衝開圍城踏出新天大聯盟

Ms LEUNG Choi-kam  
Vice Chairman

Individual

Miss WONG Suk-ying

Individual

Ms YIP Ka-yuen

Justice and Peace Commission of the HK Catholic  
Diocese

Miss YIP Po-Lam  
Organizer

Individual

Mr LO Ming-kwong

Individual

Ms KONG Pik-yu

Individual

Mr CHAN Kam-ching

Individual

Mr WONG Chai

Individual

Ms FUNG Yu-chuk

Individual

Mr KO Hin

Individual

Mr TSE Wan-wah

Individual

Ms WONG Kwai-chun

Individual

Mr LAW Doe-fat

Individual

Mr IP Wai-keung

Individual

Ms FUNG Kit-chung

Individual

Ms CHO Shung-tai

Hong Kong Construction Association Ltd.

Mr Russell JONES  
Deputy Honorary Treasurer

Individual

Mr CHAN Chuen

One Country Two Systems Research Institute

Mr CHEUNG Chi-kong  
Executive Director

Mr Joe Z FANG  
Senior Research Officer

Individual

Mr KWONG Chun-yu  
Yuen Long District Councillor

Individual

Mr Zachary WONG Wai-yin  
Yuen Long District Councillor

Individual

Mr TO Kin-man

Concern Group of Tsoi Yuen Tsuen in Shek  
Kong on the Selection of Site for the Guangzhou –  
Shenzhen – Hong Kong Express Rail Link

Ms KO Chun-heung  
Chairman

Ms CHAN Hoi-shan  
Member

**Clerk in attendance :** Ms Joanne MAK  
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

**Staff in attendance :** Ms Sarah YUEN  
Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Ms Julien CHU  
Council Secretary (1)2

Miss Winnie CHENG  
Legislative Assistant (1)5

---

Action

**I Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express  
Rail Link (XRL)**

LC CB(1)1550/08-09(01)	Paper	No. -	Administration's paper on Hong Kong Section of XRL
LC CB(1)1332/08-09(01)	Paper	No. -	Referral from Complaints Division on issues relating to implementation of the Hong Kong Section of XRL
LC CB(1)981/08-09(01)	Paper	No. -	Referral from the meeting between Legislative Council Members and Heung Yee Kuk Councillors on 8 January 2009 on XRL
LC CB(1)1550/08-09(02)	Paper	No. -	Submission from Professional Commons



LC Papers CB(1)1363/08-09(01), CB(1)1380/08-09(01) and CB(1)1473/08-09(01)	Nos. -	Submissions from Concern Group of Tsoi Yuen Tsuen in Shek Kong
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(03)	No. -	Submission from Mr CHAN Wai-keung, Yau Tsim Mong District Councillor
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(04)	No. -	Submission from Wang Toi Shan Concern Group on Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Railway Link
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(05)	No. -	Submission from HK Sustainable Agriculture Association
LC Paper CB(1)1578/08-09(01)	No. -	Submission from Hong Kong Construction Association Ltd.
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(06)	No. -	Submission from Mr CHAN Chuen
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(07)	No. -	Submission from a member of the public
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(08)	No. -	Submission from a member of the public
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(09)	No. -	Submission from Mr YEUNG Tsz-hei, Yau Tsim Mong District Councillor
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(10)	No. -	Submission from HKSAR Government Civil Engineers Association
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(11)	No. -	Submission from Democratic Alliance
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(12)	No. -	Submission from Association of Engineering Professionals in Society
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(13)	No. -	Submission from Guangdong-Hong Kong Association for the Promotion of Technology Enterprise (HK) Ltd.
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(14)	No. -	Submission from The Hong Kong Association for the Advancement of Science and Technology Ltd.
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(15)	No. -	Submission from Hong Kong Community College
LC Paper CB(1)1550/08-09(16)	No. -	Submission from a member of the public

LC CB(1)1550/08-09(17)	Paper	No. -	Submission from Professor Yeung Yue-man, the Chinese University of Hong Kong
LC CB(1)1550/08-09(18)	Paper	No. -	Submission from Ko Kee Metal & Building Materials Limited

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee received views from 47 deputations/individuals which/who expressed the following major concerns on the project of the Hong Kong Section of XRL -

- (a) the villagers of Choi Yuen Tsuen expressed strong objection to the Administration's proposal of land resumption and clearance which would affect their village area and their life. Choi Yuen Tsuen was the home for 50 families which had been living there for generations with many aged citizens, and it would be difficult for them to move to reside elsewhere and adapt to a new environment. They also objected to the proposal of rehousing them to public rental housing;
- (b) deputations from conservation groups commented that Choi Yuen Tsuen was a valuable asset in terms of natural resources and ecological value and should be protected in line with the Administration's policy on sustainable development. Clearance of the village would not only affect the villagers but also destroy the environment and upset ecological balance;
- (c) some deputations proposed alternative locations (e.g. sites with little agricultural value) for building an emergency rescue station (ERS) and stabling sidings (SSS) instead of at Shek Kong of Yuen Long;
- (d) some deputations were dissatisfied that the public consultation on the proposed alignment and railway facilities of XRL had lasted for only two months after the gazettal of the Hong Kong Section of XRL on 28 November 2008, and very little information had been provided, such as the alignment of the Hong Kong section which was not clearly set out. The Administration was criticized for conducting inadequate public consultation on such an important project and failing to conduct any Social Impact Assessment before deciding to demolish Choi Yuen Tsuen. The clearance plan came into light only after the alignment had been designed and registration procedures with the households of Choi Yuen Tsuen had commenced;

- (e) some deputations proposed the provision of an intermediate station in the New Territories (NT) North for XRL in order to maximize the economic value of the railway project and to benefit NT residents;
- (f) some deputations were concerned whether the plan to build the XRL terminus in West Kowloon (a site just outside the West Kowloon Cultural District) would entail property development above the future XRL terminus and if so, whether the development would create "wall effect"; and
- (g) concerns were raised about the impact on the environment during construction, as it was expected that a large amount of construction waste and rock would be created given the long length of the proposed railway.

3. The Administration responded that in planning the location of ERS, the extent of study areas covered the flat areas of the entire Kam Tin and Pat Heung. Shek Kong was located approximately in the midway of the whole XRL alignment between West Kowloon and Futian in Mainland. Setting up an ERS at Shek Kong would enable effective response to incidents inside the tunnel at different locations. In addition, the proposed site was well served by major roads, low-lying, flat and extensive allowing rescue teams to reach ERS conveniently and evacuation of train passengers. The Administration assured members that the concerned government departments would continue to work with MTRCL on the detailed design of XRL, and continue to timely consult the Legislative Council, the concerned DCs and Rural Committees and to take into account the public views in planning the alignment. The Administration had been trying to stay in close touch with the villagers. Secretary for Transport and Housing and Under Secretary for Transport and Housing had already met them. The Administration undertook that it would make its best endeavors to address the concerns raised by villagers of Choi Yuen Tsuen and discussion with them was still underway. MTRCL representative responded that the Corporation would make its best efforts to minimize the impacts of the project on residents concerned and to this end, the Hong Kong Section of XRL would run entirely underground except for the sites proposed for provision of the proposed SSS/ERS at Shek Kong.

4. At the request of the Subcommittee, the Administration undertook to maintain close liaison with the local communities to solicit their views and to keep the residents informed. The Administration advised that it would deal with the issue of compensation in accordance with established land policy and relevant legislation.

5. Members raised the following concerns and suggestions for the

Administration's follow-up actions -

- (a) the Administration should not try to push through the clearance plan for Choi Yuen Tsuen and rehouse the villagers to public rental housing as the villagers' wish was to preserve their homeland and their way of living. The interests of the villagers should not be compromised for the pursuit of economic development;
- (b) the Administration should consider provision of an intermediate station in NT in order to benefit the some 3,000,000 population there and enhance the economic benefits of the project;
- (c) the Secretary for Transport and Housing (STH) should pay a visit to Choi Yuen Tsuen as soon as possible to listen to the views of the villagers and address their concerns;
- (d) there was conflict of interests with MTRCL's arrangement of hiring social workers to provide assistance to the affected villagers. The support service should be provided by social workers from the Social Welfare Department instead;
- (e) the suggestion of making use of the Shek Kong Barracks as an alternative site for provision of ERS/SSS should be explored; and
- (f) the Administration should allow flexibility in offering land compensation to the affected villagers, e.g. to consider the option of land swap so that the villagers could continue with their present way of living at another site in NT.

Admin

6. The Chairman requested the Administration to convey to STH the villagers' request for meeting with her direct with a view to resolving villagers' concerns as early as possible. She considered that the Subcommittee should convene a further meeting to follow up this matter. Members agreed.

## **II Any other business**

7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 7:45 pm.

## Panel on Transport

## Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting  
on Thursday, 14 May 2009, at 4:30 pm  
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000000 – 000727	Chairman	- Opening remarks	
<i>Agenda Item I – Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL)</i>			
000728 – 001128	Choi Yuen Tsuen Support Group	- Expression of strong objection to the Administration's proposal of land resumption and clearance which would seriously affect Choi Yuen Tsuen and the life of the villagers.	
001129 – 001424	Designing Hong Kong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of support for early implementation of the railway project;</li> <li>- The Administration should make better planning for the interface of various train stations in the proximity of the future XRL terminus in order to achieve optimal travelling time for passengers; and</li> <li>- An intermediate station should be provided in the New Territories (NT) North in order to shorten the travelling time of NT residents who would like to travel to Guangdong by XRL.</li> </ul>	
001425 – 001714	Professional Commons	<p>Presentation of views as set out in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)1550/08-09(01)).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of support for early implementation of the railway project;</li> <li>- An intermediate station should be provided in NT North to serve the 3 million population in NT;</li> <li>- While the relevant Environmental Impact Assessment report would be</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>completed only in mid-2009, the Administration had commenced land resumption procedures at the end of 2008, which was unfair to villagers of Choi Yuen Tsuen; and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The relevant Social Impact Assessment had yet to be completed and land resumption should not be pursued.</li> </ul>	
001715 – 002044	Mr HUNG Wing-tat	<p>Presentation of views as set out in his submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)1920/08-09(12)).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of support for early implementation of the railway project under discussion;</li> <li>- XRL terminus should be built at Kam Sheung Road instead of in WKCD; and</li> <li>- The interests of Choi Yuen Tsuen villagers should not be sacrificed in the pursuit of the current option of constructing the necessary railway facilities at the site of Choi Yuen Tsuen, and adequate compensation should be provided to the affected villagers to ensure that their living standard would not be adversely affected by this project.</li> </ul>	
002045 – 002405	Mr IP Shui-lai	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Presentation of a CD-ROM about Choi Yuen Tsuen.</li> </ul>	
002406 – 002713	Green Sense	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Administration was criticized for failing to conduct a thorough public consultation or provide adequate information on the project to the public;</li> <li>- Concern about whether property development above the XRL terminus and thus "wall effect" would be created; and</li> <li>- XRL terminus should be built at Kam Sheung Road instead of in WKCD.</li> </ul>	
002714 –	Mr LEUNG Kai-chi	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Request for the Administration to</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
003045		consider alternative locations for building an emergency rescue station (ERS) and stabling sidings (SSS) instead of at Shek Kong of Yuen Long.	
003046 – 003302	V-artist	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Economic development of the society should not be pursued at the expense of the interests of the villagers of Choi Yuen Tsuen and their wish should be respected; and</li> <li>- The Administration was urged to actively consider the alternative locations for building ERS and SSS instead of at Shek Kong of Yuen Long and to conduct thorough public consultation on the location of the XRL terminus and the alignment of XRL Hong Kong section.</li> </ul>	
003303 – 003614	Mr CHAN Wai-keung Yau Tsim Mong District Councillor	<p>Presentation of views as set out in his submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)1550/08-09(03)).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of concern about whether the provision of the XRL terminus in WKCD would exacerbate the traffic problem in Yau Tsim Mong district; and</li> <li>- Concern about the impact of the construction of the XRL (Hong Kong Section) underground on building safety.</li> </ul>	
003615 – 003923	People's Planning Action	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Request for the Administration to carry out a comprehensive social impact assessment (which should be made a statutory procedure under the Railways Ordinance) on the railway project and to provide adequate information on the project to the affected villagers.</li> </ul>	
003924 – 004139	Civic Party	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of support for early implementation of the railway project under discussion;</li> <li>- An open comprehensive public consultation should be launched on the project as soon as possible; and</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- An intermediate station in NT north should be provided to foster development in NT.</li> </ul>	
004140 – 004458	Community Cultural Concern	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of objection to the Administration’s proposal of land resumption and clearance which would seriously affect Choi Yuen Tsuen and the lives of the residents concerned.</li> </ul>	
004459 – 004614	Ms CHENG Siu-kei	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of the view that Choi Yuen Tsuen had its unique cultural value and should be protected from clearance.</li> </ul>	
004615 – 004921	Hong Kong Christian Institute	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Request for the Administration to seriously consider the ecological and agricultural value of Choi Yuen Tsuen and strive for its preservation; and</li> <li>- There was a lack of transparency in the environmental impacts of the project and little information was provided to the public.</li> </ul>	
004922 – 005130	Tai Wai Walled Buildings Concern Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- It was doubtful as to the need for construction of the XRL Hong Kong Section and the cost-effectiveness of this proposal. The Administration was suggested to consider whether it was possible for the XRL Hong Kong Section to share the corridor with the existing West Rail Line.</li> </ul>	
005131 – 005500	Heung Yee Kuk N.T.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of concern about the inadequate information provided by the Administration, prior to the gazettal of the railway project, on the scope of area that would be affected and the extent of land resumption required under this project; and</li> <li>- The Administration should avoid the setting up of railway protection area as far as possible under this project in order not to affect the land owners concerned in their exercise of their land use right.</li> </ul>	
005501 – 005739	Ms FUNG Yu-tak	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Presentation of a CD-ROM about Choi Yuen Tsuen.</li> </ul>	



Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
005740 – 010101	Ms CHAN Kam-har	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Administration was urged to reconsider amending the proposed alignment so that Choi Yuen Tsuen would not be demolished.</li> </ul>	
010102 – 010425	Ms YEUNG Po-hi	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Administration was urged to protect the scarce agricultural resources in Hong Kong and Choi Yuen Tsuen should be protected intact as the Government had been advocating sustainable development.</li> </ul>	
010426 – 010638	Mr TANG Kwai-yau, Yuen Long District Councillor	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of support for early implementation of the railway project under discussion; and</li> <li>- Request for the Administration to relax the eligibility criteria on household income for applications of re-housing for the affected residents of Wang Toi Shan and Choi Yuen Tsuen, and to grant ex-gratia compensation to them.</li> </ul>	
010639 – 010941	Mr MAK Ip-sing, Yuen Long District Councillor	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Suggestion of amending the proposed alignment to avoid demolition of Choi Yuen Tsuen;</li> <li>- Expression of concern about whether the demolition would be followed by property development at the cleared site; and</li> <li>- An intermediate station should be provided in Yuen Long.</li> </ul>	
010942 – 011259	Wang Toi Shan Concern Group on Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Railway Link	<p>Presentation of views as set out in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)1550/08-09(04)).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The large extent of land resumption under this project was unprecedented and was of wide public concern;</li> <li>- Wang Toi Shan Village (with some 6 000 villagers) would be affected by land resumption plan and it was opposed.</li> </ul>	
011300 – 011612	The Student Union of the Chinese University of Hong Kong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of dissatisfaction with the Administration's pursuit of economic</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>development without regard for sustainable development and the interests of Choi Yuen Tsuen villagers;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Administration and MTRCL were urged to review the alignment of the project.</li> </ul>	
011613 – 011936	HK Sustainable Agriculture Association	<p>Presentation of views as set out in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)1550/08-09(05)).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Administration was urged to scrap the express railway project in order to preserve the ecological balance and avoid creating pollution problems to the environment and water source.</li> </ul>	
011937 012333	A Generation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of objection to the implementation of the project in order to preserve the ecological balance and avoid destruction of Choi Yuen Tsuen and causing pollution problems; and</li> <li>- The proposed underground construction method might have profound destructive effect on the ecological environment.</li> </ul>	
012334 – 012650	衝開圍城踏出新天大聯盟	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of the view that the interests of Choi Yuen Tsuen should not be compromised in the pursuit of railway development.</li> <li>- Request for the Administration to redesign the proposed alignment and conduct further public consultations on the need for provision of XRL (Hong Kong Section) and the proposed alignment.</li> <li>- The interests of NT West residents were neglected in the design of the location of the XRL terminus.</li> </ul>	
012651 – 013000	Miss WONG Suk-ying	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of strong dissatisfaction with the Administration's clearance plan of Choi Yuen Tsuen and providing an account of the stress</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		created to villagers concerned.	
013001 – 013309	Ms YIP Ka-yuen	- Request for the Administration/MTRCL to explore alternative sites for the provision of ERS and SSS instead of at Shek Kong of Yuen Long.	
013310 – 013635	Justice and Peace Commission of the HK Catholic Diocese	- Criticism that the Administration had neglected the needs of the aged villagers of Choi Yuen Tsuen in proposing to rehouse them in public rental housing.	
013636 – 013952	Mr LO Ming-kwong	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen and request for the Administration to have regard for the wish of the aged villagers.	
013953 – 014139	Ms KONG Pik-yu	- Request for the Administration to review the existing squatter clearance policy and rehousing arrangements which seemed to have neglected the well-being of the aged residents who might not be suitable to be rehoused to public rental housing as well as the need to preserve the life style of the affected residents.	
014140 – 014332	Mr CHAN Kam-ching	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen.	
014333 – 014556	Mr WONG Chai	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen.	
014557 – 014902	Ms FUNG Yu-chuk	- Expression of strong dissatisfaction with the Administration's clearance plan of Choi Yuen Tsuen and giving an account of the stress created to villagers concerned as a result of the clear plan.	
014903 – 015047	Mr KO Hin	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen.	
015048 – 015228	Mr TSE Wan-wah	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen.	
015229 – 015409	Ms WONG Kwai-chun	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015410 – 015550	Mr LAW Doe-fat	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen.	
015609 – 005845	Ms FUNG Kit-chung	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen.	
005846 – 020000	Ms CHO Shung-tai	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen.	
020001 – 020205	Hong Kong Construction Association Ltd.	<p>Presentation of views as set out in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)1578/08-09(01)).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of support for the project and highlighting that the project was expected to generate 5500 construction job opportunities and tremendous economic benefits for Hong Kong.</li> </ul>	
020206 – 020509	Mr CHAN Chuen	Presentation of views as set out in his submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)1550/08-09(06)).	
020510 – 020817	One Country Two Systems Research Institute	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of support for the project, the Dedicated Corridor Option for the project, and locating the terminus in West Kowloon; and</li> <li>- The Hong Kong Section should be integrated with the high speed transportation network in the Pearl River Delta to achieve the one-hour travelling target between the two places.</li> </ul>	
020818 – 021132	Mr KWONG Chun-yu Yuen Long District Councillor	- Criticism of the Administration's negligence of the objection expressed by affected villagers and lack of information provided to the public on the project. YLDC had not been consulted during the statutory public consultation period.	
021133 – 021452	Mr TO Kin-man	- Expression of objection to the clearance of Choi Yuen Tsuen which should be treasured for its local characteristics and agricultural value (e.g. a variety of organic vegetables were grown).	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
021453 – 021820	Concern Group of Tsoi Yuen Tsuen in Shek Kong on the Selection of Site for the Guangzhou – Shenzhen – Hong Kong Express Rail Link	<p>Presentation of views as set out in its submissions (LC Paper No. CB(1)1363/08-09(01) and CB(1)1473/08-09(01)).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Request for preservation of Choi Yuen Tsuen which was the important homeland to the villagers concerned and for the high ecological value of the village;</li> <li>- Request for setting up a working group (comprising official as well as non-official members and the latter should be members of the public) to work for the targets of achieving optimal use of land resources, preservation of Choi Yuen Tsuen and taking forward the XRL(Hong Kong Section) project; and</li> <li>- Criticism of the Administration's non-provision of detailed justifications for not considering the alternative feasible sites for construction of the ERS and SSS.</li> </ul>	
021821 – 022719	Chairman Administration MTRCL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Administration's and MTRCL's response and assurance that every effort would be made to minimize the impacts of the project on residents concerned.</li> </ul>	
022720 – 023248	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Chairman Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr WONG's strong view that the interests of villagers of Choi Yuen Tsuen should not be compromised for pursuit of economic development, and query about non-provision of an intermediate station in NT and why inadequate consultation was conducted prior to gazettal of the project.</li> <li>- Concern about the Administration's move in the previous year to conduct household registration with the villagers in preparation for clearance, before the relevant environmental impact assessment had been completed and the rural committee/DC had been consulted; and</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Administration's assurance that collection of views from stakeholders would continue and their views would be taken into account in planning the project.</li> </ul>	
023249 – 023759	Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Chairman Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr LEE's criticism that the Administration had not even informed YLDC about its plan to clear Choi Yuen Tsuen during public consultation nor had the villagers been consulted when the alignment was being designed. The clearance plan came into light only after the alignment had been designed and registration procedures with the households of Choi Yuen Tsuen had commenced;</li> <li>- Request for the Secretary for Transport and Housing (STH) to meet with the villagers to listen to their views;</li> <li>- Criticism that the Administration should not try to push through the clearance plan and rehouse the villagers to public rental housing against the wish of the villagers who wanted to preserve their homeland;</li> <li>- The Administration's response that STH had visited the village in person and representatives of the Administration/MTRCL had also paid visits to the village on several occasions;</li> <li>- There was little room for further changes to be made to the proposed alignment. In fact, the land provision for the proposed SSS at Shek Kong had been squeezed to a minimum; and</li> <li>- Further study on the rehousing arrangement to be offered to the affected villagers was being carried out.</li> </ul>	
023800 –	Mr Andrew CHENG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr CHENG's view that LegCo</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
024303	Chairman Administration	<p>Members could reject the relevant funding approval to be submitted by the Government if the latter failed to properly address villagers' grievances;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expression of support for setting up a working group for continuous negotiation among concerned parties and for exploring the feasibility of making use of the Shek Kong Barracks as alternative site for provision of ERS/SSS;</li> <li>- Request for direct dialogue with STH as suggested by Mr LEE Cheuk-yan; and</li> <li>- The Administration's response that the seven relevant District Councils and/or their subcommittees, the Heung Yee Kuk and the relevant Rural Committees had been consulted on the project.</li> </ul>	
024304 – 024809	Mr Ronny TONG Chairman Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr Ronny TONG's disappointment at the non-attendance of STH at this meeting and enquiry about what arrangement would be made to allow direct dialogue between STH and the villagers;</li> <li>- Enquiry of the justifications of selecting the site of Choi Yuen Tsuen for construction of the railway and whether there was really no alternative locations; and</li> <li>- The Administration's undertaking that the request for direct dialogue would be conveyed to STH for consideration. It confirmed that proposals on alternative locations had all been carefully considered by the Administration/MTRCL and reasons of non-acceptance had been provided.</li> </ul>	
024810 – 025235	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming Chairman Administration MTRCL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr CHEUNG's view that all alternative locations should be explored in order to save Choi Yuen Tsuen from clearance and that the option of building ERS/SSS on the</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Mainland should be explored;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- request for the Administration to allow flexibility in offering land compensation to the affected villagers, e.g. to consider the option of land swap so that the villagers could continue with their present life style at another site in NT;</li> <li>- The Administration's response that possible options had been considered by the Administration; and</li> <li>- MTRCL's explanation of why the option of building ERS/SSS on the Mainland was not possible.</li> </ul>	
025236 – 025813	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr CHEUNG's enquiry about the timetable for implementing the project and the Administration's response that the construction of the project was scheduled to commence before the end of 2009. The Administration would address all the concerns raised by affected residents before submission of the relevant funding proposal to LegCo for endorsement;</li> <li>- Concern about the news that MTRCL would hire social workers to provide assistance to the affected villagers and it was considered that there would be conflict of interests with such arrangements; and</li> <li>- The Administration's explanation that the arrangement had been made out of good will and that the team of social workers would only provide counseling services to address emotional stress of the affected villagers. Mr CHEUNG's counter-proposal that the Social Welfare Department could mobilize its social workers to provide the service instead.</li> <li>- [Post-meeting Notes: The Pok Oi social services team is in fact hired by the Government. A letter of acceptance of service was issued to</li> </ul>	



Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Pok Oi on 11 May 2009.]	
025814 – 030328	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Chairman Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mr LEUNG's objection to the construction of XRL which in his view would only benefit those who would use the rail service; and</li> <li>- Request for the Administration to fully address the demands and concerns of the villagers and consider the option of making use of Shek Kong Barracks for building the relevant facilities as suggested by Choi Yuen Tsuen.</li> </ul>	
030329 – 030545	Chairman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Chairman's request for the Administration to convey to STH the suggestion of arranging a meeting between her and the villagers with a view to resolving villagers concerns as early as possible. Some time would be allowed for the Administration's communication and discussion with the villagers. Depending on the progress of work of the Administration, a further meeting would be arranged, hopefully in June, to follow up on this issue.</li> </ul>	<b>Admin to follow up on the views and comments expressed by members/deputations and revert to the Subcommittee asap.</b>

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
 11 September 2009