

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(1)920/09-10  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

**Panel on Transport**

**Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

**Minutes of special meeting on  
Thursday, 17 September 2009, at 2:30 pm  
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP  
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
Hon WONG Sing-chi  
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
- Members attending** : Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun  
Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou
- Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

**Public Officers  
attending**

**: Agenda item I**

Ms Eva CHENG  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr YAU Shing-mu  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Philip YUNG  
Deputy Secretary for Transport & Housing  
(Transport) 1

Mr WAN Man-lung  
Principal Government Engineer/Railway Development  
Highways Department

Mr Raymond HO  
Government Engineer/Railway Development 2  
Highways Department

**Agenda items II and III**

Mr YAU Shing-mu  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Philip YUNG  
Deputy Secretary for Transport & Housing  
(Transport) 1

Mr Henry CHAN  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport &  
Housing (Transport) 7

Mr Raymond HO  
Government Engineer/Railway Development 2  
Highways Department

**Attendance by  
invitation**

**: Agenda items I to III**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Malcolm GIBSON  
Head of Project Engineering

Miss Maggie SO  
Senior Manager - Projects and Property Communications

**Clerk in attendance :** Ms Joanne MAK  
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

**Staff in attendance :** Ms Sarah YUEN  
Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Mr Ken WOO  
Council Secretary (1)2

Miss Winnie CHENG  
Legislative Assistant (1)5

---

Action

**I Further discussion on Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL)**

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)2582/08-09(01) - Administration's paper on Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2582/08-09(02) - Background brief prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2586/08-09 - Minutes of Subcommittee meeting on 14 May 2009
- LC Paper Nos. CB(1)2618/08-09(01), CB(1)2618/08-09(02), and CB(1)2618/08-09(03) - Submissions from Slow Development HK
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2618/08-09(04) - Submission from Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo)

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. With the aid of Powerpoint, the Secretary for Transport and Housing briefed members on the progress of the Hong Kong section of XRL. To facilitate further discussion on the project, the Administration was requested to provide the following supplementary information -

Action

- (a) Information on the choice of location for the emergency rescue station and stabling sidings for the Hong Kong section of XRL;
- (b) Detailed information including updated data on patronage projection, estimated cost and economic benefits of the Hong Kong section; and
- (c) Written response to the questions raised by Hon Andrew CHENG in his letter dated 17 September 2009 (LC Paper No. CB(1)2618/08-09(04)).

*(Post-meeting note: a supplementary paper on the emergency rescue station and stabling sidings provided by the Administration was issued vide LC Paper No. CB(1)2656/08-09(01) on 24 September 2009. Patronage, estimated cost, economic benefits and other related issues were covered by the Legislative Council Briefs issued by the Administration on 21 October 2009.)*

3. The Subcommittee agreed to hold a meeting on 23 September 2009 at 8:30 am to receive views from deputations on the Hong Kong section of XRL.

**II Further discussion on South Island Line (SIL) (East)**

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)2582/08-09(03) - Administration's paper on South Island Line (East)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2602/08-09(01) - Administration's responses to major concerns raised by Subcommittee members and deputations at the meeting on 15 May 2009
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2602/08-09(02) - Submission from 反對赤柱春坎山設置臨時爆炸品倉庫關注組
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2602/08-09(03) - Submission from TWGHs Jockey Club Rehabilitation Complex Parents Committee
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2279/08-09 - Referral from Complaints Division on issues relating to South Island Line
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2618/08-09(07) - Submission from The Democratic Party
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2618/08-09(08) - Submission from Designing Hong Kong Limited)

Action

4. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

5. Members discussed the following major issues concerning the project

-

- (a) the Administration's proposal to establish temporary barging facilities at Tin Wan Praya Road in Kellett Bay and Lee Nam Road in Ap Lei Chau for removal of the excavated materials by marine transport;
- (b) the Administration's proposed temporary magazine at a remote area at Chung Hom Shan for overnight storage of a small amount of explosives for the construction of SIL(East); and
- (c) concerns of the parents of the occupants accommodated at the Tung Wah Group of Hospitals Jockey Club Rehabilitation Complex (JCRC) as well as the management of JCRC, about the potential impact on the centre brought about by the railway.

6. Prof Partick LAU expressed concern that the storage of explosives at Chung Hom Shan would entail a long length of delivery route by road-based transport means, which would pose safety issues that merited reconsideration by the Administration. He urged the Administration to consider using marine transport means for the delivery of the explosives.

7. Members including Ms Audrey EU and Mr KAM Nai-wai expressed grave concern about the environmental and traffic impacts posed by the proposed temporary barging facilities at Tin Wan Praya Road and Lee Nam Road. In order to address the concerns of the parents of the occupants accommodated at JCRC about the potential impact on the centre brought about by the railway, members requested the Administration to explore the proposal made by Designing Hong Kong on the tunnel option. In response, the Administration undertook that it would continue to engage in close dialogue with these parents concerned and the management of JCRC and to refine the design options. The Administration would provide the refined design options when worked out to the parents and management of JCRC for consideration.

8. Mr KAM Nai-wai moved the following motion which was seconded by Mr Andrew CHENG -

"本委員會要求港鐵及政府就南港島線(東段)重新檢討以下設施的選址及走線，包括——

1. 田灣臨時搭建物料躉船轉運站

Action

2. 春坎山臨時爆炸品儲存倉庫
3. 東華三院賽馬會復康中心旁的鐵路走線

本委員會並要求港鐵及政府考慮以全隧道方式興建南港島線，並應就該鐵路的融資安排，包括上蓋物業，盡快諮詢本會及公眾。"

(Translation)

"That this Subcommittee requests the MTRCL and the Government to re-examine the locations of the following facilities and the alignment of the South Island Line (SIL) (East), including -

1. the temporary Barging Point at Tin Wan Praya Road;
2. the temporary magazine at Chung Hom Shan;
3. the rail alignment for the section adjacent to the Tung Wah Group of Hospitals Jockey Club Rehabilitation Complex.

This Subcommittee also requests the MTRCL and the Government to consider adopting a full tunnel option for the construction of SIL (East), and expeditiously consult this Council and the public on the financing arrangements for SIL (East), including the property developments above the rail stations."

9. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Four members voted in favour of the motion, and no members voted against it. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

Admin

10. The Administration was requested to -

- (a) provide refined design options (e.g. moving the proposed viaduct further away from JCRC); and
- (b) provide a written response to the above motion.

**III Kwun Tong Line Extension (KTE)**

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)2582/08-09(04) - Administration's paper on Kwun Tong Line Extension
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2595/08-09(01) - Submission from Estate Owners' Committee of Laguna Verde

Action

- LC Paper No. CB(1)2595/08-09(02) - Submission from Site 10 Whampoa Garden Section Owners Committee
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2582/08-09(05) - Background brief on Kwun Tong Line Extension prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2618/08-09(05) - Submission from Estate Owners' Committee of Laguna Verde
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2618/08-09(06) - Submission from Ms SIU Yuen-sheung, Kowloon City District Councillor)

11. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

12. Dr Priscilla LEUNG and Ms Starry LEE both declared that they each owned a property in Whampoa area.

13. Members in general urged the Administration to provide additional KTE station entrances in the vicinity of public housing estates and in old districts with a relatively large size of aged population. Consideration should also be given to enhancing pedestrian connectivity such as by providing travelators where feasible to facilitate elderly people in gaining access to KTE. In response to some members' concerns about whether a station entrance would be provided at Laguna Verde, the Administration noted such views and would continue to discuss with residents concerned.

**IV Any other business**

Clerk 14. Mr WONG Kwok-hing proposed and members agreed to include the following issues in the list of outstanding items for discussion -

- (a) MTR Tseung Kwan O Line signaling equipment fault incident on 21 August 2009; and
- (b) review of the operations of Kowloon Southern Link after its commissioning.

15. The meeting ended at 5:45 pm.

## Panel on Transport

## Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting  
on Thursday, 17 September 2009, at 2:30 pm  
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000000 – 000559	Chairman Ms Audrey EU Mr LAU Kong-wah	Chairman's opening remarks  Discussion on holding a special meeting at 8.30am on 23 September 2009 to discuss with deputations on Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link.	<b>Clerk to invite deputations</b>
<i>Agenda item I – Further discussion on Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL)</i>			
000600 – 002742	Chairman Administration MTRCL	Briefing on the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(1)2582/08-09(01)) and powerpoint presentation by the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) (LC Paper No. CB(1)2650/08-09 (01)).	
002743 – 003259	Mr WONG Kowk-hing Administration Chairman MTRCL	Mr WONG Kwok-hing's enquiries and concerns on the following -  (a) the measures to fully address the concerns of residents of Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT) and whether there were alternative sites for providing an emergency rescue station and stabling sidings; and  (b) the time gap of about three year between the completion of the Mainland section of XRL (scheduled for 2011-2012) and that of the Hong Kong section which was scheduled for commissioning in 2015.  The Administration's undertaking that it would make sustained efforts to discuss with residents of CYT at further meetings to address their concerns. Additional cost for the project and lesser economic benefits would likely be incurred if its implementation was delayed.	
003300 – 004240	Mr WONG Sing-chi Administration Chairman	Enquiries about the upsurge of project estimate from \$39.5 billion to \$63 billion, and the concrete economic benefits XRL would bring.  The Administration's response that the upsurge of project cost estimate was attributed to construction price escalation since 2006. The project design, however,	<b>Administration to provide confirmed project estimate and economic benefits of XRL in monetary terms.</b>



Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>was still being finalized and a confirmed project estimate would be presented to the LegCo in due course.</p> <p>The Chairman's request and the Administration's agreement to provide confirmed project cost estimate and detailed information on the economic benefits of the Hong Kong section of the XRL.</p>	
004241 – 004809	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming Administration	<p>Enquiries about land resumption required under the project and details of compensation to CYT residents.</p> <p>The Administration's response as follows -</p> <p>(a) would endeavor to look into particular needs and concerns of villagers in order to formulate proposals acceptable to villagers while satisfying the need for prudent use of public resources; and</p> <p>(b) the strata to be resumed would be at least 5 metres from the ground surface, the construction of small houses which did not require piling on the lots concerned would pose no impact on the tunnel of the XRL. MTRCL would also be required to deal with applications on works in the railway protection area promptly.</p>	
004810 – 005539	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration Chairman	Mr Andrew CHENG's tabling of submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)2618/08-09(04)) and request for the Administration's written response to the questions raised in the submission.	<b>Administration to provide written response to the questions.</b>
005540 – 010309	Mr Ronny TONG Administration	<p>Mr Ronny TONG's expression of concern about the reason for the upsurge of project estimate and the cost-effectiveness of the Hong Kong section of the XRL project.</p> <p>The Administration's response that the project design was still being finalized and a confirmed project estimate would be presented to LegCo in due course.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation of the strategic importance of the project.</p>	
010310 – 010855	Mr LAU Kong-wah Administration	<p>Expression of concerns on the XRL fare as it would greatly affect the patronage, the compensations to be offered, and the feasibility of co-location of boundary control facilities.</p> <p>The Administration's response that a taskforce had been set up to study the co-location arrangements for XRL and to initiate discussion with the relevant Mainland</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>authorities when ready.</p> <p>The Administration's initial views on fare arrangements and the special ex-gratia rehousing package proposal.</p>	
010856 – 011641	Ir Dr Raymond HO Administration Chairman	<p>Expression of support for the proposed project and enquiry on the economic benefits of the Hong Kong section of the XRL.</p> <p>The Administration's response on the economic benefits of the Hong Kong section estimated over its 50 years of operation.</p>	
011642 – 012335	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's query about the accuracy of the estimates made in relation to economic benefits of the Hong Kong section of the XRL.</p> <p>The Administration's reiteration of the projected figures.</p>	
012336 – 013401	Mr IP Wai-ming MTRCL Chairman Administration	<p>Mr IP Wai-ming's view/enquiry -</p> <p>(a) the accuracy of the projected patronage, given the availability of alternative means of cross-border transport; and</p> <p>(b) explanation of not considering alternative options for constructing the emergency rescue station (ERS) and stabling sidings (SSS) other than resuming the land at CYT.</p> <p>MTRCL's explanation of the patronage study undertaken which had taken into account the travel preference and economic growth. Additional land would need to be resumed and more households would be affected, if the ERS and SSS were to be provided at alternative sites other than CYT.</p>	<b>Administration to provide documentation detailing the justifications for not pursuing other options in locating the ERS and SSS other than CYT.</b>
013402 – 013956		Suspension of meeting	
013957 – 014954	Ms Audrey EU Chairman Mr IP Wai-ming Mr Andrew CHENG Administration	<p>Expression of concerns about the compensation to be offered to CYT residents and the proposed alignment.</p> <p>The Administration's response that other alignment options had been evaluated and were found infeasible.</p>	
014955 – 015249	Mr Ronny TONG Administration Chairman	<p>Discussion on the strategic importance of XRL as it would also promote tourism and benefit significantly the Hong Kong economy.</p> <p>The Chairman's conclusion that the Administration should provide detailed updated information on the</p>	<b>Administration to provide documentation detailing the economic benefits expected to be</b>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		economic benefits expected to be brought about by the XRL (Hong Kong section).	<b>brought about by the XRL.</b>
<i>Agenda item II – Further discussion on South Island Line (SIL) (East)</i>			
015250 – 015338	Chairman	Opening remarks	
015339 – 020423	Administration MTRCL	Briefing of the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(1)2582/08-09(03)) and powerpoint presentation by MTRCL (LC Paper No. CB(1)2650/08-09 (02)).	
020424 – 021321	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration Chairman	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's tabling of submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)2618/08-09(07)) and enquiries on the following -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the possibility of building the railway entirely underground;</li> <li>(b) concrete measures to address the needs of occupants of the Tung Wah Group of Hospitals Jockey Club Rehabilitation Complex (JCRC);</li> <li>(c) the impacts to residents in the vicinity of the proposed magazine at Chung Hom Shan; and</li> <li>(d) the impacts to residents close to the proposed temporary barging point at Tin Wan Praya Road.</li> </ul> <p>The Administration's response as follows -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the following implications and drawbacks were anticipated if the tunnel option was pursued - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. the depot at Wong Chuk Hang would need to be lowered by about 14 metres, resulting in additional excavation with road traffic affected and works completion delayed;</li> <li>ii. about two-thirds of the Aberdeen Channel would have to be closed for 3 years, leaving only a 35-metre fairway for marine traffic;</li> <li>iii. clearance of some shipyards on the north shore of the Channel would be required;</li> <li>iv. the high level difference between the station platform and station entrances would mean greater inconvenience to passengers;</li> <li>v. part of the land inside the Hong Kong Police College would be required and the Tactical Training Complex Building would need to be demolished;</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) preliminary study revealed that the operation of the railway would not affect the equipment at JCRC, and it was also feasible to make available noise enclosures to the viaduct;</p> <p>(c) detailed study was being carried out to assess if the viaduct could be further lowered and moved further away from the JCRC;</p> <p>(d) the proposed Chung Hom Shan magazine was more than 300 meters from the nearest residential area and was considered most appropriate amongst the options explored; and</p> <p>(e) two barging points instead of one were considered necessary and more effective in relieving the reliance and pressure on road traffic.</p>	
021322 – 022152	Prof Patrick LAU Administration Chairman	<p>Prof Patrick LAU's enquiry of the feasibility of sea transportation of explosives and his concern that storage of explosives at Chung Hom Shan would entail a long length of delivery route by road-based transport means.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation that the proposed Chung Hom Shan site was considered the most suitable location. As a suitable pier for loading of explosives, which had to be far away from residential areas, could not be identified in the Southern District, sea transportation of explosives would not be considered. The Administration also explained the stringent safety measures imposed on licensed vehicles used for the transportation of explosives.</p>	
022153 – 023257	Ms Audrey EU Administration MTRCL Chairman	<p>Ms Audrey EU's views/enquiries -</p> <p>(a) the number of trucks passing through Wong Chuk Hang and Nam Fung Road was estimated to be 800 per day and the traffic impact thus generated would be unacceptable;</p> <p>(b) the possibility of moving the viaduct away from the JCRC by situating it further down to the Wong Chuk Hang nullah; and</p> <p>(c) whether the Administration/MTRCL would further explore with Designing Hong Kong its proposal to build the alignment underground.</p> <p>The Administration's response that the traffic impact assessment study conducted revealed that the traffic impact was within acceptable levels.</p>	<p><b>Administration to provide refined design options in relation to the viaduct option.</b></p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) clearance of trees would have to be carried out at slope adjacent to the JCRC to widen the nullah if the viaduct was to situate on the nullah; and</p> <p>(b) lowering and moving the viaduct further away from the JCRC were being explored.</p> <p>The Administration's undertaking that it would refine design options and provide them to the JCRC representatives for consideration at their next meeting on 8 October 2009.</p>	
023258 – 023855	Mr Ronny TONG Administration Chairman	<p>Mr Ronny TONG's enquiry and the Administration's response that no space was reserved at the slope near the JCRC for construction of the SIL (West).</p> <p>The Administration's response that it would explain the drawbacks of the tunnel option to Designing Hong Kong.</p>	
023856 – 025403	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration Dr PAN Pey-chyou Chairman	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's concern about the future use of the space at the top of the Wong Chuk Hang station and his view that future developments there should not pose a walled effect.</p> <p>Dr PAN Pey-chyou's expression of concerns about the environmental impact posed by the proposed viaduct option.</p>	
025404 – 025509	Chairman	Voting on a motion moved by Mr KAM Nai-wai	<b>Administration to provide a written response to the motion.</b>
<b><i>Agenda item III – Kwun Tong Line Extension (KTE)</i></b>			
025510 – 025633	Chairman Administration	Opening remarks	
025634 – 030209	Dr LEUNG Mei-fun Administration Chairman	<p>Dr LEUNG Mei-fun's views/enquiries -</p> <p>(a) the need for expeditious implementation of KTE;</p> <p>(b) if station entrances would be provided for residents of Laguna Verde;</p> <p>(c) if travelators would be made available to facilitate residents of Ho Man Tin in using KTE; and</p> <p>(d) if glass hording would be erected to minimize</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		noise impact posed to shops during construction period.	
030210 – 031103	Ms Starry LEE Administration Chairman	<p>Ms Starry LEE's views/enquiries -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) declaration of interests;</li> <li>(b) conveyance of the public's wish to expedite works of KTE;</li> <li>(c) if station entrances would be provided near to Laguna Verde;</li> <li>(d) if the subway at the junction of Hung Hom Road and Tai Wan Road would be connected to the Hung Hom district;</li> <li>(e) if a station entrance would be made available at Fat Kwong Street; and</li> <li>(f) if an additional station would be planned for extension from the Ho Man Tin Station in the future.</li> </ul> <p>The Administration's reiteration that, after the gazettal of the project, issues on station entrances and pedestrian connectivity would be further explored and discussed.</p>	
031104 – 031122	Dr LEUNG Mei-fun Chairman	Dr LEUNG Mei-fun's declaration of interests.	
<b><i>Agenda item IV – Any other business</i></b>			
031123 – 031327	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Chairman	Items proposed by Mr WONG Kwok-hing for inclusion in the "List of outstanding items for discussion".	<b>Clerk to include discussion items in the "List of outstanding items for discussion".</b>