

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)927/09-10
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of special meeting on Wednesday, 23 September 2009, at 8:30 am in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

Members present : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon WONG Sing-chi
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Member attending : Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

**nPublic Officers
attending**

: Agenda item I

Mr YAU Shing-mu
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Philip YUNG
Deputy Secretary for Transport & Housing
(Transport) 1

Mr WAN Man-lung
Acting Director of Highways
Highways Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

: MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Malcolm GIBSON
Head of Project Engineering

Miss Maggie SO
Senior Manager - Projects and Property
Communications

Green Sense

Miss HO Ka-po
Project Manager

Wonderland Villas Focus Group

Ms LAW Yi
Convenor

Justice and Peace Commission of the HK Catholic
Diocese

Miss YIP Po-lam
Project Officer

Oxfam Hong Kong

Mr Joseph WOO Man-lung
Manager for HK Program

GAIA Association

Miss WONG Ka-ling
Committee member

Individual

Ms CHAN Hoi-shan

Slow Development HK

Miss Wincy SO Wing-sze
Member

Hong Kong Critical Geography Group

Mr LAU Yuen-keung

HK Sustainable Agriculture Association

Ms CHENG Shwke-ching
Consultant

St. James' Settlement Community Oriented
Mutual Economy Project

Ms LUK Yin-yung
Member

Mr MA Suen-cheung
Member

Individual

Ms WONG Kam-fook

Individual

Mr KWONG Chun-yu
Yuen Long District Councillor

Choi Yuen Village Support Group

Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Representative

Individual

Mr FUNG Yue-liang

Concern Group of Choi Yuen Tsuen in Shek Kong
on the Selection of Site for the Guangzhou –
Shenzhen – Hong Kong Express Rail Link

Ms KO Chun-heung
Chairman

Individual

Ms CHAN Kam-har

Individual

Ms FUNG Yu-tak

Individual

Mr YIP Ka-yuen

CSSA-Alliance

Miss TSE Yuk-man
Organizer

Community Development Alliance

Mr CHENG Yiu-tung
External Vice-President

Fans of Star Ferry Pier

Mr Julian FUNG
Committee

Ms LO Shuet-ying
Committee

Action Committee Against the
Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express
Rail Link

Mr TSE Kwun-tung
Founder

A Generation

Ms LEUNG Wai-man
Member

Greeners Action

Ms KWOK Ying-ying
Project Officer

Ms YIP Chui-man
Project Officer

Individual

Dr LEUNG Kai-chi

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Sarah YUEN
Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Mr Ken WOO
Council Secretary (1)2

Miss Winnie CHENG
Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

- I Further discussion on Hong Kong Section of
Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL)**
(LC Paper No. CB(1)2582/08-09(01) — Administration's paper on
Hong Kong Section of
Guangzhou-Shenzhen-

- Hong Kong Express Rail Link
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2656/08-09(01) — Administration's paper on The Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link Emergency Rescue Station and Stabling Sidings
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2582/08-09(02) — Background brief on Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (Hong Kong Section) prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2586/08-09 — Minutes of Subcommittee meeting on 14 May 2009
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2659/08-09(01) — "Choi Yuen Tsuen Newsletter" published by the Highways Department (Issue 1)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2659/08-09(02) — "Choi Yuen Tsuen Newsletter" published by the Highways Department (Issue 2)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2659/08-09(03) — "Choi Yuen Tsuen Newsletter" published by the Highways Department (Issue 3)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2659/08-09(04) — "Choi Yuen Tsuen Newsletter" published by the Highways Department (Issue 4)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2659/08-09(05) — "Choi Yuen Tsuen Newsletter" published by the Highways Department (Issue 5)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2651/08-09(01) — Powerpoint presentation material provided by MTR Corporation Limited on "Further discussion on Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link"

Action

- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(01) — Submission from Wonderland Villas Focus Group
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(02) — Submission from GAIA Association
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(03) — Submission from Slow Development HK
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(04) — Submission from HK Sustainable Agriculture Association
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(05) — Submission from Ms CHAN Hoi-shan
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(06) — Submission from Ms FUNG Yu-tak
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(07) — Submission from Mr FUNG Yu-liang
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(08) — Submission from Concern Group of Choi Yuen Tsuen in Shek Kong on the Selection of Site for the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(09) — Submission from Fans of Star Ferry Pier
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(10) — Submission from Action Committee Against Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(11) — Submission from A Generation
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(12) — Submission from Plentihope Corporation Limited
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(13) — Submission from Hong Kong General Chamber of Commerce
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(14) — Submission from St. James' Settlement Community Oriented Mutual Economy Project
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(15) — Submission from Mr YIP Ka-yuen)

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Action

2. The Subcommittee received views from 26 deputations on the Hong Kong section of XRL project.

3. Mr Albert CHAN moved the following motion which was seconded by Mr Ronny TONG -

"基於廣深港高速鐵路在財政、環境、規劃及諮詢程序方面仍有不少問題仍未解決，本會要求政府應重新考慮廣深港高速鐵路的可行性，並進行全面的重新研究及諮詢。"

(Translation)

"That, as a number of problems relating to the financing, environment, planning and consultation process in connection with the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) remain unresolved, this Subcommittee requests the Government to reconsider the feasibility of the XRL and carry out comprehensive and fresh study and consultation."

4. The Chairman put the motion to vote. The Chairman declared that six members voted for and two members voted against the motion. Three members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was passed.

Admin

5. To facilitate further deliberation on the project at a future meeting, the Administration was requested to provide -

- (a) detailed justifications for not pursuing alternative locations for the XRL Hong Kong terminus, e.g. Kam Sheung Road, as proposed by some members of the community;
- (b) detailed information on the XRL patronage forecast as well as the latest planning data and developments on the basis of which the forecast had been made;
- (c) information on any social impact assessment conducted by the Administration for the project;
- (d) response to the alternative option proposed by some residents of Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT) of resumption of the military land in the existing Shek Kong Barracks currently used by the Hong Kong Garrison of the People's Liberation Army for setting up an emergency rescue station and stabling sidings;
- (e) information on the operating and maintenance cost estimate for

Action

the Hong Kong section of the XRL; and

- (f) written response to the above motion passed by the Subcommittee.

(Post-meeting note: the Subcommittee subsequently scheduled a meeting for 22 October 2009 at 8:30 am to further discuss the Hong Kong section of the XRL. Legislative Council Briefs addressing various issues related to the Hong Kong section of the XRL project were issued by the Administration on 21 October 2009.)

II Any other business

- 6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:40 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
20 January 2010

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Wednesday, 23 September 2009, at 8:30 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Further discussion on Hong Kong Section of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL)</i>			
000000 – 000839	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000840 – 001150	Miss HO Ka-po, Green Sense	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2638/08-09(01). The reliability of the existing Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) mechanism was questioned.	
001151 – 001507	Ms LAW Yi, Wonderland Villas Focus Group	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(01) - (a) the Wonderland Villas, accommodating 1,002 families, had not been informed and consulted on the alignment of the Hong Kong section of the XRL prior to the gazettal of the project; and (b) concern about the impact of blasting works on the building structure.	
001508 – 001732	Dr LEUNG Kai-chi	Presentation of views on the feasibility of the alternative options on locations of the emergency rescue station (ERS) and stabling sidings (SSS).	
001733 – 002047	Mr Joseph WOO Man-lung, Oxfam Hong Kong	Expression of views - (a) economic development should not be pursued at the expense of sustainable development of society; and (b) there was a need for more detailed EIA and social impact assessment studies, along with extensive public consultation.	
002048 – 002354	Miss WONG Ka-ling, GAIA Association	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(02) - (a) objection to the XRL project; and	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) expression of concern about the adverse impacts of the proposed express link on the environment and ecology.	
002355 – 002552	Ms CHAN Hoi-shan	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(05).	
002553 – 002907	Miss Wincy SO Wing-sze, Slow Development HK	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(03) - (a) expression of doubt about the economic benefits that the XRL would bring about; and (b) there was a need for conducting more stringent EIA and social impact assessment studies.	
002908 – 003152	Mr LAU Yuen-keung, Hong Kong Critical Geography Group	Criticism on the hasty gazettal of the project without adequate consultation.	
003153 – 003512	Ms CHENG Shwke-ching, HK Sustainable Agriculture Association	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(04) - (a) the reliability of the project estimate was questioned; and (b) opposition to the project as it would bring no improvement to people's livelihood, and would adversely affect the economy in the long-run.	
003513 – 003824	Ms LUK Yin-yung, St. James' Settlement Community Oriented Mutual Economy Project	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(14) that the economic benefits of XRL were doubtful and there was a need to enhance the transparency of the project.	
003825 – 004150	Ms WONG Kam-fook	Expression of worries about the difficulty of adaptation to new environment after removal from Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT).	
004151 – 004551	Mr KWONG Chun-yu, Yuen Long District Councillor	Condemnation of the Administration's high-handed approach in handling CYT and its failure to consult the Yuen Long District Council on the Hong Kong section of the XRL project.	
004552 – 004820	Mr FUNG Yue-liang	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(07).	
004821 – 005134	Ms CHAN Kam-har	Elaboration of villagers' sense of attachment to CYT.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
005135 – 005443	Ms FUNG Yu-tak	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(06).	
005444 – 005804	Mr YIP Ka-yuen	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(15).	
005805 – 010800	Mr CHU Hoi-dick, Choi Yuen Village Support Group Ms KO Chun-heung, Concern Group of Choi Yuen Tsuen in Shek Kong on the Selection of Site for the Guangzhou – Shenzhen – Hong Kong Express Rail Link	Presentation of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(08) - (a) clarification that no consensus had been reached between the Administration and CYT residents over the land resumption and compensation issues; and (b) criticism of the Administration's lack of compassion for CYT residents.	
010801 – 011115	Miss TSE Yuk-man, CSSA-Alliance	Presentation of views that the huge investment in the Hong Kong section of the XRL could be better spent on domestic projects that directly improve the livelihood of the public.	
011116 – 011443	Mr CHENG Yiu-tung, Community Development Alliance	Expression of views and urging the Administration to be more compassionate with CYT villagers.	
011444 – 011857	Mr Julian FUNG, Ms LO Shuet-ying, Fans of Star Ferry Pier	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(09) that there was a need for the inclusion of assessment on radiation and electromagnetic waves in EIA studies.	
011858 – 012239	Mr TSE Kwun-tung, Action Committee Against the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(10) and proposing that the terminus of XRL should be at Lok Ma Chau to reduce investment cost and better utilize the existing railway network.	
012240 – 012611	Ms LEUNG Wai-man, A Generation	Expression of views as set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)2652/08-09(11).	
012612 – 012929	Ms KWOK Ying-ying, Greeners Action	Expression of concerns about the impact of the Hong Kong section of the XRL proposal on the sustainable development and the society.	
012930 – 013256	Miss YIP Po-lam, Justice and Peace Commission of the HK Catholic Diocese	Expression of concern over the reliability of the projected patronage for XRL in view of the rising trend in the use of through buses for cross-boundary transport. In fact, most travelers between Shenzhen and Hong Kong might find the fare of XRL	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		unaffordable.	
013257 – 013635	Administration	<p>Administration's response to views of the deputations -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Hong Kong section of the XRL project was generally supported by the community; (b) the requests for better communication and preserving the environment and agricultural activities were noted; and (c) concerns and worries of CYT villagers affected by the clearance were noted and proposals were being actively explored to assist eligible villagers to make their own choices for establishing new life according to their needs. 	
013636 – 014602	MTRCL Chairman	Powerpoint presentation by MTRCL (LC Paper No. CB(1)2651/08-09 (01)).	
014603 – 015148	Ms Audrey EU Administration MTRCL Chairman	<p>Ms Audrey EU's expression of concerns about the high construction cost and the feasibility of alternative options for location of the Hong Kong terminus.</p> <p>The Administration/MTRCL's response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) considerations had been given to identifying a venue for the terminus in the urban area which was convenient to travelers; (b) larger scale of land resumption and more people would be affected if the terminus was in the New Territories; (c) termini of all high-speed railway lines should be located in the centre of population and employment; and (d) the terminus options of Lok Ma Chau and Kam Sheung Road were considered infeasible as the former would affect the Mai Po Marshes while the latter would entail even greater land resumption. 	
015149 – 015738	Mr Ronny TONG Administration MTRCL Chairman	<p>Mr Ronny TONG's enquiries on the Administration's projection on patronage for 2016.</p> <p>The Administration/MTRCL's explanation of the basis of the patronage forecast and agreement to provide more detailed information and data.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015739 – 015937	Chairman Mr Albert CHAN Mr Andrew CHENG	Voting on a motion moved by Mr Albert CHAN and seconded by Mr Ronny TONG.	
015938 – 020425	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's views that the Administration should explore the possibility of relocation of the Shek Kong Barracks to make way for the relevant railway emergency facilities and the new option proposed for locating the terminus at Kam Sheung Road.</p> <p>The Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the Hong Kong Garrison of the People's Liberation Army (the Garrison) currently had no plan to relinquish any part of the Barracks site for non-defense use; and</p> <p>(b) patronage of the West Rail had increased with the commissioning of the Kowloon Southern Link.</p>	
020426 – 020835	Mr KAM Nai-wai Chairman Administration	Mr KAM Nai-wai's requests for provision of additional information and the Administration's explanation that communication with the Garrison was made through the Security Bureau.	
020836 – 021436	Mr WONG Sing-chi Miss YIP Po-lam Administration Chairman	<p>Mr WONG Sing-chi's expression of concern on the possible deficit operation of the XRL and over-projection of patronage of the XRL. The Administration's response that the project estimate was still being finalized and further information would be provided.</p> <p>The Chairman's request for the Administration to follow up members' concerns and provide the requisite information.</p>	The Administration to follow up members' requests and provide the requisite information. (para. 4 of minutes)