

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)943/08-09
(These minutes have been by the
Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/08

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting
held on Tuesday, 13 January 2009, at 11:00 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon LEE Wing-tat (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Hon Tanya CHAN
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun
- Members absent** : Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Sing-chi
Dr Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

- Public Officers attending** : Home Affairs Bureau
- Mrs Carrie YAU, JP
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs
- Miss Cathy CHU, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District)
- Mr Danny LAU
Principal Assistant Secretary (West Kowloon Cultural District)
- Mr Augustine NG
Project Director (West Kowloon Cultural District Authority)
- Clerk in attendance** : Ms Betty FONG
Chief Council Secretary (2)2
- Staff in attendance** : Ms Janet SHUM
Senior Council Secretary (2)2
- Ms Anna CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2)2

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes

[LC Paper No. CB(2)611/08-09]

The minutes of the meeting held on 19 December 2008 were confirmed.

2. The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

II. Meeting with the Administration

(11:05 am - 12:55 pm)

LC Paper No. -- Paper provided by the Administration
CB(2)612/08-09(01)

LC Paper No. -- Membership list of the Board of the West
CB(2)634/08-09(01) Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCD) and profiles of the 15 Non-Public Officer

Action

Members of WKCDA provided by the Administration

- LC Paper No. CB(2)612/08-09(02) -- Summary of views and suggestions made in the Phase III Study Report of the Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development for future monitoring of the project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(2)612/08-09(03) -- Summary of the Administration's response/undertakings to issues relating to the West Kowloon Cultural District Development prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- LC Paper No. FS19/08-09 -- Summary of local press reports on the West Kowloon Cultural District project from 14 November 2008 to 9 January 2009 prepared by Research and Library Services Division of the Legislative Council Secretariat

Public Accountability

3. Mr Alan LEONG asked how the Administration would ensure the accountability of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA) to the Legislative Council (LegCo). Mr James TO also held the view that representatives of WKCDA should attend meetings of the Joint Subcommittee to respond to members' questions. Ms Emily LAU questioned the Administration's sincerity in collaborating with LegCo in taking forward the project.

4. Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs (PSHA) acknowledged the importance of maintaining a good working relationship and close communication with LegCo, and undertook to convey members' views to WKCDA.

Appointment to WKCDA

5. Mr Alan LEONG enquired about the selection criteria of the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) and how the public could monitor the selection process. PSHA responded that the selection criteria would be worked out pending the recommendations of the consultancy study on the organizational structure of WKCDA to be completed by the second quarter of 2009. The CEO would be selected through global recruitment in an open and transparent manner. In response to Ms Emily LAU, PSHA said that the Executive Director was a transitional post to be filled through open recruitment to be responsible for overseeing the day-to-day operation of WKCDA before the Authority was fully established. Having regard to the responsibilities of the post, applicants were expected to be earning a salary of HK\$1.5 million per annum.

Action

Project implementation

6. Mr CHEUNG Man Kwong said that the timeframe for the completion of the Phase I facilities in 2014-2015 was too long. He expressed concern about a further delay of the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project due to complications and arguments which might arise during the planning stage. Ms Emily LAU said that for the smooth and expeditious implementation of the WKCD project, the Administration should adopt a more accommodating attitude towards different views and demonstrate the ability to find a consensus among diverse opinions. The Chairman shared members' concern on the slow progress of the project.

7. PSHA said that in the implementation of the WKCD project, the Administration was fully aware of the need to expedite the project and engage the public extensively in the process, a common goal shared by the public and LegCo members. In order to allow ample time for wide public consultation, however, the planning of the project would be carried out in three key stages before the commencement of the statutory procedures for the Development Plan. PSHA agreed that close collaboration with LegCo and a mutually accommodating attitude should facilitate the early implementation of the project.

Public engagement

8. Mr Alan LEONG said that the ownership of the WKCD project belonged to the Hong Kong people and their views should be gauged at an early stage of the planning process. The public engagement process should adopt bottom-up and community-driven approaches, and opportunities should be provided as soon as possible for the public to express their views in a non-prescriptive manner. Mr LEONG urged the Administration to put in place the statutory Consultation Panel as soon as possible.

9. Ms Cyd HO considered that the public engagement exercise should aim to garner public views on broader cultural issues, rather than confining to discussion on the Development Plan, and funding should be earmarked for the Consultation Panel to organize research and interactive community discussions. Mrs Sophie LEUNG said that more focus groups should be organized at all levels of the community to solicit public views.

10. PSHA said that the Administration attached great importance to public engagement, and hence section 20 of the WKCDA Ordinance (the Ordinance) had exceptionally provided for the establishment of a Consultation Panel to gather public views on matters relevant to the functions of the Authority. The scope of public consultation should be broad and inclusive. The first stage of the public engagement exercise for the preparation of the Development Plan scheduled tentatively for the second quarter of 2009 would provide an open platform for the community to express their aspirations and expectations on the WKCD project. WKCDA was in the processing of establishing the Consultation Panel, which was scheduled to be established in the first quarter of 2009.

Action

11. Mr Paul TSE said that for WKCD to become a must-visit appeal to tourists, WKCDA should examine the components for WKCD to become a tourist attraction and invite frontline representatives from the tourism sector to participate in meetings convened by WKCDA. In response, PSHA advised that : (a) the future Consultation Panel would help collecting views from relevant sectors, including frontline representatives of the tourism industry; (b) the operation of WKCDA would not be official-led as it was an independent statutory body; and (c) the WKCD Office set up under the Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) would cease to operate in June 2010 when the organizational structure of WKCDA was expected to be fully established.

12. Dr LAM Tai-fai considered that WKCDA should consult the public at large in order to obtain a better understanding of the interest of the grass root level. To enhance WKCD's appeal to tourists, its cultural activities should emphasize not only on Western high arts, but also Chinese traditional and Hong Kong popular arts. PSHA responded that members of the WKCDA Board, which comprised District Council members and representatives of the cultural sectors, should be able to reflect the views of the arts community and the public at large. Moreover, public views from a wide spectrum of the society would be gauged in the public engagement exercise.

Cultural policy and software development

13. Mr LEE Wing-tat suggested that the Administration should give more attention and encouragement to the budding artists of the Jockey Club Creative Arts Centre (JCCAC) in Shek Kip Mei who were aggrieved by the poor management of the factory building, as well as those renting the Fotan Artists Open Studios. He also considered that the Administration should promote the display of artworks in public areas and make reference to overseas experience in resolving technical problems involved, such as insurance and security issues. Mr Paul TSE added that the Administration should refrain from adopting a bureaucratic approach in dealing with artists and arts groups.

14. In response, PSHA said that: (a) the Administration was aware of the situation at JCCAC and had encouraged the artists and the management committee concerned to improve their communication; (b) it had solicited support from the Jockey Club service centres to publicize the work of JCCAC; (c) the Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC) would be operating a Venue Subsidy Scheme with funding from the HK Jockey Club Charities Trust to support small and medium-sized arts groups and budding artists in their use of the JCCAC blackbox theatre; and (d) the development of cultural software and humanware would proceed in parallel with the development of cultural hardware in WKCD.

15. Pointing out that WKCD was a cultural rather than an economic investment, Ms Cyd HO said that complementary measures, such as development of local culture and strengthening of arts education, should be put in place to underpin the project. Mrs Sophie LEUNG said that the vitality of a city hinged on the breadth and depth of its cultural contents and, apart from elite arts, the Administration should enhance its efforts in the promotion of popular arts.

Action

16. PSHA highlighted the Administration's efforts in promoting community/popular arts, including media coverage of the folk art displays at the Hong Kong Heritage Museum in Shatin and submission to the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation to inscribe Cantonese Opera onto the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity. She added that the Administration would take into account public views in the constant review of its cultural policy with a view to promoting arts and cultural activities of all realms, including traditional and avant-garde arts, as well as elite and popular arts.

17. The Chairman said that whether the WKCD project would be able to enhance the cultural standard and the cultural ambience of the community would hinge on the timely implementation of a comprehensive strategy for developing cultural software and humanware. He asked how HAB and the Education Bureau (EDB) would work towards that direction.

18. PSHA said that WKCD would serve as a platform for international cultural exchange and co-operation, and various activities had been/would be organized for such a purpose. These activities included overseas exposure of local flagship arts groups at renowned performance venues; convening of the 10th Greater Pearl River Delta (GPRD) Cultural Cooperation Meeting in February 2009; and organization of the Asia Cultural Co-operation Forum in October 2009. To enhance closer partnership between schools and artists, the first arts education fair, the Art Mart, co-organized by HAB, EDB and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) was held in January 2009. This apart, the Administration would continue to provide support for the development of the arts through established mechanisms such as various grant schemes administered by HKADC and the Venue-Partnership Scheme operated by LCSD.

19. Mr Timothy FOK stressed the need for the Administration to strengthen regional based cultural exchange programmes, such as by enhancing the co-operation between Hong Kong and the Guangdong Province in the field of Cantonese Opera. PSHA responded that the GPRD Cultural Cooperation Meeting co-organized by Guangdong, Hong Kong and Macau would serve such a purpose. She agreed to reflect Ms Emily LAU's suggestion for bring in Taiwan at future cultural forums organized in Hong Kong.

Financial arrangements

20. Mr Paul TSE considered that WKCDA should be prudent in managing the upfront endowment approved by LegCo and adhere to the principle of value for money in its expenditure. Mr Alan LEONG said that there should be a mechanism to enable LegCo's timely monitoring of the financial position of the WKCD project. PSHA said that she would convey members' view to WKCDA for consideration.

Action

Development of WKCD

21. Dr Priscilla LEUNG said that WKCD should comprise a cultural mix where community arts/local culture would mingle with international culture. In addition, more open space should be dedicated to artistic creation and expression in WKCD, and WKCD should be connected to its neighbouring areas through tree-lined pedestrian pathways for easy access by the general public. PSHA agreed to convey these views to the Project and Conceptual Plan Consultants of the Development Plan to be commissioned by WKCDA.

22. Prof Patrick LAU asked about the mechanism and criteria for the selection of the three Conceptual Plan Consultants and the Project Consultant for the preparation of the Development Plan. He suggested that WKCDA should engage consultants who had expressed interest in including graphic designs for the project in their submissions.

23. Project Director (West Kowloon Cultural District Authority) (PD(WKCDA)) said that WKCDA had launched the consultants selection process to invite expression of interest (EOI) for the Project and Conceptual Plan consultancies, largely following the government practice. Seven and 33 EOIs had been received respectively. Based on their experience and expertise, a number of consultants would be shortlisted for invitation to submit technical and fee proposals.

24. In response to Mr LEE Wing-tat's enquiry about public participation in the selection of the conceptual plan, PD(WKCDA) said that in stage two of the planning process, three Conceptual Plan Options for WKCD would be formulated by three different Consultants to be commissioned by WKCDA. Members of the public would be invited to give views on these Options.

25. Ms Cyd HO suggested that the Administration should consider making use of the WKCD as a temporary venue for organizing community activities. This could help to promote WKCD as a venue for all and enhance the community's sense of ownership for the project. She added that the development of WKCD should synchronize with the cultural activities of the community at large, and space should be allowed for its organic growth.

26. PSHA said that the WKCD site had been used for organizing various community activities and agreed to further explore its usage with a view to promoting public interest and participation in the project. She also acknowledged the importance of public wisdom and inputs in the formulation of the Development Plan for WKCD.

Planning of M+/Interim M+

27. Prof Patrick LAU and Mr LEE Wing-tat enquired about the progress in the setting up of interim M+ for display of works of Hong Kong visual artists.

28. Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District) (DSHA(WKCD)) said that the mode of operation of the interim M+ should tie in with the future M+. Pending WKCDA's deliberation on how M+ should be developed as a

Action

new and forward-looking cultural institution with museum functions, a timetable for the implementation of interim M+ would be worked out. PSHA added that apart from the proposed site in North Point, HAB would explore other possible sites. In view of the rising demand for visual arts, HAB would study the feasibility of providing more public space for the display of the works of visual artists.

29. Mrs Regina IP said that she objected to the implementation of the WKCD project despite the fact the project had been approved by LegCo. She considered that the components of the project were unpopular with the community at large, and it would be a "white elephant" adding burden rather than bringing economic benefits to the community. Mrs IP also considered M+ an over-ambitious project and enquired about the detailed development plan of M+ and whether it would be built in phases.

30. PSHA responded that the WKCD project had been taken forward based on the consensus reached after lengthy discussions and public consultation. It was envisaged that WKCD would serve as a cultural platform for the local community and would draw visitors from the Pearl River Delta and its surrounding areas. To ensure that the cultural contents of the project would be of substantial quality, the Administration had strengthened the development of cultural software and humanware. DSHA(WKCD) said that M+ as a museum focusing on 20th to 21st century visual culture would be a novel concept, and its future operation mode would have to be worked out by the Museum Committee of WKCD. Apart from acquisition of collections, M+ would seek cooperation with museums in the Mainland and overseas in the exhibition of collections.

Follow up actions

31. The Chairman requested the Administration to provide in writing the following information -

- (a) the Administration's responses to the recommendations in the Phase III Study Report of the former Subcommittee on WKCD as summarized in the LC Paper No. CB(2)612/08-09(02);
- (b) mechanism for timely monitoring of the financial position of the WKCD project; and
- (c) conduct of public engagement exercise for the WKCD project.

32. Ms Cyd HO considered that in parallel with the Administration's public engagement exercise, the Joint Subcommittee should conduct public hearings on the project. Mr Alan LEONG shared the Chairman's view that written submissions to solicit further views on the WKCD project from the public, in particular deputations who had presented views to the former Subcommittee, should suffice at this stage. The meeting agreed that written submissions should be invited from the public.

Action

III. Date of next meeting

- Admin 33. Members agreed that the next meeting would be scheduled for 27 February 2009.
34. The meeting ended at 12:55 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
26 February 2009

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project
on Tuesday, 13 January 2009, at 11:00 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000001-000439	Chairman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Confirmation of minutes - Opening remarks 	
000440-000759	Ms Emily LAU Chairman	The decision of the Committee on Rules of Procedure on the appointment of more than one Deputy Chairman for the Joint Subcommittee	
000800-001145	Administration Chairman	Briefing on the Administration's paper and development of cultural software to complement the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project	
001146-001702	Ms Emily LAU Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The need for the Administration to expedite the project - Appointment of the Executive Director of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA) - Cultural co-operation 	
001703-002321	Mr Alan LEONG Administration Chairman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accountability of WKCDA to LegCo - Setting up of the Consultation Panel - Public engagement - Appointment of the Chief Executive Officer 	
002322-002829	Mrs Regina IP Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Comment on the WKCD project - Planning of M+/Interim M+ 	
002830-003340	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Administration's support for young artists in cultural villages 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Development of cultural software 	
003341-003922	Mr James TO Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accountability of WKCD to LegCo - Clarification of name change for WKCD 	
003923-004538	Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong Administration Chairman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Cultural contents of WKCD - Time frame for the completion of the phase 1 of the WKCD project 	
004539-005047	Ms Cyd HO Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Development of WKCD as a cultural project - Connectivity between the WKCD and the on-going cultural activities in the local community - Public engagement aiming to garner public views on broader cultural issues 	
005048-005552	Mr Paul TSE Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The need to seek views from frontline representatives of the tourism sector - Development of cultural software - Concern about the WKCD project being official-led 	
005553-010104	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Promotion of local community culture - Green issues - Open space for artistic expression in WKCD 	
010105-010637	Prof Patrick LAU Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Request for the Administration to respond to the recommendations in the Phase III Study Report of the former Subcommittee on WKCD - Planning of Interim M+ - Selection of the three Conceptual Plan Consultants and the Project Consultant 	The Administration to provide a written response

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
010638-011245	Mrs Sophie LEUNG Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Development of popular culture - Role of focus groups in public consultation 	
011246-011541	Dr LAM Tai-fai Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The need to conduct extensive public consultation on the cultural contents of the WKCD project - The need to promote traditional and popular arts 	
011542-012109	Chairman Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Development of cultural software to complement the WKCD project - Timeframe for the completion of phase 1 of the WKCD project 	
012110-012359	Ms Emily LAU Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Importance of seeking consensus among diverse opinions - The Administration's working relationship with LegCo 	
012400-012601	Mr Timothy FOK Administration	The need to strengthen regional based cultural exchange programmes	
012602-013116	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Support to cultural villages - Progress of interim M+ - Display of arts works at public spaces 	
013117-013606	Ms Cyd HO Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Research and interactive community discussions to be organized by the Consultation Panel - Use of the WKCD site for community activities - Organic growth of WKCD 	
013607-013854	Prof Patrick LAU Administration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mechanism and criteria for the selection of the Conceptual Plan consultant and the Project Consultant - Progress of the Interim M+ 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
013855-015211	Mr Alan LEONG Administration Chairman Ms Cyd HO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Time table for the establishment of the Consultation Panel - Views on the approach for conducting public engagement exercise - Mechanism to monitor the financial position of the WKCD project - Issues to be discussed at the next meeting - The need for the Joint Subcommittee to conduct public hearing at this stage 	
015212-015314	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration	Public participation in the selection of the conceptual plan	
015515-015819	Chairman Administration Ms Cyd HO Mr Alan LEONG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Written information to be provided by the Administration - Collection of public views on the WKCD project by the Joint Committee at this stage 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Administration to provide a written response (see paragraph 31 of the minutes) - The Clerk to invite written submissions from the public

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
 26 February 2009