

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1283/08-09
(These minutes have been by the
Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/08

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting
held on Friday, 27 February 2009, at 3:30 pm
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present	: Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP (Chairman) Hon LEE Wing-tat (Deputy Chairman) Hon Albert HO Chun-yan Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP Hon James TO Kun-sun Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan Hon Starry LEE Wai-king Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP Hon CHAN Hak-kan Hon Tanya CHAN Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che Hon WONG Sing-chi Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun Dr Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP
Member attending	: Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

**Members
absent** : Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Public Officers
attending** : Home Affairs Bureau

Mr TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

Miss Cathy CHU, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

Mr Danny LAU
Principal Assistant Secretary
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

Mr Howard LAM
Chief Treasury Accountant
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

Mr Augustine NG
Project Director
(West Kowloon Cultural District Authority)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

The Honourable Ronald Arculli, GBS, JP
Member, Board of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority and Chairman, Development Committee

Dr Allan Zeman, GBS, JP
Member, Board of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority and Chairman, Performing Arts Committee

**Clerk in
attendance** : Ms Betty FONG
Chief Council Secretary (2)2

**Staff in
attendance** : Ms Janet SHUM
Senior Council Secretary (2)2

Ms Anna CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2)2

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes

[LC Paper No. CB(2)943/08-09]

The minutes of the meeting held on 13 January 2009 were confirmed.

2. The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

II. Meeting with the Administration and Board members of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA)

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)944/08-09(01) and (02)]

- (a) Response to the recommendations in the Phase III Study Report of the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development

LC Paper No. CB(2)944/08-09(01) -- Administration's response to the recommendations in the Phase III Study Report of the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development, public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project and mechanism for timely monitoring of the financial position of WKCDA

Relevant papers

LC Paper No. CB(2)612/08-09(02) -- Summary of views and suggestions made in the Phase III Study Report of the Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development for future monitoring of the project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

LC Paper No. CB(2)612/08-09(03) -- Summary of the Administration's response/undertakings to issues relating to the West Kowloon Cultural District Development prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

Action

- (b) Public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project
-

LC Paper No. CB(2)944/08-09(01) -- Administration's response to the recommendations in the Phase III Study Report of the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development, public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project and mechanism for timely monitoring of the financial position of WKCD

LC Paper No. CB(2)944/08-09(02) -- Summary of past deliberations on agenda items II (b) and (c) to be discussed at the meeting of the Joint Subcommittee on 27 February 2009 prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

- (c) Mechanism for timely monitoring of the financial position of WKCD

LC Paper No. CB(2)944/08-09(01) -- Administration's response to the recommendations in the Phase III Study Report of the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development, public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project and mechanism for timely monitoring of the financial position of WKCD

LC Paper No. CB(2)944/08-09(02) -- Summary of past deliberations on agenda items II (b) and (c) to be discussed at the meeting of the Joint Subcommittee on 27 February 2009 prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

Action

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

3. Mrs Sophie LEUNG sought the views of Dr Allan Zeman and Mr Ronald Arculli on the development of the Western Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project. Mrs Regina IP asked about the recruitment plan for staff of the Western Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA). Mr James TO enquired whether the Investment Committee had come up with any plan for the management of the upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion.

4. Dr Allan Zeman said that WKCD was a significant project which should be taken forward in a cautious and systematic manner. As the first and foremost task, WKCDA would need to get the right people in place. It would then proceed with the public engagement (PE) exercise to understand the community's aspirations and expectations. The planning of the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities (CACF) would be made taking into account the public views, relevant overseas experience and advice of the expert consultants. In order for the project to succeed, it would also be essential to strengthen arts education at school.

5. Mr Ronald Arculli said that for the submission of the finalised Development Plan to the Town Planning Board (TPB) in early 2011, WKCDA had to work under a tight timeframe to proceed with work at different levels. This included staff recruitment and selection of consultants for the preparation of the Conceptual Plans and the Development Plan, establishment of the Consultation Panel (CP), and conduct of PE exercise in three stages to garner public views on the three Conceptual Plan Options and the Development Plan before its submission to TPB. Bearing in mind the significance of the WKCD project to Hong Kong, the scale of the project and the vast amount of public resources involved, due consideration would also be given to other relevant issues in the planning process, such as marine and land transportation to WKCD, use of open spaces, connectivity with the neighbouring district, audience building and contents development.

6. The Secretary for Home Affairs (SHA) and Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District) (DSHA(WKCD)) provided the following responses to members' enquiries -

- (a) the consultancy study on the organisational structure of WKCDA would be completed by the second quarter of 2009 and, based on the recommendations of the study, the Authority would work out the manpower requirement and recruitment plan, including the qualifications, selection criteria and remuneration packages for senior staff. Recruitment exercises would be conducted progressively and systematically in an open manner. To take forward the planning process for the project, WKCDA had already commenced the appointment of the relevant consultants and mid-level professional staff; and

Action

- (b) an Investment Committee had been set up to advise the Authority regarding the investment of the upfront endowment allocated to WKCD during the 2008-2009 financial year. The Committee was considering the engagement of a financial consultant for the management of the fund, which was currently placed as fixed deposit in view of the volatility of the current financial market.

Planning of M+/Interim M+

7. Mr CHAN Hak-kan and Mr LEE Wing-tat asked about the progress of the setting up of the Interim M+ and whether the Museum Committee (MC) would consider an alternative site if the proposed site at Oil Street was not feasible. Mr LEE also urged WKCD to expedite the Interim M+ project which would provide the much needed venue for the display of art works kept in the repositories of museums managed by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD), enable the trial run of the M+ concept in a smaller scale and facilitate the promotion of the M+ concept to the public. Mr James TO asked whether there was any plan to display in M+ the collections kept in the repositories of the LCSD museums.

8. In response, SHA and DSHA(WKCD) said that -

- (a) the MC considered that the site at Oil Street was not suitable for the Interim M+ because of the small size of the building at the site and other issues like land contamination issue. MC would continue to explore other locations and launch activities in different areas of Hong Kong to promote the concept of M+;
- (b) the immediate task of MC, which was established to advise WKCD on the strategies on the operation of the museum in WKCD, was to identify a team of curatorial professionals to kick-start the planning of M+. Any concrete plan for the Interim M+ could only be worked out after the appointment of the staff concerned;
- (c) LCSD would expedite the rotation of exhibits and organise more roving exhibitions in public areas to address the issue relating to the display of the collections kept in the repositories; and
- (d) M+ would be a new and forward-looking cultural institution focusing on 20th and 21st century visual culture mainly from a Hong Kong perspective with four initial broad groupings, viz. visual art (including ink art), design, moving image and popular culture. MC would work closely with LCSD to identify suitable collections for display at the future M+. It would also commission art works of local artists which matched the themes of M+.

Action

9. Mr LEE Wing-tat expressed concern about the viability of M+ given its untried concept and the projection that it would account for about 78% of the operating deficit of WKCD. Pointing out that the project represented a substantial increase by 52% of the total space provision of all the existing public museums in Hong Kong and with a total capital cost amounting to \$4.749 billion, Ms Emily LAU questioned whether it was still prudent for the Administration to proceed with the project in one go. She also expressed concern over its huge operating shortfall, its small audience base, and its ability to build up a quality collection at the early stage of its operation. Mrs Regina IP was worried that the huge operating deficit of M+ would not be covered by the rental proceeds of the commercial premises. She further remarked that by focusing on 20th and 21st century visual culture, M+ would restrict the scope of collections and exhibits to be displayed, and hence its appeal to visitors.

10. SHA acknowledged that M+ was a costly project which required careful planning. He added that the inadequate space for display of the collections kept in the repositories of the LCSD museums had reflected the long-standing venue shortage problem for museum facilities. Mr Ronald Arculli said that the viability of a museum should not be measured solely by its economic returns. He pointed out that even the world-renowned museums could not achieve break-even, and the rental proceeds to be generated from the retail/dining/entertainment facilities incorporated in the WKCD project could hopefully cover the operating deficit of M+. As regards the collections for M+, he said that apart from acquisition and donation, it was a common practice for a mega museum like M+ to enrich its exhibits through borrowing or exchange arrangements with its international counterparts.

11. Mr James TO suggested that a dedicated team should be set up to initiate contact with renowned collectors for potential donations. Mr Paul TSE shared similar views and added that the Administration should expedite its work in the retention and preservation of valuable collections and structures in Hong Kong. Mrs Regina IP enquired whether the Administration would consider setting up a permanent museum for the display of the reunification and anniversary gifts from the Mainland. She suggested that these items might be added to the collections of M+. Ms Cyd HO stressed the need for the development of curatorial staff, and highlighted the importance of their professional knowledge and creativity in enhancing the attraction of M+.

12. SHA agreed to convey members' views to MC for consideration. DSHA(WKCD) added that upon the appointment of the relevant curatorial professionals towards the second half of 2009, MC would deliberate issues relating to the building up of the collections for M+ and the formulation of a collection policy in this regard. Mr Ronald Arculli advised that Board members had already initiated contact with potential donors locally and abroad through their personal network.

Action

Performance venues

13. Mrs Regina IP considered that audience building and high quality performances were key factors for the success of a performance venue. She enquired about the estimated seating capacity of the performance venues in WKCD, the development schedule of CACF and measures to be taken by the Administration to realign the existing LCSD cultural venues to complement the WKCD project. She further suggested that WKCDA could make available small-size performance venues for the better appreciation of various types of Xiqu performances. Mr LEE Wing-tat stressed that the development of cultural software was far more urgent and important than the construction of hardware facilities. He considered it essential to review the functions of the existing cultural venues (such as the Hong Kong Cultural Centre and Ko Shan Theatre) and the roles of the Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC) and the Academy for the Performing Arts (APA) in the light of the development of the WKCD project. He further suggested that apart from venue management, LCSD should assume a more proactive role in audience building in the community. Ms Cyd HO highlighted the urgent need for the development of arts administrators and stage management professionals and enquired whether there was any plan to engage such expertise globally.

14. SHA responded that -

- (a) the total seating capacity of the Mega Performance Venue was 15 000 (compared to 12 000 for the Hong Kong Coliseum) and there was a genuine demand for more cultural facilities since no large scale performing arts venue had been constructed for a considerable period of time;
- (b) HKADC and APA, with their respective role in the nurturing of small and medium sized performing arts groups and the training of performing artists/technical professionals, would play an increasingly important role in the development of cultural software in the light of the WKCD project; and
- (c) efforts would be made to strengthen LCSD's role in outreach work to promote arts performance programmes organised at venues under its management.

15. Dr Allan Zeman acknowledged the importance for the provision of high quality stage management and technical support, such as acoustic and lighting effects, for the 15 performing arts venues recommended to be built in WKCD, each of which would have specific requirements. He said that the Performing Arts Committee (PAC) would liaise with the performing arts groups with a view to understanding their particular needs, as well as relevant experts for their technical advice in the planning of these facilities.

Action

Consultation Panel/Public engagement exercise

16. Mr Alan LEONG stressed that the ownership of the WKCD project belonged to the Hong Kong people. To realize the vision of a people-oriented and community-oriented WKCD, it was of paramount importance that the public was fully engaged in the development of the project. To this end, WKCDA should engage the public with sincerity and humility instead of paying lip-service to the process or taking it as merely window dressing. Mr CHAN Hak-kan enquired about the rationale for shortlisting three conceptual plans instead of one at stage two of the PE exercise.

17. Ms Cyd HO suggested that: (a) stage one of the PE exercise should be extended to allow more extensive and in-depth discussions on the community's aspirations and expectations on WKCD, while stage two could be shortened as public views should have been reflected in the three conceptual plans; (b) public consultation should be carried out through a series of workshops, particularly during stage one, and the consultant to be engaged for the PE exercise should discuss with the arts and cultural sector on how these workshops should be conducted; (c) the public should have access to the audio/video records of the PE process through the website; and (d) the methodology used for gauging public views should be made transparent and the results of the PE exercise should be summed up in a comprehensive manner for future monitoring by members of the public.

18. SHA and DSHA(WKCD) responded that -

- (a) the formulation of three conceptual plans instead of one should provide the public with more options in considering the development of WKCD;
- (b) WKCDA would adopt an open attitude regarding the timeframe for the respective stages of the PE exercise while bearing in mind the need to expedite the project and provide job opportunities through its implementation;
- (c) public views would be gauged through a series of thematic workshops, the proceedings of which would be properly recorded;
- (d) CP would help the planning of the PE exercise in preparing the Development Plan and ensure that the consultation was conducted in an open and transparent manner; and
- (e) arrangement would be made to explain to the public as to how the three conceptual plans had incorporated their visions and aspirations on the WKCD project.

Action

19. Dr Allan Zeman considered that WKCD would need to gather all relevant information prior to the planning of the project, and saw no reason why the first stage consultation could not be extended if the proposed period was considered inadequate. Mr Ronald Arculli said that he as the Chairman of the Development Committee (DC), and Dr Zeman and Mr Victor LO respectively as the Chairmen of PAC and MC had volunteered to join CP as they considered it essential for the WKCD Board to collaborate closely with CP.

20. Mr Alan LEONG noted that WKCD had established CP as prescribed under section 20(1) of the WKCD Ordinance (Cap.601). He expressed concern as to whether CP would open all its meetings to the public in accordance with section 20(8). According to his interpretation, the legislation had provided for CP to hold at least one open meeting each year, and if more than one CP meetings were held, all such meetings should also be open to the public.

21. Referring to an earlier public announcement in which the Chairman of WKCD stated that CP would be responsible for the planning and reviewing of the implementation of the PE exercise and collating public views to facilitate the WKCD Board in devising the Development Plan proposals, Mr LEONG expressed concern as to whether the functions of CP as perceived by the Chairman reconciled entirely with section 20(1), which stipulated that CP was set up to gauge public views on matters relevant to the functions of the Authority. Mr LEONG considered that CP was intended to assume a more direct role in soliciting public views in a non-prescriptive manner, rather than just acting as an advisor and coordinator in PE-related issues.

22. SHA and DSHA(WKCD) responded that -

- (a) while the function of CP was to promote and gather public views, its views were highly regarded by the WKCD Board, and it could always advise WKCD on issues relating to the development of WKCD. Moreover, the Authority might issue guidelines in relation to the functions of CP from time to time taking into account the progress of the project, in accordance with section 20(5) of the Ordinance; and
- (b) CP would start operating with effect from 1 March 2009 and hold its first meeting no later than May 2009 to plan for the specifics of the stage one PE exercise scheduled for mid 2009. The relevant details of the PE exercise would be announced in due course. While CP was required by section 20(8) of the Ordinance to hold at least one meeting each year and to open that meeting to the public, it was anticipated that it would exceed the prescribed requirement and organise not just one but more meetings each year for public participation.

Action

23. Dr Allan Zeman reiterated the importance of engaging the public through a bottom-up approach, particularly in soliciting their views on the scale and number of venues to be built, so that the WKCD project would not become a “white elephant”. As he understood, all Board members of WKCDA shared the view that public engagement was of utmost importance to the success of the WKCD project and without which the project could not be taken forward.

Written response to be provided by the Administration

Admin

24. The Administration was requested to provide a written response on the following -

- (a) the Administration's interpretation of section 20(8) of the Ordinance and its stance in opening all meetings of CP to the public;
- (b) guidelines issued by WKCDA in relation to the functions and operation of CP;
- (c) further details on the three stages of the PE exercise, in particular (i) whether it would be possible for the public to comment on all conceptual plans instead of the three selected by the Authority at Stage two of the PE exercise and, if not, the reason for such; and (ii) how WKCDA would ensure that the public would be engaged in a structured and systematic manner, as recommended by the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development in its Final Report;
- (d) the categories and number of collections awaiting to be exhibited by LCSD museums and their suitability for display at M+;
- (e) the existing number of curatorial staff in Hong Kong, and the manpower projection, requirements and training plan for curators to complement the scale and themes of M+;
- (f) the mechanism to ensure the effective co-ordination between SHA and the relevant Bureaux/departments in implementing the WKCD project and other major infrastructure projects in the vicinity;
- (g) whether the redevelopment of the old districts in the vicinity of WKCD would be planned in tandem with the WKCD project and, if not, the reason for such;
- (h) details on the approach in awarding design and construction contracts for the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD;

Action

- (i) recruitment plan for staff of WKCD, including the time schedule, manpower requirement (categories/number/level of staff), entry requirements, remuneration packages and recruitment procedures;
- (j) plan for the nurturing of young artists and building of audience to underpin the WKCD project; and
- (k) manpower projection for stage management professionals and recruitment plan to engage stage management expertise globally.

Meeting arrangements

25. Ms Emily LAU said that it would be useful for the Chairmen of DC, PAC and MC, who were also members of the WKCD Board and CP, to exchange views with members of the Joint Subcommittee, in particular when the outcome of the first stage PE exercise was known. The Chairman suggested and members agreed that WKCD members should attend future meetings of the Joint Subcommittee on a need basis.

26. Mr Ronald Arculli said that the Chairman of the various Committees under WKCD would endeavour to attend the meetings of the Joint Subcommittee as required.

27. Members noted that the next meeting scheduled for 14 April 2009 would focus on discussing matters related to public engagement and the planning and development of M+.

III. Any other business

28. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:30 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
7 April 2009

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project
on Friday, 27 February 2009, at 3:30 pm
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000001-000202	Chairman	- Confirmation of minutes - Opening remarks	
000203-000751	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration	
000752-001043	Mrs Regina IP Admin	Request for the Administration to provide details of the staff recruitment plan for the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA)	The Adm to provide a written response
001044-001312	Mr James TO Admin	Management of the upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion	
001313-001659	Mr CHAN Hak-kan Admin	- Rationale for three conceptual plans - Progress of the Interim M+	
001700-002420	Mrs Sophie LEUNG WKCDA Board members	- Views of the WKCDA Board members on the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) - Building of consensus among Board members of WKCDA	
002421-003050	Ms Cyd HO Admin	- Views on the timeframe, design and approach of the first stage public engagement (PE) exercise - Suggestions on the analysis, presentation and follow-up of public views	
003051-004446	Mr Alan LEONG Admin Chairman WKCDA Board members	- The function of CP as specified in section 20(1) of the WKCDA Ordinance (Cap. 601) - The opening of the Consultation Panel (CP) meetings to the public as specified in section 20(8) of the Ordinance	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Meeting between WKCD Board members and the performing arts group - Progress in the establishment of CP and its work schedule - The importance of engaging the public in the consultation process and adopting a bottom-up approach in decision making 	
004447-005432	Mr LEE Wing-tat Admin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Viability of the M+ project and the progress in the setting up of the Interim M+ - Display of the collections kept in the repositories of the museums managed by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) - Development of cultural software to complement the construction of cultural hardware - The Administration was requested to provide information on its plan for the nurturing of artists and audience building to underpin the WKCD project 	The Adm to provide a written response
005433-005928	Mrs Regina IP Admin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The seating capacity of the performing arts venues in WKCD and their realignment with the existing cultural venues - Suggestion to include reunification and anniversary gifts from the Mainland to the collections of M+ 	
005929-010812	Ms Emily LAU Admin Chairman WKCD Board members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Concern about the operating deficit and inadequate audience/collections for the future M+ - The need to reduce the size of M+ 	
010813-011609	Mr James TO Admin WKCD Board member	- Arrangement to display the art works kept in the repositories of LCSD museums in M+	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>project and other major infrastructure projects in the vicinity;</p> <p>(c) further details on the three stages of PE exercise, in particular (i) whether it would be possible for the public to comment on all conceptual plans instead of the three selected by the Authority at Stage Two of the PE exercise and, if not, the reason for such; and (ii) how WKCD would ensure that the public would be engaged in a structured and systematic manner, as recommended by the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development in its Final Report;</p> <p>(d) whether the redevelopment of the old district in the vicinity of WKCD would be planned in tandem with the WKCD project and, if not, the reason for such;</p> <p>(e) details on the approach in awarding design and construction contracts for the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Attendance by WKCD board members at future meetings of the Joint Subcommittee - Date of the next meeting 	<p>}</p> <p>The Adm</p> <p>to provide a</p> <p>written</p> <p>response</p>

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
7 April 2009