

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)402/09-10
(These minutes have been by the
Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/08

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting
held on Monday, 7 September 2009, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present :

- Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP (Chairman)
- Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
- Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
- Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
- Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
- Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
- Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
- Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
- Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
- Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
- Hon Starry LEE Wai-king
- Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP
- Hon CHAN Hak-kan
- Hon Tanya CHAN
- Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
- Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
- Hon WONG Sing-chi

Members absent :

- Hon LEE Wing-tat (Deputy Chairman)
- Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
- Hon James TO Kun-sun
- Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
- Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
- Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
- Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
- Hon WONG Yuk-man

Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun
Dr Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Public Officers : Home Affairs Bureau
attending

Mr TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

Miss Cathy CHU, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

Mr SO Kam-shing, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Mr Danny LAU
Principal Assistant Secretary
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

Mr Howard LAM
Chief Treasury Accountant
(West Kowloon Cultural District), Home Affairs Bureau

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

The Honourable Ronald Arculli, GBS, JP
Member, Board of the West Kowloon Cultural District
Authority and Chairman, Development Committee

Mr SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Member, Board of the West Kowloon Cultural District
Authority and Chairman, Remuneration Committee

Mr Augustine NG
Project Director (West Kowloon Cultural District Authority)

Attendance by : Museum of Site
invitation

Mr LAU Chung-hang
Representative

Hong Kong Comics & Animation Federation

Mr Thomas TANG
Director

Ms TAI Sau-wai

Cisco Systems (Hong Kong) Limited

Mr Argon HO
Head of Marketing & Channel Operations

The Hong Kong Literary Museum Initiative

Ms TANG Siu-wa
Interim Convener

Mr Alvin YIP
cultural and creative industries worker

Wing Lung Art

Mr FU Lou-yeung
Art and Chief Executive Officer

Clerk in attendance : Ms Betty FONG
Chief Council Secretary (2)2

Staff in attendance : Mrs Claren MOK
Senior Council Secretary (2)2

Ms Anna CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2)2

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes
[LC Paper No. CB(2)2431/08-09]

The minutes of the meeting held on 19 June 2009 were confirmed.

2. The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Action

II. Meeting with deputations, the Administration and representatives of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

LC Paper No. CB(2)2433/08-09(01) -- Paper provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(2)2433/08-09(02) -- Summary of concerns raised by the Legislative Council (LegCo) Members in the Third LegCo in relation to the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project and the Administration's responses and undertakings prepared by LegCo Secretariat

LC Paper No. CB(2)2433/08-09(03) -- Questions raised by Hon Alan LEONG on the implementation of the WKCD project

LC Paper No. CB(2)2434/08-09 -- Key views and suggestions made by deputations

Meeting with deputations

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, representatives of deputations presented their views on the development of the WKCD project as detailed in their written submissions.

Discussion

Cultural policy and software development

4. Mr Alan LEONG expressed concern as to whether the cultural software development in Hong Kong could measure up to and complement the hardware development in WKCD, as well as which committee(s) under the WKCDA were responsible for software development. He further asked: (a) how the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA) would ensure the recruitment of a Chief Executive Officer (CEO) with a vision to transform Hong Kong into a cultural metropolis; (b) how the public engagement (PE) exercise would be conducted so as to solicit widely public views on software development; and (c) the allocation of resources for software development and the timeframe for implementing programmes and activities for such purpose.

5. Ms Starry LEE opined that for the development of cultural and creative industries, the Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) and the Education Bureau should work in

Action

collaboration in the promotion of arts education and building of audience. Mrs Sophie LEUNG did not consider it necessary to rush through a decision on the hardware and software for WKCD at that stage, as the ideas relating to these elements would evolve and gradually take shape over a period of time through various interactive arts and cultural programmes and activities in the community. She believed that more time and space should be allowed for the progressive development of cultural hardware and software for WKCD.

6. Secretary for Home Affairs (SHA), Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District) (DSHA), Mr Ronald Arculli and Mr SIN Chung-kai responded that -

- (a) WKCDA attached equal importance to both hardware and software developments of the WKCD project. Open public forums and small group meetings would be organized to solicit views of the public and stakeholders on their expectations on the provision of programmes and education activities for WKCD, apart from general planning matters. The Administration also met regularly with local artists and arts groups for the establishment of a collaborative relationship in the development of cultural software. Relevant information and papers of the PE exercise had been uploaded onto the Authority's website for easy public access;
- (b) to achieve the cultural vision of WKCD, relevant background and experience in the arts and cultural environment was included as one of the entry requirements for the CEO post;
- (c) the Performing Arts Committee and the Museum Committee would be working in partnership with various arts groups and stakeholders to recommend arts and cultural programmes under their respective purview for the consideration of the WKCDA Board. WKCDA would also work in close collaboration with the Administration on the development of cultural policy and software; and
- (d) WKCDA would exercise due care in expending the upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion to the Authority as approved by the Finance Committee, which was basically the capital expenditure of the project. WKCDA would devise a more concrete plan on resources allocation for programme development early next year when the Authority's senior executives and other supporting structure were in place. Thereafter, WKCDA would organize activities for the promotion of WKCD at different parts of the community.

Literary museum

7. Ms Cyd HO opined that literature, which linked people to other forms of arts, should be recognized as an essential element of cultural software. She strongly

Action

supported the establishment of a literary museum in WKCD and urged WKCDA to consider allocating space and resources for such a purpose. Ms TANG Siu-wa highlighted the hardware and software requirements of the proposed museum as detailed in the written submission from the Hong Kong Literary Museum Initiative. In response, Mr Ronald Arculli agreed to convey Ms HO's view to WKCDA. He also invited Ms TANG to forward details of her proposal for WKCDA's consideration.

Public consultation

8. Miss Tanya CHAN criticized the design of the questions for the PE exercise, which in her view kept dragging on some fundamental principles which had already been widely discussed and trivial details on hardware facilities. Having regard to the way the questions were set, Miss CHAN was worried that WKCDA might become overly concerned about the iconic design of the hardware facilities and neglect their cultural content.

9. DSHA and Project Director (West Kowloon Cultural District) (PD(WKCD)) responded that the objectives of stage one of the PE exercise were to gauge public and stakeholders' views on their aspirations and expectations on WKCD and to seek the views of the visitors of the facilities and the arts and cultural venues as well as stakeholders in the arts and cultural sector on their requirements for these venues. Questions on matters concerning WKCD's general planning and provision of facilities and open spaces in the arts and cultural venues were prepared, based on the recommendations of the Performing Arts Committee and Museum Committee, as well as input from the consultants commissioned by the Authority. The focus of these questions was to solicit views from the users' perspective for the building of a people oriented WKCD.

Appointment of senior staff

10. Members in general considered that WKCDA should take forward the recruitment of CEO expeditiously but with caution to ensure the selection of the right candidate for such a key post. As the CEO would steer the future operation of the seven functional departments under the Authority, members also held the view that WKCDA should ensure the involvement of the future incumbent of the post in the selection of candidates for the senior executive posts of WKCDA, in particular the Executive Directors. Dr LAM Tai-fai enquired about the duration of the contract for the CEO, and the number of applicants who responded to WKCDA's recent advertisement for the CEO post and other senior executive posts. Mr Alan LEONG asked whether members of the Consultation Panel would take part in the selection of CEO. Ms Emily LAU enquired about measures to improve the current recruitment exercise, in light of the experience gained from the recruitment of the former Project Delivery Executive Director who resigned shortly after he took up the post. The Chairman enquired whether arrangements would be put in place for the engagement of specialist consultants in the operation of WKCDA.

Action

11. Mr Ronald Arculli, Mr SIN Chung-kai, DSHA and Principal Assistant Secretary (West Kowloon Cultural District) provided the following response and information -

- (a) the consultancy study on WKCDA's organizational structure was completed in May 2009. Based on the study, the CEO would head seven functional departments covering museum policy and management services, performing arts policy and management services, project delivery, marketing, communications and programming, finance, human resources and legal services. For the early appointment of the CEO and other senior executives (as set out in paragraph 11(c) below), WKCDA had commissioned head-hunting agencies to proceed in full swing the recruitment of these staff. WKCDA was fully aware of the importance for the CEO to take part in the final selection of the senior executives, in particular the Executive Directors of museum and performing arts policies, and would endeavour to involve the CEO in the process;
- (b) as WKCDA's organizational structure and other relevant information were now made available to the public on the Authority's website, applicants for the CEO post should have a more comprehensive understanding of the requirements of the post. For managing a mega cultural development like WKCD, the CEO was required, among other things, to possess sound experience at senior executive level and good professional standing in the arts and cultural sector. The Chairman of the Consultation Panel would take part in the recruitment of CEO as a member of the selection board. To allow more flexibility for the Authority in the offer of employment to the selected candidates, the duration of the contract for the CEO and other senior posts had yet to be determined. The engagement of specialist consultants for WKCDA would only be considered where necessary after the full professional team had assumed office; and
- (c) the numbers of applications received for the senior executive posts (excluding those candidates directly approached by the head-hunting agencies) by the deadline of application on 4 September 2009 were -

Post	Number of Application
Chief Executive Director	51
Museum Policy and Management Services Executive Director	16
Performing Arts Policy and Management Services Executive Director	13
Project Delivery Executive Director	55
Finance Executive Director	74
Human Resources Executive Director	69

Post	Number of Application
Marketing, Communications and Programming Executive Director	116
General Counsel	30
Internal Auditor	40

Planning and development of WKCD

12. Professor Patrick LAU and Ms Starry LEE suggested that before the full implementation of the WKCD project, the Administration should set up a temporary performing and exhibition venue in WKCD to enable local arts groups to trial run their programmes and activities. They considered that the arrangement should promote the cultural content of WKCD and the development of an audience base for WKCD. Ms LEE further highlighted the importance for the establishment of a good connectivity between WKCD and its adjoining areas and the community as a whole in terms of transportation network, land use, software development as well as layout and facilities design.

13. In response, SHA, DSHA and Mr Ronald Arculli said that -

- (a) to encourage the public to be more familiar about the use of WKCD site, the government supported the Hong Kong Institute of Architects to organize the Hong Kong and Shenzhen Biennale at WKCD in 2009. To enhance the community's understanding of the WKCD project, WKCD would further explore the feasibility of having programmes on temporary venues at WKCD; and
- (b) given the scale and significance of the WKCD project, one of the prime concerns of WKCD was to ensure the establishment of good connectivity both within WKCD as well as between WKCD and the rest of the community in terms of hardware development (such as construction of transportation network for easy access to WKCD) and software development (such as promotion of indigenous culture in WKCD). The Authority would work closely with the Administration in this regard.

IV. Any other business

14. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:33 pm.

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project
on Monday, 7 September 2009, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000001 – 001209	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes [LC Paper No. CB(2)2432/08-09] Opening remarks	
001210 – 001517	Museum of Site	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1869/08-09(08)] [LC Paper No. CB(2)2457/08-09(01)] The West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCD) should be led and managed by a team of professionals with arts and cultural background	
001518 – 002045	Hong Kong Comics & Animation Federation	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1923/08-09(04)] - Creative industry was one of the pillars for Hong Kong's future economy. With its highly recognized achievement worldwide, comics and animation should become an integral part of the cultural and creative industries along side with other forms of arts and culture - The West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project should be conducive to the development of creative industry and an exhibition centre for comics and animation should be established to promote the further development of the industry	
002046 – 002717	Ms TAI Sau-wai	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1869/08-09(06)] [LC Paper No. CB(2)2457/08-09(02)] The WKCD should be a venue where there was a connection between people and stories related to the place. These stories included "the building and the reclaimed land", "the element water and the place's ecological history", "the Boat Schools"; and "the time line showing the evolution of the place"	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
002718 – 003157	Cisco Systems (Hong Kong) Limited	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1869/08-09(07)] [LC Paper No. CB(2)2457/08-09(03)]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The WKCD project was an opportunity to create an iconic landmark not only for its artistic content, but also for the deployment of information and communication technology from its design stage to achieve the principles of sustainability, accessibility and connectivity - Hong Kong should take the lead in the provision and use of online platforms to promote art and culture within and outside Hong Kong 	
003158 – 003714	The Hong Kong Literary Museum Initiative	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1869/08-09(09)] [LC Paper No. CB(2)2457/08-09(04)]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A literary museum, in the form of an interactive centre promoting literature reading and the Hong Kong story, should be established in WKCD to provide a forum for greater public participation in literary art - The proposal should be included in the public consultation exercise to solicit views from the literary sector and other stakeholders 	
003715 – 004034	Mr Alvin YIP	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)2433/08-09(04)]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The WKCDA should allow more small-scale architectural firms to take part in the planning and design of the WKCD project - A building and design competition centre should be established on a long-term basis for identifying and developing new talents for the creative industry - The Administration should allow more flexibility in the planning and design of WKCD to encourage greater creativity in the development of the project 	
004035 – 004419	Wing Lung Art	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)2457/08-09(05)]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A Chinese Culture Museum should be established in WKCD for the promotion of Chinese culture 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - WKCD could serve as a forum for cultural exchanges between the Mainland, Hong Kong and Taiwan - The Administration should enhance the involvement of stakeholders in the planning and design of the project 	
004420 – 004653	Chairman Admin WKCDA	Acknowledgment of and responses to deputations' views	
004654 – 005911	Chairman Mr Alan LEONG Admin WKCDA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Views on the development of cultural software to complement the WKCD project - Measures taken by WKCDA to realize the cultural vision of WKCD in the recruitment of the Chief Executive Officer (CEO), public engagement (PE) exercise and resources allocation 	
005912 – 010652	Chairman Ms Cyd HO The Hong Kong Literary Museum Initiative WKCDA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Views on literature as an essential element of cultural software and the need for the allocation of space and resource in WKCD for the establishment of a literary museum - Deputation's views on the hardware and software requirements of the proposed literature museums in WKCD 	
010653 – 011425	Chairman Miss Tanya CHAN WKCDA Admin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Views on the scope and focus of questions for the PE exercise, the need to promote the participation of small architecture firms in the WKCD project and allocation of resources for software development - Explanation on the objective of stage one of the PE exercise and the focus of the questions used in the exercise 	
011426 – 012204	Chairman Ms Emily LAU Museum of Site The Hong Kong Literary Museum Initiative Mr Alvin YIP	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Need for the CEO to take part in the selection of senior executives of WKCDA - Deputations' views on (a) their experience of communication with the Administration; (b) the management of the Jockey Club Creative Arts Centre at Shek Kip Mei; (c) the need for WKCDA to refocus on the software content of WKCD; and (d) the need for the Administration to encourage a variety of arts forms 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
012205 – 012624	Prof Patrick LAU Chairman Admin	Suggestion for the establishment of a temporary performing/exhibition venue at WKCD before the full implementation of the project	
012625 – 013259	Chairman Ms Starry LEE Admin WKCDA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Views on the use of land at WKCD in the interim, the importance of establishing good connectivity between WKCD and its adjoining communities, and the need for software development to catch up with the hardware development in WKCD - Issues on software development and connectivity being major concerns of the Administration and WKCDA 	
013300 – 013820	Chairman WKCDA	Recruitment of the CEO and other senior executives of WKCDA	
013821 – 014209	Chairman Mrs Sophie LEUNG	The need to allow more time and space for the development of hardware and software for WKCD	
014210 – 014959	Chairman Mr LAM Tai-fai Admin WKCDA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Employment-related statistics in the recruitment of the CEO and other senior executives of WKCDA and duration of their contracts - Need for WKCDA to involve the CEO in the selection of senior executives of WKCDA 	
015000 – 015502	Chairman Mr Alan LEONG Admin	Resources allocation for software development and timeframe for organizing the related programmes	
015503 – 015926	Ms Emily LAU WKCDA	Improvement measures taken by WKCDA in the recruitment of senior executives for WKCDA	
015927 – 020229	Miss Tanya CHAN WKCDA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Views on the questions relating to planning matters in stage one of the PE exercise - Explanation on the objectives and scope of questions set for stage one of the PE exercise 	
020230- 020314	Chairman	Arrangement for the next meeting	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
30 November 2009