

Bills Committee on Motor Vehicle Idling (Fixed Penalty) Bill

**Summary of views expressed by deputations attending meetings on 1 and 7 June 2010
(as at 5 August 2010)**

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|---|---|
| <u>Taxi & public light bus (PLB) associations</u> | | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Tai Wo Motors Ltd (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(11)) ● Happy Taxi Operator's Association Ltd. ● Shun On Motors Trading Limited ● Association of N.T. Radio Taxicabs Ltd. ● Hong Kong Kowloon & New Territories Taxi Association ● Hong Kong (Four Seas) Taxi Drivers Association Ltd. ● Front Line Taxi Driver Association ● New Territories Taxi Drivers' Rights Alliance (LC Papers Nos. CB(1)2090/09-10(09) and CB(1)2121/09-10(14)) ● Rights of Taxi (Si Hai) Telecommunication Centre Limited ● Association for the Rights of Liberty Taxi Drivers (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10(06)) ● Taxi Drivers & Operators Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)2053/09-10(06)) ● CTOD Association Company Limited (LC Paper No. CB(1)2064/09-10(04)) ● Hong Kong and Kowloon Taxi Merchants' Joint Committee (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10(08)) ● Chit Fai Motors Co. Ltd. | <p>Taxi and PLB associations requested that all taxi and PLB stands should be exempted from the proposed prohibition against idling vehicles with running engines (the idling prohibition). The reasons they put forward included the following –</p> <p>(a) To comply with the idling prohibition, the sixth taxi/third PLB (and those following) waiting in line would need to switch off and restart their engines frequently, leading to more emissions, extensive wear and tear of starters and batteries and hence higher maintenance costs.</p> <p>(b) There was a need for taxi/PLB drivers to keep the air-conditioning on, particularly on rainy days to avoid fogging of glass panels due to condensation to ensure driving safety, and to avoid passengers and seats from getting wet.</p> <p>(c) Measures such as early replacement of buses or imposing restrictions against constructing wall-effect buildings</p> | <p><i>Taxis and minibuses:</i></p> <p>(a) to (m) The Government is committed to improving Hong Kong's air quality. In particular, we have embarked on a comprehensive vehicle emission control programme since 1999, which have significantly reduced roadside concentrations of key air pollutants. To step up our efforts in this area, apart from implementing measures such as schemes for replacing older diesel commercial vehicles and promoting the use of environment-friendly vehicles (including electric vehicles) and fuels [please refer to LC Paper No. CB(1)2690/09-10(01) for details], we have also introduced the Motor Vehicle Idling (Fixed Penalty) Bill (the Bill) to reduce roadside air pollution and environmental nuisances caused by idling vehicles with running engines to pedestrians and people working or living</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|---|--|
| <p>(LC Paper No. CB(1)2117/09-10(06))</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Kowloon Taxi Owners Association Ltd (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10(08)) ● United Friendship Taxi Owners & Drivers Association Ltd ● N. W. Area Taxi Drivers & Operators Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)2038/09-10(05)) ● Hong Kong Kowloon Taxi & Lorry Owners' Association Ltd (LC Papers Nos. CB(1)2064/09-10(02) and CB(1)2090/09-10(08)) ● Sun Hing Taxi Radio Association ● Sun Hing Taxi Radio Service General Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)2038/09-10(04)) ● Motor Transport Workers General Union Public Light Bus Division ● Motor Transport Workers General Union Taxi Drivers Division ● HK Public Light Bus Owner & Driver Association ● The Hong Kong Taxi & Public Light Bus Association Ltd ● Association for the Rights of Taxi Drivers (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(05)) ● Taxi Dealers & Owners Association Ltd (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10(03)) ● Hong Kong Taxi Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10(02)) ● Wai Yik H.K., KLN. & N.T. Taxi Owners | <p>should be pursued instead of subjecting taxis/PLBs to further restrictions.</p> <p>(d) There were not sufficient supporting measures and facilities, such as parking/waiting areas, covers and shades for taxi/PLB stands, etc. to facilitate implementation of the idling prohibition.</p> <p>(e) The idling prohibition would have adverse impacts on the operation and livelihood of professional drivers.</p> <p><u>Reasons related to taxis</u></p> <p>(f) The idling prohibition would give rise to discomfort of passengers, thereby affecting the quality, competitiveness and business of taxi service.</p> <p>(g) The ambient temperature inside a vehicle might exceed 40 degrees Celsius when air temperature was only 27 degrees Celsius. Since taxis were in fact the working places of taxi drivers where they had to stay a long time, if taxis queuing at taxi stands were required to switch off the engine and air-conditioning, drivers' health and judgement and hence road safety would be affected.</p> | <p>nearby the roads. The proposed idling prohibition would also reduce exposure of drivers to vehicle exhaust emissions, thereby safeguarding their health.</p> <p>To cater for the operational needs of drivers and the transport trades, the Bill provides a three-in-sixty-minute grace period to all drivers as well as an extensive list of exemptions covering drivers of different motor vehicles and various circumstances. In particular, the grace period would enable drivers of motor vehicles equipped with turbochargers to follow the vehicle manufacturers' recommendation to idle the internal combustion engines (ICEs) for a few minutes after the vehicles have become stationary. With the grace period and exemptions at taxi stands, taxi drivers could also simultaneously comply with the idling prohibition and the statutory requirement to keep the roof "TAXI" signal (which is powered by vehicle battery) illuminated during the hours of darkness when the taxi is available for hire. During scrutiny of the Bill, we have also proposed to grant exemption to all drivers on days when the "Very Hot Weather Warning" or the "Amber, Red or Black Rainstorm Signal" has been issued, which would further cater for the needs of drivers during</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|---|---|
| <p>Association</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Taxi & PLB Concern Group (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10 (04)) ● Urban Taxi Drivers Association Joint Committee Co Ltd | <p>(h) To keep the air-conditioning on during hot weather out of operational needs, taxis might choose to circulate on the road to circumvent the idling prohibition instead of switching off their engines, thereby aggravating traffic congestion and pollution.</p> <p>(i) The proposed exemptions for taxi stands could not cater to the needs of taxis waiting at spots other than taxi stands to pick up passengers in response to service calls. Enforcement problems would arise in the absence of guidelines on how taxis waiting at non-taxi stands should be handled.</p> <p>(j) Taxis would have difficulty in complying with the statutory requirement to keep its roof light on to indicate availability if it had to comply with the idling prohibition.</p> <p><u>Reasons related to PLBs</u></p> <p>(k) For operational reasons, Euro IV PLBs had to keep engines idling for 15 to 45 minutes to conduct a special "燒炭" process as described in Chit Fai Motors Co. Ltd's submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)2117/09-10(06)). There was</p> | <p>extreme weather.</p> <p>In proposing the Bill, we have taken into account an important factor that the Bill with the proposed exemptions would not oblige drivers to stay inside a motor vehicle for a long period of time with the engine stopped. For example, taxi drivers may wait outside their vehicles with the engines stopped at the taxi stands when there is already a long queue of taxis waiting for customers. It is indeed a common practice in cities where there are legislative controls on banning of idling vehicles that drivers wait outside their motor vehicles when the engines are turned off. In addition, taxi drivers are free to decide whether they should continue to wait in case there is already a long queue of taxis outside the taxi stand or move on to other places for customers. To facilitate compliance with the idling prohibition, TD will consider and assist in the provision of parking/waiting areas as well as covers/shades for the passengers at taxi/PLB stands whenever necessary and feasible. Upon receipt of such suggestion, it will examine the operation and utilisation of the concerned taxi/PLB stand, as well as the traffic management and site condition of the concerned taxi/PLB stands together with the relevant parties.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|---|---|
| | <p>also a genuine need for PLBs with turbo-timers to leave their engines idling for three to five minutes before switching off and restarting.</p> <p><u><i>Suggestions made by individual taxi and PLB associations</i></u></p> <p><i>Further exemptions:</i></p> <p>(l) Implementation of the idling prohibition should be temporarily suspended during days of very hot weather/heavy rain, such as days on which "very hot weather warnings" or amber, red and black rainstorm signals were issued, or when air temperature reached 27 degrees Celsius, or as in the case of Toronto, when the ambient temperature inside a vehicle was more than 27 degrees Celsius.</p> <p>(m) Taxis queuing for entry to taxi stands or for refill at LPG filling stations should be exempted.</p> <p><i>Implementation approach and measures:</i></p> <p>(n) Considering the difficulties in enforcing the idling prohibition, a phased approach should be adopted.</p> | <p>On the whole, the Administration is of the view that the legislative proposal would help reduce exposure of drivers and people living or working nearby roads to vehicle exhaust emissions, and would be of health benefits to professional drivers and the general public.</p> <p>That said, the Administration is considering the proposals on further exemptions put forth by some representatives of the transport trades and Members of the Bills Committee including those regarding taxis, minibuses and buses. We will report our views to the Bills Committee at the coming meeting.</p> <p><i>Implementation approach and measures:</i></p> <p>(n) With the aim to balance between the operational needs of drivers and the transport trades and the need to protect the public from environmental nuisances</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|---|---|
| | <p>(o) The deployment of traffic wardens and senior traffic wardens as the enforcement agents might give rise to query about their objectivity and hence disputes.</p> <p>(p) The Administration should subsidize taxis to install air conditioners which could run on battery power for a short period after the engine was switched off, or allow taxis to charge \$1 extra to cover the cost incurred.</p> | <p>caused by idling vehicles, the Bill provides an extensive list of exemptions covering drivers of different motor vehicles and various circumstances. Upon passage of the Bill, the Government would launch a series of publicity and educational programs to raise public awareness and understanding of the idling prohibition before commencement of enforcement. This approach would adequately facilitate compliance as well as enforcement.</p> <p>(o) Upon passage of the Bill, we would provide adequate training and clear enforcement guidelines to the authorized officers.</p> <p>(p) The retrofit device being developed by the Hong Kong Productivity Council (HKPC) funded by the Environment and Conservation Fund aims to offer similar functions. The device is developed to automatically stop the engine when a motor vehicle becomes stationary, and to restart the engine when it has to start moving again. It will also enable the operation of air conditioning system by battery when the engine is switched off. HKPC expects to complete the trial by end-2010. At present, we are not aware of any viable product that offers similar functions in the</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|---|---|
| | <p>(q) The Administration should conduct studies to identify other technologies which could reduce roadside emissions, such as electric cars, and promote their use with government subsidies rather than implementing the idling prohibition with fixed penalty.</p> | <p>market. We will continue to closely monitor retrofit devices and measures which may facilitate drivers to comply with the idling prohibition, and explore ways to facilitate drivers' adoption of those viable options in due course. We will continue to maintain communication with the transport trades on this issue.</p> <p>(q) The Government is committed to identifying and promoting the use of feasible technologies to improve roadside air quality. To promote the wider use of electric vehicles in Hong Kong, we have been providing incentives for car buyers through extending the waiver of First Registration Tax for electric vehicles and implementing a proposal to accelerate the profits tax deduction of capital expenditure on environment-friendly vehicles, including electric vehicles. Also, we have been working with the private sector to set up electric vehicle charging facilities at car parks, which are crucial to the adoption of these vehicles. Furthermore, we have been exploring with different manufacturers on early supply of electric vehicles to Hong Kong.</p> <p>At present, the supply of electric vehicles worldwide is still very limited as their commercial production and worldwide</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|--|--|
| | | distribution are expected to commence in late 2010 and early 2011 at the earliest. In 2010-11, there will be a supply of around 200 electric vehicles for the local market. We will continue our efforts to promote electric vehicles so as to increase their number in Hong Kong in the medium-to-long term. |
| <u>Bus companies, truck and bus associations, and workers' unions</u> | | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Hong Kong Logistics Association ● Hong Kong Association of Aircargo Truckers Ltd ● Hong Kong Container Tractor Owner Association ● New Lantao Bus Co. (1973) Ltd ● Hong Kong (Cross Border) Transportation Drivers' Association. ● H.K. Vehicle Transportation Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)2038/09-10(01)) ● Citybus Limited (Citybus) (LC Paper No. CB(1)2053/09-10(03)) ● New World First Bus Services Limited ● Transport Industry Committee of the Federation of Hong Kong and Kowloon Labour Unions (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(07)) ● Traffic Services Employees Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(08)) ● The Kowloon Motor Bus Co. (1933) Ltd. (KMB) | <p><u>Views specially related to the logistics industry</u></p> <p>(a) Exemptions should be granted to all vehicles with a genuine need to keep engines idling for operational reasons.</p> <p>(b) Vehicles with turbo engines should be exempted as there was a genuine need for their engines to be left idling for a while before switching off and restarting.</p> <p>(c) The idling prohibition would be a nuisance to the logistics industry and cause operational difficulty.</p> | <p><i>Logistics industry:</i></p> <p>(a) to (c) To cater for the operational needs of drivers and the transport trades, the Bill provides a three-in-sixty-minute grace period to all drivers, which will also enable drivers of motor vehicles equipped with turbochargers to follow the vehicle manufacturers' recommendation to idle the internal combustion engines for a few minutes after the vehicles have become stationary. It also provides an extensive list of exemptions covering drivers of different motor vehicles and various circumstances. For example, exemption would be granted to drivers who must idle a motor vehicle, which is lawfully designed for a purpose other than carriage of the driver, any passenger and their personal effects, for the primary purpose of the vehicle, such as a driver who must idle a</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|---|--|
| <p>(LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(01))</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Motor Transport Workers General Union Kowloon Division ● Motor Transport Workers General Union (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(09)) ● Motor Transport Workers General Union Organization Executive ● Hong Kong Waste Disposal Industry Association ● Hong Kong Bus Suppliers Association ● Yuen Long District Tourists and Passengers Omnibus Operators Association Ltd. ● New Territories West Buses/Coaches Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)2117/09-10(07)) ● China Hong Kong and Macau Boundary Crossing Bus Association ● Public Omnibus Operators Association Ltd ● Motor Transport Workers General Union Non-franchised Bus Division (LC Paper No. CB(1)2117/09-10(08)) ● Hong Kong District Tourists and Passengers Omnibus Operators Association ● Non-franchised Public Buses Workers Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(06)) | <p><u>Views specially related to franchised/non-franchised buses</u></p> <p>(d) Bus drivers would suffer from great heat in complying with the idling prohibition, particularly if their buses were installed with sealed windows.</p> <p>(e) There was a need to turn on the air-conditioning for at least 10 minutes before boarding of passenger for the comfort and health of drivers and passengers.</p> <p>(f) Citybus and KMB pointed out that there would be difficulties in enforcing the proposed 3-minute grace period on buses running circular routes or interchange routes because they might need to wait more than three minutes at bus termini or interchange stops with passengers on board. As such, the exemption available to non-franchised</p> | <p>refrigerator truck for carrying perishable freight at specified low temperatures. We have also proposed to grant exemption to all drivers on days when the “Very Hot Weather Warning” or the “Amber, Red or Black Rainstorm Signal” has been issued, which would further cater for the needs of drivers during extreme weather.</p> <p><i>Franchised / non-franchised buses:</i></p> <p>(d) to (h) Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> <p>(d) to (g) Since franchised buses provide scheduled services, the departure time of buses from bus termini is clearly set out in the service timetable of the respective bus routes. Once passengers start boarding the bus according to the timetables, the bus drivers can switch on the engines and thus the air conditioner of the bus and start driving off the bus within a short period of time. If the buses are allowed to idle their engines for an extended period at the bus termini, e.g. ten minutes as suggested by the franchised bus companies, the passengers waiting nearby will have to suffer from the heat, noise and emission generated by idling engines simultaneously. The adverse impact</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|--|---|
| | <p>buses when there was any passenger on board should also apply to franchised buses.</p> <p>(g) The high ambient temperature inside a bus, which could exceed 50 degrees Celsius on hot days, would have adverse impact on the first passenger who boarded the bus before the engine could be switched on to enable air-conditioning to operate.</p> <p>(h) There were not sufficient covered parking facilities for tourist coaches. If they were required to switch off the engine while waiting for tourists under the sun, they might not have sufficient time to cool down to provide the required comfort when tourists boarded the bus. As such, exemption similar to that for PLBs should be granted to non-franchised buses.</p> | <p>caused to the passengers is more prominent at Public Transport Interchange (PTI) where dispersion of emission exhaust is less efficient.</p> <p>With the three-in-sixty-minute grace period and the exemption for bus drivers while there is a passenger boarding or alighting from the bus, we are of the view that the legislative proposal has struck a reasonable balance between protecting the public (including bus driver) from the environmental nuisance generated by idling vehicles and catering the operational need of franchised buses.</p> <p>(h) Tourist coaches belong to non-franchised buses (NFB) which provide tailor-made services to specific groups of passengers to meet certain market niches. Unlike PLBs, most NFBs do not operate from public stands (or termini). In consideration of their operational mode and sealed window design, we proposed to exempt drivers of NFBs with one or more passengers on board so that they could run the air conditioning system to maintain sufficient ventilation. Together with the three-in-sixty-minutes grace period as well as other exemptions related to passenger boarding and alighting and traffic conditions, the current proposal should be</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|---|--|
| | <p>(i) The idling prohibition would discourage tourists from visiting Hong Kong during the hot summer months.</p> <p>(j) The Administration should ensure the provision of proper supporting facilities, in particular parking and waiting areas at tourist spots, or incentives for switch to electric vehicles.</p> | <p>able to cater for the operational needs of NFBs. Hence, we do not consider any further exemption for NFB drivers justifiable.</p> <p>(i) The extensive list of exemptions, including exemption for drivers of non-franchised buses that has any passenger on board, should keep the inconvenience to tourists to an acceptable level. Indeed, many advanced counties, including those with hot and humid summer such as Singapore and Japan, already have laws prohibiting idling vehicles. The idling prohibition would put Hong Kong on par with these countries.</p> <p>(j) TD will consider and assist in the provision of parking/waiting areas as well as covers/shades for the passengers at taxi/PLB stands whenever necessary and feasible. Upon receipt of such suggestion, it will examine the operation and utilisation of the concerned taxi/PLB stand, as well as the traffic management and site condition of the concerned taxi/PLB stands together with the relevant parties.</p> <p>On electric vehicles, please refer to the response to item (q) on pages 6 to 7 above.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|---|--|
| | <p>(k) It was unclear as to whether the escorts on school buses would be considered as passengers to qualify the school buses concerned for the exemption available to non-franchised buses with any passenger on board. Instead, exemption from the idling prohibition should be granted when the air temperature reached 27 degrees Celsius.</p> <p><i>Other views and comments</i></p> <p><i>On implementation:</i></p> <p>(l) The idling prohibition would affect professional drivers' livelihood. A phased approach should be adopted in taking it forward with application to private cars as a start.</p> <p><i>On exemptions:</i></p> <p>(m) Exemptions should be granted under inclement weather such as very hot or rainy days. For example, to grant exemption when the air temperature exceeded 30 degrees Celsius, or when the ambient temperature inside the vehicle exceeded 27 degrees Celsius, or on rainy days to avoid fogging of glass panels due to condensation.</p> | <p>(k) Under the Bill, escorts on non-franchised buses are considered as "passengers".</p> <p>On further exemption, please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> <p><i>Implementation:</i></p> <p>(l) Please refer to the response to item (n) on pages 4 to 5 above.</p> <p><i>Exemptions:</i></p> <p>(m) to (o) Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|---|--|
| | <p>(n) Drivers who were able to submit medical proofs that they could not tolerate hot weather due to health problems should be allowed to keep their engines on while idling.</p> <p>(o) It was unfair not to apply the idling prohibition to vehicles carrying live animals idling for operational needs, while such exemption would not apply to dump trucks which frequently had to queue at landfills or construction sites where the conditions were very unpleasant.</p> <p>(p) Exemptions provided in the Bill for vehicles with a genuine need to keep engines idling for operational reasons were unclear and might lead to enforcement problems. It was also not clear as to whether the proposed exemptions were applicable to vehicles in car parks or on private roads.</p> | <p>(p) Clause 7 of Schedule 1 to the Bill clearly sets out the criteria for drivers to be exempted under such provision. It also provides examples to further explain its application. The Bill, including all exemption provisions, would also be applicable to motor vehicles on private roads, including car parks.</p> |
| <u>Driving instructor associations and automobile associations</u> | | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Motor Transport Workers General Union Driving Instructors Division ● Right Hand Drive Motors Association Ltd (LC Paper No. CB(1)2053/09-10(08)) ● Hong Kong Automobile Association (LC Paper No. CB(1)2038/09-10(06)) | <p>(a) Some vehicles might choose to circulate on the road instead of switching off their engines to circumvent the idling prohibition, thereby aggravating traffic congestion and pollution.</p> | <p>(a) to (c) Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|---|--|
| | <p>(b) For health reasons, the idling prohibition should be lifted during the hot summer months.</p> <p>(c) It should be noted that the compartments of heavy vehicles, such as tourist coaches and buses, required longer time to cool down.</p> <p>(d) The Administration should encourage tourist coaches to install windows that could be opened instead of sealed windows.</p> <p><u>Specific views expressed by individual organizations</u></p> <p>(e) The Hong Kong Automobile Association in principle supported the switching off of the engine while idling but was against its mandatory implementation with fixed penalty for fear of causing nuisance. In particular, there would be difficulties in enforcing the proposed 3-minute grace period, and adequate training and guidelines should be given to front-line enforcement officers. The Association considered that exempting tourist spots from the Bill was preferable over exempting tourist</p> | <p>(d) According to TD, the Road Traffic Ordinance (Cap. 374) does not have specific requirements on the method of opening windows inside the compartment of a tourist coach.</p> <p>(e) When enforcing the three-in-sixty-minute grace period, an authorized officer would go near to an idling vehicle to ascertain the case and then start timing. If the driver fails to switch off the engine of his or her motor vehicle after three minutes, the authorized officer would issue a fixed penalty ticket to him. This would be similar to the enforcement arrangement of Toronto, Canada, which has been successfully enforcing the idling prohibition for years. Upon passage of the Bill, we would provide adequate training and clear enforcement guidelines</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|--|--|
| | <p>coaches. The Administration should also pursue measures other than the idling prohibition as listed in the Association's submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)2038/09-10(06) to improve air quality</p> <p>(f) The Right Hand Drive Motors Association (HK) Ltd. opined that to encourage drivers to switch off the engine while idling, the ambient temperature inside the vehicle should be kept low by amending the relevant legislation to permit the use of more environmental friendly window panels that had a lower light transmission rate.</p> | <p>to the authorized officers.</p> <p>For our response to other views, please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> <p>(f) According to TD, the setting of light transmission rate of vehicle window glass is to ensure that drivers will have a clear vision while driving on the road. It also facilitates Police to see clearly inside a vehicle compartment for effective law enforcement, for example to enforce the law on wearing of safety belts and prohibiting the use of non-hand-free mobile phones while driving, and fire-fighters to discover trapped passengers in case there is a traffic accident.</p> <p>The requirement for all private cars, buses, goods vehicles and special purpose vehicles have been relaxed in 2008-09, allowing the light transmission rate of all window glass behind the driver seat to be reduced from 70% to a minimum of 44% (however for the sake of safe driving, there was no relaxation on the light transmission rate of front windscreen and side glass on both sides of the driver). Besides, vehicle owners may apply to TD for addition of heat insulating films on vehicle glass if such an addition</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|---|--|
| | | <p>does not violate the light transmission rate requirement.</p> <p>Taking into account the demand from the public and the need to facilitate effective law enforcement, the Administration considers that the present requirement is appropriate and has no plan to further amend the law to lower the light transmission rate.</p> |
| <u>Green groups</u> | | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Clean Air Network (LC Paper No. CB(1)2038/09-10(02)) | <p>The Network supported the Bill in consideration of the impacts of roadside emissions on public health, particularly the health of children, and that of drivers of idling vehicles who were in fact affected by the toxic buildup of pollutants inside the vehicles due to poor ventilation. Moreover, idling a vehicle with the engine running would accelerate its wear and tear. The Network was also opposed to bus companies' request for extending the proposed 3-minute grace period to ten minutes for buses because they were a major source of roadside emissions. Instead, the bus replacement programme should be accelerated.</p> | <p>We note the Clean Air Network's support to the idling prohibition and its views against further exemption.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Conservancy Association (CA) (LC Papers Nos. CB(1) 2203/09-10(03) and 2208/09-10(01)) | <p>CA supported the idling prohibition and warned against granting further exemptions lest the fundamental objectives of the Bill</p> | <p>We note The Conservancy Association's support to the idling prohibition and its views against further exemption.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|---|---|
| | <p>would be undermined. Moreover, the proposed exemptions were already very comprehensive and could address the operational needs of the transport sector. The idling prohibition should be implemented early because roadside emissions were the greatest source of air pollution. Moreover, there was no evidence to show that the engine would suffer greater wear and tear if frequently switched off and restarted.</p> <p>CA opined that the idling prohibition should be allowed to take effect by adopting a warning approach, with a review on it to be conducted one year later to assess whether it should be tightened or relaxed as necessary.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the Government should provide more shaded parking spaces and plant more trees at taxi and PLB stands.</p> | <p>Upon passage of the Bill, the Government will launch a series of publicity and educational programs to raise public awareness and understanding of the idling prohibition before commencement of enforcement. This approach will adequately facilitate compliance as well as enforcement.</p> <p>TD will consider and assist in the provision of covers/shades for the passengers at taxi/PLB stands whenever necessary and feasible. Upon receipt of such suggestion, it will examine the operation and utilisation of the concerned taxi/PLB stand, as well as the traffic management and site condition of the concerned taxi/PLB stands together with the relevant parties.</p> <p>On greening, the Government has been promoting it proactively to provide a better</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|--|--|
| | | environment through a holistic approach, including identification of suitable planting locations with a careful choice of plant species, visually pleasing landscape design and proper vegetation maintenance. Where appropriate and subject to site conditions, we will encourage planting at suitable areas near parking spaces, bus stops as well as taxi and minibus stands. |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Green Sense | <p>Green Sense supported the idling prohibition to improve roadside air quality for the benefit of pedestrians and people working near roads.</p> <p>It pointed out that if bus windows could be opened, passengers could enjoy fresh air without the need to rely on air-conditioning all the time, particularly in winter.</p> | <p>We note Green Sense's support to the idling prohibition.</p> <p>According to TD, the Road Traffic Ordinance (Cap. 374) does not have specific requirements on the method of opening windows inside the compartment of a tourist coach.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Greeners Action | <p>Greeners Action fully supported the Bill, which in its view could cater to the needs of different trades by providing a number of exemptions. As such, further exemptions should not be granted lest the Bill would be rendered ineffective.</p> <p>The Government should also require large vehicles to install windows that could be opened to let in fresh air, thereby reducing the reliance on air-conditioning.</p> | <p>We note Greeners Action's support to the idling prohibition and its views against further exemption.</p> <p>According to TD, the Road Traffic Ordinance (Cap. 374) does not have specific requirements on the method of opening windows inside the compartment of a tourist coach.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|---|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Clear The Air (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10(07)) | <p>Clear The Air supported the Bill and opined that exemptions should only be granted to vehicles idling for medical, emergency or law enforcement purposes. Since poor air quality had significant impact on public health, everyone should play a role to improve it.</p> <p>The Administration should strive to make available devices that could power vehicles' air conditioning systems whilst their engines were switched off.</p> | <p>We note Clear The Air's support to the idling prohibition and its views against further exemption.</p> <p>The Environment and Conservation Fund Committee has allocated funding to the Hong Kong Productivity Council (HKPC) for developing a retrofit device which will automatically stop the engine when a motor vehicle becomes stationary, then restart the engine when it starts moving. The device will also enable the operation of air conditioning system by battery when the engine is switched off. HKPC expects to complete the trial by end-2010. At the same time, the Government will continue to closely monitor other retrofit devices and measures which may facilitate drivers to comply with the idling prohibition. We will maintain communication with the transport trades on this issue.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Mini Spotters (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10(05)) | <p>Mini Spotters made the following points –</p> <p>(a) Exemptions from the idling prohibition should only be granted to vehicles that were lawfully stopped or legally parked.</p> | <p>(a) and (b) We note Mini Spotters' support to the idling prohibition and views against further exemption.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|--|---|
| | <p>(b) There should be no exemptions for indoor public transport interchanges.</p> <p>(c) There was no consensus among turbo-charger manufacturers that all turbo-charged vehicles had to idle for three minutes after stopping.</p> <p>(d) To facilitate enforcement of the idling prohibition, the law should allow the Police to get the name of the driver from the vehicle owner.</p> | <p>(c) According to the advice which we obtained from the vehicle manufacturers, for certain commercial vehicles equipped with turbochargers, it is necessary for the drivers to keep the engines running for a short period after the vehicles become stationary. Although the length of idling period suggested by different manufacturers varied, but in general it is sufficient for the drivers to idle the vehicles for three minutes.</p> <p>The Bill authorizes traffic wardens and environmental protection inspectors, not police officers, as enforcement agents. The Bill does not include a clause enabling the Authority to obtain a driver's name from a vehicle owner as there may be serious arguments as to whether such clause is proportionate to the objective of the Bill and the penalty level proposed.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Taxi & Bus Passengers for Clean Air (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(04)) | <p>The organization made the following points –</p> <p>(a) In consideration of the serious pollution caused by roadside emission, the idling prohibition should be implemented early with no further exemptions.</p> | <p>(a) We note Taxi & Bus Passengers for Clean Air's support to the idling prohibition and its views against further exemption.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|---|--|
| | <p>To facilitate its enforcement, the Administration should also ensure the provision of necessary supporting facilities, such as covers and shades for taxi stands.</p> <p>(b) The Government should also actively pursue other measures which could improve air quality. For example, compilation of Hong Kong's air quality index with reference to the World Trade Organization's guidelines on air quality.</p> <p>(c) Bus companies should maintain the air-conditioning on buses at 25.5 degrees Celsius in summer and turn it</p> | <p>Please refer to the response to The Conservancy Association's views on pages 15 to 17 above.</p> <p>(b) Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above. On the Air Quality Objectives (AQOs) Review, we completed the public consultation on the proposed new AQOs and air quality improvement measures in end-November 2009 and reported the findings to the Panel on Environmental Affairs in June 2010. The proposed air quality improvement measures encompass a wide range of areas covering power plants, motor vehicles, vessels, traffic and transport management, as well as energy efficiency improvement. Many of these are as controversial as they are complicated. It will take us some more time to develop a comprehensive strategy on how best we should take forward the air quality improvement measures and update the AQOs. Meanwhile, we are actively pursuing those measures that are generally supported by the community.</p> <p>(c) According to TD, the air-conditioning systems of all franchised buses are equipped with thermostats for temperature</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|--|---|
| | off in winter. | control. The system can adjust the temperature of the bus compartment and at the same time effectively eliminate humidity and odors from passengers. In order to improve the quality of service, some bus companies have applied comprehensive air-conditioning systems with heat and cooling functions, offering passengers with a more comfortable environment in winter. |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lung Fu Shan Environmental Concern Group (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(03)) | <p>The Concern Group supported the Bill, and was concerned about requests from the transport trade for further exemptions.</p> <p>It also considered the proposal to allow the Director of Environmental Protection to further exempt any driver or class of driver too broad, and called for its removal from the Bill.</p> | <p>We note Lung Fu Shan Environmental Concern Group's support to the idling prohibition and its views against further exemption.</p> <p>In deciding whether to grant an exemption under clause 6 of the Bill to a driver (or a class of drivers), the Director of Environmental Protection (the Director) will carefully consider whether the need to allow the ICE to operate while the motor vehicle is stationary on the road is genuine and unavoidable as well as the degree of environmental nuisances caused. The Director will only exercise the power under clause 6 of the Bill if he or she is satisfied that there is a justified case, and the Director may impose any condition which he or she thinks fit. If a case is related to a particular local community, the Director would also consider the views of the</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|---|---|
| | | District Council concerned when deciding on the matter. |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Hong Kong Business Coalition on the Environment (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10(10)) | <p>The Coalition supported the Bill in principle in recognition that air pollution was a threat to the business community's competitiveness. It agreed on the need to allow flexibility for vehicles that had to keep their engines running for operational reasons. It also called for more concrete efforts by the Government to tackle the local and regional air pollution problems.</p> | <p>We note Hong Kong Business Coalition on the Environment's support to the idling prohibition. Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Green Power (LC Paper No. CB(1)2203/09-10(02)) | <p>Green Power made the following points –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) It accepted the proposed exemptions in the Bill only to facilitate its passage to implement the idling prohibition. (b) Idling vehicles with the engine running would lead to greater wear and tear of the engine and waste of fuels. (c) Public support was important in ensuring success of the idling prohibition. (d) The Bill was long overdue. Members should facilitate its early implementation to safeguard public health. | <p>We note Green Power's support to the idling prohibition.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|---|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Clean Air Action | <p>Clean Air Action made the following points –</p> <p>(a) It hoped the Bill could be passed early considering the significant benefits it could bring to the air quality of Hong Kong as evidenced by the roadside measurements Clean Air Action had made, and the impacts of roadside emissions on public health, in particular on the drivers themselves.</p> <p>(b) Idling vehicles with running engines would do more harm to the engine than frequently switching it off and on.</p> <p>(c) More supporting facilities should be provided to facilitate implementation of the idling prohibition.</p> | <p>(a) and (b) We note Clean Air Action's support to the idling prohibition.</p> <p>(c) Please refer to the response to The Conservancy Association's views on pages 15 to 17 above and the response to Clear The Air's views on page 18 above.</p> |
| <u>Professional institutes</u> | | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Association of Engineering Professionals in Society Ltd (AES) (LC Paper No. CB(1)2064/09-10(05)) | <p>AES supported the idling prohibition in recognition that some drivers tended to turn on the air-conditioning for their own comfort while vehicles were idling. The prohibition would, however, cause greater wear and tear to the engine due to frequent switching off and restarting, which in turn would also lead to greater emissions. The prohibition might also affect the business of taxis and PLBs because passengers might prefer rail service to taxi and PLB service if these vehicles became too hot</p> | <p>Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> <p><i>Frequent restart of engines:</i></p> <p>With the comprehensive list of exemptions covering drivers of different motor vehicles and various circumstances as well as the three-in-sixty-minute grace period, drivers of commercial vehicles will not have to restart the engines of their vehicles</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|---|---|
| | <p>because of the prohibition. As such, all commercial vehicles should be exempted from the idling prohibition.</p> | <p>frequently. In fact, reducing unnecessary idling of the engines helps reduce the wear and tear of engine parts. According to a study conducted by the Office of Energy Efficiency of the Natural Resources Canada (the Office), an idling vehicle will produce carbon deposits and unburned fuel residues which will accumulate and damage the engine at several vital points. Excessive idling may lead to more frequent servicing of spark plugs, fuel injectors, valve seats and piston crowns. The study also suggests that idling a motor vehicle for one hour is equivalent to two hours of driving in terms of wear-and-tear.</p> <p>On whether frequent restart of a motor vehicle will result in extra wear and tear of the starter and battery, the Office advises that the break-even point for offsetting any incremental maintenance cost is under 60 seconds. In other words, by switching off the engine of an idling vehicle for at least 60 seconds, the monetary saving from reduced fuel use should be more than offset any potential increase in maintenance cost.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Institute of the Motor Industry HK | <p>Hong Kong's traffic conditions and weather were different from those of other countries. As such, care should be exercised in implementing the idling prohibition so as not to cause nuisance to affected parties.</p> | <p>Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|---|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Hong Kong Paediatric Society (LC Paper No. CB(1)2053/09-10(05)) | <p>The Society supported the Bill because emissions from idling vehicles were directly linked to respiratory dysfunction in children, predisposition to asthmatic attacks, lowering of the immune function, permanent lung damage, and there might be association between premature mortality and ozone exposures.</p> | <p>We note The Hong Kong Paediatric Society's support to the idling prohibition.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers (HKIE) (LC Paper No. CB(1) 2121/09-10(15)) | <p>While welcoming measures to improve air quality, HKIE also made the following points –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) It did not support the Bill because it had failed to meet the criteria of being equitable and fair, simple and direct in its enforcement and cost effective, and not too intrusive. (b) The idling prohibition should not cover all locations at all hours but should be implemented only at locations which posed extreme health risks to pedestrians. (c) HKIE was glad to note that the technical parameters of various engines were presently taken into account, and that private roads were covered in the Bill. (d) The proposed 3-minute grace period was not easy to enforce. | <p>Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above. On enforcement of the three-in-sixty-minute grace period, please refer to the response to item (e) on pages 13 to 14 above.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|---|--|
| | (e) Exemptions should be granted to the physically challenged or those with health needs on their way to and from medical consultation. | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Hong Kong Asthma Society (LC Paper No. CB(1)2117/09-10(05)) | <p>The Society fully supported the Bill, and pointed out that there were very strong local data to show that air pollution resulted in a proportional increase in asthmatic exacerbations, doctor and emergency room visits, hospitalization, and death from asthma and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. The effect was especially severe in children and senior citizens. There was an urgent need for the Government to reduce roadside emissions through all possible measures. The idling prohibition was an important step in this regard.</p> | <p>We note The Hong Kong Asthma Society's support to the idling prohibition.</p> |
| <p><u>Political parties, District Council members and public policy think tanks</u></p> | | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong (DAB) | <p>The idling prohibition should be implemented flexibly to take into account operational needs of the transport trades. Further exemptions should also be considered in the light of their views and concerns.</p> <p>The Administration should provide sufficient training to enforcement agents, provide implementation details of the proposed 3-minute grace period, and include police officers as enforcement agents.</p> | <p>Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> <p>Please refer to the response to item (e) on pages 13 to 14 above. On the enforcement arrangement, the Hong Kong Police Force reiterated that police officers will not be listed as "authorized officers"</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|---|---|
| | | under the Bill. |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ms Christine FONG, Sai Kung District Councillor (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(02)) | To protect professional drivers' health, exemptions should be provided at taxi/PLB/bus stands on days of very hot weather/heavy rains, and under warranted circumstances (e.g. the road was swamped with mosquitoes.) A grace period should be allowed when the Bill first took effect. | Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above and the response to item (n) on pages 4 to 5 above. |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dr YANG Mo, Southern District Councillor (LC Paper No. CB(1)2053/09-10(02)) | Apart from stating support for the Bill, Dr YANG also proposed that the exemption granted to the first five taxis at taxi stands should be further relaxed to avoid frequent switching off and restarting of the engine. | We note Dr Yang's support to the idling prohibition. Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above. |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mr YEUNG Wai-sing, Eastern District Councillor (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(10)) | <p>The enforcement agents should give warnings before starting to count the time.</p> <p>Prominent warning signs should also be posted to remind drivers of the idling prohibition.</p> <p>An appeal mechanism should be provided under the Bill.</p> | <p>Please refer to the response to item (e) on pages 13 to 14 above.</p> <p>Please refer to second paragraph of the response to The Conservancy Association's views on pages 15 to 17 above.</p> <p>The Bill provides a mechanism for a person to dispute his or her liability for contravention of the idling prohibition.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Designing Hong Kong (LC Paper No. CB(1)2053/09-10(04)) | Designing Hong Kong strongly supported the idling prohibition and pointed out that technology which could allow the air conditioner in a vehicle to run on battery | We note Designing Hong Kong's support to the idling prohibition. On powering of air conditioner while a motor vehicle is stationary, please refer to the response to |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|--|---|
| | <p>power for a short period was available at reasonable cost.</p> <p>It considered the proposed 3-minute grace period unnecessary and undesirable because it would make enforcement of the Bill impossible.</p> <p>It also opined that enforcement matters should be left to the Police.</p> | <p>Clear The Air's views on page 18 above.</p> <p>Please refer to the response to item (e) on pages 13 to 14 above.</p> <p>On the enforcement arrangement, the Hong Kong Police Force reiterated that police officers will not be listed as "authorized officers" under the Bill.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Lion Rock Institute | <p>The Institute strongly opposed to the Bill, and opined that measures other than the idling prohibition should be taken instead, such as reduction of emissions from power generation, negotiation with the Guangdong Province to reduce pollutants from the Mainland, etc.</p> | <p>Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Civic Exchange | <p>Civic Exchange opined that public health should not be sacrificed for personal comfort. It proposed that concessions for increased idling times should be offered to franchised and non-franchised buses that complied with emission standards equivalent to or better than those of a well-maintained Euro IV engine. This would create an incentive for public transport operators to upgrade/retrofit their fleets faster.</p> | <p>In proposing the Bill, we have carefully considered whether the proposed exemptions would be adequate to cater for the operational needs of drivers and the transport trades. Since buses meeting more stringent emission standards will still create roadside air pollution and environmental nuisances when they are idling, we do not support the proposal of granting a longer grace period to their drivers on this ground.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|--|---|
| | <p>The focus of the above scheme should be placed on buses while school buses and trucks should also be encouraged to switch to cleaner vehicles.</p> <p>All vehicles should also be labeled to show their emission standards. This would help the Administration and the trades to prepare for the introduction of low emission zones (LEZs).</p> | <p>To reduce roadside air pollution and environmental nuisances caused by idling vehicles, as well as to reduce exposure of drivers to vehicle exhaust emissions, we propose to apply the idling prohibition to all motor vehicles with ICEs. At the same time, we will continue our efforts in encouraging the replacement of older diesel commercial vehicles and promoting the use of environment-friendly vehicles (including electric vehicles) and fuels [please refer to LC Paper No. CB(1)2690/09-10(01) for details].</p> <p>On introduction of LEZs, as franchised buses account for up to 40% of the traffic flow along busy corridors in Causeway Bay, Central and Mong Kok, we are examining the feasibility of setting up pilot LEZs targeting at franchised buses at one or more of these busy corridors. The findings will help us study the feasibility of extending the scope of LEZs to other types of motor vehicles in the future. Should the extension be considered feasible, we will examine the need for labelling motor vehicles to show their design emission standards to facilitate its enforcement.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|--|---|
| <u>Schools, chambers of commerce and community organizations</u> | | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Canadian International School of Hong Kong (LC Paper No. CB(1)203809-10(07)) | <p>The school community strongly supported the Bill considering the health impacts of air pollution. In their view, the Bill would empower the school to seek the co-operation of drivers waiting near the school to turn off the engines of their cars while idling, and could help bring Hong Kong up to par with other international cities.</p> | <p>We note Canadian International School of Hong Kong's support to the idling prohibition.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Chinese International School | <p>Chinese International School supported the idling prohibition which had been implemented in many places in the world and was an important step to tackling roadside emissions. It should be noted that the proposed 3-minute grace period which had been implemented in New York City for many years had been shortened to one minute for places near to schools.</p> | <p>We note Chinese International School's support to the idling prohibition.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Swedish Chamber of Commerce | <p>Air pollution had a real negative impact on overseas enterprises' decisions regarding business expansion in Hong Kong. Taking measures against unnecessary idling was therefore a step in the right direction. There would be risks if further exemptions were provided.</p> | <p>We note Swedish Chamber of Commerce's support to the idling prohibition and its views against further exemption.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Danish Chamber of Commerce (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(13)) | <p>The Chamber supported the Bill because roadside pollution in Hong Kong was a disgrace, and the most important improvement</p> | <p>We note Danish Chamber of Commerce's support to the idling prohibition.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|--|--|
| | required for future international recognition of Hong Kong was better air quality. | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Australian Chamber of Commerce in Hong Kong (LC Paper No. CB(1)2117/09-10(10)) | <p>The Chamber supported the Bill in principle. The Chamber agreed that there should be practicable and enforceable penalties with flexibility for vehicles which had to keep their engines running for operational reasons. The Chamber also urged the Government to tackle local and regional air pollution problems.</p> | <p>We note Australian Chamber of Commerce in Hong Kong's support to the idling prohibition. Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Neighbourhood and Workers' Service Centre (NWSC) (LC Paper No. CB(1)2090/09-10(09)) | <p>NWSC made the following points –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) LPG taxis should be exempted from the idling prohibition. (b) There were not sufficient taxi stands to support implementation of the idling prohibition. (c) Enforcement problems would arise in the absence of guidelines on how weather issues and taxis waiting at non-taxi stands should be handled, leading to disputes between enforcement agents and drivers. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Regardless of fuel type, all vehicles cause environmental nuisances and consume fuel when their ICEs are operating. Therefore, the idling prohibition would also be applicable to all vehicles of all fuel type. (b) Taking into account the operational needs and traffic conditions, TD will consider suggestions from the trade on provision of taxi stands in suitable locations. (c) to (e) Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above. |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|---|--|
| | <p>(d) Exemptions should be provided to drivers/vehicles on days of very hot weather/heavy rain.</p> <p>(e) The Bill would affect taxi drivers' livelihood and health.</p> | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Senior Citizen Home Safety Association (LC Paper No. CB(1) 2064/09-10(03)) | <p>The Association pointed out that air quality was closely associated with the health of the elderly and respiratory diseases. It supported the Bill in principle.</p> | <p>We note Senior Citizen Home Safety Association's support to the idling prohibition.</p> |
| <p><u>Others</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mr Martin OEI (LC Paper No. CB(1)2064/09-10(01)) | <p>Mr OEI made the following points –</p> <p>(a) Considering the health and labour insurance issues involved, exemptions from the idling prohibition should be granted when the ambient temperature inside a vehicle exceeded 27 degrees Celsius. Better still, all commercial vehicles in operation should be exempted.</p> <p>(b) Doctors on duty and drivers certified to have relevant health needs should also be exempted.</p> <p>(c) Government vehicles and vehicles of the People's Liberation Army stationed in Hong Kong should also be exempted when on duty.</p> | <p>Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|--|--|--|
| | Exemptions for taxis and PLBs provided in section 2 of Schedule 1 to the Bill should be amended as per his suggestions made in his submission. | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mr Rummen YEUNG (LC Paper No. CB(1)2038/09-10(03)) | Mr YEUNG considered that idling vehicles with running engines were not a major source of roadside air pollution. To improve air quality, the Administration should promote the use of electric cars instead of implementing the idling prohibition, which had many problems. For example, uncertainties as to whether a driver would be prosecuted for illegal parking if he did not stay in his idling car because the temperature inside was too high. Mr YEUNG proposed that the idling prohibition should be enforced in designated areas only, such as where schools, hospitals, homes for the aged, etc were nearby. | Please refer to the response to items (a) to (m) on pages 1 to 4 above and the response to item (q) on pages 6 to 7. |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Coalition of Hong Kong Newspaper and Magazine Merchants (LC Paper No. CB(1)2121/09-10(12)) | The Coalition supported the Bill as newspaper vendors were exposed to roadside pollution from idling vehicles with running engines every day for long hours. | We note Coalition of Hong Kong Newspaper and Magazine Merchants' support to the idling prohibition. |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ms Tania Willis (LC Paper No. CB(1)2053/09-10(01)) | Ms Willis supported the Bill and considered it essential to ensuring public health. | We note Ms Tania Willis's support to the idling prohibition. |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mr Markus Wohlgenannt (LC Paper No. CB(1)2053/09-10(07)) | Mr Wohlgenannt opined that the Bill was long overdue because the problem of vehicles idling with running engines was serious, and the air quality was deteriorating and affecting public | We note Mr Markus Wohlgenannt's support to the idling prohibition. |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---|--|--|
| | health. | |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Electric Transport Systems Limited (ETS) (LC Paper No. CB(1)2117/09-10(09)) | <p>ETS supported the Bill and made the following suggestions to address the heat problem of stationary vehicles –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) Use of devices which could power most vehicles' air conditioning systems while their engines were switched off. (b) Modifications to the construction of certain vehicles to significantly reduce heat gain and loss of coolness. (c) Construction of environmentally friendly covered termini in a combination of planter trellis, PV solar panels and micro-wind turbines which could supply clean electricity to vehicles waiting at these termini. | <p>We note ETS's support to the idling prohibition.</p> <p>Conducting a real-life trial is the best way to objectively assess the technical viability and cost implication of a product to its user. We have therefore arranged a meeting for Mr Nigel Lam of ETS to explain his device to some interested members of the taxi trade and explore with them the feasibility of trying the device. The trial findings will also be useful to Mr Lam in his promotion of the device to the local transport trades.</p> <p>Subsequent to the meeting, Mr Lam has touched base with interested members of the taxi trade for the arrangement of the trial. Upon receipt of more detailed information about the proposed device from Mr Lam, we will help seek comments from the relevant government departments, such as Transport Department and the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department, on the device.</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ms Amy NG | <p>Ms NG supported the Bill and urged the Government to provide more shaded parking or waiting areas for taxis and PLBs to facilitate implementation of the idling prohibition. The many exemptions under the Bill might only</p> | <p>We note Ms Amy Ng's support to the idling prohibition and its views against further exemption.</p> |

| <i>Organization</i> | <i>Concerns/Views</i> | <i>Administration's comments</i> |
|---------------------|------------------------------------|---|
| | water down the effect of the Bill. | TD will consider and assist in the provision of parking/waiting areas as well as covers/shades for the passengers at taxi/PLB stands whenever necessary and feasible. Upon receipt of such suggestion, it will examine the operation and utilisation of the concerned taxi/PLB stand, as well as the traffic management and site condition of the concerned taxi/PLB stands together with the relevant parties. |

**Environment Protection Department
September 2010**