

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 4

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 28 October 2009 at 11:00 am,
Thursday 29 October at 9:00 am and Friday 30 October 2009 at 9:00 am**

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 29.10.2009)

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP (absent on 29.10.2009)

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP (absent on 28.10.2009)

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau (absent on 29.10.2009)

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Member absent:

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

On 28.10.2009

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration and
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

28.10.2009 and 29.10.2009

Ms Julia LEUNG Fung-ye, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Mr Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP
Under Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

On 28.10.2009, 29.10.2009 and 30.10.2009

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

On 29.10.2009 and 30.10.2009

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBM, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

Ms Florence HUI Hiu-fai, JP
Under Secretary for Home Affairs

30.10.2009

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-ye, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Prof LAU Siu-kai, JP
Head, Central Policy Unit

Clerks in attendance:

On 28.10.2009 and 29.10.2009

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

On 28.10.2009, 29.10.2009 and 30.10.2009

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

On 28.10.2009 and 30.10.2009

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

On 29.10.2009

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 29.10.2009 and 30.10.2009

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Air Navigation (Hong Kong) Order 1995 (Amendment of Schedule 16) Order 2009 (gazetted on 23.10.2009)	193/2009
2. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule) Order 2009 (gazetted on 23.10.2009)	194/2009
3. Shipping and Port Control (Amendment) Regulation 2008 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 23.10.2009)	195/2009
4. Merchant Shipping (Local Vessels) (General) (Amendment) Regulation 2008 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 23.10.2009)	196/2009

Other Papers

No. 20	-	Audited Financial Statements of the Customs and Excise Service Welfare Fund for the year ended 31 March 2009 and its Summary, together with the Director of Audit's Report (published on 21.10.2009)
No. 21	-	Electrical and Mechanical Services Trading Fund Annual Report 2008/09 (published on 21.10.2009)
No. 22	-	Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Fund Annual Report for the year from 1 April 2008 to 31 March 2009 (published on 23.10.2009)
No. 23	-	Office of the Telecommunications Authority Trading Fund Report 2008/09 (published on 27.10.2009)
No. 24	-	Hong Kong Post Annual Report 2008/09 (published on 28.10.2009)

Questions

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Motion of Thanks

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council thanks the Chief Executive for his address.

While Hon Miriam LAU was speaking, Hon LAU Kong-wah said that the placards displayed by other Members blocked his view. He requested the Members to put down the placards.

The President said that the convention regarding display of placards or other objects by Members in the Chamber during Council meetings was that such placards or objects should be relevant to the subject being debated and they should not obstruct the conduct of meetings or other Members. The President then requested Members to place the placards at a suitable position so as not to block the view of other Members.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong said that the placards were so small that they could not block the view of other Members.

The President reiterated that the display of placards in the Chamber should follow the convention that they should not obstruct other Members.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke again.

While Hon Miriam LAU was speaking, Hon LAU Kong-wah repeated his request that the placard which was blocking his view should be removed.

The President pointed out that Hon LAU Kong-wah's request was not a point of order, and the Rules of Procedure did not specify how placards should be displayed. The President hoped that Members would cooperate so that the meeting could be conducted smoothly.

Hon Miriam LAU continued to speak.

Question on the motion proposed.

The President said that the motion and the amendments thereto, to be moved by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Emily LAU, Hon WONG Sing-chi and Hon Alan LEONG, would be debated together in a joint debate.

The President announced the commencement of the first debate session on the theme of "Developing the Infrastructure for Economic Growth". The session covered the policy areas of commerce and industry, development (planning, lands and works), economic development (other than energy), financial affairs, housing, information technology and broadcasting (other than creative industry) and transport.

Six Members and Hon Mrs Regina IP spoke.

While Hon Mrs Regina IP was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:03 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two more Members and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke.

At 1:41 pm, while Hon LEE Wing-tat was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Twenty-one other Members and Hon WONG Ting-kwong spoke.

While Hon WONG Ting-kwong was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two more Members and Hon Cyd HO spoke.

At 7:33 pm, while Hon Cyd HO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three other Members spoke.

Hon Abraham SHEK spoke and declared that he was an Independent Non-executive Director of the MTR Corporation Limited.

One more Member spoke.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:01 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 29 October 2009 to continue the first debate session of the Motion of Thanks.

Three Members spoke.

The Financial Secretary, the Secretary for Transport and Housing, the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development, the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke.

The President announced the end of the first debate session and the commencement of the second debate session on the theme of "Quality City and Quality Life". The session covered the policy areas of development (heritage conservation), economic development (energy), environmental affairs, food safety and environmental hygiene, home affairs (other than district administration and civic education), information technology and broadcasting (creative industry).

Eleven Members and Hon WONG Yung-kan spoke.

While Hon WONG Yung-kan was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:02 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three other Members and Prof Hon Patrick LAU spoke.

At 1:59 pm, while Prof Hon Patrick LAU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Ten more Members spoke.

With the President's permission, Hon WONG Yung-kan elucidated a point made in his earlier speech, which had been misunderstood by Hon WONG Sing-chi.

Three other Members spoke.

The Secretary for the Environment, the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development, the Secretary for Food and Health and the Secretary for Home Affairs spoke.

The President announced the end of the second debate session and the commencement of the third debate session on the theme of "Investing for a Caring Society". The session covered the policy areas of manpower, welfare services (including social enterprise and family matters) and security (anti-drug policy).

Six Members and Hon Ronny TONG spoke.

While Hon Ronny TONG was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Six more Members and Hon WONG Sing-chi spoke.

At 7:20 pm, while Hon WONG Sing-chi was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Five other Members spoke.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:20 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 30 October 2009 to continue the third debate session of the Motion of Thanks.

The Secretary for Home Affairs, the Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Education spoke.

The President announced the end of the third debate session and the commencement of the fourth debate session on the theme of “Optimising Our Demographic Structure and Attracting Talent”. The session covered the policy areas of education, health services and security (immigration policies).

Eighteen Members spoke.

The Secretary for Education, the Secretary for Food and Health and the Secretary for Security spoke.

The President announced the end of the fourth debate session and the commencement of the fifth debate session on the theme of “Developing Democracy and Enhancing Governance”. The session covered the policy areas of administration of justice and legal services, constitutional affairs, home affairs (district administration and civic education), public service and security (other than immigration and anti-drug policies).

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke.

While Dr Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:56 pm temporarily and the President’s Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Eight other Members and Hon James TO spoke.

At 2:00 pm, while Hon James TO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Thirteen more Members spoke.

The Chief Secretary for Administration, the Secretary for Justice, the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs, the Secretary for the Civil Service, the Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Home Affairs spoke.

The President announced the end of the fifth debate session.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the amendments.

Hon Fredrick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU’s motion:

To add “, but expresses deep regret at the Policy Address’s failure to put forward any specific alleviation measures to respond to the difficulties currently faced by the grassroots, as well as its lack of any medium and long-term strategies to solve the problem of the disparity between the rich and the poor” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Fredrick FUNG's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon Fredrick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 18 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Motion of Thanks" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Emily LAU moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add " , but expresses regret at the Chief Executive's failure to perform his duty to approach the Central Government to strive for the implementation of the election of the Chief Executive and all Legislative Council Members by universal suffrage in 2012" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 23 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and three abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add “, but expresses regret that the Chief Executive completely ignores the problems of worsening disparity between the rich and the poor and the drastic increase in the poverty population” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment to Hon Miriam LAU’s motion proposed and put.

Hon WONG Sing-chi claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU’s motion:

To add “, but expresses deep regret at the Chief Executive’s failure to provide a roadmap for universal suffrage in the Policy Address, as well as his failure to honour his election promise of ‘settling the issue of universal suffrage once and for all’ ” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG’s amendment to Hon Miriam LAU’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Ronny TONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 22 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and four abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Miriam LAU replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Miriam LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 29 were present, 24 were in favour of the motion, three against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 10 were in favour of the motion and 19 against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 4 November 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 4:56 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
4 December 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 30/10/2009
 時間 TIME: 04:43:30 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對劉健儀議員的「致謝議案」，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	30	
投票 Vote	27	29	
贊成 Yes	4	17	
反對 No	18	6	
棄權 Abstain	5	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體	Functional Constituencies			地方選區	Geographical Constituencies		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國賢	Dr David LI	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
黃杏根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	Alan LEONG	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權	ABSTAIN
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	反對	NO	李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO
梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau			陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權	ABSTAIN	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	棄權	ABSTAIN
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	棄權	ABSTAIN	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	棄權	ABSTAIN
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	反對	NO	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 30/10/2009
 時間 TIME: 04:46:18 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 劉慧卿議員對劉健儀議員的「致謝議案」，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON EMILY LAU TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿 Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	30	
投票 Vote	28	29	
贊成 Yes	4	16	
反對 No	23	10	
棄權 Abstain	1	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 30/10/2009
時間 TIME: 04:48:25 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 黃成智議員對劉健儀議員的「致謝議案」議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG SING-CHI TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃成智 WONG Sing-chi

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	30	
投票 Vote	28	29	
贊成 Yes	9	17	
反對 No	15	6	
棄權 Abstain	4	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 30/10/2009
時間 TIME: 04:50:39 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁家傑議員對劉健儀議員的「致謝議案」，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON ALAN LEONG TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	30	
投票 Vote	28	29	
贊成 Yes	4	16	
反對 No	22	9	
棄權 Abstain	2	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 30/10/2009
 時間 TIME: 04:54:04 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「致謝議案」
 "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	29	30	
投票 Vote	29	29	
贊成 Yes	24	10	
反對 No	3	19	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁繼忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK