

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 5

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 4 November 2009 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Member absent:

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-ye, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Dumping at Sea (Exemption) (Amendment) Order 2009 (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	203/2009
2. Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Ordinance (Amendment of Schedules) Order 2009 (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	204/2009
3. Market (Cessation of Application of the Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance) Declaration 2009 (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	205/2009
4. Public Health and Municipal Services (Cessation of Designation as Public Market) Order 2009 (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	206/2009
5. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Amendment of Tenth Schedule) Order 2009 (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	207/2009
6. Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (Legislative Council) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	208/2009
7. Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (District Councils) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	209/2009
8. Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (Election Committee) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	210/2009
9. Electoral Procedure (Chief Executive Election) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	211/2009
10. Electoral Procedure (Village Representative Election) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	212/2009
11. Electoral Affairs Commission (Registration of Electors) (Legislative Council Geographical Constituencies) (District Council Constituencies) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.10.2009)	213/2009

- | | | |
|-----|--|----------|
| 12. | Electoral Affairs Commission (Registration) (Electors for Legislative Council Functional Constituencies) (Voters for Election Committee Subsectors) (Members of Election Committee) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.10.2009) | 214/2009 |
| 13. | Electoral Affairs Commission (Registration of Electors) (Village Representative Election) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.10.2009) | 215/2009 |
| 14. | Voting by Imprisoned Persons Ordinance (Commencement) (No. 2) Notice 2009 (gazetted on 30.10.2009) | 216/2009 |

Questions

1. Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development declared that she was a Council member of the Hong Kong Trade Development Council and then replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Dr Hon Philip WONG declared that he was a Council member of the Hong Kong Trade Development Council. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Another Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO declared that he was the Chairman of the Infrastructure Development Advisory Committee of the Hong Kong Trade Development Council. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

One more Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

3. Hon Paul TSE asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Transport and Housing and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

4. Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

5. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Labour and Welfare and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

6. Hon James TO asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Disability Discrimination Ordinance

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the Disability Discrimination Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 5) Notice 2009, made by the Chief Executive in Council on 6 October 2009, be approved.

While the Secretary for Labour and Welfare was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:16 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Three Members and Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the motion.

At 1:42 pm, while Hon TAM Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three other Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon CHAN Kin-por moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that in relation to the Building (Minor Works) (Fees) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 178 of 2009 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 14 October 2009, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 2 December 2009.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that in relation to the Rules of the High Court (Amendment) Rules 2009, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 186 of 2009 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 14 October 2009, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 2 December 2009.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Alleviating the burden of travelling expenses

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as the people of Hong Kong are still under the impact of the financial tsunami, many of them face difficulties in life and bear a heavy burden of travelling expenses, this Council urges the Government to discuss with various public transport operators and adopt effective measures to alleviate the burden of travelling expenses on the public, which include:

- (a) to provide subsidies to the MTR Corporation Limited, bus companies, green minibus and ferry operators so that they will offer half-fare concessions to passengers on Saturdays, Sundays and public holidays, thereby enabling the public to have more opportunities to get together with their families and friends on those days;
- (b) to extend the deadline for submitting applications under the Transport Support Scheme, further relax the eligibility criteria and the subsidy period under the Scheme and expand it to cover all districts in the territory;
- (c) to discuss with various public transport operators to offer the Free-ride Day for the elderly on public holidays and specified days of each week on a permanent basis, formulate an implementation timetable for the provision of half-fare concessions to people with disabilities, and study the feasibility of introducing daily, weekly and monthly travel passes that are valid among various public transport operators;
- (d) to discuss with the MTR Corporation Limited to continue extending its fare-freeze period, re-launch the 'Ride 10 Get One Free' Promotion, set up more MTR Fare Savers according to the requests of the residents and by using more consistent standards, and explore further extension of the existing monthly and daily ticket schemes, including introducing monthly tickets for short-haul trips and making it a permanent arrangement, etc;
- (e) to rationalize the fare structure of the MTR Corporation Limited, including rectifying the unreasonable and chaotic situation of 'fares for short-haul trips being more expensive than long-haul trips', adjusting downwards the fares of the Kowloon Southern Link to a reasonable level, and enabling the passengers to travel to Hung Hom Station using Tuen Mun-Nam Cheong Monthly Pass at the original price; as well as resume the service of the free bus route number K16;
- (f) to discuss with the franchised bus companies to re-launch same day return fare concessions, improve their existing fare structures, expeditiously revise the scale of fares under the Public Bus Services Ordinance as well as the route groupings under the scale, re-formulate the existing guidelines on the setting of fares to provide comprehensive sectional fares and bus-bus interchange concessions, including discounts for interchange among buses of different companies, provide half-fare concessions to all full-time students, as well as introduce daily and monthly ticket schemes for buses; and

- (g) targeting at the problem of high fares of outlying island ferry services, to actively study various suitable options, including substantially increasing the non-fare box revenue of ferry operators or the Government directly operating the services, etc; allocate resources to alleviate the burden of ferry service expenses on outlying island residents; and offer half-fare concessions on ferry services to students of outlying islands.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Andrew CHENG and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Twenty-four Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke again.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion:

To add "and the fare concessions offered to the elderly by local franchised bus companies and the MTR Corporation Limited will also expire early next year;" after "heavy burden of travelling expenses,;" to add "extend the existing fare concessions for the elderly and" after "public transport operators to"; to delete "study the feasibility of introducing" after "people with disabilities, and" and substitute with "expeditiously introduce"; to delete "explore further extension of" after "consistent standards, and" and substitute with "further extend"; and to add "as soon as possible" after "monthly and daily ticket schemes".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the following further amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG:

To delete "and" after "ticket schemes for buses,;" and to add "; (h) to progressively let the public sector operate the major transport facilities and services, so as to provide inexpensive, suitable and convenient public transport services to people and prevent

large consortia from profiteering; and (i) to halt the construction of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link, and make use of the funds earmarked for constructing the Rail Link to repurchase the Eastern Harbour Crossing, Western Harbour Crossing and the privately-owned shares of the MTR Corporation Limited, thereby reducing tunnel tolls and the fares of the MTR Corporation Limited” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung’s amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming’s motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 20 were against the amendment and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 18 against it and four abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming replied.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming’s motion as amended by Andrew CHENG put and agreed to.

Increasing the supply of medium and small-sized residential flats

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council urges the Government to resume the sale of land by public auction, build Home Ownership Scheme flats and re-launch the ‘Tenants Purchase Scheme’, so as to increase the supply of medium and small-sized residential flats to stabilize the property market, help the public purchase flats which are affordable to them and address the demand for housing.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat’s motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Vincent FANG intended to move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon James TO intended to move an amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Vincent FANG, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon James TO who intended to move an amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments, and declared that he was a non-executive director of the Urban Renewal Authority.

The Secretary for Development spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While the Secretary for Development was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eight Members and Prof Hon Patrick LAU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:30 pm, while Prof Hon Patrick LAU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Fourteen other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Development spoke again.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke again.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion:

To add “, in view of the recent abnormal speculation and soaring prices in the property market of Hong Kong, which have affected local residents in acquiring their homes,” after “That”; to delete “to resume” after “the Government” and substitute with “, on the basis of ensuring that the supply of land for building public rental housing will not be reduced and the waiting time for public rental housing will be shortened, to take proactive and effective countermeasures, which include: (a) to immediately improve the Application List System by lowering the threshold for applying for the sale of sites and increasing the land supply in the Application List; (b) to proactively consider resuming”; to delete “, build Home Ownership Scheme flats and re-launch” after “auction” and substitute with “; (c) whichever land sale measures mentioned above are to be adopted, the Government should give priority to exploring ways to increase the supply of land resources for building properties that meet the needs of the local sandwich class and grassroots to buy properties for self-occupation; (d) to resume building an appropriate number of Home Ownership Scheme (‘HOS’) flats; (e) to adopt proactive measures to revitalize the HOS secondary market; and (f) to re-launch”; and to add “so that public housing tenants can acquire their own homes;” after “ ‘Tenants Purchase Scheme’, ”.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed.

Hon James TO moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment:

To delete "consider resuming" after "(b) to proactively" and substitute with "arrange for resumption of".

Question on Hon James TO's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment, as amended by Hon James TO, to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon Vincent FANG had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion if Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment was passed. Hon Vincent FANG had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's and Hon James TO's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Kam-lam to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon James TO:

To add "and (g) in response to the aspiration of local residents, to relax the threshold for auction under the Land (Compulsory Sale for Redevelopment) Ordinance to speed up the redevelopment of old districts;" after "own homes;".

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon James TO proposed and put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and 12 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon LEE Wing-tat replied.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon James TO put.

Hon Vincent FANG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion as amended and five against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 24 were in favour of the motion as amended and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion as amended was passed.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 11 November 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 9:50 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
4 December 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 04/11/2009
時間 TIME: 05:29:05 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁國雄議員對張學明議員就「減輕交通費用負擔」所提，經鄭家富議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG KWOK-HUNG TO HON CHEUNG HOK-MING'S MOTION ON "ALLEVIATING THE BURDEN OF TRAVELLING EXPENSES" AS AMENDED BY HON ANDREW CHENG

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	27	
投票 Vote	24	26	
贊成 Yes	0	4	
反對 No	20	18	
棄權 Abstain	4	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
潘佩琴 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 04/11/2009
 時間 TIME: 09:39:10 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 陳鑑林議員對李永達議員就「增加中小型住宅供應」所提，經王國興議員及涂謹申議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHAN KAM-LAM TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S MOTION ON "INCREASING THE SUPPLY OF MEDIUM AND SMALL-SIZED RESIDENTIAL FLATS" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG KWOK-HING AND HON JAMES TO

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳鑑林CHAN Kam-lam

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	26	
投票 Vote	19	25	
贊成 Yes	11	6	
反對 No	6	7	
棄權 Abstain	2	12	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 04/11/2009
時間 TIME: 09:48:30 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 由李永達議員動議，經王國興議員 ~~及~~ 涂謹申議員 ~~及~~ 陳鑑林議員 ~~及~~ 方剛議員修正的「增加中小型住宅供應」議案
MOTION MOVED BY HON LEE WING-TAT ON "INCREASING THE SUPPLY OF MEDIUM AND SMALL-SIZED RESIDENTIAL FLATS" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG KWOK-HING, ~~AND HON JAMES TO, AND HON CHAN KAM-LAM, AND HON VINCENT FANG~~

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	26	
投票 Vote	18	25	
贊成 Yes	13	24	
反對 No	5	0	
棄權 Abstain	0	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

秘書 CLERK