

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 10

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9 December 2009 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS , JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

Ms Julia LEUNG Fung-ye, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP  
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

## **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Dangerous Drugs Ordinance (Amendment of Second Schedule) (No. 2) Order 2009 (gazetted on 4.12.2009)	239/2009
2. Pilotage (Dues) (Amendment) Order 2009 (gazetted on 4.12.2009)	240/2009
3. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 5) Notice 2009 (gazetted on 4.12.2009)	241/2009

## **Other Papers**

- No. 39 - Hong Kong Tourism Board Annual Report 2008/09 (published on 7.12.2009)
- No. 40 - Director of Social Welfare Incorporated  
Financial statements for the year ended 31 March 2009 together with the Report of the Director of Audit (published on 7.12.2009)
- No. 41 - Emergency Relief Fund Annual Report by the Trustee for the year ending 31 March 2009 (published on 7.12.2009)
- No. 42 - Police Welfare Fund Annual Report 2008/2009 (published on 7.12.2009)
- No. 43 - Annual Report on the Police Children's Education Trust and the Police Education and Welfare Trust 2008/2009 (published on 7.12.2009)

## **Questions**

1. Hon LAU Wong-fat asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Eight Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

2. Hon Alan LEONG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

3. Hon KAM Nai-wai asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Food and Health and the Secretary for Development replied.

4. Hon Albert CHAN asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

5. Hon Ronny TONG asked Question 5.

While Hon Ronny TONG was asking his question, the President left the chair at 12:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

A Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Hon CHIM Pui-chung declared that he was a major shareholder of one or two companies listed in the annex to the Administration's reply. He then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Hon Ronny TONG declared that he had provided legal service to many of those 38 companies listed in the annex to the Administration's reply.

Three other Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

6. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### First Reading

#### Buildings Energy Efficiency Bill

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

#### Buildings Energy Efficiency Bill

The Secretary for the Environment moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

At 1:13 pm, while the Secretary for the Environment was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

## Members' Motions

### Motion under Rule 49B(1A) of the Rules of Procedure

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council, in accordance with Article 79(7) of the Basic Law, censures Hon KAM Nai-wai for misbehaviour (details as particularized in the Schedule to this motion).

### **Schedule**

Details of misbehaviours of Hon KAM Nai-wai are set out below:

**(a) Hon KAM Nai-wai made inconsistent remarks to the media and withheld key information, causing the public to have doubts about his integrity**

There were media reports on 4 October 2009 that Hon KAM Nai-wai dismissed his female assistant because of his unsuccessful advances to her. The female assistant was employed with public funds to assist him in performing his duties as a Legislative Council Member. At his press conference held on the same day, Mr KAM:

- (i) denied that he had made advances to his female assistant and did not disclose that he had expressed affection towards her; and
- (ii) denied that he had dismissed his female assistant because of his unsuccessful advances, and pointed out that the employment contract with his female assistant was terminated by giving one-month payment in lieu of notice which was in accordance with the employment contract, but did not mention that he had expressed affection towards her.

However, after the media subsequently reported that he had actually made advances to his female assistant, Mr KAM admitted on 6 October 2009 on a radio programme that he had expressed affection towards his female assistant when he was alone with her on one occasion in mid-June 2009.

**(b) Hon KAM Nai-wai was unfair in dismissing his female assistant, whose overall work performance was judged by him to be good, after his expression of affection was rejected by her**

In mid-June 2009, Hon KAM Nai-wai expressed affection towards his female assistant. Subsequently, he noticed some signs of his female assistant rejecting him. Between early September and mid-September 2009, Mr KAM invited his female assistant to dine out and was also refused by her. Subsequently on 24 September 2009, he terminated the employment contract with his female assistant with immediate effect without reason assigned, although her overall work performance was judged by him to be good.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion ("censure motion") proposed.

The President stated that in accordance with Rule 49B(2A) of the Rules of Procedure, upon moving of the censure motion, the debate should be adjourned immediately and the matter stated in the censure motion should be referred to an investigation committee. However, a motion might be moved without notice by any Member to order the Council not to take further action on the censure motion. If the former motion was moved and passed by the Council, the Council should not take any further action on the censure motion, i.e. no debate would be held on the censure motion and no investigation committee would be established to investigate the matter stated in the censure motion.

Hon Paul TSE moved the following motion under Rule 49B(2A) of the Rules of Procedure and spoke on the motion:

That no further action shall be taken on the censure motion moved by Hon Miriam LAU.

Question on Hon Paul TSE's motion proposed.

Before inviting Members to speak on Hon Paul TSE's motion, the President reminded Members that they should confine their speeches to the scope of Hon Paul TSE's motion and should not express views on the allegations contained in the censure motion.

When he was called upon by the President to speak on Hon Paul TSE's motion, Hon KAM Nai-wai denied the two allegations against him as detailed in the censure motion moved by Hon Miriam LAU. The President reminded Hon KAM Nai-wai that he should only speak on Hon Paul TSE's motion and not the censure motion. Hon KAM Nai-wai explained that he only intended to provide some background information to facilitate Members in deciding whether to support Hon Paul TSE's motion.

Despite the President's repeated reminders, Hon KAM Nai-wai continued to express his opinions on the contents of the censure motion. The President then warned Hon KAM Nai-wai that he would not allow him to continue to speak if he insisted on making such remarks.

Hon James TO raised a point of order that Hon KAM Nai-wai should be allowed to continue his speech.

Hon Cyd HO also raised a point of order proposing that the meeting be suspended for 10 minutes so as to allow time for Hon KAM Nai-wai to reconsider the contents of his speech.

In response to the President, Hon KAM Nai-wai said that he did not need to reconsider the contents of his speech.

Dr Hon Margaret NG also raised a point of order proposing that the meeting be suspended for 10 minutes to enable Members to consider the matter and put forward views to the President regarding his ruling that Members should not express views on the allegations in the censure motion.

The President stated that he had given the matter due consideration before the meeting and considered that there was no need to suspend the meeting.

Hon KAM Nai-wai then continued to speak.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on Hon Paul TSE's motion.

While Dr Hon Margaret NG was speaking, Hon Miriam LAU sought elucidation of a point raised by Dr Hon Margaret NG in her speech. Dr Hon Margaret NG elucidated and continued to speak.

With the President's permission, Hon Miriam LAU elucidated a point she had made earlier which she considered to be misunderstood by Dr Hon Margaret NG.

Another Member and Hon CHIM Pui-chung spoke on the motion.

Dr Hon Margaret NG raised a point of order on whether Hon CHIM Pui-chung had used offensive language about her in his speech.

The President suspended the meeting at 3:32 pm.

The Council resumed at 3:45 pm.

The President ruled that Hon CHIM Pui-chung had used offensive language about another Member and that Hon CHIM Pui-chung should withdraw the remark concerned.

Hon CHIM Pui-chung withdrew his remark and continued to speak on the motion.

Eight more Members spoke on the motion.

With the President's permission, Hon Paul CHAN elucidated some points he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Ronny TONG and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung respectively.

Hon LAU Kong-wah spoke on the motion.

While Hon LAU Kong-wah was speaking, Hon LEE Wing-tat sought elucidation of a point raised by Hon LAU Kong-wah in his speech. Hon LAU Kong-wah elucidated and continued to speak.

Another Member and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the motion.

With the President's permission, Hon LAU Kong-wah elucidated some points he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon LEE Wing-tat.

With the President's permission, Hon LEE Wing-tat also elucidated a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon LAU Kong-wah.

Five more Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Paul TSE replied.

With the President's permission, Dr Hon Margaret NG elucidated a point she had made earlier which she considered to be misunderstood by Hon Paul TSE.

Question on Hon Paul TSE's motion put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, four were in favour of the motion, 15 against it and nine abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 10 were in favour of the motion, seven against it and 10 abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

The President ordered that in accordance with Rule 49B(2A) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate should now be adjourned and the matter stated in the censure motion moved by Hon Miriam LAU should be referred to an investigation committee.

Reviewing afresh the use of land at the Kowloon waterfront

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Chief Executive has put forward the policy directions of reducing development density and beautifying the waterfront promenade in his past three years' policy addresses, yet many waterfront sites in Kowloon have still been wrongly planned for the construction of densely built high-rise buildings in recent years, causing further damages to the beautiful ridgelines of Kowloon and even blocking the ventilation openings and aggravating the wall and heat island effects, hence exacerbating the environmental problems in Kowloon; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to honour its pledges made in the policy addresses and, by adhering to the overriding principle of conforming to environmental protection and low development density, strengthen the coordination and cooperation among different departments as well as review afresh the use of vacant waterfront sites in Kowloon, so as to create favourable conditions for the implementation of the Kowloon waterfront promenade project.

Question on Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion proposed.

The President stated that three Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG, Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon James TO, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Development spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While the Secretary for Development was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:26 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Seven Members and Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:29 pm, while Hon TAM Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Development spoke again.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion:

To add “, in his past three years’ policy addresses,” after “That”; to delete “put forward the policy directions of reducing development density and beautifying the waterfront promenade in his past three years’ policy addresses, yet many waterfront sites in Kowloon have still been wrongly planned for the construction of densely built high-rise buildings in recent years, causing further damages to the beautiful ridgelines of Kowloon and even blocking the ventilation openings and aggravating the wall and heat island effects, hence exacerbating the environmental problems in Kowloon” after “the Chief Executive has” and substitute with “proposed to beautify the harbourfront, implement harbourfront enhancement work and create a better living environment through a proper review of development density”; to delete “honour its pledges made in the policy addresses and, by adhering to the overriding principle of conforming to environmental protection and low development density” after “this Council urges the Government to” and substitute with “, by adhering to the overriding principle of balancing different needs for land between Hong Kong’s economic development and quality life”; to delete “as well as review afresh the use of vacant waterfront sites in Kowloon” after “different departments”; and to delete “the Kowloon waterfront promenade project” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “harbourfront beautifying work in various districts”.

Question on Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG’s amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and three against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Reviewing afresh the use of land at the Kowloon waterfront” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s motion:

To add “as well as constructing” after “reducing development density”; to add “there is still much room for improvement in the planning of” after “policy addresses, yet”; to add “and other districts, the Government should as far as practicable enable as many members of the public as possible to use these waterfront sites; at the same time, these sites” after “many waterfront sites in Kowloon”; to add “and other districts” after “beautiful ridgelines of Kowloon”; to delete “in Kowloon” after “environmental problems”; to delete “vacant” after “review afresh the use of”; and to add “and other districts” before “, so as to”.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN’s amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 16 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, five against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present and 25 were in favour of the amendment (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon James TO moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s motion as amended by Hon Tanya CHAN:

To add “including improving the accessibility of the waterfront and studying measures to address issues relating to ownership of private lands at the waterfront, present use of waterfront sites as well as impact of various future projects on lands at the waterfront,” before “so as to”.

Question on Hon James TO’s amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s motion as amended by Hon Tanya CHAN proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG replied.

Question on Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s motion as amended by Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon James TO put and agreed to.

#### Resignation en masse of Members returned from five geographical constituencies as a referendum

Hon WONG Yuk-man moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, this Council appeals to all people in Hong Kong to fully support the campaign of 'Resignation en masse of Members returned from five geographical constituencies as a referendum on the fight for dual universal suffrage in 2012', so as to, by way of direct democracy, return the right of decision on constitutional development to the people, and strongly requests the Special Administrative Region Government to take the opportunity of the constitutional reform consultation to relay to the Beijing Government the aspiration of Hong Kong people, with a view to fighting for the implementation of dual universal suffrage in 2012.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung and Hon Alan LEONG, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Four Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the President directed Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung to discontinue his speech as he had spoken in excess of the specified time.

Twelve Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Yuk-man spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion:

To delete "this Council appeals to" after "That," and substitute with "as constitutional development is a major issue affecting the well-being and interests of all Hong Kong people, this Council appeals to the Special Administrative Region Government to allow"; and to delete "fully support the campaign of 'Resignation en masse of Members returned from five geographical constituencies as a referendum on the fight for dual universal suffrage in 2012', so as to, by way of direct democracy," after "all people in Hong Kong to" and substitute with "decide, through a referendum, the constitutional arrangements for 2012 and beyond, and".

Question on Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion:

To add "de facto" after "as a"; to delete "dual universal suffrage in 2012" after "the fight for" and substitute with "the implementation of genuine universal suffrage and abolition of functional constituencies"; and to delete "dual universal suffrage in 2012" immediately before the full stop and substitute with "genuine universal suffrage and abolition of functional constituencies".

Question on Hon Alan LEONG's amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion proposed and put.

Hon Alan LEONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 18 against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion put.

Hon WONG Yuk-man claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, three were in favour of the motion, 21 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, 10 against it and 10 abstained (voting record in **Appendix VI**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 16 December 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 10:51 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
18 January 2010

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 09/12/2009  
時間 TIME: 05:36:50 下午-pm

動議 MOTION: 根據《議事規則》第49B條第(2A)款動議，不得就劉健儀議員動議的譴責議案再採取任何行動  
MOTION UNDER RULE 49B(2A) OF THE RULES OF PROCEDURE THAT NO FURTHER ACTION SHALL BE TAKEN ON THE CENSURE MOTION MOVED BY HON MIRIAM LAU

動議人 MOVED BY: 謝偉俊 Paul TSE

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	28	
投票 Vote	28	27	
贊成 Yes	4	10	
反對 No	15	7	
棄權 Abstain	9	10	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kgwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩瑛 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 09/12/2009  
時間 TIME: 07:51:14 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁劉柔芬議員對梁美芬議員的「重新審視九龍臨近海濱土地用途」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON MRS SOPHIE LEUNG TO DR HON PRISCILLA LEUNG'S MOTION ON  
"REVIEWING AFRESH THE USE OF LAND AT THE KOWLOON WATERFRONT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	24	
投票 Vote	18	23	
贊成 Yes	15	9	
反對 No	3	13	
棄權 Abstain	0	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 09/12/2009  
 時間 TIME: 07:54:21 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 陳淑莊議員對梁美芬議員的「重新審視九龍臨近海濱土地用途」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON TANYA CHAN TO DR HON PRISCILLA LEUNG'S MOTION ON  
 "REVIEWING AFRESH THE USE OF LAND AT THE KOWLOON WATERFRONT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳淑莊CHAN Tanya

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	16	26	
投票 Vote	16	25	
贊成 Yes	9	25	
反對 No	5	0	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 09/12/2009  
 時間 TIME: 10:41:30 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁耀忠議員對黃毓民議員的「五區總辭 全民公決」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG YIU-CHUNG TO HON WONG YUK-MAN'S MOTION ON  
 "RESIGNATION EN MASSE OF MEMBERS RETURNED FROM FIVE GEOGRAPHICAL  
 CONSTITUENCIES AS A REFERENDUM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	29	
投票 Vote	25	28	
贊成 Yes	4	18	
反對 No	21	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 5  
 日期 DATE: 09/12/2009  
 時間 TIME: 10:45:30 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁家傑議員對黃毓民議員的「五區總辭 全民公決」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALAN LEONG TO HON WONG YUK-MAN'S MOTION ON  
 "RESIGNATION EN MASSE OF MEMBERS RETURNED FROM FIVE GEOGRAPHICAL  
 CONSTITUENCIES AS A REFERENDUM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	28	
投票 Vote	25	27	
贊成 Yes	3	7	
反對 No	22	18	
棄權 Abstain	0	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-iam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6  
日期 DATE: 09/12/2009  
時間 TIME: 10:49:29 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「五區總辭 全民公決」議案  
MOTION ON "RESIGNATION EN MASSE OF MEMBERS RETURNED FROM FIVE GEOGRAPHICAL CONSTITUENCIES AS A REFERENDUM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	28	
投票 Vote	25	27 28	
贊成 Yes	3	8	
反對 No	21	10	
棄權 Abstain	1	10	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			何俊仁	Albert HO	棄權	ABSTAIN
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN	李華明	Fred LI	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	棄權	ABSTAIN
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	←	NO
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	反對	NO	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	反對	NO	李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO
梁家驛	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau			陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	反對	NO	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對	NO
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	棄權	ABSTAIN
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對	NO	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	反對	NO
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	贊成	YES
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	反對	NO	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK