

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 12

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 6 January 2010 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS , JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Members absent:

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBM, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

Dr Kitty POON Kit, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Patents Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1) Order 2009 (gazetted on 18.12.2009)	252/2009
2. Registered Designs Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Regulation 2009 (gazetted on 18.12.2009)	253/2009
3. Trade Marks Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1) Regulation 2009 (gazetted on 18.12.2009)	254/2009
4. Layout-design (Topography) of Integrated Circuits (Designation of Qualifying Countries, Territories or Areas) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (gazetted on 18.12.2009)	255/2009
5. Hawker (Permitted Places) Declaration 2009 (gazetted on 18.12.2009)	256/2009
6. Import and Export (Strategic Commodities) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule 1) Order 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 24.12.2009)	260/2009
7. Prisons (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2009 (gazetted on 31.12.2009)	261/2009
8. Drug Addiction Treatment Centre (Hei Ling Chau Addiction Treatment Centre) (Amendment) Order 2009 (gazetted on 31.12.2009)	262/2009
9. Drug Addiction Treatment Centre (Nei Kwu Correctional Institution) Order (gazetted on 31.12.2009)	263/2009
10. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 6) Notice 2009 (gazetted on 31.12.2009)	264/2009
11. Domestic Violence (Amendment) Ordinance 2009 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 31.12.2009)	265/2009

Other Papers

Report No. 2/09-10 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 4.1.2010)

Report of the Bills Committee on Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No. 3) Bill 2009 (published on 5.1.2010)

Questions

1. Hon CHAN Hak-kan asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

2. Hon Audrey EU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

3. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

4. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

5. Hon IP Wai-ming asked Question 5.

While Hon IP Wai-ming was asking his question, the President left the chair at 12:26 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

6. Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No. 3) Bill 2009

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 8 July 2009 resumed.

Hon Paul CHAN, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No. 3) Bill 2009, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

At 1:13 pm, while Hon Paul CHAN was addressing the Council, the President resumed the chair.

After the address, Hon Paul CHAN spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Two Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No. 3) Bill 2009.

Question that clauses 1 and 4 to 9 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2 and 3 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2 and 3 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No. 3) Bill 2009

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

The Secretary for the Environment moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Ordinance (Amendment of Schedules) Order 2009, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 204 of 2009 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 4 November 2009, be amended, in section 2, in the new Division 5, in section 1(b)(iv), by repealing “87” and substituting “35”.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Audrey EU spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Ordinance (Amendment of Schedules) Order 2009, and then in her personal capacity as a Member.

Another Member spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Motion under Rule 49E(2) of the Rules of Procedure

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council takes note of Report No. 2/09-10 of the House Committee laid on the Table of the Council on 6 January 2010 in relation to the subsidiary legislation and instrument(s) as listed below:

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Title of Subsidiary Legislation or Instrument</u>
(1)	Dumping at Sea (Exemption) (Amendment) Order 2009 (L.N. 203/2009).

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Albert HO spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Dumping at Sea (Exemption) (Amendment) Order 2009, and then in his personal capacity as a Member.

Two other Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion.

The President stated that under Rule 49E(9) of the Rules of Procedure, he would not put any question on the motion and the Council would proceed to the next item of business.

Establishing a comprehensive consumer protection regime

Hon Starry LEE moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, incidents of traders using misleading, deceptive, high-pressure, intimidating, harassing or other unfair means to market products or services are common in recent years, undermining the interests of consumers, and many people consider that consumer protection in Hong Kong is inadequate; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to establish a comprehensive consumer protection regime, including:

- (a) to require a cooling-off period be provided for agreements involving membership, package tickets and other pre-paid services to allow consumers to terminate such agreements within a specified period after signing an agreement to purchase the relevant goods or services without having to pay any fees or charges;
- (b) to require traders to issue in writing the terms and conditions within a specified period for any service agreement reached verbally through on-street promotion or over the telephone, and that the agreement will only be effective upon a signed confirmation by the consumer;
- (c) to monitor effectively the services provided by telecommunications service operators and those services provided by a third party through such operators, such as mobile messages and content services, etc. so as to ensure that the marketing practices, terms and conditions of services and charges are transparent and fair;
- (d) to extend the scope of the Unsolicited Electronic Messages Ordinance to include person-to-person commercial telemarketing calls, and require the caller to stop all marketing activities immediately upon a roaming signal coming from the telephone of the receiver;
- (e) to introduce legislative amendments to enhance the regulation of multi-level marketing;
- (f) to empower the Consumer Council to act as the proctor for consumers whose interests are undermined to initiate court proceedings to seek compensation from unscrupulous traders when required; and
- (g) to formulate a comprehensive Consumer Interests Protection Ordinance to plug the loopholes arising from the existing fragmented and discordant legislation, and to fully regulate unfair trade practices involving goods and services; and at the same time, in order to tie in with the implementation of the Consumer Interests Protection Ordinance, to confer administrative and law enforcement powers under the Ordinance to the Consumer Council, or establish the post of consumer protection commissioner to undertake the relevant administrative and law enforcement work.

Question on Hon Starry LEE's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon Samson TAM, Hon Fred LI and Hon Vincent FANG, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Two Members and Hon WONG Ting-kwong spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon WONG Ting-kwong was speaking, the President left the chair at 4:11 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Two more Members and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 4:32 pm, while Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Eight other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Starry LEE spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke again.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon Starry LEE's motion:

To add "to safeguard Hong Kong's international reputation as a shopping paradise, the SAR Government must face squarely the fact that" after "That,,"; to add "certain" after "incidents of"; to add "and unjust" after "other unfair"; to add "to enhance consumers' rights to knowledge, choice and protection" after "consumer protection regime"; to delete "and fair" after "transparent" and substitute with ", fair and just"; to delete "to introduce legislative amendments to enhance the regulation of multi-level marketing" after "(e)" and substitute with "while stepping up supervision, publicity and education to promote legal and proper marketing, to expeditiously amend the Pyramid Selling Prohibition Ordinance (Cap. 355) to combat and eliminate all types of fraudulent multi-level marketing practices"; to delete "and" after "unscrupulous traders when required;"; to add "and unjust" after "regulate unfair"; and to add "; and (h) to further increase publicity and education on protection of consumers' rights to raise consumers' alertness; to foster transparency of information on sales of commodities and services on all fronts, so as to enhance consumers' rights to knowledge, choice and protection" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Starry LEE's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Samson TAM claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present and 23 were in favour of the amendment (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

The President stated that Dr Hon Samson TAM and Hon Vincent FANG had indicated that they would withdraw their amendments to Hon Starry LEE's motion if Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment was passed. Dr Hon Samson TAM and Hon Vincent FANG had therefore withdrawn their amendments.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Fred LI to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Fred LI moved the following further amendment to Hon Starry LEE's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; (i) to expeditiously amend the Trade Descriptions Ordinance to extend the prohibition of making false or misleading descriptions in the course of trade to services; and (j) to enact legislation which stipulates that traders who do not provide services after receiving prepaid service fees will be subject to criminal prosecution, so as to protect consumers' interests” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon Starry LEE's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing proposed and put.

Hon Fred LI claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present and 24 were in favour of the amendment (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon Starry LEE replied.

Question on Hon Starry LEE's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Fred LI put and agreed to.

Promoting the sports development in Hong Kong

Hon IP Kwok-him moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the East Asian Games has been successfully completed, and with the support of the community as well as the strenuous effort of the athletes, Hong Kong players have achieved outstanding performance and won high praise; in order to further enhance the standard of local sports and promote the sports development in Hong Kong, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) review the existing scoring mechanism for the elite training programmes, and actively consider including team sports with development potentials in such programmes;
- (b) encourage the Hong Kong Jockey Club to put in more resources to support the development of local football;
- (c) examine the effectiveness of the various existing funding schemes, and increase the funding amounts according to actual needs;
- (d) improve the hardware facilities for various sports activities and expeditiously carry out the multi-purpose stadium complex project in the Kai Tak Development Area, so as to provide better support for sports development;
- (e) formulate a specific policy to improve the treatment of athletes and their career development after retirement;
- (f) draw reference from the Mainland and overseas experience to encourage the business sector to take part in the funding of sports;
- (g) step up effort in motivating schools, the general public and enterprises to attach importance to sports, promote sports for all, and create a competition atmosphere among district sports teams, so as to increase public participation and community cohesion;
- (h) strengthen collaboration and exchanges with the Mainland to enhance the standard of local sports; and
- (i) actively consider bidding to host the 18th Asian Games in 2019.

While Hon IP Kwok-him was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:12 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon IP Kwok-him's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that three Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEE Wing-tat, Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon Paul CHAN, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Four Members and Hon CHAN Kin-por spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:26 pm, while Hon CHAN Kin-por was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Fourteen more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon IP Kwok-him spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke again.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon IP Kwok-him's motion:

To add "the sports development in Hong Kong has long been neglected, but" after "That"; to add "still" after "Hong Kong players have"; to delete "with" after "team sports" and substitute with "which are popular among the public and have"; to add "take the lead in providing additional funding and" after "(b)"; to add "(c) allocate funding to directly support the football academy at Tseung Kwan O, and provide adequate funding to maintain and develop football representative teams of different age groups; (d) provide sufficient training venues for various First Division football clubs and consider waiving their venue rental;" after "local football;"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(e)"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(f)"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(g)"; to delete the original "(f)" and substitute with "(h)"; to delete the original "(g)" and substitute with "(i)"; to delete the original "(h)" and substitute with "(j)"; and to delete the original "(i)" and substitute with "(k)".

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon IP Kwok-him's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon Tanya CHAN had indicated that she would withdraw her amendment to Hon IP Kwok-him's motion if Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment was passed. Hon Tanya CHAN had therefore withdrawn her amendment.

As Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Paul CHAN to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Paul CHAN moved the following further amendment to Hon IP Kwok-him's motion as amended by Hon LEE Wing-tat:

To add “; (l) review the adequacy of resources currently allocated to sports, and enhance the transparency of the funding policy and the funding approval process; and (m) assist various national sports associations in enhancing their discipline in corporate governance, accounting and compliance with rules and regulations, so as to ensure that the resources allocated to them are utilized in a proper and effective manner” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Paul CHAN's amendment to Hon IP Kwok-him's motion as amended by Hon LEE Wing-tat proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon IP Kwok-him replied.

Question on Hon IP Kwok-him's motion as amended by Hon LEE Wing-tat and Hon Paul CHAN put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 13 January 2010 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 9:28 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
8 February 2010

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 06/01/2010
時間 TIME: 05:54:23 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對李慧琼議員的「建立全面保障消費者制度」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON STARRY LEE'S MOTION ON
"ESTABLISHING A COMPREHENSIVE CONSUMER PROTECTION REGIME"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	13	23	
反對 No	10	0	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 06/01/2010
時間 TIME: 05:59:43 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 李華明議員對李慧琼議員就「建立全面保障消費者制度」所提，經王國興議員／譚偉豪議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON FRED LI TO HON STARRY LEE'S MOTION ON "ESTABLISHING A COMPREHENSIVE CONSUMER PROTECTION REGIME" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG KWOK-HING / ~~DR HON SAMSON TAM~~

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明 Fred LI

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	25	
投票 Vote	24	24	
贊成 Yes	14	24	
反對 No	9	0	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

秘書 CLERK