

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 23

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 21 April 2010 at 11:00 am  
and Thursday 22 April 2010 at 9:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP (absent on 22.4.2010)

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

**Member absent:**

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

**Public officers attending:**

On 21.4.2010

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP  
Secretary for Development

Ms Julia LEUNG Fung-ye, JP  
Under Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Prof Gabriel Matthew LEUNG, JP  
Under Secretary for Food and Health

On 22.4.2010

Prof LAU Siu-kai, JP  
Head, Central Policy Unit

On 21.4.2010 and 22.4.2010

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP  
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Mr LAI Tung-kwok, SBS, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP  
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Mr Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP  
Under Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Dr Kitty POON Kit, JP  
Under Secretary for the Environment

Mr Kenneth CHEN Wei-on, JP  
Under Secretary for Education

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Florence HUI Hiu-fai, JP  
Under Secretary for Home Affairs

Miss Adeline WONG Ching-man, JP  
Under Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

**Clerks in attendance:**

On 21.4.2010

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 21.4.2010 and 22.4.2010

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

### **Obituary tribute**

The Council observed one minute's silence to mourn the victims of the earthquake which occurred earlier in Yushu, Qinghai.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Prisons (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2010 (gazetted on 16.4.2010)	38/2010
2. Public Health and Municipal Services (Setting Aside Places and Cessation of Setting Aside Places for Use as Public Pleasure Grounds) Order 2010 (gazetted on 16.4.2010)	39/2010
3. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Amendment of Fourth Schedule) Order 2010 (gazetted on 16.4.2010)	40/2010

### **Other Papers**

No. 88 - Report No. 54 of the Director of Audit on the results of value for money audits – March 2010 (published on 21.4.2010)

Report No. 8/09-10 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 15.4.2010)

### **Questions**

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Bills**

#### **First Reading**

Deposit Protection Scheme (Amendment) Bill 2010

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

## Second Reading

### Deposit Protection Scheme (Amendment) Bill 2010

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

### Appropriation Bill 2010

#### Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the motion for the Second Reading which was moved on 24 February 2010 resumed.

The Chief Secretary for Administration, the Secretary for Transport and Housing and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 49 Members were present, 32 were in favour of the motion and 16 against it (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

#### Committee stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the Appropriation Bill 2010.

In accordance with Rule 68 of the Rules of Procedure, the Committee first considered the schedule to the Bill.

Question that the sums for heads 21 to 28, 30, 31, 33, 37, 39, 42, 44 to 49, 51, 53, 55, 59, 60, 62, 63, 72, 74, 76, 78, 79, 80, 82, 90, 91, 92, 94, 95, 96, 100, 106, 112, 114, 116, 118, 120, 121, 136 to 140, 142, 143, 147, 148, 151, 152, 155, 159, 160, 162, 166, 168, 169, 170, 173, 174, 180, 181, 184, 186, 188, 190 and 194 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.



Question that the sum for head 70 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon Audrey EU moved that head 70 be reduced by \$5,940,000 in respect of subhead 000 and spoke on the amendment.

While Hon Audrey EU was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 12:29 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three Members and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke on the amendment.

At 1:27 pm, while Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Six more Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon Audrey EU spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Audrey EU claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

While the division bell was ringing, Hon Paul TSE declared that he had provided legal service relating to the business of investment immigrant consultants.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that the company in which his wife worked provided investment immigrant-related services.

Hon Miriam LAU declared that she had assisted some investment immigrants in the legal formalities for purchasing properties.

Hon Mrs Regina IP declared that during her tenure of office as the Secretary for Security, she was responsible for promoting the Capital Investment Entrant Scheme.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 19 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 18 against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the other provisions of the Appropriation Bill 2010 or amendments thereto, the Committee do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the sum for head 70 stand part of the schedule put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as Hon James TO was unable to attend the meeting due to indisposition, Mr TO had therefore withdrawn the notices of his amendments. The Chairman added that he had waived the notice required for Hon Albert HO to move three amendments during the Committee stage. Hon Albert HO's three amendments were the same as the three amendments originally proposed by Hon James TO.

Question that the sum for head 122 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon Albert HO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$44,920,000 in respect of subhead 000 and spoke on the amendment.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE declared that he was a Vice-Chairman of the Independent Police Complaints Council. He then spoke on the amendment.

Two other Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon Albert HO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 18 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert HO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$14,798,400 in respect of subhead 000 and spoke on the amendment.

Two Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon Albert HO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 20 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert HO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$80,000,000 in respect of subhead 103 and spoke on the amendment.

Two Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon Albert HO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 122 stand part of the schedule put and agreed to.

Question that the sum for head 141 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved that head 141 be reduced by \$281,666 in respect of subhead 000 and spoke on the amendment.

Five Members and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the amendment.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 6:10 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Seven more Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Financial Services and Treasury spoke on the amendment.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke again.

At 7:14 pm, while Hon LEE Cheuk-yan was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Cyd HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 18 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix VI**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 141 stand part of the schedule put and agreed to.

Question that the sum for head 144 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon Audrey EU moved that head 144 be reduced by \$281,666 in respect of subhead 000 and spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Financial Services and Treasury and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendment.

Hon Audrey EU spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Audrey EU claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 18 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix VII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 144 stand part of the schedule put and agreed to.

Question on that the sum for head 156 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon Cyd HO moved that head 156 be reduced by \$281,666 in respect of subhead 000 and spoke on the amendment.

Three Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Financial Services and Treasury and the Secretary for Education spoke on the amendment.

Hon Cyd HO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Cyd HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 18 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix VIII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 156 stand part of the schedule put and agreed to.

Question that the sum for head 158 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved that the head 158 be reduced by \$281,666 in respect of subhead 000 and spoke on the amendment.

Three Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Financial Services and Treasury spoke on the amendment.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 20 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix IX**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 158 stand part of the schedule put and agreed to.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 10:00 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Committee resumed at 9:00 am on 22 April 2010.

Question that the sum for head 163 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved that the head 163 be reduced by \$147,000,000 in respect of subhead 000 and spoke on the amendment.

Four Members spoke on the amendment.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke for the second time.

Nine more Members spoke on the amendment.

Hon Ronny TONG spoke for the second time.

Another Member spoke on the amendment.

Hon Paul TSE spoke for the second time.

While Hon Paul TSE was speaking, Hon Audrey EU sought elucidation of a point raised by Hon Paul TSE in his speech. Hon Paul TSE elucidated and continued to speak.

The Chairman reminded Members that their speeches should not deviate from the question under debate, and Members should not repeat what they had already covered in their earlier speeches.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke for the third time.

While Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG was speaking, Hon Abraham SHEK raised a point of order that the speeches of Dr LEUNG and many other Members had deviated from the question under debate.

The Chairman stated that he had again reminded Members not to deviate from the question under debate. The Chairman asked Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG to continue to speak.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG then continued to speak.

Another Member spoke on the amendment.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke for the second time.

While Dr Hon Margaret NG was speaking, Hon Abraham SHEK raised a point of order that Dr NG's speech had deviated from the question under debate. The Chairman considered that Dr Hon Margaret NG's speech did not contravene the Rules of Procedure.

Dr Hon Margaret NG then continued to speak.

Hon Ronny TONG elucidated a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Dr Hon Margaret NG.

Another Member spoke on the amendment.

Hon Paul TSE spoke for the third time.

The Chairman stated that while Members might speak more than once during the Committee stage of the bill, Members should make good use of their speaking time and should not seek to respond whenever different views were expressed by other Members. If they did so and repeated what they had already covered in their earlier speeches each time they made a response, the debate would unnecessarily be prolonged.

Two more Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendment.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 29 were present, six were in favour of the amendment and 23 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it (voting record in **Appendix X**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that the sum for head 163 stand part of the schedule put and agreed to.

Question that the schedule stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### Third Reading

The Financial Secretary reported that

the Appropriation Bill 2010

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 52 Members were present, 35 were in favour of the motion and 16 against it (voting record in **Appendix XI**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### Members' Motions

#### Motion under Rule 49E(2) of the Rules of Procedure

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council takes note of Report No. 8/09-10 of the House Committee laid on the Table of the Council on 21 April 2010 in relation to the subsidiary legislation and instrument(s) as listed below:

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Title of Subsidiary Legislation or Instrument</u>
(1)	Designation of Libraries Order 2010 (L.N. 22/2010).

Question on the motion proposed.



Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Designation of Libraries Order 2010, and then in his personal capacity as a Member.

While Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:59 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another Member and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the motion.

At 2:27 pm, while Hon LEE Wing-tat was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

One more Member spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion.

The President stated that in accordance with Rule 49E(9) of the Rules of Procedure, he would not put any question on the motion.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 28 April 2010 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 2:43 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
2 June 2010

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 21/04/2010  
 時間 TIME: 12:25:38 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》 - 二讀  
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財政司司長Financial Secretary

出席 Present :49  
 投票 Vote :48  
     贊成 Yes :32  
     反對 No :16  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
涂謹申	James TO			詹培忠	CHIM Pui chung	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對	NO
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming		
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	謝偉俊	Paul TSE	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES				

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 21/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 02:59:52 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目70削減5,940,000元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 70 BE REDUCED BY \$5,940,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇 Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	2	5 <i>hu</i>	
反對 No	19	17 <i>hu</i>	
棄權 Abstain	3	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	徐護申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu chung	贊成 YES
劉卓發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 <del>贊成</del> YES NO <i>hu</i>
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming			
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN		
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM			

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 21/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 03:50:53 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目122削減44,920,000元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE REDUCED BY \$44,920,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	23	
投票 Vote	20	22	
贊成 Yes	2	11	
反對 No	18	11	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE			
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM			

秘書 CLERK

*Wai-an Lam*

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 21/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 04:20:28 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目122 ~~(進一步)~~ 削減14,798,400元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE ~~(FURTHER)~~ REDUCED BY \$14,798,400 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: ~~徐謹中 James TO~~ 何偉仁 Albert Ho lu

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	23	
投票 Vote	23	22	
贊成 Yes	2	11	
反對 No	20	11	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何偉仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	徐謹中 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN		
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 21/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 04:56:20 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目103而將總目122 ~~←進一步→~~ 削減80,000,000元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE ~~(FURTHER)~~ REDUCED BY \$80,000,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 103

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	23	
投票 Vote	23	22	
贊成 Yes	2	12	
反對 No	21	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO		
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6  
日期 DATE: 21/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 07:23:10 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目141削減281,666元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 141 BE REDUCED BY \$281,666 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	23	
投票 Vote	22	22	
贊成 Yes	4	12	
反對 No	18	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 ALBERT HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO		
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 7  
日期 DATE: 21/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 08:03:58 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目144削減281,666元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 144 BE REDUCED BY \$281,666 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	22	
投票 Vote	22	21	
贊成 Yes	4	11	
反對 No	18	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE			
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO		

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 8  
日期 DATE: 21/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 08:57:54 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目156削減281,666元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 156 BE REDUCED BY \$281,666 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 何秀蘭Cyd HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	21	
投票 Vote	22	20	
贊成 Yes	4	10	
反對 No	18	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yuug-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE			
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 9  
 日期 DATE: 21/04/2010  
 時間 TIME: 09:59:56 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目158削減281,666元  
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 158 BE REDUCED BY \$281,666 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	20	
投票 Vote	24	19	
贊成 Yes	4	9	
反對 No	20	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE			
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 10  
日期 DATE: 22/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 01:48:12 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目163削減147,000,000元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 163 BE REDUCED BY \$147,000,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	29	23	
投票 Vote	29	22	
贊成 Yes	6	8	
反對 No	23	14	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES		
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 11  
 日期 DATE: 22/04/2010  
 時間 TIME: 01:54:18 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年撥款條例草案》- 三讀  
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2010 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財政司司長 Financial Secretary

出席 Present :52  
 投票 Vote :51  
     贊成 Yes :35  
     反對 No :16  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
涂謹申	James TO			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對	NO
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	謝偉俊	Paul TSE	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES				