

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 24

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 28 April 2010 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

**Members absent:**

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration and  
Secretary for Education

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

## **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
Designation of Libraries (No. 2) Order 2010 (gazetted on 23.4.2010)	42/2010

### Other Papers

- No. 89 - Audited statement of accounts of the Language Fund for the year ended 31 August 2009 (published on 22.4.2010)
- No. 90 - Annual Report and Financial Report 2008/2009 of the Vocational Training Council (published on 22.4.2010)
- No. 91 - Securities and Futures Commission Approved Budget of Income and Expenditure for Financial Year 2010/2011 (published on 26.4.2010)

Report of the Bills Committee on Employment (Amendment) Bill 2009 (published on 23.4.2010)

## **Questions**

1. Hon Paul CHAN asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Dr Hon Samson TAM asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai declared that he was the Member representing The Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Education replied.

Another Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Education replied.

3. Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

4. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Eight Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

5. Hon Mrs Regina IP asked Question 5.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Financial Secretary replied.

6. Hon Albert HO asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

With the President's permission, Hon Albert HO elucidated a point he had made earlier in his speech.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## Bills

### First Reading

#### Motor Vehicle Idling (Fixed Penalty) Bill

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

#### Motor Vehicle Idling (Fixed Penalty) Bill

The Secretary for the Environment moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

While the Secretary for the Environment was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:12 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President's Deputy stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

#### Employment (Amendment) Bill 2009

### Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 8 July 2009 resumed.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Employment (Amendment) Bill 2009, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Five Members and Hon LI Fung-ying spoke on the Bill.

At 2:35 pm, while Hon LI Fung-ying was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Seven other Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### Committee stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the Employment (Amendment) Bill 2009.

Question that clauses 1, 2 and 3 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved amendments to clause 4 and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clause 4 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### Third Reading

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare reported that

the Employment (Amendment) Bill 2009

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Members' Motions**

#### Strengthening the regulation of the sale of residential properties

Hon James TO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the sale of residential properties in Hong Kong has all along relied on advertising and publicity, sales brochures, visits to show flats, real estate agents and newspapers to provide information about properties and the property market to the public, and while the Government, The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong ('REDA'), the Estate Agents Authority ('EAA') and the Consumer Council have



repeatedly laid down guidelines, launched publicity and issued reminders, cases of advertisements with ambiguous content, sales brochures without clear and detailed information, discrepancies between show flats and actual flats for sale, confusing market information, etc. still continue to occur; as such, this Council urges the Government to adopt the following measures to enhance the transparency and fairness in property sales and protect the interests of home buyers:

- (a) on the basis of the Sales Descriptions of Uncompleted Residential Properties Bill which was published as a White Bill in 2000, to introduce legislation to regulate the sale of uncompleted residential properties;
- (b) to revise the 'Consent Scheme' by incorporating into its conditions all the relevant guidelines drawn up by REDA, and prescribing more detailed requirements for compliance by developers, including strengthening the restrictions on the content of promotional materials and sales brochures as well as tightening the requirements on show flats, and requiring developers to publish on their web pages property sales information, including the full version of the sales brochure, the content of land leases and deeds of mutual covenant, every price list, records of sale and purchase agreements and completion of transactions, information on connected party transactions, information on related transactions, and details of internal and private sales, etc., with a view to providing clear and detailed information, and hence avoiding misunderstandings and preventing the public from being easily confused by rumours in the market; and
- (c) to step up inspections, remind estate agency practitioners to comply with the codes and circulars drawn up by EAA, and penalize the non-complying practitioners, so as to enhance the credibility of the estate agency trade.

Question on Hon James TO's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon James TO's motion and spoke on the motion and the amendment:

To add “, as” after “That”; to add “first-hand” before “residential properties in Hong Kong”; to delete “as such,” after “occur;”; to add “and put forward an implementation timetable” after “measures”; to delete “for” after “detailed requirements” and substitute with “to require”; to delete “publish” after “developers to” and substitute with “provide”; to add “and in their sales offices more detailed” after “web pages”; to delete “and” after “in the market;”; to add “to provide additional resources” after “(c)”; to add “real estate developers, estate agencies and” after “remind”; to delete

“practitioners” after “non-complying” and substitute with “real estate developers, estate agencies and estate agency practitioners in accordance with the law”; to add “real estate developers and” after “credibility of”; and to add “and safeguard the interests of home buyers; and (d) to strengthen the power of the Consumer Council to monitor real estate developers and estate agencies, including considering the introduction of legislation on cross-trade business practices, so as to enable the Consumer Council to exercise the power vested by law to name and criticize the real estate developers and estate agencies engaging in unscrupulous sales practices, and to allow people to make reports for referral to law enforcement departments for prosecution, so that home buyers can obtain adequate consumer information and protection” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s amendment to Hon James TO’s motion proposed.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Eleven Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that he was an independent non-executive director of Wharf (Holdings) Limited which carried on the business of real estate investment and development. He then spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Two other Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Abraham SHEK spoke on the motion and the amendment. He then declared that he was the Member representing the real estate sector and also an independent non-executive director of a number of listed companies.

Another Member and Hon Albert HO spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon Albert HO was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:07 pm temporarily and the President’s Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

One more Member spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke again.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s amendment to Hon James TO’s motion put.

Hon Abraham SHEK claimed a division. The President’s Deputy then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 6:28 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the President resumed the chair.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 21 were in favour of the amendment and one against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present and 23 were in favour of the amendment (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon James TO replied.

While Hon James TO was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:34 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Question on Hon James TO's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President's Deputy then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President's Deputy announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 21 were in favour of the motion as amended and one against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present and 22 were in favour of the motion as amended (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion as amended was passed.

#### Eradicating plutocratic monopoly and promoting social harmony

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Hong Kong Institute of Asia-Pacific Studies of The Chinese University of Hong Kong has earlier published the findings of an opinion poll, confirming that Hong Kong is not a harmonious society and estimating that there are 1.5 million people in favour of resorting to radical means to press the Government to respond to their demands, which tolls the death bell for the Government's credibility of its governance; this Council considers that the fundamental reasons contributing to social disharmony in Hong Kong are the plutocratic monopoly of political and economic powers and the Government's implementation of policies which are biased towards the interests of people who are powerful and wealthy, resulting in the aggravation of class conflicts and the worsening of confrontation between the Government and the people; in this connection, this Council urges that the Government should not continue to disregard social crises and leave the people to be trapped in a state of worries, and must change its course to make fundamental reforms, including abolishing the political privileges of functional bodies and formulating measures to narrow the gap between the rich and the poor, maintain social mobility and ensure fair competition, thereby alleviating the deep-rooted conflicts in Hong Kong and promoting social harmony.

At 6:50 pm, while Hon LEE Cheuk-yan was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Ronny TONG and Hon Emily LAU, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Twenty Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the amendments.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke again.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion:

To add “, as” after “That”; to delete “;” after “governance” and substitute with “,”; to delete “between” after “confrontation” and substitute with “among”; to add “, the business sector” before “and the people;”; to add “, changing the existing policies which are biased towards the business sector,” after “functional bodies”; and to add “resolving the conflicts of interest between the business sector and the people,” after “thereby”.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion proposed and put.

Hon Ronny TONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Emily LAU moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion:

To add "in recent years social conflicts have become daily occurrences, and" after "That"; and to add "; this Council also appeals to all Hong Kong people to demonstrate their power on 2 May to urge the Government to implement genuine universal suffrage for the election of the Chief Executive and the Legislative Council, so as to resolve social confrontation and avoid Hong Kong being driven towards a crisis of being ungovernable" after "competition".

Question on Hon Emily LAU's amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion proposed and put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan replied.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, four were in favour of the motion and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 5 May 2010 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 10:20 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
2 June 2010

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 28/04/2010  
 時間 TIME: 06:31:09 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對涂謹申議員的「加強監管住宅物業銷售」議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON JAMES TO'S MOTION ON  
 "STRENGTHENING THE REGULATION OF THE SALE OF RESIDENTIAL PROPERTIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	24	
投票 Vote	22	23	
贊成 Yes	21	23	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES		
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 28/04/2010  
 時間 TIME: 06:38:43 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 由涂謹申議員動議，經王國興議員修正的「加強監管住宅物業銷售」議案  
 MOTION MOVED BY HON JAMES TO ON "STRENGTHENING THE REGULATION OF THE SALE OF RESIDENTIAL PROPERTIES" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG KWOK-HING

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	23	
投票 Vote	22	22	
贊成 Yes	21	22	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	<del>出席 PRESENT</del>
李國賢 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	<del>出席 PRESENT</del>
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES		
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES		

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 28/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 10:09:06 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員對李卓人議員的「破除財閥壟斷、促進社會和諧」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON RONNY TONG TO HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S MOTION ON  
"ERADICATING PLUTOCRATIC MONOPOLY AND PROMOTING SOCIAL HARMONY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	24	
投票 Vote	21	23	
贊成 Yes	4	13	
反對 No	17	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO		
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO		
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO		
謝偉俊 Paul TSE			
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 28/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 10:13:02 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 劉慧卿議員對李卓人議員的「破除財閥壟斷、促進社會和諧」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON EMILY LAU TO HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S MOTION ON  
"ERADICATING PLUTOCRATIC MONOPOLY AND PROMOTING SOCIAL HARMONY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	24	
投票 Vote	21	23	
贊成 Yes	4	13	
反對 No	17	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>				<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU			劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李鳳英	Li Fung-ying			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	反對	NO	李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	反對	NO	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對	NO
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
梁家驊	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	反對	NO
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	反對	NO
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	反對	NO				
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO				
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對	NO				
謝偉俊	Paul TSE						
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	反對	NO				

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 28/04/2010  
時間 TIME: 10:19:35 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「破除財閥壟斷、促進社會和諧」議案  
MOTION ON "ERADICATING PLUTOCRATIC MONOPOLY AND PROMOTING SOCIAL HARMONY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	24	
投票 Vote	21	23	
贊成 Yes	4	13	
反對 No	17	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>				<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miniam LAU			劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	反對	NO	李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	反對	NO	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對	NO
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	反對	NO
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	反對	NO
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	反對	NO				
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO				
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對	NO				
謝偉俊	Paul TSE						
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	反對	NO				

秘書 CLERK