

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 31

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9 June 2010 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Member absent:

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBM, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Ms Julia LEUNG Fung-ye, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Country Parks (Designation) (Consolidation) (Amendment) Order 2010 (gazetted on 4.6.2010)	72/2010
2. Declaration of Increase in Pensions Notice 2010 (gazetted on 4.6.2010)	73/2010
3. Widows and Orphans Pension (Increase) Notice 2010 (gazetted on 4.6.2010)	74/2010
4. Employees Retraining Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 2) Notice 2010 (gazetted on 4.6.2010)	75/2010

Other Papers

No. 98 - Broadcasting Authority Annual Report 2008-2009 (published on 3.6.2010)

Report No. 13/09-10 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 3.6.2010)

Report of the Bills Committee on Inland Revenue (Amendment) Bill 2010 (published on 4.6.2010)

Questions

1. Mrs Regina IP asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

2. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

3. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

A Member and Hon Tanya CHAN asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

After the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs had replied to Hon Tanya CHAN's supplementary question, the President explained that Members who resigned earlier in the session and returned at the by-election were given priority to ask supplementary questions to oral questions, as they were regarded as not having asked any supplementary question before. However, he noticed that after Members concerned had been called to ask supplementary questions, other Members were deprived of the opportunities to do the same. He requested Members to be as concise as possible in asking questions, so as to enable more Members to ask questions.

Another Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Hon Albert CHAN asked his supplementary question.

While Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs sought the President's ruling on whether Hon Albert CHAN had used insulting language about him.

The President ruled that Hon Albert CHAN had used insulting and offensive language about the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs and that Hon Albert CHAN should withdraw the expressions concerned.

Hon Albert CHAN did not agree to the President's ruling. He said that he had used the same expressions at the last Council meeting and no objection against such expressions was raised by the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs. He requested the President to give an explanation on his ruling.

The President stated that there were precedents in the Council that even if an expression made was not questioned or objected to by Members or public officers, it did not mean that such an expression was in order. Where a Member raised that an expression might have contravened the Rules of Procedure, he would make a ruling on it in accordance with the Rules of Procedure. The President further said that he would explain to Hon Albert CHAN about the rationale for his ruling after the meeting.

Hon Albert CHAN continued to speak.

While Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, Hon WONG Kwok-kin raised a point of order that Hon Albert CHAN had not complied with the President's order to withdraw his expressions.

The President ordered Hon Albert CHAN to withdraw the insulting expressions he made earlier on and Hon Albert CHAN complied.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

4. Hon WONG Kwok-kin asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

5. Hon Albert HO asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

A Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was replying to the supplementary question, Hon WONG Yuk-man interrupted him. The President asked Hon WONG Yuk-man to sit down, and stated that Members should not interrupt the public officers or other Members except when they wished to raise a point of order or seek elucidation. The request for seeking elucidation of the matter raised by another Member or a public officer would be allowed if that Member or public officer was willing to give way and the President's permission was given.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs continued to reply.

After the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs had replied to the supplementary question, Hon LEE Wing-tat raised a point of order on whether the President would extend the duration of the question time for this oral question to enable more Members to ask supplementary questions, given that the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs had used a lot of time in answering a supplementary question.

The President stated that he would appropriately adjust the duration of the question time. He then reminded Members and the public officers to avoid expressing views at length in the course of asking and answering questions.

Five other Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

6. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Inland Revenue (Amendment) Bill 2010

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 12 May 2010 resumed.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Inland Revenue (Amendment) Bill 2010, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

While Hon CHAN Kam-lam was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:23 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

A Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the Inland Revenue (Amendment) Bill 2010.

Question that clauses 1 to 9 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the Inland Revenue (Amendment) Bill 2010

had passed through the Committee without amendment. She moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under Article 73(7) of the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China and section 7A of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the appointment of the Honourable Mr Justice Geoffrey Ma Tao-li as the Chief Justice of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal pursuant to section 6 of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance (Cap. 484) be endorsed.

Question on the motion proposed.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Proposed Senior Judicial Appointments, and then in her personal capacity as a Member.

Another Member spoke on the motion.

Hon Ronny TONG declared that he and Hon Mr Justice Geoffrey Ma Tao-li were good friends, and they had worked together for many years. He then spoke on the motion.

Two other Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Paul TSE declared that he was a litigant in several court cases presided over by Hon Mr Justice Andrew LI Kwok-nang, and at least in one court case presided over by Hon Mr Justice Geoffrey Ma Tao-li. He then spoke on the motion.

Hon Audrey EU declared that she had known Hon Mr Justice Geoffrey Ma Tao-li for many years, and his wife was her classmate when they took law studies in the university. She then spoke on the motion.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under Article 73(7) of the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China and section 7A of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the appointment of –

- (a) the Honourable Mr Justice Robert Tang Ching;
- (b) the Honourable Mr Justice Frank Stock; and
- (c) the Honourable Mr Justice Michael John Hartmann,

as non-permanent Hong Kong judges of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal pursuant to section 8 of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance (Cap. 484) be endorsed.

Question on the motion proposed.

A Member spoke on the motion.

Hon Ronny TONG declared that he had known the three judges, especially Hon Mr Justice Robert Tang Ching, for many years. He then spoke on the motion.

Hon Paul TSE declared that he knew the three judges as they presided over court cases involving him. He then spoke on the motion.

Hon Audrey Eu declared that she had known Hon Mr Justice Robert Tang Ching for many years and knew the other two judges as well. She then spoke on the motion.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Pharmacy and Poisons Ordinance

The Secretary for Food and Health moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the following Regulations, made by the Pharmacy and Poisons Board on 19 May 2010, be approved –

- (a) the Pharmacy and Poisons (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulation 2010; and
- (b) the Poisons List (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulation 2010.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Constitutional reform

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as the SAR Government and the Chief Secretary for Administration have repeatedly stated in public that the existing functional constituency elections do not comply with the principle of 'universality' and 'equality', and as universal suffrage models should comply with this fundamental principle and Hong Kong people also hope that discussions on universal suffrage models can commence as soon as possible, this Council urges the Government to proactively motivate various sectors to engage in extensive and in-depth discussions and studies on the selection of the Chief Executive by universal suffrage upon nomination in accordance with 'democratic procedures' as provided under Article 45 of the Basic Law and on the way to deal with the issue of functional constituencies, so as to forge consensus on universal suffrage models and implement dual universal suffrage as early as possible.

At 3:38 pm, while Hon Ronny TONG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Jeffrey LAM and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, Hon Ronny TONG raised a point of order that the subject of his proposed motion was implementing universal suffrage, but the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the 2012 constitutional reform proposals. The President asked the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs to speak on the subject of the motion.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs continued to speak.

Nine Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

With the President's permission, Hon Ronny TONG elucidated a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Dr Hon Margaret NG and Hon Emily LAU.

Ten other Members and Hon Albert HO spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Albert HO was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:38 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Ronny TONG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

At 7:03 pm, while the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Jeffrey LAM moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG's motion:

To delete “, as the SAR” after “That” and substitute with “the HKSAR”; to delete “,” after “as soon as possible” and substitute with “;”; to add “the various political parties and Members of the Legislative Council to support the passage of the 2012 constitutional reform proposals, so as to pave the way for implementing universal suffrage for the Chief Executive in 2017 and subsequently for the Legislative Council; on this basis, this Council proposes that” after “this Council urges” and to delete “to” after “the Government”.

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Ronny TONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, 22 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 19 against it (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG's motion:

To add “that” after “this Council urges”; and to delete “to proactively motivate various sectors to engage in extensive and in-depth discussions and studies on the selection of the Chief Executive by universal suffrage upon nomination in accordance with ‘democratic procedures’ as provided under Article 45 of the Basic Law and on the way to deal with the issue of functional constituencies, so as to forge consensus on universal suffrage models and implement dual universal suffrage as early as possible” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “must, in respect of the electoral system for the Chief Executive, abolish the existing Election Committee system, so that any eligible person who is nominated (with signatures) by a certain number of registered electors (e.g. 50 000) can stand for the election of the Chief Executive on a one-person-one-vote basis, so as to comply with the principle of all persons having the right to elect and to be elected by universal and equal suffrage; in respect of the electoral system for the Legislative Council, ensure that seats must be returned by universal suffrage while the existing functional constituencies must be abolished and dual universal suffrage be implemented in 2012”.

Question on Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 23 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's motion put.

Hon Ronny TONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, two against it and 17 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 20 were in favour of the motion and nine abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Hong Kong's co-operation with ASEAN region

Hon Andrew LEUNG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, after the financial tsunami, the focus of global development is shifting from Europe and the United States to Asia, and the economies of the East Asian region are also gradually moving towards integration; Hong Kong is geographically positioned in the core zone between Mainland China and ASEAN, and with the formal launch of the China-ASEAN Free Trade Area ('CAFTA'), economic and trade activities in CAFTA will be increasing, which will lead to continuous growth in the demand for capital, logistics and professional services in CAFTA in the future; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to vigorously promote economic and trade collaboration between Hong Kong and ASEAN, so as to capitalize on Hong Kong's advantage in connecting the Mainland, in particular the Pearl River Delta, with ASEAN region.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke on the motion.

Eight Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke again.

Hon Andrew LEUNG replied.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG's motion put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 23 June 2010 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:49 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
21 October 2010

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 09/06/2010
 時間 TIME: 07:19:03 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 林健鋒議員對湯家驊議員的「政制改革」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON JEFFREY LAM TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON
 "CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	30	
投票 Vote	27	29	
贊成 Yes	22	10	
反對 No	4	19	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Kwok-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩瑋 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

Victoria Lam

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 09/06/2010
 時間 TIME: 07:23:08 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁國雄議員對湯家驊議員的「政制改革」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG KWOK-HUNG TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON
 "CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	30	
投票 Vote	27	29	
贊成 Yes	4	19	
反對 No	23	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

Wai-an Lam

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 09/06/2010
 時間 TIME: 07:27:07 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「政制改革」議案
 MOTION ON "CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	30	
投票 Vote	26	29	
贊成 Yes	7	20	
反對 No	2	0	
棄權 Abstain	17	9	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩珍 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

Wai-an Lam