

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 34

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 7 July 2010 at 11:00 am  
and Thursday 8 July 2010 at 2:30 pm**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP (absent on 8.7.2010)

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat (absent on 8.7.2010)

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau (absent on 8.7.2010)

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip (absent on 8.7.2010)

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Member absent:**

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

On 7.7.2010

Mr Kenneth CHEN Wei-on, JP  
Secretary for Education

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Development

On 8.7.2010

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP  
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

On 7.7.2010 and 8.7.2010

Ms Florence HUI Hiu-fai, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

**Clerks in attendance:**

On 7.7.2010

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

On 8.7.2010

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

## Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income) (Brunei Darussalam) Order (gazetted on 2.7.2010)	89/2010
2. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income) (Kingdom of the Netherlands) Order (gazetted on 2.7.2010)	90/2010
3. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income) (Republic of Indonesia) Order (gazetted on 2.7.2010)	91/2010

### Other Papers

- No. 103 - Report by the Trustee of the Correctional Services Children's Education Trust for the period from 1st September 2008 to 31st August 2009 (published on 2.7.2010)
- No. 104 - Construction Industry Council Annual Report 2009 (published on 2.7.2010)
- No. 105 - Hong Kong Trade Development Council Annual Report 2009/10 (published on 2.7.2010)
- No. 106 - Independent Commission Against Corruption Complaints Committee Annual Report 2009 (published on 6.7.2010)
- No. 107 - Annual Report of The Ombudsman Hong Kong 2010 (published on 7.7.2010)
- No. 108 - Hong Kong Export Credit Insurance Corporation Annual Report 2009-10 (published on 7.7.2010)
- No. 109 - Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Independent Commission Against Corruption Annual Report 2009 (published on 7.7.2010)

Report of the Finance Committee on the examination of the Estimates of Expenditure 2010-2011 (published on 5.7.2010)

Report No. 16/09-10 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 30.6.2010)

Report of the Bills Committee on Companies (Amendment) Bill 2010 and Business Registration (Amendment) Bill 2010 (published on 6.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Manpower 2009-2010 (published on 2.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services 2009-2010 (published on 2.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Home Affairs 2009-2010 (published on 5.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Security 2009-2010 (published on 2.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Constitutional Affairs 2009-2010 (published on 2.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene 2009-2010 (published on 5.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Financial Affairs 2009-2010 (published on 6.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Education 2009-2010 (published on 5.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Development 2009-2010 (published on 5.7.2010)

Report of the Panel on Welfare Services 2009-2010 (published on 2.7.2010)

### **Addresses**

Hon CHAN Kam-lam addressed the Council on the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Independent Commission Against Corruption Annual Report 2009.

Hon Emily LAU, Chairman of the Finance Committee, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report on the examination of the Estimates of Expenditure 2010-2011.

Hon LI Fung-ying, Chairman of the Panel on Manpower, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

Dr Hon Margaret NG, Chairman of the Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

Hon IP Kwok-him, Chairman of the Panel on Home Affairs, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

Hon LAU Kong-wah, Chairman of the Panel on Security, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, Chairman of the Panel on Constitutional Affairs, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

Hon Fred LI, Chairman of the Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Chairman of the Panel on Financial Affairs, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

Hon Cyd HO, Chairman of the Panel on Education, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

Hon LAU Wong-fat, Chairman of the Panel on Development, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

Hon WONG Sing-chi, Chairman of the Panel on Welfare Services, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2009-2010.

### Questions

1. Hon WONG Yuk-man asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

2. Hon TAM Yiu-chung asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

3. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

4. Hon Starry LEE asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

5. Hon Paul CHAN asked Question 5.

While Hon Paul CHAN was asking his question, the President left his chair at 1:52 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

6. Hon LEUNG Kwok-huung asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

Companies (Amendment) Bill 2010

### Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 3 February 2010 resumed.

Hon Paul CHAN, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Companies (Amendment) Bill 2010 and Business Registration (Amendment) Bill 2010, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.



Question on the Second Reading put and agree to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### Committee stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the Companies (Amendment) Bill 2010.

Question that clauses 1 to 4, 6 to 9, 12 to 23, 25, 26, 28, 29, 30 and 32 to 57 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 5, 10, 11, 24, 27 and 31 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to clauses 5, 10, 11, 24, 27 and 31 and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 5, 10, 11, 24, 27 and 31 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 3A, 5A, 5B and 22A read the first time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading of new clauses 3A, 5A, 5B and 22A. He then spoke on the new clauses.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 3A, 5A, 5B and 22A proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 3A, 5A, 5B and 22A read the second time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the addition of new clauses 3A, 5A, 5B and 22A to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the Companies (Amendment) Bill 2010

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Business Registration (Amendment) Bill 2010

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 3 February 2010 resumed.

Hon Paul CHAN, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Companies (Amendment) Bill 2010 and Business Registration (Amendment) Bill 2010, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

At 3:20 pm, while the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on the Second Reading put and agree to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the Business Registration (Amendment) Bill 2010.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 3, 5 to 8, 10 to 13, 15 to 24 and 26 to 30 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 4, 9, 14 and 25 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to clauses 4, 9, 14 and 25 and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 4, 9, 14 and 25 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The new heading before new clause 31, and new clauses 31 and 32 read the first time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading of new heading before new clause 31, and new clauses 31 and 32. He then spoke on the new heading and new clauses.

Question on the Second Reading of the new heading before new clause 31, and new clauses 31 and 32 proposed, put and agreed to.

The new heading before new clause 31, and new clauses 31 and 32 read the second time.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the addition of the new heading before new clause 31, and new clauses 31 and 32 to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the Business Registration (Amendment) Bill 2010

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### Motions

#### Proposed resolution under the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters Ordinance

The Secretary for Security moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (South Africa) Order, made by the Chief Executive in Council on 20 April 2010, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) Ordinance

The Secretary for Security moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Code of Practice for requiring persons to furnish information or produce material under the new Section 12A of the United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) Ordinance added by Section 12 of the United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) (Amendment) Ordinance 2004, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon IP Kwok-him spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Proposed Resolution under Section 12A of the United Nations (Anti-Terrorism Measures) Ordinance (Cap. 575) , and then in his personal capacity as a Member.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

**Members' Motions**

Report of the Subcommittee on Poverty Alleviation

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council notes the Report of the Subcommittee on Poverty Alleviation.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion.

Fourteen Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Enhancing the administration of tax policy in Hong Kong

Hon Paul CHAN moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, whereas:

- (a) Hong Kong, through its membership of the Global Forum on Transparency and Exchange of Information for Tax Purposes under the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development and the comprehensive agreements on avoidance of double taxation to be signed with many countries in the world, is increasingly involved in international taxation matters;
- (b) international organizations such as the Group of Twenty ('G-20') are proactively developing tax policies for implementation by the member countries and jurisdictions which are actively involved in the global economy and financial system, including Hong Kong;
- (c) complementary tax initiatives must be introduced in Hong Kong to facilitate the development of industries with competitive edge and the smooth transformation of the Hong Kong economy;
- (d) Hong Kong must compete with other jurisdictions, which offer tax concessions, to attract external investors to establish their regional headquarters in Hong Kong;
- (e) tax initiatives can be an effective tool in addressing the problems of economic and social inequalities in Hong Kong; and
- (f) the tax base of Hong Kong remains very narrow, posing a risk of instability in public finance,

matters relating to the tax policy in Hong Kong have therefore become increasingly complex and important, yet the Administration has so far vested such matters primarily in the Inland Revenue Department ('IRD') but its function should be confined to the implementation of tax laws; if IRD is required to undertake in-depth and substantial studies on tax policy, it will encounter a conflict of roles as well as resources constraints; as such, this Council urges the Administration:

- (i) to adopt a proactive approach in responding to international agreements on tax initiatives and their requirements, including the tax policies and initiatives introduced by the G-20 and other multilateral international organizations;
- (ii) to critically review the existing taxation system with a view to identifying feasible initiatives to enhance the competitiveness of Hong Kong as a regional business centre;

- (iii) to study the use of tax initiatives as one of the means to address the problems of social and economic inequalities;
- (iv) to study afresh the identification of reasonable and sound initiatives that can broaden the tax base of Hong Kong without undermining its competitiveness; and
- (v) to establish a specialist tax policy unit within the government structure, to be staffed by local and international tax experts with the relevant professional knowledge, technical expertise and practical experience, to assist the Administration in undertaking the tasks in (i) to (iv) above, so as to ensure effective formulation of future tax policy in Hong Kong.

While Hon Paul CHAN was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:40 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Paul CHAN's motion and spoke on the motion and the amendment:

To add "with the increasingly closer economic and trade relationship between Hong Kong and the Guangdong Province under the Framework Agreement on Hong Kong/Guangdong Co-operation, the flow of passengers, goods and information will become more frequent, and" after "(c)"; to add "the upgrading and transformation of small and medium enterprises and to complement" after "facilitate"; to add "to examine afresh all the taxation policies involving cross-border trade and employment, including section 39E of the Inland Revenue Ordinance and assessment of profits tax for the processing trade, and to relax the existing 183-day standard under the Arrangement between the Mainland of China and the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the Avoidance of Double Taxation and the Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income, so as to match the trend in the economic development of Hong Kong and Guangdong and the new life pattern of the 'one-hour living sphere'; (iv)" after "(iii)"; to delete the original "(iv)" and substitute with "(v)"; to delete the original "(v)" and substitute with "(vi)"; and to delete "(iv)" after "tasks in (i) to" and substitute with "(v)".

Question on Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's amendment to Hon Paul CHAN's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Six Members and Hon James TO spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 7:32 pm, while Hon James TO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Six other Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Paul CHAN spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke again.

While the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury was speaking, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung sought elucidation of a point raised by the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury in his speech. The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury did not accede to the request and continued to speak.

Question on Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's amendment to Hon Paul CHAN's motion put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon Paul CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Paul CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG put.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion as amended and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion as amended, three against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion as amended was passed.

Utilizing young people's power of civic participation

Dr Hon Samson TAM moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That in recent years, with the development of a knowledge-based society and dawning of the network era, the attitude of young people in Hong Kong towards the discussion of social issues has become increasingly active, and they have gradually become one of the major political commentary groups in society, and the ways of expression and actions of some of these young people have aroused extensive discussions and concerns in the community; some members of the public consider that the Government's lack of effective internal and external communication of information, as well as the obvious inadequacies in its existing consultative framework has affected the formulation of public policies; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to make reference to the relevant experience of other countries or regions to formulate overall objectives and strategies, and allocate sufficient resources to enhance young people's civic participation, as well as:

- (a) to formulate a clear public sector information access policy to make public government information and documents, so that members of the public have the right of access to or commenting on them;
- (b) to make use of the Web 2.0 interactive platform to enhance direct communication between policy-making government officials and young people, so as to listen to the views of young people;
- (c) government officials should change their mentality and mind to bravely deal with interactive communications and accept criticism; and
- (d) starting from education and social culture, to allocate resources to enhance the quality of the network citizens, and to promote a way of communication based on reasons, mutual trust and mutual respect, thereby bringing together social wisdom effectively.

Question on Dr Hon Samson TAM's motion proposed.

The President stated that three Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon KAM Nai-wai, Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Three Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.



The President suspended the meeting at 10:00 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 2:30 pm on 8 July 2010.

Six Members and Hon Alan LEONG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Alan LEONG was speaking, the President left the chair at 3:14 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another Member and Hon WONG Sing-chi spoke at the motion and the amendments.

At 3:22 pm, while Hon Wong Sing-chi was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

With the President's permission, Hon CHAN Hak-kan elucidated two points he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon WONG Sing-chi.

Three more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Samson TAM spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke again.

While the Secretary for Home Affairs was speaking, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung sought elucidation of a point raised by the Secretary for Home Affairs in her speech. The Secretary for Home Affairs did not accede to the request and continued to speak.

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Samson TAM's motion:

To add "young people are the pillar of the Hong Kong society," after "That"; to delete "and" after "criticism;"; and to add "; (e) to establish afresh the youth councils in the 18 districts, and to set up a permanent mechanism for schools and youth organizations of the respective districts to send young people as delegates, so as to effectively promote youth activities and services in the districts; (f) to hold more youth forums, so that young people can put forward their opinions to officials in person and the Government can listen to various voices of young people; and (g) to review the structure and operation of the Commission on Youth, and to assess its effectiveness in promoting youth affairs, as well as to implement a self-nominating mechanism for young people to join the Commission, so as to enhance their chances of participation and the Commission's recognition " immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's amendment to Dr Hon Samson TAM's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 13 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and 12 abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Utilizing young people's power of civic participation" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Samson TAM's motion:

To delete "the development of a knowledge-based society and dawning of the network era" after "That in recent years, with" and substitute with "continuous enhancement in civic awareness"; to delete "and the ways of expression and actions of some of these young people have aroused extensive discussions and concerns in the community;" after "in society,;" to add "conduct a comprehensive study on young people's social participation," after "urges the Government to"; to delete "and" after "criticism,;" to add "and develop young people's independent thinking" after "network citizens"; and to add "; (e) to increase young people's participation in various public bodies and advisory organizations, in particular those organizations related to major subjects of young people's concern, and to consider drawing up reference indicators for the ratio of young people in the membership of these bodies; (f) to strengthen resources allocation in civic and human rights education, and to make good use of Liberal Studies of the New Senior Secondary School curriculum to nurture young people with civic awareness and independent thinking; and (g) to convene youth summits and related local forums annually, and to provide more appropriate open platforms, so that young people can have more chances to realize public participation" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN's amendment to Dr Hon Samson TAM's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, seven against and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Samson TAM's motion:

To add "coupled with the fact that the Government's policies are not beneficial to young people," after "network era,"; and to delete "and (d) starting from education and social culture, to allocate resources to enhance the quality of the network citizens, and to promote a way of communication based on reasons, mutual trust and mutual respect, thereby bringing together social wisdom effectively" immediately before the full stop and substitute with "(d) to promote an open attitude in society towards young people's political commentaries, including the ways they express their opinions, so as to uphold their right of expression; (e) to improve the voter registration system, so that young people reaching the age of 18 can participate in voting as early as possible; and (f) to amend the Telecommunications Ordinance and broadcasting policies to provide the airwaves and the television broadcasting platform for young people to fully exercise their freedom of speech and expression".

Question on Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's amendment to Dr Hon Samson TAM's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hun claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon Samson TAM replied.

Question on Dr Hon Samson TAM's motion put and agreed to.

Motion for the adjournment of the Council

The President said that he had determined under Rule 16(6) and (7) of the Rules of Procedure, the total speaking time for the debate was one and a half hours, of which 75 minutes were Members' speaking time. Each Member, including the mover of the motion, might speak for up to five minutes, and the designated public officer making a reply might speak for up to 15 minutes.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council do now adjourn for the purpose of debating the following issue:  
The current arrangement of implementing in Hong Kong sanctions resolved by the Security Council of the United Nations.

Question on the motion proposed.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

**Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 13 July 2010 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 4:47 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
27 October 2010

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 07/07/2010  
時間 TIME: 08:47:11 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁劉柔芬議員對陳茂波議員的「優化香港稅務政策的管理」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON MRS SOPHIE LEUNG TO HON PAUL CHAN'S MOTION ON  
"ENHANCING THE ADMINISTRATION OF TAX POLICY IN HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	23	
投票 Vote	21	22	
贊成 Yes	19	16	
反對 No	0	4	
棄權 Abstain	2	2	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 07/07/2010  
時間 TIME: 08:53:29 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 由陳茂波議員動議，經梁劉柔芬議員修正的「優化香港稅務政策的管理」議案  
MOTION MOVED BY HON PAUL CHAN ON "ENHANCING THE ADMINISTRATION OF TAX POLICY IN HONG KONG" AS AMENDED BY HON MRS SOPHIE LEUNG

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳茂波Paul CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	22	
投票 Vote	21	21	
贊成 Yes	19	16	
反對 No	0	3	
棄權 Abstain	2	2	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>				<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			劉江華	LAU Kong-wah		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
李鳳英	Li Fung-ying	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU			李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi		
梁家驛	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	棄權	ABSTAIN
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 08/07/2010  
時間 TIME: 04:12:36 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 甘乃威議員對譚偉豪議員的「發揮青年人公民參與力量」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON KAM NAI-WAI TO DR HON SAMSON TAM'S MOTION ON  
"UTILIZING YOUNG PEOPLE'S POWER OF CIVIC PARTICIPATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	27	
投票 Vote	22	26	
贊成 Yes	8	14	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	13	12	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>				<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	棄權	ABSTAIN	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權	ABSTAIN
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	棄權	ABSTAIN	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	棄權	ABSTAIN	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	棄權	ABSTAIN	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	棄權	ABSTAIN	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU			李慧琼	Starry LEE	棄權	ABSTAIN
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	棄權	ABSTAIN
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou			陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 08/07/2010  
時間 TIME: 04:15:35 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 陳淑莊議員對譚偉豪議員的「發揮青年人公民參與力量」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON TANYA CHAN TO DR HON SAMSON TAM'S MOTION ON  
"UTILIZING YOUNG PEOPLE'S POWER OF CIVIC PARTICIPATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳淑莊CHAN Tanya

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	27	
投票 Vote	22	26	
贊成 Yes	7	15	
反對 No	9	7	
棄權 Abstain	6	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 08/07/2010  
時間 TIME: 04:17:38 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁國雄議員對譚偉豪議員的「發揮青年人公民參與力量」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG KWOK-HUNG TO DR HON SAMSON TAM'S MOTION ON  
"UTILIZING YOUNG PEOPLE'S POWER OF CIVIC PARTICIPATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁國雄LEUNG Kwok-hung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	27	
投票 Vote	22	26	
贊成 Yes	5	16	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	1	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK