

**Finance Committee
Meetings on 16 January 2010**

**Motions moved by members under paragraph 37A of the
Finance Committee Procedure**

Proposed motion No. 1

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip**:

"That, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link despite strong opposition from the public, the Government should ensure that contractors of railway and non-railway works must give employment priority to local construction workers so as to ensure that the works concerned can create job opportunities for the construction sector."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

22 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 2

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan**:

"That, as the resumption of agricultural land and domestic structures from the residents of Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT) due to the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link project will disrupt the existing community life of the residents, the Government must arrange for the relocation of CYT, provide an environment which is comparable to their present community life and domestic structures, and extend the deadline of rehousing registration to the end of April 2010."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

20 members voted for and 30 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 3

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah:**

"That, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) despite opposition from various fronts and locates the terminus in West Kowloon, making the XRL hardly accessible to the 3.8 million residents in the New Territories, the Government must provide various connecting facilities and services to ensure that the wrong choice of location will not render the XRL inaccessible to the residents in the New Territories."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

20 members voted for and 30 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 4

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Albert HO Chun-yan:**

"That, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) despite strong opposition from the public, the Government should study the feasibility of providing a XRL station at Kam Sheung Road."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Albert HO Chun-yan under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

20 members voted for and 30 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Albert HO Chun-yan.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 5

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon LEE Cheuk-yan**:

"That the Government should require all contractors undertaking the XRL-related works to use locally-manufactured prefabricated components, if these components have to be used, in order to ensure that the job opportunities in the construction sector created by the relevant works can be maximized."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon LEE Cheuk-yan under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

20 members voted for and 29 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon LEE Cheuk-yan.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 6

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee**:

"That, during the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) by the Government, should the underground strata of Tai Kok Tsui be subject to land subsidence and ground settlement caused by the XRL-related works, rendering it impossible for the residents to stay in their existing homes, the Government should compensate the property owners concerned according to market value to make up for local residents' losses due to the works implemented by the Government in a hasty manner."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

19 members voted for and 30 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 7

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Albert HO Chun-yan**:

"That, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) despite strong opposition from various fronts and locates the terminus in West Kowloon, making residents in Tuen Mun, Tin Shui Wai and Yuen Long having to pay the expensive West Rail fares before they can make use of the XRL, the Government should press the MTR Corporation Limited, upon the commissioning of the XRL, to offer fare concessions to commuters who take the West Rail for using the XRL, so as to ensure that residents in Tuen Mun and Yuen Long will not have to incur heavy traffic expenses for using the XRL."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Albert HO Chun-yan under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 30 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Albert HO Chun-yan.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 8

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon WONG Sing-chi**:

"That, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) despite opposition from various fronts and locates the terminus in West Kowloon, which is far away from Sheung Shui and Tai Po, making residents in Sheung Shui and Tai Po having to pay expensive fares to take the East Rail and then interchange for the West Rail before they can use the XRL, the Government must press the MTR Corporation Limited, upon the commissioning of the XRL, to offer fare concessions to commuters who take the East Rail and then interchange for the West Rail for using the XRL, so as to ensure that residents in Sheung Shui and Tai Po will not have to incur heavy traffic expenses for using the XRL."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon WONG Sing-chi under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 30 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon WONG Sing-chi.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 9

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon LEE Wing-tat**:

"That, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) despite opposition from various fronts, the Administration should report regularly to the residents of Wonderland Villas the condition of the underground strata of their estates so that they can have a clear understanding of the impact of the XRL on the underground strata of their residential properties."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon LEE Wing-tat under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon LEE Wing-tat.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 10

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon LEE Wing-tat**:

"That, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link despite strong opposition from the public and enforce land resumption at Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT), the Government must offer rehousing arrangements to the affected CYT residents and provide them with housing comparable to their existing living environment."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon LEE Wing-tat under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon LEE Wing-tat.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 11

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon KAM Nai-wai**:

"As the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) involves \$66.9 billion of public funds and the findings of the Public Opinion Programme of the University of Hong Kong published recently show that 59% of the respondents said they knew 'very little' or 'quite little' about the entire XRL project, indicating that most people do not understand the substance and social impact of the XRL, I now move under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure to demand that the Government shelve the funding proposals on the XRL and assess the public awareness of the XRL with an opinion poll conducted by an independent organization, and re-submit the funding proposals after having ascertained that the majority of the people of Hong Kong clearly understand the substance of the XRL and its impact on the society."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon KAM Nai-wai under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon KAM Nai-wai.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 12

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee**:

"That, as the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) by the Government may affect the underground strata of Tai Kok Tsui, the SAR Government should release relevant information regularly to the affected residents in Tai Kok Tsui so that they

can clearly understand the impact of the XRL on the underground strata of their residential properties."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 13

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon WONG Yuk-man**:

"That, as the latest opinion poll and social campaign indicate that those who oppose the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) are mainly young people, I move under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure that, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) despite opposition from various fronts, the Government must clearly explain and introduce to the young people the importance and cost-effectiveness of the XRL, with a view to abating the discontent of the young people of Hong Kong arising from the construction of the XRL by the Government."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon WONG Yuk-man under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon WONG Yuk-man.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 14

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon LEE Wing-tat and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung**:

"That, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) despite opposition from various fronts, the Administration should report regularly to the residents of Hutchison Estate, Kwai Chung the condition of the underground strata of their estates so that they can clearly understand the impact of the XRL on the underground strata of their residential properties."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon LEE Wing-tat and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon LEE Wing-tat and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 15

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee**:

"That, as the Government still pushes through the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) despite opposition from various fronts, the Administration must, upon the commissioning of the XRL, report annually to the relevant committee of the Legislative Council on the turnover, operating cost, profit or loss, cash flow and liability of the Hong Kong section of the XRL, with a view to facilitating the public's understanding of the financial position of the XRL."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 16

Wording of the motion proposed by **Dr Hon Margaret NG**:

"That this Committee condemns the authorities for ignoring the doubts regarding the legality of the 'co-location of immigration and customs facilities' in the SAR and bulldozing through its request for the passage of the funding proposals on the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Dr Hon Margaret NG under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Dr Hon Margaret NG.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 17

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Tanya CHAN**:

"That, given the extensive and long-term adverse traffic impact of the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link on Tsim Sha Tsui, Jordan, Yau Ma Tei and the West Kowloon District, the authorities must bear the costs of all traffic improvement measures, as well as consult and notify as soon as possible the affected members of the public and the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Tanya CHAN under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Tanya CHAN.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 18

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon James TO Kun-sun**:

"That, as the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link by the Government may have implications on the development rights of the property owners concerned in Tai Kok Tsui, this Committee requests the Urban Renewal Authority to consider comprehensive redevelopment for the affected areas in order to minimize the implications on the property owners."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon James TO Kun-sun under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 30 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon James TO Kun-sun.

Proposed motion No. 19

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah**:

"That this Committee strongly condemns the SAR Government for ignoring the aspirations of Hong Kong people and pushing through the passage of the funding proposals on the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) without comprehensive and reasonable consultations nor thorough consideration of various problems related to the XRL project."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

20 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 20

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan:**

"That, as the authorities have not conducted any social impact assessment on the works and facilities in relation to the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link, this Committee considers that the authorities must immediately engage an independent consultant to conduct social impact assessment and formulate remedial measures for the residents affected by such works and facilities."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

20 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 21

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit:**

"That, as the Government has recently directed a number of criticisms at The Professional Commons, which has introduced alternative opinions on

the location of the Hong Kong terminus of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL), while The Professional Commons considers that such criticisms have misrepresented the facts, indicating that the Government has not seriously assessed the opinions from The Professional Commons; I now move under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure that, 'as the Government pushes through the construction of the XRL despite opposition from various fronts, the Government should engage an independent consultant to assess the proposal of The Professional Commons, and if the criticisms of the Government are found to be misrepresenting the facts, it should make a public apology to The Professional Commons.'

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 22

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon WONG Yuk-man and Hon WONG Sing-chi:**

"That this Committee commends and expresses thanks to post-80s youngsters, youngsters participating in ascetic, the Anti-Express Railway Group and The Professional Commons for their serious concerns about the funding of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL), as well as their valuable opinions in relation to the XRL."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon WONG Yuk-man and Hon WONG Sing-chi under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon WONG Yuk-man and Hon WONG Sing-chi.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 23

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung**:

"That the Government should require the contractor to hire disabled persons during the construction of the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL); and apart from hiring such persons in the operation of the XRL in the future, offer half-fare concession to the disabled."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

21 members voted for and 30 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 24

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun**:

"That, although the construction project of Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) will probably be approved, many members of the public have considerable reservation on the consultation process; this Committee therefore urges the Government to implement appropriate remedial measures as soon as possible, and actively makes reference to the motions moved by various Members during the consideration of the funding proposals on the XRL project by the Finance Committee, so as to improve administration and demonstrate its determination in attaching importance to public opinion."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

20 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 25

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung**:

"That, as the SAR Government has betrayed its promise and deceived the people by first breaking its own words and changing course suddenly, and even subjecting itself to being self-contradictory by abandoning the original proposal for the XRL to share the tracks of West Rail Line, then by rejecting the engagement of an independent professional consultant to study whether the terminus can be moved away from 'West Kowloon' to reduce public spending and mitigate the impacts on the residents of Choi Yuen Tsuen, Wonderland Villas, Sheung Kwai Chung Village, Ha Kwai Chung Village and Tai Kok Tsui; and more surprisingly, the people concerned have not been consulted directly, leaving their interests not properly protected; moreover, under the continuous protests from the people and the increasing opposition in public opinion following the gradual disclosure of information, the Government still insists on its own course and merely excuses itself from the queries of members of this Committee on the 'co-location' arrangement by claiming that such arrangement is under study, depriving members of the public from their right to know about the implementation of this arrangement, thus making them unable to know that, if the implementation of this arrangement results in Mainland public security officials taking enforcement actions in Hong Kong, the existing right of protection of the Hong Kong people under the Basic Law will surely be jeopardized; and if co-location is not practicable, the so-called express rail will most likely lose its high speed efficiency to complicated clearance procedures and turn into a 'white elephant' which will result in wastage of public money; as to patronage forecast, the Government has time and again declined to disclose its mode and basis of forecast, and has exaggerated the patronage to fabricate the relevant employment opportunities and economic benefits, which is the most serious falsehood;

this Committee urges the Government to apologize and immediately withdraw the funding proposals."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

19 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 26

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung:**

"That, as the Government has planned to shift its resources for the XRL which costs \$66.9 billion by way of cutting back Category A projects, rendering construction workers in Hong Kong to suffer from the loss of immediate positions before they can enjoy the benefits brought about by the XRL project, this Committee urges the Government to undertake that Category A projects will increase as planned; if not, this Committee urges the Government to shelve the funding applications immediately."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

19 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 27

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung**:

"That, as many Members have not declared their interests at Subcommittee meetings and other meetings during which the Government's funding applications for XRL were considered, hence depriving the citizens' right to know in the voting on whether to engage a professional consultant to conduct independent assessments of the alignment and operation of the XRL, this Committee urges the Government to retrospectively engage independent professionals to reassess the current XRL proposal before applying for funding."

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

19 members voted for and 29 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung.

X X X X X X X X

Proposed motion No. 28

Wording of the motion proposed by **Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip**:

"Given that the Government has claimed that the Guangzhou–Shenzhen–Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) is expected to generate economic benefits of \$87 billion for Hong Kong over 50 years of operation, I now move under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure that 'the Administration be required to report annually on the economic benefits brought to Hong Kong by the XRL after its completion, and if the economic benefits it brings to Hong Kong are lower than expected, the Administration should hold the consultant company making such assessment accountable and recover the losses from the company.'"

The Chairman considered the above motion as directly related to the agenda item and put the following question to vote in accordance with paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure --

"That this Committee should forthwith proceed with the motion moved by Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure."

19 members voted for and 31 members voted against the question. The Chairman declared that as the above question was not agreed by a majority of members, the Committee would not forthwith proceed with the motion proposed by Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip.

X X X X X X X X