

**立法會**  
*Legislative Council*

LC Paper No. PWSC53/09-10  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee  
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> meeting  
held in Conference Room A of Legislative Council Building  
on Wednesday, 10 February 2010 at 8:30 am**

**Members present:**

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP (Chairman)  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP  
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP  
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP  
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan  
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS  
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

**Members absent:**

Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP  
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

**Public officers attending:**

Ms Doris HO Pui-ling	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) <sup>3</sup>
Mr MAK Chai-kwong, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)
Mr Thomas CHOW Tat-ming, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)
Ms Anissa WONG, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment
Miss Sandra LAM Ching-nga	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Works)
Mr LAU Ka-keung, JP	Director of Drainage Services
Mr Elvis AU Wai-kwong, JP	Assistant Director (Water Policy)
Mr MAK Ka-wai	Environmental Protection Department Chief Engineer (Consultants Management)
Mr CHAU Kwok-ming	Drainage Services Department Chief Engineer (Harbour Area Treatment Scheme) Drainage Services Department

**Clerk in attendance:**

Ms Debbie YAU	Chief Council Secretary (1) <sup>6</sup>
---------------	--

**Staff in attendance:**

Mrs Constance LI	Assistant Secretary General 1
Ms Angel SHEK	Senior Council Secretary (1) <sup>1</sup>
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1) <sup>3</sup>
Ms Christy YAU	Legislative Assistant (1) <sup>1</sup>

---

Action

The Chairman reported that a total of 19 capital works projects of an amount \$84,271.8 million had been endorsed by the Public Works Subcommittee (PWSC) in the 2009-2010 session so far.

**Application for late membership**

2. The Chairman referred to Ms Audrey EU's letter dated 2 February 2010 applying to join the PWSC. He advised that according to rule 4(b) of PWSC Procedures, a request for late membership of PWSC on grounds other than indisposition or absence from Hong Kong should be put to the Subcommittee which should accept such applications only when sufficient grounds had been provided. In reply to Mr TAM Yiu-chung, the Chairman said that among the five Legislative Council (LegCo) Members who had recently resigned, two of them

were Members belonging to the Civic Party (CP) who were also PWSC members. As Ms EU was a Member from the same party, acceptance of her application for late membership would help maintain the participation of CP Members in PWSC. Members agreed and welcomed Ms EU to join the Subcommittee.

3. On the filling of the vacancy of the deputy chairmanship of PWSC arising from the resignation of Hon Alan LEONG, the Chairman suggested and members agreed that the re-election be held at the next meeting on 14 April 2010.

**Head 704 - Drainage**

**PWSC (2009-10)89      359DS      North District sewerage, stage 1 phase 2B**

4. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to increase the approved project estimate of 359DS by \$55 million from \$130 million to \$185 million in money-of-the-day (MOD) prices. The Panel on Environmental Affairs (the EA Panel) had been consulted on the proposal at the meeting on 25 January 2010, and Panel members had not raised objection to the proposal. The Administration had provided supplementary information to the EA Panel on 2 February 2010.

5. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**PWSC (2009-10)87      341DS      Harbour Area Treatment Scheme, stage 2A-  
upgrading of Stonecutters Island sewage  
treatment works and preliminary treatment  
works**

6. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade 341DS to Category A at an estimated cost of \$7,913.4 million in MOD prices for the upgrading of Stonecutters Island sewage treatment works (SCISTW) and eight associated preliminary treatment works (PTWs) on Hong Kong Island. The EA Panel had been consulted on the proposed works at the meetings on 15 December 2009 and 25 January 2010, and Panel members had not raised objection to the proposal. The Administration had provided supplementary information to the EA Panel on 22 December 2009 and 2 February 2010.

Sludge reception and treatment facilities

7. Referring to the sludge reception site at Ha Pak Nai as denoted in Enclosure 1 to PWSC(2009-10)87, Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired about the areas to be served by the site and the mitigation measures to be put in place to minimize adverse impacts arising from the land transportation of the sludge to the reception site. Ms Miriam LAU shared similar concern about odour emission from sludge reception and treatment facilities, and enquired about the treatment and disposal of the sludge. Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming also enquired about the sludge treatment process.

8. The Director of Drainage Services (DDS) said that to minimize odour problem and other adverse impacts on the environment, the sludge would be transported to the reception site by sea. To ensure smooth transportation and receipt of the sludge, the proposed expansion of SCISTW and upgrading of sludge reception facilities would include works to facilitate sludge transportation by sea. The Assistant Director (Water Policy), Environmental Protection Department (AD(WP), EPD) advised that the sludge reception site at Ha Pak Nai would receive sludge mainly from SCISTW, although it would also serve some other sewage treatment facilities (e.g. the Pillar Point sewage treatment works (STW)). After being dewatered at SCISTW, the sludge would be sent to the sludge reception facilities by sea in sealed containers, and then conveyed to the Sludge Treatment Facility (STF) at Tsang Tsui for incineration. The ash discharged from incineration would be disposed at the adjacent West New Territories (WENT) landfill. As the sludge would be treated by high temperature incineration, the odour emitted from the sludge disposed at the WENT landfill would be greatly reduced. Besides, the works were in progress following approval by the Finance Committee (FC) in June 2009 to provide covers and deodourization facilities to the existing sedimentary tanks at SCISTW to further minimize odour emission from these facilities.

9. Mr TAM Yiu-chung noted that the quantity of dewatered sludge generated from SCISTW was estimated to increase substantially from about 600 tonnes per day at present to more than 1 000 tonnes per day under the ultimate development scenario of SCISTW operating at its design treatment capacity. He was concerned whether the capacity of the STF at Tsang Tsui could cope with the increasing sludge load. The Permanent Secretary for the Environment (PS(Env)) advised that, with a designed capacity of 2 000 tonnes per day, the new STF at Tsang Tsui would be able to provide treatment for sludge generated by the expanded SCISTW and other regional STWs.

#### Public consultation

10. Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired about the consultation with the Tuen Mun District Council (TMDC) on the proposed project. Mr TAM Yiu-chung noted from the Administration's paper PWSC(2009-10)87 that while seven District Councils (DCs) (i.e. Central and Western DC, Eastern DC, Kwai Tsing DC, Sham Shui Po DC, Wan Chai DC, Southern DC and Tsuen Wan DC) had been consulted on the proposed works, the Administration did not seem to have consulted TMDC and the Yuen Long District Council. Ms Audrey EU also asked whether the relevant DCs had been consulted on the expansion of SCISTW and upgrading of sludge reception facilities at the existing WENT landfill piers.

11. PS(Env) and AD(WP), EPD said that the STF at Tsang Tsui was a dedicated outlet for the handling of sludge arising from the Harbour Area Treatment Scheme (HATS) programme. The TMDC and the relevant LegCo Panel had been consulted on the STF before the HATS project was approved by FC in June 2009. AD(WP), EPD added that the Administration had consulted TMDC and the Tuen Mun Area Committees from 2007 to 2008, and the TMDC was consulted again in

January and March 2009 on the STF project. The Administration had subsequently arranged tendering for the STF construction works, with a view to commissioning the facility by 2013. He assured members that the Administration would continue to maintain close communication with TMDC and local residents regarding the progress of works.

Admin

12. Ms Audrey EU queried why such information was not provided in the paper, given that the latest consultation with TMDC on the STF project in March 2009 coincided with the consultation with the seven DCs on the proposed works in the first quarter of 2009. DDS explained that the consultation on the sludge transportation and loading arrangement at Nim Wan had been conducted together with the STF project at Tsang Tsui, and this had been reported in the submission to PWSC concerning the proposed construction of STF. The Chairman advised the Administration to provide, before the relevant FC meeting, supplementary information about the consultation with relevant district councils, in particular TMDC, on the proposed expansion of SCISTW and the upgrading of sludge reception facilities at the existing WENT landfill piers.

13. Mr TAM Yiu-chung remarked that the Administration should have provided relevant information on the consultation with DCs in the paper for PWSC to facilitate members' consideration of the funding proposal. The Chairman said that he had reminded time and again to include relevant information in the PWSC papers to enable members to have the full picture in considering the proposals. The Administration took note of members' concerns.

14. Mr KAM Nai-wai suggested that the Administration should set up a liaison group to communicate with the residents concerned about the progress of the proposed works and respond to their suggestions/complaints proactively. He requested the Administration to draw experience from the construction of a public library and indoor recreation centre in Yuen Long and the demolition of the Kennedy Town Incinerator where the residents in the local community had not been informed of the projects and their progress. DDS said that the Administration had consulted the local community on the proposed projects. Information on the progress of works would be disseminated through newsletters and the relevant websites in line with current practice.

#### Upgrading of eight preliminary treatment works

15. Referring to the odour problem associated with Chai Wan PTW, Mr KAM Nai-wai asked about the odour abatement measures for the eight PTWs under the proposed project. He also enquired whether the projects would include replacement of sewers for conveying sewage.

16. DDS said that except the Cyberport PTW, the other seven PTWs on Hong Kong Island had been in use for more than 20 years, and their capacities and facilities would need to be upgraded to cater for the new requirements of HATS stage 2A. Deodourization facilities and covers would be provided for these PTWs to minimize odour nuisance. The aesthetic and landscaping design of the PTWs

would also be improved with roof greening. As for sewers, reviews would be conducted annually, with repair and maintenance works carried out on a need basis.

17. Referring to the complaint from the local community about the noise nuisance caused by the drainage works at Cyberport, Mr KAM Nai-wai expressed concern about the potential noise impact of the proposed upgrading works for the eight PTWs, in particular the Cyberport PTW, Sandy Bay PTW and Wah Fu PTW which were located in a relatively tranquil environment. DDS said that an EIA had been conducted for HATS stage 2A including the upgrading works for the eight PTWs. The EIA report confirmed that with the implementation of the recommended mitigation measures, the environmental impacts of the proposed works during and after construction could be controlled to within the prescribed standards and guidelines. The Administration would implement the mitigation measures as recommended in the EIA report to control noise, such as the use of noise enclosures.

18. Mr KAM Nai-wai doubted the effectiveness of the mitigation measures as contractors might not implement them to the required standard and hence could not meet the expectation of the local residents. To effectively minimize the adverse impact, he requested the Administration to adopt more stringent mitigation measures than those recommended in the EIA report in order to meet present-day requirements. DDS said that environmental mitigation works at a cost of \$57 million would be undertaken for the proposed project. He advised that an independent consultant would be engaged to carry out a comprehensive Environmental Monitoring and Audit programme to ensure the contractor's compliance with the environmental permit requirements. AD(WP), EPD added that similar to other sewerage works, assessments of noise levels on affected parties arising from the proposed works had been conducted. The recommended mitigation measures had proven to be effective in reducing noise generation in similar projects.

19. Noting from Enclosure 1 to PWSC(2009-10)87 that most of the PTWs and the SCISTW were near the waterfront, Prof Patrick LAU expressed concern about the potential impact of the proposed works on harbourfront planning, and the need to provide adequate space for a continuous promenade. DDS advised that the Administration had consulted the Harbour-front Enhancement Committee (HEC) regarding the proposed layout design of upgrading works of some PTWs. The HEC had no objection in-principle to the proposal and supported the proposed greening works for the PTWs. DDS advised that there was passage way near the Central and Wanchai East PTWs providing direct access to the waterfront. At the request of Prof LAU, the Administration agreed to provide, before the relevant FC meeting, information on the views and suggestions received from HEC regarding the proposed layout design of the PTWs at Wanchai East and Central.

Water quality

20. Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired about the progress of HATS in improving the water quality of the beaches in Northwest New Territories, especially those in Tsuen Wan which had been closed because of their high *E Coli* level. AD(WP), EPD said that under stage 2A of HATS, 450 000 cubic metres of sewage generated daily would be collected from the northern and south-western parts of Hong Kong Island not handled by stage 1. The sewage would be transferred for chemically-enhanced primary treatment (CEPT) and disinfection at the expanded SCISTW before discharge. With the expansion and modification of the CEPT facilities, and provision of permanent disinfection facilities at SCISTW under the proposed project, it was expected that HATS stage 2A would further improve the water quality of the harbour, including that of the closed Tsuen Wan beaches. He added that since the commissioning of the first stage of disinfection facilities in December 2009, there were already marked improvements in the water quality of Tsuen Wan beaches. The Administration would continue monitoring the beach water quality over the period from March to October 2010. Consideration would be given to re-opening the closed beaches if the beach water quality was found to be acceptable. At the request of Mr WONG, AD(WP), EPD undertook to provide information on the result of the water quality monitoring when available.

Admin

Other issues

21. Noting that the proposed works would involve the removal of 50 trees, including six trees to be felled, 23 trees to be replanted within the project site and 21 trees to be transplanted offsite, Mr KAM Nai-wai enquired about the location of the trees to be felled and the reasons for felling them. DDS advised that of the six trees to be felled, three were located at the North Point PTW, and each of the remaining three at the Wanchai East PTW, Aberdeen PTW and Wah Fu PTW respectively. While the Administration had managed to preserve most of the 321 trees within the project boundary by adjusting the design and location of facilities to be upgraded at the PTWs, the six trees had to be felled as a last resort to make way for the expanded facilities.

22. The item was voted on and endorsed.

23. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 9:20 am.