

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

Ref : CB2/HS/2/09

LC Paper No. CB(2)2312/09-10  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

**Subcommittee on Package of Proposals for the  
Methods for Selecting the Chief Executive  
and for Forming the Legislative Council in 2012**

**Minutes of the sixth meeting  
held on Tuesday, 25 May 2010, at 2:30 pm  
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

**Members present** :

- Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP (Chairman)
- Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
- Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
- Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
- Dr Hon Margaret NG
- Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
- Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
- Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
- Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
- Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
- Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP
- Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
- Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
- Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
- Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
- Hon LEE Wing-tat
- Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
- Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
- Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP
- Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
- Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
- Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
- Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP
- Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
- Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS
- Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
- Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
- Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP
- Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun
- Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
- Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
- Hon Tanya CHAN

- Members absent** : Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou
- Public Officers attending** : Mr Stephen LAM Sui-lung  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs
- Mr Joshua LAW Chi-kong }  
Permanent Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland } for sessions  
Affairs } Three to Four
- Mr Arthur HO Kin-wah }  
Deputy Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland } for sessions  
Affairs } One to Two
- Mr Curtis LO Kam-fat  
Assistant Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland  
Affairs
- Attendance by invitation** : Session One
- Association of Hong Kong Schools for Workers'  
Children Alumni Limited  
Mr LAM Man-fai
- Mr LAU Yuk
- Mr CHAN Hiu-chun
- Mr CHAN Fook-wing
- Mr CHEUNG Chi-fai
- Mr YOUNG Wing-fai
- Mr KWOK Wai-keung  
Member of Eastern District Council
- Jump Youth  
Mr LEE Wai-ming
- 田之動力  
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-leung
- Radical Anti-government Power  
Mr SZETO Tze-long  
Member

Victoria Park in Action

Mr AU YEUNG Ying-kit  
Convenor

Speak Up Hong Kong

Mr YUM Liang-hsien  
Convenor

Session Two

Tsuen Wan Youth Association

Mr CHEUNG Yat-chuen  
Member

Construction Professionals' Development Centre

Mr WONG King  
Chief Executive

Innovation & Technology Association

Mr LI Wing-kwai  
Chartered President

葵涌南文藝協進會

Mr Peter CHEUNG

The Federation of Alumni Associations of Chinese  
Colleges and Universities in Hong Kong

Mr Patrick TSE  
Vice Chairman

Mr CHIU Chi-keung  
Member of Eastern District Council

Hong Kong Senior Education Workers Association Limited

Mr LEE Kam-chung  
President

Hong Kong Federation of Education Workers

Mr WONG On-nam  
Assistant to the President

Hong Kong Association of China Travel Organisers

Mr CHAN Lup-chi  
Secretary General

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and  
Progress of Hong Kong

Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan  
Deputy Spokesman, Political Affairs

Hong Kong Society of Juvenile & Youth

Mr Frank YEUNG  
Vice Chairman

Young Democratic Alliance for the Betterment  
and Progress of Hong Kong

Mr Charles CHONG  
Member

Mr POON Cheuk-bun

Hong Kong Christian Institute

Mr TANG Wing-fai  
Programme Secretary

The Democratic Party

Mr YIM Ka-wing  
Representative

*Session Three*

Hong Kong Political Economic and Cultural Society

Mr WONG Chi-wa

Hong Kong Youth Think-Tank

Mr CHAN Chi-ho  
Chairman

Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations

Mr HUNG Lin-cham  
Chairman of the Youth Committee

Federation of New Territories Youth

Mr TSANG Hin-hong

Miss CHEUK Wan-ying

Mr LI Sai-wing

Miss LUI Dik-ming

Mr YEUNG Hok-ming

Mr NG Yam-fung

Mr CHAN Kuen-hong

Miss Catherine NG

HK Public Administration Association

Dr Peter FONG  
President

Hong Kong Project Management Exchange Centre Ltd

Mr CHAN Ka-wah  
Chairman

Miss CHAN Yuen-pik

Mr CHAN Chi-hing

Ms FONG Kwok-shan  
Members of Sai Kung District Council

Mr CHAN Kar-tai

Session Four

Hong Kong All Youth Alliance

Miss WONG Chui-lan  
Vice Secretary

Civic Party

Mr Thomas YU  
Member

Federation of Employees Unions in Service

Mr TONG Kang-yiu  
Chairman

Central & Western District Council

Mr CHUNG Yam-cheung  
District Council Member

Mr LEE Ning-choun

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Flora TAI  
Chief Council Secretary (2)3

**Staff in attendance** : Mr Arthur CHEUNG  
Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2

Ms Clara TAM  
Assistant Legal Adviser 9

Mrs Eleanor CHOW  
Senior Council Secretary (2)4

Mrs Fanny TSANG  
Legislative Assistant (2)3

Miss Lulu YEUNG  
Clerical Assistant (2)3

---

Action

**I. Meeting with deputations and the Administration**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1614/09-10(01) to (19) and CB(2)1701/09-10(10) to (19)]

The Subcommittee received views from a total of 49 individuals and organizations (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Deputy Chairman informed members that the Subcommittee would continue to receive views from the public at its meeting to be held on 29 May 2010 from 9:00 am to 12:00 noon.

3. The meeting ended at 7:00 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
28 September 2010

**Proceedings of the sixth meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Package of Proposals for the  
Methods for Selecting the Chief Executive  
and for Forming the Legislative Council in 2012  
on Tuesday, 25 May 2010, at 2:30 pm  
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<b>Session One (2:30 pm - 3:45 pm)</b>			
000408 - 000704	Chairman	Opening remarks  Meeting with deputations to receive views on the package of proposals for the methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") and for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012 ("the proposed package")	
000705 - 001008	Association of Hong Kong Schools for Workers' Children Alumni Limited	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(10)]	
001009 - 001156	Mr LAU Yuk	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(02)]	
001157 - 001404	Mr CHAN Hiu-chun	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(03)]	
001405 - 001628	Mr CHAN Fook-wing	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(04)]	
001629 - 001820	Mr CHEUNG Chi-fai	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(05)]	
001821 - 002126	Mr YOUNG Wing-fai	Presentation of views	
002127 - 002359	Mr KWOK Wai-keung, Member of Eastern District Council	Presentation of views	
002400 - 002559	Jump Youth	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(11)]	
002600 - 002906	田之動力	Presentation of views	
002907 - 003213	Radical Anti-government Power	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(07)]	
003214 - 003517	Victoria Park in Action	Presentation of views	
003518 - 003824	Speak Up Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
003825 - 003841	Chairman	Speaking order of members	

<b>Time Marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
003842 - 004407	Chairman Dr Margaret NG Mr CHAN Hiu-chun 田之動力	Discussion on whether incumbent Members returned by functional constituency ("FC") elections should support the abolition of FCs in order to implement universal suffrage, and the results of the opinion survey conducted by the South China Morning Post on the proposed package and the abolition of FCs published on 24 May 2010	
004408 - 004939	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mr KWOK Wai-keung, Member of Eastern District Council Radical Anti-government Power	Discussion on the proposal to create more FC seats by inclusion of other sectors such as the housewife and student sectors to return LegCo Members by "one-person-two-votes" under universal suffrage, and the proposal to allocate \$66.9 billion to FC Members in exchange for their agreement to abolish FCs	
004940 - 005504	Chairman Mr Ronny TONG Mr YOUNG Wing-fai	Discussion on the abolition of the split voting system and the eventual abolition of FCs when universal suffrage was implemented	
005505 - 010032	Chairman Ms Miriam LAU Speak Up Hong Kong	Discussion on why the proposed package was considered retrogressive when the five District Council ("DC") FC Members were to be returned by 3.3 million registered electors by indirect election and the threshold specified as a percentage of the total membership of the Election Committee for nominating candidates for the CE election remained unchanged	
010033 - 010615	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration Speak Up Hong Kong Association of Hong Kong Schools for Workers' Children Alumni Limited	Discussion on the ratio of FC Members and geographical constituency Members in 2012, whether the constitutional development of Hong Kong was decided by the Central People's Government, and whether DC FC Members had the mandate of the people	
010616 - 010719	Chairman	Withdrawal of Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and the representative of Association of Hong Kong Schools for Workers' Children Alumni Limited from the meeting	
010720 - 011044	Chairman Dr Margaret NG Speak Up Hong Kong	Discussion on whether the proposal to return DC FC Members by indirect election was retrogressive	
011045 - 011736	Chairman Administration	Administration's responses to deputations' views	
<b>Session Two (3:45 pm - 5:00 pm)</b>			
011915 - 012102	Chairman	Opening remarks	
012103 - 012254	Tsuen Wan Youth Association	Presentation of views	



<b>Time Marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
012255 - 012526	Construction Professionals' Development Centre	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(08)]	
012527 - 012823	Innovation & Technology Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(09)]	
012824 - 013139	葵涌南文藝協進會	Presentation of views	
013140 - 013319	The Federation of Alumni Associations of Chinese Colleges and Universities in Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(10)]	
013320 - 013627	Mr CHIU Chi-keung, Member of Eastern District Council	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(12)]	
013628 - 013936	Hong Kong Senior Education Workers Association Limited	Presentation of views	
013937 - 014203	Hong Kong Federation of Education Workers	Presentation of views	
014204 - 014516	Hong Kong Association of China Travel Organisers	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(13)]	
014517 - 014759	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
014800 - 015110	Hong Kong Society of Juvenile & Youth	Presentation of views	
015111 - 015428	Young Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
015429 - 015636	Mr POON Cheuk-bun	Presentation of views	
015637 - 015944	Hong Kong Christian Institute	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(14)]	
015945 - 020250	The Democratic Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(11)]	
020251 - 020308	Chairman	Speaking order of members	
020309 - 020812	Chairman Dr Margaret NG Construction Professionals' Development Centre	Discussion on the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010, results of the opinion survey conducted by the South China Morning Post on the proposed package and the abolition of FCs published on 24 May 2010	

<b>Time Marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
020813 - 021322	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Construction Professionals' Development Centre	Discussion on the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010	
021323 - 021910	Chairman Mr LAU Kong-wah 葵涌南文藝協進會 Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	Discussion on freedom of expression, why drastic changes to the electoral methods would not be conducive to democratic development in the face of financial tsunami, and the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010	
021911 - 022417	Ms Audrey EU	Expression of views that the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010, unlike FC election, allowed people the opportunity to stand for the election, the abolition of the FC system which had existed for over 25 years was not too hasty and drastic, the latest results of an opinion survey conducted by the University of Hong Kong indicated that more people opposed the proposed package, and the retention of FCs should not be compromised at the expense of the principles of universality and equality	
022418 - 022811	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	Expression of views that the Civic Party had regarded the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010 as "referendum", the FC system should be improved in order to implement universal suffrage, and issues relating to political reform should be discussed in a rational manner	
022812 - 022921	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Innovation & Technology Association	Discussion on why FCs should be retained	
022922 - 023545	Chairman Administration	Administration's responses to views expressed by deputations and members	
023546 - 024223		<b>Break</b>	
<b>Session Three (5:05 pm - 6:20 pm)</b>			
024224 - 024424	Chairman	Opening remarks	
024425 - 024738	Hong Kong Political Economic and Cultural Society	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(12)]	
024739 - 025047	Hong Kong Youth Think-Tank	Presentation of views	
025048 - 025310	Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(13)]	
025311 - 025552	Federation of New Territories Youth	Presentation of views	

<b>Time Marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
025553 - 025719	Ms CHEUK Wan-ying	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(15)]	
025720 - 025859	Mr LI Sai-wing	Presentation of views	
025900 - 030104	Miss LUI Dik-ming	Presentation of views	
030105 - 030416	Mr YEUNG Hok-ming	Presentation of views	
030417 - 030535	Mr NG Yam-fung	Presentation of views	
030536 - 030848	Mr CHAN Kuen-hong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(14)]	
030849 - 031101	Miss Catherine NG	Presentation of views	
031102 - 031409	HK Public Administration Association	Presentation of views	
031410 - 031635	Hong Kong Project Management Exchange Centre Ltd	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(15)]	
031636 - 031826	Miss CHAN Yuen-pik	Presentation of views	
031827 - 032131	Mr CHAN Chi-hing	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(16)]	
032132 - 032438	Ms FONG Kwok-shan, Members of Sai Kung District Council	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(16)]	
032439 - 032744	Mr CHAN Kar-tai	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1614/09-10(17)]	
032745 - 032754	Chairman	Speaking order of members	
032755 - 033259	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	Expression of views on Cultural Revolution, and whether the CE election to be conducted in 2017 would comply with the international standard of universal suffrage	
033300 - 033803	Chairman Mr Alan LEONG HK Public Administration Association Mr YEUNG Hok-ming	Discussion on why the proposed package should be supported when there was no guarantee that genuine universal suffrage would be implemented, whether supporting the proposed package would help resolve livelihood problems in Hong Kong, whether the abolition of the FC system which had existed for over 25 years was too hasty and drastic, and how to address the demand for abolition of FCs by the 500 000 voters who had participated in the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010	
033804 - 034118	Mr WONG Yung-kan	Expression of views on freedom of expression, respecting the views of others, the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010, and FC elections	

<b>Time Marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
034119 - 034316	Chairman Mr WONG Yung-kan Ms FONG Kwok-shan, Members of Sai Kung District Council Hong Kong Political Economic and Cultural Society	Discussion on reasons for attending the meeting and livelihood problems in Hong Kong	
034317 - 034852	Chairman Mr IP Kwok-him Hong Kong Political Economic and Cultural Society Mr LI Sai-wing Mr CHAN Chi-hing Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	Discussion on the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010, and whether the 500 000 voters participated in the LegCo By-election on 16 May 2010 could represent the views of those who chose not to vote	
034853 - 035426	Chairman Mr Jeffrey LAM Mr CHAN Kar-tai Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations	Discussion on the radical move of young people to besiege LegCo on 23 June 2010, freedom of expression and respect for others in a democratic society, and the importance of rational discussion on political reform among Members	
035427 - 035927	Chairman Administration	Administration's responses to views expressed by deputations and members	
<b>Session Four (6:20 pm - 6:55 pm)</b>			
040033 - 040132	Deputy Chairman	Opening remarks	
040133 - 040438	Hong Kong All Youth Alliance	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(17)]	
040439 - 040748	Civic Party	Presentation of views	
040749 - 041057	Federation of Employees Unions in Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(18)]	
041058 - 041414	Mr CHUNG Yam-cheung, Member of Central & Western District Council	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(19)]	
041415 - 041606	Mr LEE Ning-choun	Presentation of views	
041607 - 041640	Deputy Chairman Mr LAU Kong-wah	Speaking order of members	
041641 - 041736	Mr CHUNG Yam-cheung, Member of Central & Western District Council	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(19)]	

<b>Time Marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
041737 - 041905	Mr LAU Kong-wah	Expression of views on the impact of voting down the proposed package and the importance of political reform to move forward	
041906 - 042003	Deputy Chairman Mr LAU Kong-wah Hong Kong All Youth Alliance	Discussion on the proposal to expand the membership of the Election Committee to 1 800 to include the young people subsector	
042004 - 042310	Deputy Chairman Mr WONG Ting-kwong Mr CHUNG Yam-cheung, Member of Central & Western District Council Hong Kong All Youth Alliance	Discussion on the Democratic Party's proposal to return the 5 DC FC Members through indirect election by 3.3 million registered electors and the likelihood for young candidate to win in an election	
042311 - 042616	Deputy Chairman Miss Tanya CHAN Hong Kong All Youth Alliance	Discussion on the retention of FCs, and the right to nominate candidates and to stand for election	
042617 - 042957	Deputy Chairman Administration	Administration's responses to the deputations' views	
042958 - 043034	Deputy Chairman	Date of next meeting	