

立法會
Legislative Council

Ref : CB2/HS/2/09

LC Paper No. CB(2)2313/09-10
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

**Subcommittee on Package of Proposals for the
Methods for Selecting the Chief Executive
and for Forming the Legislative Council in 2012**

**Minutes of the seventh meeting
held on Saturday, 29 May 2010, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** :
- Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP (Chairman)
 - Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
 - Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
 - Dr Hon Margaret NG
 - Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
 - Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
 - Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
 - Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
 - Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
 - Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
 - Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
 - Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
 - Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP
 - Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP
 - Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
 - Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
 - Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou
 - Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun
 - Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
 - Hon Tanya CHAN
- Members absent** :
- Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
 - Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
 - Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
 - Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
 - Hon LEE Wing-tat
 - Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
 - Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
 - Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
 - Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
 - Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
 - Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon WONG Yuk-man

- Public Officers attending** : Mr Stephen LAM Sui-lung
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs
- Mr Arthur HO Kin-wah
Deputy Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs
- Mr Curtis LO Kam-fat
Assistant Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs
- Attendance by invitation** : *Session One*
- Mr LEUNG Wing-hang
- Mr TSE Wai-kam
- 青民大專發展小組
Mr Alex CHEN
- Mr Holden CHOW
- Good Contribution Association
Mr LUNG Hon-shing
Chairman
- Hon Wah College Alumni Association
Mr FUNG Kim-tang
Director
- Mr NG Chi-pui
- Hong Kong United Youth Association Ltd.
Mr CHENG Chung-fo
Secretary
- Miss PANG Che-kwan, Gigi
- Hong Kong Youth Exchange Promotion United Association
Mr Islam Anwer ul
Director
- Mr LI Kai-hei

The Unified Association of Kowloon West Ltd.
Mr TSOI Pui
Vice-President

Session Two

On Tin Estate Community Association
Mr CHOW Chun-wa

The Hong Kong Printers Association
Mr YEUNG Kam-kai
Chairman

Hong Kong Youth & Tertiary Students Association
Mr LEUNG Hang-faat
Vice President

Institute of Print-media Professionals
Mr LAU Hoi-tung

HK Politics 2.0
Mr PANG Hin-to, James

Motor Transport Workers General Union
Mr CHAN Siu-wah, Lewis
Administrative Officer

Hong Kong Construction Industry Employees
General Union
Mr FUNG Kin-cho
Secretary

Hong Kong Confederation of Trade Unions
Mr TAM Chun-yin
Coordinating Secretary

將軍澳區社區服務及規劃發展委員會
Mr YU Hon-lun

The Hong Kong Polytechnic University Students' Union
Mr Sam WONG
President

Lingnan University Students' Union
Mr Leo TANG
External Vice President

Hong Kong Federation of Students

Mr LIN Chiu-fai
Deputy Secretary General

The Student Union of the Hong Kong Baptist University

Mr CHEUNG Lok-kan
External Vice President

Session Three

The Hong Kong Overseas Chinese General Association

Mr TJANG Tjen-tjong

Hong Kong Chamber of Films

Ms Lorraine HO

Ms CHAN Yin-shan

Mr CHAN Sin-ming

Youth Network

Mr HUNG Hiu-wai
Director

UPOST

Miss LAW Mei-ting
Editor

Ngau Tau Kok Teen Network

Mr WAT Chi-wah

The Hong Kong Institute of Planners

Ms PONG Yuen-yee
Council Member

香港菁英會

Mr PAK Fu-hung

Mr Clement WU

Clerk in attendance : Miss Flora TAI
Chief Council Secretary (2)3

Staff in attendance : Mr Arthur CHEUNG
Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2

Mrs Eleanor CHOW
Senior Council Secretary (2)4

Mrs Fanny TSANG
Legislative Assistant (2)3

Miss Lulu YEUNG
Clerical Assistant (2)3

Action

I. Meeting with deputations and the Administration

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1651/09-10(01) to (28), CB(2)1701/09-10(20) to (28) and CB(2)1830/09-10(01) to (04)]

The Subcommittee received views from a total of 35 individuals and organizations (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee noted that the next meeting would be held on 31 May 2010 at 2:30 pm.
3. The meeting ended at 12:23 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
28 September 2010

**Proceedings of the seventh meeting of the
Subcommittee on Package of Proposals for the
Methods for Selecting the Chief Executive
and for Forming the Legislative Council in 2012
on Saturday, 29 May 2010, at 9:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
Session One (9:00 am - 10:00 am)			
000520 - 000735	Chairman	Opening remarks Meeting with deputations to receive views on the package of proposals for the methods for selecting the Chief Executive ("CE") and for forming the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2012 ("the proposed package")	
000736 - 001032	Mr LEUNG Wing-hang	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(01)]	
001033 - 001318	Mr TSE Wai-kam	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(02)]	
001319 - 001631	青民大專發展小組	Presentation of views	
001632 - 001920	Mr Holden CHOW	Presentation of views	
001921 - 002220	Good Contribution Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(03)]	
002221 - 002542	Hon Wah College Alumni Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(04)]	
002543 - 002857	Mr NG Chi-pui	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(05)]	
002858 - 003200	Hong Kong United Youth Association Ltd.	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(20)]	
003201 - 003444	Miss PANG Che-kwan, Gigi	Presentation of views	
003445 - 003736	Hong Kong Youth Exchange Promotion United Association	Presentation of views	
003737 - 004043	Mr LI Kai-hei	Presentation of views	
004044 - 004352	The Unified Association of Kowloon West Ltd.	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(07)]	
004353 - 004408	Chairman	Speaking order of members	
004409 - 004727	Ms Emily LAU	Expression of views that the majority of the opinion surveys conducted in the past indicated that more than half of the people supported the implementation of dual universal suffrage in 2007/2008 and subsequently in 2012, the	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
		screening process for the election of CE in 2017 and the retention of the functional constituencies ("FCs") in the LegCo election in 2020 would not comply with the principles of universal suffrage, and the Democratic Party wished political reform to move forward	
004728 - 004922	Chairman Hon Wah College Alumni Association Ms Emily LAU	Discussion on whether restriction should be imposed on nomination of CE candidacy when universal suffrage was implemented	
004923 - 005402	Dr Margaret NG	Expression of views that the purpose of the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010 was to enable 3.3 million registered electors to express their views on political reform, political reform could move forward if the Administration undertook to abolish the FC system when universal suffrage was implemented, and the FC system with a narrow electorate base was defective and unfair	
005403 - 005909	Chairman Mr WONG Ting-kwong Miss PANG Che-kwan, Gigi Mr NG Chi-pui	Clarification of the position of FC Members in respect of the Minimum Wage legislation Discussion on the impact of the use of abusive language in LegCo on children and the support of such an approach by some young people	
005910 - 010408	Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong	Expression of views that Members should avoid using abusive language in LegCo, and universal suffrage had to be pursued vigorously in order to protect the rights of future generations	
010409 - 010426	Good Contribution Association	Expression of views on freedom of expression	
010427 - 010937	Mr Paul TSE	Expression of views that Hong Kong should treasure the many values which made it a success, universal suffrage should not be the prime concern and should not be pursued at the expense of an orderly and harmonious society, there were inherent limitations of the FC system under which FC Members would tend to protect interests of their respective sectors (e.g. the Legal FC) when relevant issues were discussed, the FC system had its merits and should be improved instead of abolished lightly, and there were risks of resolving livelihood problems by populism	
010938 - 011135	Dr Margaret NG Chairman Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong	Objection raised by Dr Margaret NG that the Chairman did not allow her to respond to Mr Paul TSE's personal attack on her Ruling of the Chairman that the comments made by Mr Paul TSE regarding the Legal FC did not amount to personal attack on Dr Margaret Ng, who represented the Legal FC	
011136 - 011833	Chairman Administration	Administration's responses to views expressed by deputations and members	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
Session Two (10:00 am - 11:00 am)			
012007 - 012144	Chairman	Opening remarks	
012145 - 012152	On Tin Estate Community Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(08)]	
012153 - 012427	The Hong Kong Printers Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(09)]	
012428 - 012734	Hong Kong Youth & Tertiary Students Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(10)]	
012735 - 013051	Institute of Print-media Professionals	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(11)]	
013052 - 013058	HK Politics 2.0	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(21)]	
013059 - 013324	Motor Transport Workers General Union	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(12)]	
013325 - 013631	Hong Kong Construction Industry Employees General Union	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(13)]	
013632 - 013921	Hong Kong Confederation of Trade Unions	Presentation of views	
013922 - 014233	將軍澳區社區服務及規劃發展委員會	Presentation of views	
014234 - 014515	The Hong Kong Polytechnic University Students' Union	Presentation of views	
014516 - 014757	Lingnan University Students' Union	Presentation of views	
014758 - 015059	Hong Kong Federation of Students	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(14)]	
015100 - 015333	The Student Union of the Hong Kong Baptist University	Presentation of views	
015334 - 015345	Chairman	Speaking order of members	
015346 - 015910	Chairman Ms Miriam LAU Institute of Print-media Professionals	Discussion on whether geographical constituency ("GC") Members could represent the views and interests of different sectors of society, such as the business sector, and merits of the FC system	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
015911 - 020304	Mr WONG Ting-kwong	Expression of views that some young people had no concept of nationhood, they did not consider the proposed package in a comprehensive manner, the notion that the FC system would lead to the collusion between the Government and conglomerates was unfounded, there were merits in the FC system but it needed to be improved, and a divisive society would not be conducive to the development of Hong Kong	
020305 - 020413	Chairman Mr WONG Ting-kwong Institute of Print-media Professionals The Hong Kong Printers Association	Discussion on the merits of the FC system and how it could be improved	
020414 - 020853	Dr Margaret NG	Expression of views that the unfair FC system was of a transitional nature, one of her tasks of being a representative of the Legal FC was to pursue the abolition of FC, LegCo Members should work for the well-being of the community and not certain sectors, opportunities were provided to professionals and other individuals to take part in GC elections, and GC Members also had the duty to protect the interests of the business sector	
020854 - 021000	Hong Kong Federation of Students	Expression of views that young people was committed to work for the well-being of the country and Hong Kong, and the FC system could not help resolve livelihood problems	
021001 - 021511	Mr Paul TSE	Expression of views that Members returned by FC elections had the duty to represent the views and protect the interests of the respective FCs (e.g. Legal FC), the pace of political reform in a place would depend on the operation of the government, its historical, social and political development, one might need to make a strategic move to step backward in order to move forward in political reform, and the importance of heading towards the goal of democracy	
021512 - 022007	Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong	Expression of views that there were deficiencies and unfairness in the FC system and the split voting system, the implementation of universal suffrage would not necessarily discourage companies from investing in Hong Kong, democracy should be supported by an effective legal system, former Members who returned by GC elections had also represented the interests of the business sector, and the need for FC Members who represented the business sector to solicit support from the grassroots in the coming 10 years in order to return in the 2020 LegCo election when universal suffrage was implemented	
022008 - 022027	The Hong Kong Polytechnic University Students' Union	Expression of views on equal pay for work of equal value	
022028 - 022738	Chairman Administration	Administration's responses to views expressed by deputations and members	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
022739 - 023347		Break	
Session Three (11:05 am - 11:55 am)			
023348 - 023538	Chairman	Opening remarks	
023539 - 023831	The Hong Kong Overseas Chinese General Association	Presentation of views	
023832 - 024124	Hong Kong Chamber of Films	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(15)]	
024125 - 024411	Ms CHAN Yin-shan	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(16)]	
024412 - 024642	Mr CHAN Sin-ming	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(17)]	
024643 - 025013	Youth Network	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(22)]	
025014 - 025329	UPOST	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(23)]	
025330 - 025404	Ngau Tau Kok Teen Network	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(18)]	
025405 - 025635	The Hong Kong Institute of Planners	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1651/09-10(19)]	
025636 - 025932	香港菁英會	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(24)]	
025933 - 030250	Mr Clement WU	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1701/09-10(25)]	
030251 - 030307	Chairman	Speaking order of members	
030308 - 030519	Ms Miriam LAU The Hong Kong Institute of Planners	Clarification from The Hong Kong Institute of Planners that it considered the FC system unfair, and the electorate base of FCs should be broadened by replacing corporate votes with individual votes pending the abolition of the FC system	
030520 - 030611	Chairman The Hong Kong Institute of Planners	Clarification from The Hong Kong Institute of Planners about the opinion survey conducted on the proposed package on its 600 members and the their responses	

Time Marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
030612 - 031122	Chairman Mr Alan LEONG 香港菁英會 Mr Clement WU Ms CHAN Yin-shan Mr CHAN Sin-ming The Hong Kong Overseas Chinese General Association	Discussion on whether the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010 was necessary, whether the membership of the Election Committee proposed to be increased from 800 to 1200 (but below 1 600 as proposed in the 2005 proposed package) was a retrogression, whether abolishing the FC system was too hasty and drastic, and the need to respect the views of both the poor and the rich	
031123 - 031629	Mr Paul TSE	Expression of views that the LegCo By-election held on 16 May 2010 was unnecessary, it was a waste of money and a complete failure	
031630 - 031704	Chairman	Advice of the Chairman that he had allowed the meeting to continue for 15 minutes beyond the appointed ending time of the meeting Agreement of members to extend the meeting further to allow the Administration to give its responses	
031705 - 032211	Administration	Administration's responses to views expressed by deputations and members	
032212 - 032243	Chairman	Closing remarks	