

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(1) 3000/09-10  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/3/08/1

**Panel on Environmental Affairs**

**Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality**

**Minutes of meeting**  
**held on Tuesday, 27 July 2010, at 10:45 am**  
**in Conference Room B of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP
- Members absent** : Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan  
Hon Tanya CHAN
- Public officers attending** : **For item II**
- Dr Kitty POON  
Under Secretary for the Environment
- Mr Carlson K S CHAN  
Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (3)  
Environmental Protection Department
- Mr PANG Sik-wing  
Principal Environmental Protection Officer  
(Air Policy)  
Environmental Protection Department
- Mr Edmond HO  
Principal Environmental Protection Officer  
(Mobile Source)  
Environmental Protection Department

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Becky YU  
Chief Council Secretary (1)1

**Staff in attendance** : Mrs Mary TANG  
Senior Council Secretary (1)2

---

**I. Confirmation of minutes and matters arising**

- (LC Paper No. CB(1) 2619/09-10 — Minutes of the meeting held on 11 May 2010
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 2000/09-10(01) — List of follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 11 May 2010
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 2620/09-10(01) — Administration's response to items 1 to 3 of CB(1) 2000/09-10(01))

The minutes of the meeting held on 11 May 2010 were confirmed.

**II. Findings of public consultation on Review of Air Quality Objectives**

- (LC Paper No. CB(1) 2620/09-10(02) — Administration's paper on Review of Air Quality Objectives - Proposed air quality improvement measures
- LC Paper No. CB(1) 2620/09-10(03) — Paper on review of Air Quality Objectives prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)

Relevant paper

- (LC Paper No. CB(1) 2324/09-10(06) — Administration's paper on Findings of public consultation on Review of Air Quality Objectives)

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached in **Annex**).

Administration's response to follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 4 January 2010

3. The Administration was requested to -

- (a) provide details of the five electric motor cycles currently registered in Hong Kong;

- (b) provide the consultancy brief for the Air Pollution Index (API) Review Study and information on the membership of the study team and the institutions involved, the expected timeframe for completion of the review as well as the resources allocated for the review. To also provide an undertaking that the full unedited report of the study team would be provided to the Subcommittee and uploaded onto the Government website for public reference;

Review of Air Quality Objectives - Proposed air quality improvement measures

4. The Administration was requested to -
- (a) advise the increase in road length and number of vehicles, including private, public and franchised vehicles, following the rapid expansion of the rail network over the past 10 years;
  - (b) consider making the use of photovoltaic panels a mandatory requirement for new buildings to promote the use of renewable energy;
  - (c) map out a future street lighting system based on the use of solar energy, wind energy or light emitting diode;
  - (d) advise the best practicable means available to enable power companies to increase the use of natural gas for electricity generation. To also advise if the supply of natural gas from the Mainland for local electricity generation was fully utilized and if not, the rationale behind the under-utilization;
  - (e) provide a paper on the trial on retrofitting of franchised buses with selective catalytic reduction devices, inter alia, the coverage of the trial, membership of the task force, expected time for completion of the trial, and whether an independent third party would be engaged to oversee the trial; and
  - (f) consider providing direct subsidy to ferry companies if it was the policy intent to mandate the use of ultra low sulphur diesel by local vessels.
5. The Subcommittee agreed that it should continue its work in the next legislative session. A report on the work of the Subcommittee during the 2009-2010 legislative session would be submitted for consideration by the Panel on Environment Affairs in due course.

**III. Any other business**

6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

## Panel on Environmental Affairs

## Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality

**Proceedings of the meeting  
on Tuesday, 27 July 2010, at 10:45 am  
in Conference Room B of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I - Confirmation of minutes and matters arising</i>			
000410 - 000416	Chairman	The minutes of the meeting held on 11 May 2010 (LC Paper No. CB(1) 2619/09-10) were confirmed.	
000417 - 000830	Administration	Discussion on the Administration's response to follow-up actions arising from the discussion at the meeting on 4 January 2010 (LC Paper No. CB(1) 2620/09-10(01)).	
000831 - 002623	Ms Miriam LAU Chairman Administration	<p>Chairman and Ms Miriam LAU's enquiries and requests -</p> <p>(a) reason why there were only five electric motor cycles being registered since 2002;</p> <p>(b) timing for completion of the review of the Air Pollution Index (API) System; and</p> <p>(c) consultancy brief and relevant information on the API Review.</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the development of electric cycles was slowly emerging, but it was only in recent years that these could be manufactured on a commercial scale;</p> <p>(b) electric motor cycles had to meet the technical and safety requirements if they were used on local expressways;</p> <p>(c) the review of API system had commenced since 2008;</p> <p>(d) the Review would draw reference to, inter alia, the Canadian system;</p> <p>(e) the study team of the API Review was led by the Chinese University of Hong Kong and comprised leading local medical and air science experts; and</p>	<p>The Administration to -</p> <p>(a) provide details of the five electric motor cycles currently registered in Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(b) provide the consultancy brief for API Review Study and information on the membership of the study team and the institutions involved, the expected timeframe for completion of the review as well as the resources allocated for the review.</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(f) the API Review was expected to be completed by end of 2010 and a health-based API System would be recommended for application.	
002624 - 003957	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	<p>Ms Cyd HO's concerns and requests -</p> <p>(a) information on the scope of API Review and compatibility with the World Health Organization's Air Quality Guidelines (WHO AQG);</p> <p>(b) the full unedited report of the study team should be released so that members would know all the findings and recommendations of the study team;</p> <p>(c) the new API system should be developed to suit the unique situation of Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(d) the authority to decide on the acceptability of the new API system.</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the new API system would make reference to the ultimate targets of WHO AQG; and</p> <p>(b) the new system aimed to provide an accurate and timely communication to the public on the health risks due to ambient air pollution. The public would be consulted on the system.</p>	The Administration to provide an undertaking that the full unedited report of the study team would be provided to the Subcommittee and uploaded onto the Government website for public reference.
003958 - 004609	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's enquiries -</p> <p>(a) whether the new API system would comply with WHO standards;</p> <p>(b) whether a comparison between the new API system and that in other jurisdictions would be made; and</p> <p>(c) whether the new system would provide health warning to the public.</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the new API system would take into account WHO AQG as well as local air quality standards and health data; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) the air quality would be banded and health warning to be worked out at a later stage would be provided for those bands with higher health risk.	
<i>Agenda Item II - Findings of public consultation on Review of Air Quality Objectives</i>			
004610 - 000631	Chairman Administration Ms Miriam LAU	<p>Administration's explanation on its paper on "Review of Air Quality Objectives and proposed air quality improvement measures" (LC Paper No. CB(1) 2620/09-10(02))</p> <p>Ms Miriam LAU's views -</p> <p>(a) Hong Kong appeared to lag behind the Mainland in the development of renewable energy (RE);</p> <p>(b) the efforts made by the Jiang Su Province in developing RE was impressive, particularly in respect of the use of solar energy in street lighting and residential developments;</p> <p>(c) Hong Kong should endeavour to promote the development and use of solar energy, including the use of solar-powered street lamps. Consideration should also be given to requiring new buildings to install photovoltaic systems at rooftops; and</p> <p>(d) targets for improvements in roadside air quality should be set for the expansion of rail network.</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) the wider use of solar energy by Mainland provinces was made possible because of the availability of locally manufactured photovoltaic panels as well as the relatively lower density of development;</p> <p>(b) there were land constraints in the development of solar energy in Hong Kong. Nevertheless, funding for RE projects could be applied through the Environment and Conservation Fund;</p> <p>(c) the Development Bureau, the Environment Bureau and the Council on Sustainable Development were working on the</p>	<p>The Administration to -</p> <p>(a) map out a future street lighting system based on the use of solar energy, wind energy or light emitting diode (LED); and</p> <p>(b) consider making the use of photovoltaic panels a mandatory requirement for new buildings to promote the use of renewable energy.</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>guidelines for development of sustainable buildings; and</p> <p>(d) it was the Government's policy to use rail as the backbone of public transport. Expansion of the rail network should be able to reduce road traffic by 10%.</p>	
010632 - 012747	Ms Cyd HO Ms Miriam LAU Chairman Administration	<p>Ms Cyd HO's views/enquiries -</p> <p>(a) the increase in road length and number of vehicles, including private, public and franchised vehicles, following the rapid expansion of the rail network over the past 10 years;</p> <p>(b) more "park and ride" facilities should be provided to encourage car owners to use the rail network;</p> <p>(c) more efforts should be made to promote the use of solar energy, particularly in respect of street lighting; and</p> <p>(d) the best practicable means to enable power companies to increase the use of natural gas for electricity generation, the reasons for the under-utilization of natural gas in local electricity generation; and the timing for a steady supply of natural gas.</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) consideration would be given to using solar-powered street lighting subject to its reliability and cost-effectiveness;</p> <p>(b) a trial on LED street lamps was underway;</p> <p>(c) some of the gas-fired generation units of local power companies had been under-utilized in the past because of insufficient supply of natural gas;</p> <p>(d) with the forecast increase in supply of natural gas from various sources, particularly the connection of the West-East Natural Gas Pipeline to local power companies to be completed in 2013, there would be a steady supply of natural gas for power generation starting 2014. The possibility of increasing the use of natural</p>	<p>The Administration to -</p> <p>(a) advise the increase in road length and number of vehicles, including private, public and franchised vehicles, following the rapid expansion of the rail network over the past 10 years; and</p> <p>(b) advise the best practicable means available to enable power companies to increase the use of natural gas for electricity generation. To also advise if the supply of natural gas from the Mainland for local electricity generation was fully utilized and if not, the rationale behind the under-utilization.</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>gas for electricity generation based on the best practicable means available to power companies could be explored;</p> <p>(e) the Technical Memorandum for Allocation of Emission Allowances in Respect of Specified Licences (TM) issued under section 26G of the Air Pollution Control Ordinance (Cap.311) was under review with a view to tightening the emission caps for power companies; and</p> <p>(f) the tightened emission caps would take effect in 2015 if the new TM was introduced in 2010 as an advance notice of no less than four years had to be given to the power companies to allow sufficient lead time for adjustment of operation.</p>	
012748 - 013252	Ms Miriam LAU Administration	<p>Ms Miriam LAU's views/concerns -</p> <p>(a) the low take-up rate for the one-off grant scheme for the replacement of aged diesel commercial vehicles was attributable to the financial crisis and the operational problems of Euro IV vehicles;</p> <p>(b) the proposal to increase the licence fees for aged commercial vehicles would have adverse impact on the transport trades;</p> <p>(c) consideration should be given to introducing a scheme with both incentives and disincentives to encourage early replacement of aged diesel commercial vehicles, particularly when a new replacement model manufactured in the Mainland would soon become available in the market; and</p> <p>(d) consideration could also be given to buying out polluting vehicles so that these would be removed from the roads permanently.</p> <p>Administration's response that it would closely monitor the availability of new replacement models.</p>	
013253 - 014529	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman Ms Miriam LAU	<p>Ms Cyd HO's enquiries -</p> <p>(a) the progress of retrofitting franchised buses with selective catalytic reduction (SCR)</p>	The Administration to provide a paper on the trial on retrofitting of franchised buses with

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>devices to reduce emissions; and</p> <p>(b) whether licence fees could be levied in proportion to the level of emissions such that higher licence fees would be charged for more polluting vehicles.</p> <p>Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) a trial would be conducted on the feasibility of retrofitting Euro II and Euro III buses with SCR devices to reduce nitrogen oxide emissions from the franchised bus fleet;</p> <p>(b) a task force comprising representatives from the major franchised bus companies, overseas and local experts as well as relevant Government departments had been set up to examine the relevant technical issues and to oversee the trial, which was expected to commence by late 2010 or early 2011; and</p> <p>(c) SCR devices would be applied to franchised buses on a large scale if the trial had confirmed their feasibility.</p> <p>Chairman's request for more details of the trial, inter alia, the coverage of the trial, membership of the task force, expected time for completion of the trial, and whether an independent third party would be engaged to oversee the trial.</p>	<p>SCR devices, inter alia, the coverage of the trial, membership of the task force, expected time for completion of the trial, and whether an independent third party would be engaged to oversee the trial.</p>
014530 - 015013	Ms Miriam LAU Chairman Administration	<p>Ms Miriam LAU's enquiries/views -</p> <p>(a) which party, the Administration or franchised bus companies, would be responsible for the trial on retrofitting of franchised buses with SCR devices; and</p> <p>(b) reference could be made to past experience in retrofitting pre-Euro and Euro I vehicles with catalytic devices.</p> <p>Administration's explanation -</p> <p>(a) SCR devices were retrofitted on a large scale in some European countries such as Belgium;</p> <p>(b) the trial was initiated and funded by the Environmental Protection Department; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(c) tenders would be invited to conduct the trial while local and overseas experts would be engaged to oversee the trial.	
015014 - 015220	Chairman Ms Cyd HO Mr KAM Nai-wai Ms Miriam LAU	Discussion on the need for continuation of the work of the Subcommittee on Improving Air Quality in the next legislative session.  Ms Cyd HO and Mr KAM Nai-wai's support for the continuation of the work of the Subcommittee given the wide range of measures required to improve air quality.  Ms Miriam LAU did not object to the continuation of the work of the Subcommittee.	
015021 - 015245	Ms Cyd HO Chairman	Ms Cyd HO's concerns about the pollution associated with the emission from local vessels using marine light diesel with high sulphur content.	
015246 - 015951	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration Ms Miriam LAU Chairman	Mr KAM Nai-wai's request for expediting the trial on retrofitting franchised buses with SCR devices to bring early improvement to the emission performance of franchised buses.  Administration's response -  (a) the duration of the trial would be determined by the task force set up to oversee the trial; and  (b) the tendering process would also take time.  Chairman's agreement that the Panel on Environmental Affairs would monitor the progress of the trial.  Ms Miriam LAU's view that consideration should be given to providing direct subsidy to ferry companies if it was the policy intent to mandate the use of ultra low sulphur diesel by local vessels.	The Administration to consider providing direct subsidy to ferry companies if it was the policy intent to mandate the use of ultra low sulphur diesel by local vessels.
015952 - 020020	Chairman	Closing remarks	