

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1072/09-10
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on Thursday, 22 October 2009, at 8:30 am in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

- Members present** :
- Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
 - Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
 - Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
 - Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
 - Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
 - Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
 - Hon LEE Wing-tat
 - Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
 - Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
 - Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
 - Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
 - Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
 - Hon WONG Sing-chi
 - Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
 - Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
- Members attending** :
- Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
 - Hon James TO Kun-sun
 - Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
 - Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
 - Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
 - Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP
 - Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Members absent : Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

Public Officers attending : **Agenda item IV**

Ms Eva CHENG
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Philip YUNG
Deputy Secretary for Transport & Housing

Mr CHAN Wai-wai
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport & Housing

Mr WAI Chi-sing
Director of Highways

Mr LAM Sai-hung
Chief Engineer / Railway Development
Highways Department

Attendance by invitation : **Agenda item IV**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Malcolm GIBSON
Head of Project Engineering

Miss Maggie SO
Senior Manager - Projects and Property
Communications

Mr Frank YUEN
Design Manager

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr Ken WOO
Council Secretary (1)2

Miss Winnie CHENG
Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

I Election of Chairman

Ms Miriam LAU was elected Chairman of the Subcommittee for the 2009-2010 session.

II Schedule of meetings for the 2009-2010 session

2. Members noted the proposed meeting schedule tabled at the meeting and agreed that the regular meetings of the Subcommittee for the 2009-2010 session would be held once every two months. Special meetings would be held to discuss any urgent matters where necessary.

(Post-meeting note : a meeting schedule was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)135/09-10 on 23 October 2009.)

III Items for discussion at the next meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)97/09-10(01) — List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(1)97/09-10(02) — List of follow-up actions)

Next regular meeting on 4 December 2009

3. Members agreed to discuss the recent railway incidents at the next regular meeting scheduled for Friday, 4 December 2009, at 8:30 am.

4. At the suggestion of Mr KAM Nai-wai, members agreed that the Administration would be requested to confirm whether it was ready to update members on the progress of the South Island Line (East) project at the next regular meeting on 4 December 2009.

Special meeting on 6 November 2009

5. The Subcommittee agreed to schedule a special meeting for Friday, 6 November 2009, at 5:00 pm (or immediately after the Finance Committee meeting scheduled for the same day) for discussion on the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL). The Subcommittee further agreed to invite The Professional Commons to attend the meeting to present their proposed new option as well as representatives of professional institutions of the engineering sector to attend the meeting to give views.

Clerk

IV The Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link

- (Legislative Council Brief — Administration's paper on the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link: Authorization of Scheme (Legislative Council Brief)
- Legislative Council Brief — Administration's paper on the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link: Funding Arrangement and Special Rehousing Package (Legislative Council Brief)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)166/09-10(01) — Powerpoint presentation material provided by the Administration on the "Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link"
- LC Paper No. CB(1)128/09-10(01) — Submission from Hon Andrew CHENG Kar foo
- LC Paper No. CB(1)128/09-10(02) — Submission from Federation of Hong Kong Industries
- LC Paper No. CB(1)128/09-10(03) — Submission from Business and Professionals Federation of Hong Kong
- LC Paper No. CB(1)128/09-10(04) — Submission from The Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong
- LC Paper No. CB(1)128/09-10(05) — Submission from Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association)

6. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin

7. The Administration was requested to provide the following information -

- (a) the rate of project cost increase, and a comparison of it with those of other projects, for example, the West Island Line, the reconstruction and improvement of Tuen Mun Road, the Kai Tak Cruise Terminal Development, and the Central-Wan Chai Bypass project;

- (b) response to list of questions and concerns raised in the letter from Mr Andrew CHENG to the Subcommittee (LC Paper No. CB(1)128/09-10(01));
- (c) the Administration's views and comments on the new option put forward by The Professional Commons;
- (d) information on the Administration's plan regarding the design and greening of public space at the proposed West Kowloon Terminus; and
- (e) written response to concerns about the impact to be brought about by the construction works of the project on the structural safety of buildings in areas along the alignment of the Hong Kong section such as the Tai Kok Tsui district, and information on the buildings to be affected by the strata resumption and on making claims regarding any affected redevelopment potential.

Admin

8. To facilitate continued discussion on the project, the Administration was requested to provide the requisite information as far as possible before the next meeting to be held on Friday, 6 November 2009, at 5:00 pm (or immediately after the Finance Committee meeting scheduled for the same day).

V Any other business

9. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:40 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
9 February 2010

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Thursday, 22 October 2009, at 8:30 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Election of Chairman</i>			
000000 – 000209	Ms Miriam LAU Mr LAU Kong-wah Mr Jeffrey LAM	Election of Chairman for the 2009-2010 session	
<i>Agenda Item II – Schedule of meetings for the 2009-2010 session</i>			
000210 – 000256	Chairman Mr Ronny TONG	Schedule of meetings	
<i>Agenda Item III – Items for discussion at the next meeting</i>			
000257 – 002103	Chairman Members	Discussion on agenda items for the next regular meeting. Scheduling of a special meeting for Friday, 6 November 2009.	
<i>Agenda Item IV – The Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link</i>			
002104 – 005612	Chairman Administration	Powerpoint presentation on the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) by the Administration (LC Paper No. CB(1)166/09-10 (01)). The Chairman's request for the Administration to provide response to the letter from Mr Andrew CHENG, which was tabled at the meeting (LC Paper No. CB(1)128/09-10(01)).	Administration to respond to Mr Andrew CHENG's letter. (para. 7 of minutes)
005613 – 005903	Mrs Regina IP Administration	Mrs Regina IP's enquires on the co-location of boundary control facilities (BCF) and the future top-side development at the proposed West Kowloon Terminus (WKT). The Administration's response that the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) would not be given the right to develop the top-side premises at the WKT, and that a task force had been set up to study the arrangements on co-location of BCF and to initiate discussion with the relevant Mainland authorities when ready.	
005904 – 010613	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	Mr WONG Kwok-hing's request for information on project cost increase and enquiries on the proposed community farm, greening plan for the public space at the WKT, and measures to facilitate XRL commuters travelling between the proposed WKT and the China Hong Kong City. The Administration's response and undertaking to provide the requisite response and supplementary	Administration to provide written response and supplementary information. (para. 7 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		information.	
010614 – 011412	Mr Ronny TONG Administration	<p>Mr Ronny TONG's expression of concerns on the economic benefits, the merits of the proposed WKT and the pedestrian connectivity between the proposed WKT with the Kowloon Station of Airport Express Line nearby.</p> <p>The Administration's response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) planning was being made to enhance the connectivity of the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) as a whole, including the availability of footbridges, subways and travelators; (b) the recurrent expenditure of the railway works would be funded by the fare and non-fare revenue from the railway operation. This would be taken into account in calculating the service concession payment from the MTRCL. According to the preliminary estimate based on the latest patronage forecast, the concession payment would be about \$28.1 billion over 50 years of operation; and (c) the rationale for locating the terminus in West Kowloon was explained. 	
011413 – 012042	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming Administration	<p>Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming's queries on the co-location of BCF and the response of Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT) villagers to the compensation proposals.</p> <p>The Administration's response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) a task force, led by the Transport and Housing Bureau, with the participation of the Department of Justice, Security Bureau, the Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau and Highways Department, had been set up to study the arrangements on the co-location of BCF; (b) the patronage forecast for 2016 for all means of cross-boundary transport was expected to rise, except the Hung Hom through train; and (c) meetings had been held with CYT villagers since the railway scheme was gazetted in November 2009. Since the XRL scheme was authorized, two briefing sessions had been held and a cross-departmental information centre had been set up to provide consultation services to CYT residents. The Administration would continue to visit affected households to provide necessary assistance. 	
012043 – 012623	Mr Jeffrey LAM Administration	Mr Jeffrey LAM's expression of concerns about the co-location of BCF, the location of the WKT and its	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>supporting facilities, and the economic benefits of proposed express rail link.</p> <p>The Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) it would take around 15 minutes to reach most commercial districts and around 30 minutes to reach most residential districts from the proposed WKT;</p> <p>(b) the economic benefits of \$87 billion were derived from the 42 million hours of time savings over 50 years of operation; and</p> <p>(c) the induced and catalytic benefits as brought about by a point-to-point direct transport would be substantial.</p>	
012624 – 013319	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat's requests for -</p> <p>(a) written response from the Administration on the XRL proposal put forward by The Professional Commons, and information on the impact of the project on buildings along the alignment of the Hong Kong section in the urban area; and</p> <p>(b) measures to enhance the linkage amongst the WKT, the Kowloon Station and the Austin Station.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation that the XRL (Hong Kong section) was a project of strategic significance to Hong Kong. The Railways Ordinance allowed any person, who had a compensatable interest in the land/strata to be resumed or temporarily occupied, to claim for damage arising from such resumption or temporary occupation.</p>	<p>Administration to provide written response to The Professional Commons's proposal, and other redevelopment issues. (para. 7 of minutes)</p>
013320 – 013842	Mr Albert CHAN Administration	<p>Mr Albert CHAN's enquiry and the Administration's explanation of the rationale for the current proposal to offer ex-gratia rehousing package for the CYT villagers and other parties affected by land resumption and clearance of various sites required under the project.</p>	
013843 – 014438	Mr CHAN Kam-lam Administration	<p>Mr CHAN Kam-lam's support for co-location of BCF in the WKT and his enquiries on the development of the terminus cover.</p> <p>The Administration's response that the co-location of BCF in the WKT was being explored and planning was being made for the design of the open space at the WKT.</p>	
014439 – 015016	Mr LAU Kong-wah Administration	<p>Mr LAU Kong-wah's concerns about the development of the transport network within the West Kowloon District, and the realization of the projected economic benefits of the project if co-location of BCF could not be arranged.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		The Administration's response that the various roads and underpasses in place in addition to the new road projects would enhance the connectivity of the WKT.	
015017 – 015607	Ir Dr Raymond HO Administration	Ir Dr Raymond HO's request for provision of more detailed information on the economic benefits, in particular, the intangible benefits that would be achieved by the implementation of the project.	
015608 – 020149	Ms Emily LAU Administration	<p>Ms Emily LAU's concerns on the impact of the XRL on the development of the WKCD, and the long walking time between the WKT and the Kowloon Station.</p> <p>The Administration's response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) further improvements to the pedestrian linkage between the WKT and the Kowloon Station would be made; and (b) the Administration would engage in close dialogue with the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority to work out interfacing arrangement and ensure smooth implementation of the two projects. 	
020150 – 020656	Mr WONG Sing-chi Administration	Mr WONG Sing-chi's request for detailed illustration on the economic benefits of the XRL project. The Administration's explanation that based on its patronage forecast, it had calculated the direct economic benefits and the Economic Internal Rate of Return which served as indicators for assessing the economic benefits that the XRL project would bring to Hong Kong.	
020657 – 021240	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration Chairman	<p>Mr KAM Nai-wai's queries about -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the patronage projection of 89,000 as in the low case scenario; (b) the considerations of the Administration's decision not to locate the XRL terminus at Kam Sheung Road, and (c) what assistance would be provided to owners whose buildings were situated along the strata to be resumed by the XRL project, and request for a list of the buildings to be affected. <p>The Administration's response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the low case scenario was derived from assuming a lower Gross Domestic Product growth for Guangdong of 7.6% to 9.8% between 2009 to 2015; (b) the Administration's considerations of deciding to locate the terminus at West Kowloon; and 	Administration to provide information on the buildings to be affected by the strata resumption. (para. 7 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(c) strata resumption would not affect the structural safety of the buildings concerned. Any person who had a compensatable interest in the land affected by underground strata resumption may claim compensation under the Railways Ordinance.	

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
9 February 2010