

# 立法會

## *Legislative Council*

LC Paper No. CB(1)2071/09-10  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

### **Panel on Transport**

#### **Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

#### **Minutes of meeting on Friday, 16 April 2010, at 8:30 am in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP  
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
Hon WONG Sing-chi  
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
- Members attending** : Hon Starry LEE Wai-king  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
- Member absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

**Public Officers  
attending**

**: Agenda item IV**

Mr YAU Shing-mu  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr C W CHOW  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport & Housing

Mr WAN Man-lung  
Principal Government Engineer / Railway Development  
Highways Department

**Agenda item V**

Ms Eva CHENG  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Maisie CHENG  
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr WAI Chi-sing  
Director of Highways

**Attendance by  
invitation**

**: Agenda item IV**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Henry LAM  
General Manager – SCL/KTE

Miss Maggie SO  
Senior Manager – Projects and Property Communications

**Agenda item V**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr T C CHEW  
Project Director

Mr Paul LO  
General Manager (Express Rail Link)

Miss Maggie SO  
Senior Manager – Projects and Property Communications

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Joanne MAK  
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

**Staff in attendance** : Mr Ken WOO  
Council Secretary (1)2

Miss Angela LAM  
Legislative Assistant (1)5

---

Action

- I Confirmation of minutes of meeting**  
(LC Paper No. CB(1)1386/09-10 — Minutes of the meeting held on 9 February 2010)

The minutes of the meeting held on 9 February 2010 were confirmed.

- II Information papers issued since last meeting**
- (LC Paper No. CB(1)1411/09-10(01) — Referral from Legislative Council Members' meeting-cum-luncheon with Tuen Mun District Council members on 28 January 2010 on improvements to Light Rail Services
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1388/09-10(01) — Submission from a Mr SZE complaining about the overcrowded situation of the concourse of the MTR Tai Koo Station
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1388/09-10(02) — Submission from a Mr LEE on the design of the MTR Diamond Hill Station and the extension of the East Rail Line under the Shatin to Central Link project
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1388/09-10(03) — Submission from a Mr WOK requesting for early implementation of the South Island Line (West) project

- LC Paper No. CB(1)1388/09-10(04) — A further submission dated 8 March 2010 from 翔龍灣業主委員會 on the Shatin to Central Link project
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1475/09-10(01) — Letter of thanks from Caritas MOK CHEUNG Sui Kun Community Centre and West Island Line Residents Concern Group
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1572/09-10(01) — Submission from Matauwai Residents Association on the Shatin to Central Link project
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1572/09-10(02) — Submission from South Tokwawan Concern Group on the Shatin to Central Link project
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1572/09-10(03) — Submission from a member of the public on the South Island Line (East) project

2. Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last regular meeting.

**III Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 4 June 2010**

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)1573/09-10(01) — List of outstanding items for discussion
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1573/09-10(02) — List of follow-up actions)

3. Members agreed to discuss "Review of the Mass Transit Railway By-laws and North-west Railway By-laws" and "Railway Station Design to Showcase Local History and Culture" at the next regular meeting scheduled for Friday, 4 June 2010, at 8:30 am.

Clerk 4. At the request of members, the Chairman requested the Clerk to check with the Administration whether it would be ready to report on the "Shatin to Central Link project" and "Retrofitting of platform screen doors" at the next regular meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairman, an item on "Funding application – Protection works for Shatin to Central Link in Wan Chai Development Phase II" was subsequently added to the agenda for the meeting on 4 June 2010.)*

**IV Kwun Tong Line Extension**

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)1573/09-10(03) — Administration's paper on progress report on the Kwun Tong Line Extension
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1557/09-10 — Background brief on Kwun Tong Line Extension prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1642/09-10(01) — Powerpoint presentation materials provided by the MTR Corporation Limited on Kwun Tong Line Extension)

5. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).
6. Ms Starry LEE declared that she owned properties in Whampoa and in Ho Man Tin. Dr Priscilla LEUNG also declared that she owned a property in Whampoa and she was presently Kowloon City District Council member.
7. With the aid of Powerpoint, the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) briefed members on the latest progress of the Kwun Tong Line Extension (KTE) project.
8. Members in general were concerned about the inconvenience posed by the remote location of the Ho Man Tin Station (HOM), which would be provided at the site of ex-Valley Road Estate, and the inadequate provision of station entrances for HOM and the Whampoa Station (WHA). Some members requested MTRCL to provide an additional station entrance at Fat Kwong Street to meet the needs of residents of Ho Man Tin Estate and areas nearby, and to further extend the proposed footbridge at Chung Yee Street to the carpark in Oi Man Estate. Some members also suggested enhancing pedestrian connections between WHA and its neighbouring housing estates and Hung Hom old district.
9. MTRCL explained that due to topographical constraints such as the risk posed by the existing water service reservoir at Fat Kwong Street, provision of a station entrance at Fat Kwong Street for HOM was not recommended. As regards the suggestion of extending the proposed footbridge at Chung Yee Street to the carpark in Oi Man Estate, MTRCL advised that residents there had expressed concerns about security and privacy issues. The Corporation was currently following up on this option but also noted the concerns of the residents.
10. Regarding the suggestion of constructing additional pedestrian subways or footbridges for connection with WHA, MTRCL advised that the proposed public pedestrian links might duplicate in function with the existing pedestrian road and subway near to Tak On Street. Dr Priscilla LEUNG expressed concern

Action

Admin about the implications of locating WHA at a private road in the Whampoa Garden on the management costs borne by residents concerned in the future. She urged the Administration and MTRCL to look at the matter.

Clerk 11. At the suggestion of Mr LAU Kong-wah, members agreed to conduct a site visit to the proposed HOM and WHA. The Clerk would follow up with MTRCL and issue a circular to inform members of the arrangements.

*(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairman, the visit was scheduled for 17 May 2010 (am).)*

12. After discussion, Mrs Regina IP moved the following motion which was seconded by Ms LI Fung-ying –

"本會(即交通事務委員會鐵路事宜小組委員會)促請政府及港鐵公司在何文田站及黃埔站增加出入口以方便當區市民。"

(Translation)

"That this Committee (i.e. the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways under the Panel on Transport) urges the Government and the MTRCL to increase the number of entrances at both Ho Man Tin Station and Whampoa Station for the convenience of local residents."

13. The Chairman put the motion to vote. After voting, the Chairman declared that six members voted for and no member voted against the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

Admin 14. The Administration was requested to provide the following information –

- (a) Explanation of the technical constraints on provision of additional station entrances as requested by residents for HOM and WHA (such as the one at Fat Kwong Street); and
- (b) a written response to the above motion.

**V Mechanism of regular report on the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link**  
(LC Paper No. CB(1)1573/09-10(04) — Administration's paper on government's monitoring and reporting on the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link

Action

- LC Paper No. CB(1)1581/09-10 — Background brief on the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1620/09-10(01) — Submission from 大角嘴高鐵關注大聯盟)

15. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).
16. The Administration briefed members on the Government's monitoring mechanism on the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) and the proposal of regular reporting to the Subcommittee on the XRL project.
17. In response to members' enquiries, the Administration advised that the Lands Department had been offering assistance to Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT) villagers applying for agricultural resite under existing policy. The Heung Yee Kuk and the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department also assisted interested CYT villagers in identifying suitable sites for relocation of farming activities. As regards measures to address concerns of affected residents in Tai Kok Tsui, the Administration advised that MTRCL had set up a dedicated team to conduct home visits and explain to residents the impacts of the construction works and the relevant building impact assessment report. The Administration had also invited the Hong Kong Institution of Engineers and employed independent surveying companies to offer independent professional advice to the affected residents.
18. Mr WONG Kwok-hing and Ms LI Fung-ying requested MTRCL and its contractors to accord priority to the employment of local construction workers in taking forward the project. The Administration undertook that it would endeavor to promote employment opportunities for the local workforce in implementing the project.

Admin

19. After discussion, the Administration was requested –
- (a) to provide a flow chart on the Government's monitoring mechanism on the construction of the Hong Kong section of the XRL project;
  - (b) to provide detailed information on the job opportunities created by the project for local workers and professionals as well as the types of jobs involved;
  - (c) to provide, in the first progress report, information on the conduct of home visits to the Tai Kok Tsui residents and the owners'

Action

corporations met to explain the impacts of construction and relevant building impact assessment report, and the Administration's response to residents' demand for streamlined compensation procedures in connection with property redevelopment;

- (d) to expand the scope of the future progress reports to cover (i) preparatory work such as land clearance (e.g. CYT), and interface issues such as impacts of construction works (e.g. impact on building structure in Tai Kwok Tsui) and mitigating measures; and (ii) employment opportunities created by the project; and
- (e) to report progress on the co-location of boundary control facilities for XRL, if any.

20. The Administration advised that the first report would cover the period between 16 January 2010, when the Finance Committee approved the project funding, and 30 June 2010 and it would be available in July. Members agreed to hold a special meeting in early July 2010 to discuss the report.

Clerk

*(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairman, the special meeting was scheduled for 6 July 2010 at 8:30 am.)*

**VI Any other business**

21. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:40 am.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
2 June 2010

## Panel on Transport

## Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting  
on Friday, 16 April 2010, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Confirmation of minutes of meeting</i>			
000220– 000259	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of the meeting held on 9 February 2010.	
<i>Agenda item II – Information papers issued since last meeting</i>			
000300– 000449	Chairman	Information papers issued since the last regular meeting.	
<i>Agenda item III – Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 4 June 2010</i>			
000450– 000736	Chairman Ms LI Fung-ying Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Members' enquiry about whether the Administration would be ready to discuss the "Shatin to Central Link project" and "Retrofitting of platform screen doors" in June 2010.	<b>Clerk to follow up with the Administration. (para. 4 of minutes)</b>
<i>Agenda item IV – Kwun Tong Line Extension</i>			
000737– 002549	Chairman Administration MTRCL	Powerpoint presentation on Kwun Tong Line Extension (KTE) by the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) (LC Paper No. CB(1)1642/09-10(01)).	
002550– 003252	Mr Jeffery LAM Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Jeffery LAM's concerns on the proposed pedestrian connections between the Ho Man Tin Station (HOM) and its neighbouring developments, impacts of the project on road-based transport services, and the structural integrity of the buildings in close proximity to the alignment.</p> <p>The Administration's response that different levels of intermodal coordination would be assessed before the commissioning of KTE to enhance the co-ordination of public transport service, maintain their overall efficiency and minimize wasteful competition.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) the pedestrian connections between HOM and its surroundings were proposed having regard to the constraints posed by the complex terrain in the vicinity and existing facilities; and</p> <p>(b) Ground Investigation works had been conducted along Wuhu Street. Pre-construction condition surveys and site monitoring would follow to ensure that the structural integrity of premises in close proximity to the alignment would not be affected.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
003253-003906	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming MTRCL	<p>Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming's enquiries on the completion date of KTE and the adequacy of station entrances for the Whampoa Station (WHA) and HOM.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response on the projected date of commissioning of KTE. In response to Mr CHEUNG's further enquiry, the Administration advised that the need to revitalize industrial buildings in Hung Hom had been given due consideration in the design of entrances for WHA.</p>	
003907-004555	Ms LI Fung-ying MTRCL	<p>Ms LI Fung-ying's request for a station entrance at Fat Kwong Street.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) the reason for locating HOM at the ex-Valley Road Estate and WHA at Tak On Street was that the former was limited by the KTE alignment while the latter involved no land resumption and hence would pose the least impact to the local community; and</p> <p>(b) the technical constraints for the provision of a station entrance at Fat Kwong Street.</p>	
004556-005244	Ms Starry LEE MTRCL Chairman	<p>Ms Starry LEE's declaration of interest. Her requests for provision of a station entrance at Fat Kwong Street, increasing the number of entrances for HOM, extending the proposed footbridge to the Oi Man Estate and enhancing accessibility of WHA.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) the requested public pedestrian subway to connect to WHA or to the pedestrian subway at the junction of Hung Hom Road and Tai Wan Road would be a duplication of the existing pedestrian facilities as the existing footpath along the Hung Hom Road already provided a comfortable walking environment for pedestrians heading to WHA; and</p> <p>(b) extending the proposed footbridge from the end of Chung Yee Street to the carpark of Oi Man Estate would be followed up and discussion with the Housing Department had commenced.</p>	
005245-005816	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing's requests for early gazettal of the Shatin to Central Link (SCL) scheme and a paper setting out the reasons for the non-provision of a pedestrian subway connecting Fat Kwong Street with HOM.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation as to why more time</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>was needed for the implementation of the SCL project. Consultation on the SCL scheme was expected to be completed in 2010 so that the scheme could be gazetted in early 2011.</p>	
005817-010449	Dr Priscilla LEUNG MTRCL	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG's declaration of interest and enquiries on the implications of locating WHA at a private road in the Whampoa Garden on the management costs borne by residents concerned. She also expressed concern about the location of the proposed ventilation shaft which should be located farther away from the primary school concerned and the need to enhance pedestrian connection between WHA and the neighbouring housing estates.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) Tak On Street would be temporarily occupied for construction of WHA underground and would be returned to residents of Whampoa Garden upon completion of works; and</p> <p>(b) the ventilation shaft outside the G.C.E. Past Students' Association Whampoa Primary School would be an emergency rescue access and alternative locations were still being explored for the ventilation shaft.</p> <p>Dr LEUNG urged MTRCL to compensate the interest of residents of the Whampoa Garden as it was unfair to hold them responsible for the huge maintenance costs of the Tak On Street with WHA located underneath.</p>	
010450-010921	Mr IP Wai-ming Administration	<p>Mr IP Wai-ming's request for maintaining road-based transport services for the Ho Man Tin Estate/Sheung Lok Street residents given the unsatisfactory pedestrian connections with HOM.</p> <p>The Administration's reiteration that the different levels of intermodal coordination would be assessed before the commissioning of KTE.</p>	
010922-011426	Mr LAU Kong-wah Administration MTRCL Chairman	<p>Mr LAU Kong-wah's request for provision of additional pedestrian subway(s) to connect the neighbouring housing estates to WHA.</p> <p>The Administration and MTRCL's explanation that the existing pedestrian road/subway near to the proposed WHA already provided a suitable pedestrian link and a comfortable walking environment.</p> <p>Mr LAU's suggestion and members' concurrence for the Subcommittee to conduct a visit to the proposed HOM and WHA.</p>	<p><b>Clerk to take follow-up action. (para. 11 of minutes)</b></p>

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
011427– 011945	Mr Andrew CHENG Chairman Administration	Mr Andrew CHENG's request for detailed information on the technical constraints on provision of additional station entrances as requested by residents for HOM and WHA (such as the one at Fat Kwong Street). The Chairman's request for provision of the requisite information before the visit.	<b>MTRCL to provide information.</b> <b>(para. 14 of minutes)</b>
011946– 012034	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG	The Chairman's closing remarks.  Dr Priscilla LEUNG's request for provision of pedestrian connection with WHA for residents of Ka Wai Chuen.	
012035– 012128	Chairman	Voting on the motion moved by Mrs Regina IP.	<b>Administration to provide a written response to the motion.</b> <b>(para. 14 of minutes)</b>
<i>Agenda item V – Mechanism of regular report on the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link</i>			
012129– 012850	Chairman Administration	Briefing on the government's monitoring and reporting on the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) by the Administration (LC Paper No. CB(1)1573/09-10(04).	
012851– 013301	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	Mr WONG Kwok-hing's enquiry on the monitoring mechanism of the XRL project and the Administration's response.  The Administration's advice that under the prevailing policy, MTRCL and its contractors had to accord priority to local workers in filling job vacancies. Imported workers would only be allowed in the absence of relevant technical personnel in the local market.	<b>Administration to provide information.</b> <b>(para. 19 of minutes)</b>
013302– 013730	Ms LI Fung-ying Administration Chairman	Ms LI Fung-ying's request for including the following updates into the regular report: the type and the number of employment opportunities created and the number of local workers employed; matters relating to the land resumption in Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT) and Tai Kok Tsui; and the mitigation measures on the transport and the community.  The Administration's response that it would endeavour to promote employment opportunities to the local construction workforce.	<b>Administration to provide information.</b> <b>(para. 19 of minutes)</b>
013731– 014335	Ms Starry LEE Administration Chairman	Ms Starry LEE's request for regular report on the conduct of home visits to Tai Kok Tsui residents and introduction of streamlined procedures for claiming damages under the Railways Ordinance (Cap. 519).	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) apart from setting up a dedicated team for paying home visits to the affected owners, MTRCL and government representatives would meet with individual owners' corporation and owners in April 2010 to brief them on the relevant building impact assessment report; and</p> <p>(b) the Hong Kong Institution of Engineers (HKIE) and independent surveying companies would provide independent professional advice to residents via the XRL Urban Information Centre.</p>	
014336-014917	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's request for inclusion of the following matters into future progress reports: land clearance (e.g. CYT and Tai Kok Tsui) and impacts of construction works/mitigating measures, and the employment situation of local construction workforce under the project. The Administration's agreement to do so.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that progress of major pre-construction preparatory work (such as land clearance, condition surveys for buildings along the railway alignment, and important temporary traffic arrangements) as well as major interface issues (such as traffic impact in affected areas due to construction works and coordination with related projects) would be covered in the regular reports.</p>	<b>Administration to provide information. (para. 19 of minutes)</b>
014918-015436	Mr LAU Kong-wah Administration Chairman	<p>Mr LAU Kong-wah's concerns on the progress made regarding the co-location of boundary control facilities. The Administration's response that an internal inter-disciplinary task force had already been set up to study the co-location arrangements for XRL and discuss with the relevant Mainland authorities.</p>	
015437-015848	Mrs Regina IP Administration	<p>Mrs Regina IP's concern on the progress of agricultural resite for interested CYT villagers.</p> <p>The Administration's response -</p> <p>(a) over 70% of applications for the ex-gratia cash allowance had been approved and vetting of the rest was expected to be completed before end-April 2010 for notification to applicants in May 2010;</p> <p>(b) the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) had been offering assistance and advice to villagers concerned; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration would provide one-stop</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		service with a view to speeding up the application process.	
015849-020352	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Administration Chairman	Dr Priscilla LEUNG's enquiries on the availability of independent consultants to provide professional advice on building structural safety for Tai Kok Tsui residents concerned and the relevant compensation mechanism. The Administration's reiteration on the availability of independent consultation service provided by HKIE and the surveying companies employed.  The Chairman's view that the Law Society of Hong Kong should also be invited to provide legal advice to the affected owners.	
020353-020840	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration Chairman	Mr LEE Wing-tat's view that progress of agricultural resite for CYT villagers should be reported more regularly. The Administration's response that the Lands Department had been offering assistance to CYT villagers in proceeding with the applications. The Heung Yee Kuk and AFCD had also been in close touch with interested CYT villagers to help them search for suitable farming sites and proceed with the settlement arrangements respectively. One-stop service would be provided to speed up the processing of applications. Progress of the development would be included in the first progress report.	
020841-020855	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming Chairman	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming's concern on rehousing CYT villagers before the clearance of CYT in October 2010.	
020856-020940	Chairman Administration	Scheduling of a special meeting in early July 2010 for discussion of the first progress report.	