

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)45/10-11
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of special meeting on Tuesday, 6 July 2010, at 8:30 am in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon WONG Sing-chi
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
- Members attending** : Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
- Members absent** : Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

**Public Officers
attending**

: Agenda item I

Ms Eva CHENG
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Fletch CHAN
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr WAN Man-lung
Acting Director of Highways

Mr LAM Sai-hung
Chief Engineer (Railway Development)
Highways Department

Agenda item II

Mr YAU Shing-mu
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr C W CHOW
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr CHAN Chi-yan
Acting Principal Government Engineer / Railway
Development
Highways Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda item I

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr T C CHEW
Project Director

Mr Paul LO
General Manager (Express Rail Link)

Miss Maggie SO
Senior Manager – Projects and Property Communications

Agenda item II

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Henry LAM
General Manager – SCL / KTE

Miss Maggie SO
Senior Manager – Projects and Property Communications

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr Ken WOO
Council Secretary (1)2

Miss Pauline NG
Clerical Assistant (1)1

Action

-
- I Progress report on the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link project**
(LC Paper No. CB(1)2290/09-10(01) — Administration's paper on progress and financial situation of the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2288/09-10 — Background brief on the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2312/09-10(01) — Submission from "象山邨居民互助組"
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2290/09-10(02) — Submission from a member of the public
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2218/09-10(01) — Submission from "米埔村高鐵關注組"
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2473/09-10(01) — Submission from Concern Group of Tsoi Yuen Tsuen in Shek Kong

Action

- LC Paper No. CB(1)2473/09-10(02) — Submission from "高鐵苦主
互助聯盟"
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2473/09-10(03) — Joint submission from 10
concern groups
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2474/09-10(01) — Powerpoint presentation
materials)

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. At the commencement of the meeting, the Chairman reminded members to disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interest in the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) project before they spoke on the matter. Mr Jeffrey LAM declared that he was an independent non-executive director of a company which had taken part in the project.

3. With the aid of Powerpoint, the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) briefed members on the latest progress of the Hong Kong section of XRL project, including the progress of land resumption in Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT) as detailed in paragraph 11(i)-(vii) of the Administration's paper.

4. The Administration advised that the project had been implemented on schedule and within budget. It was the Administration's target to complete the clearance of CYT and moving out of villagers from the site in October 2010.

5. As regards the concerns of Tai Kok Tsui residents, the MTRCL advised that of the 19 buildings affected by strata resumption, condition surveys for common areas of 16 buildings and around 450 (out of some 3 000) units had been completed. The survey reports were being delivered to the respective Incorporated Owners and individual owners. A summary of the building impact assessment report covering the 19 buildings had also been distributed to owners of these buildings, and the full report was made available at the Information Centre in New Kowloon Plaza for inspection. Briefing sessions had been held for residents to help them understand the content of the report with professional advice and assistance rendered by the Hong Kong Institution of Engineers.

6. Members noted a joint submission from various concern organizations requesting the Subcommittee to hold a public hearing on the XRL project. After discussion, members agreed to hold a special meeting in September 2010 to receive public views.

(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairman, the special meeting was subsequently scheduled for 20 September 2010 at 4:30 pm.)

Action

II Progress of Kwun Tong Line Extension

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)2290/09-10(03) — Administration's paper on progress report on the Kwun Tong Line Extension
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2289/09-10 — Background brief on Kwun Tong Line Extension prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2312/09-10(02) — Submission from Whampoa Garden Incorporated Owners Preparation Committee
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2474/09-10(02) — Powerpoint presentation materials)

7. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).
8. Ms Starry LEE and Dr Priscilla LEUNG both declared that they owned properties along the alignment of the Kwun Tong Line Extension (KTE). Dr Priscilla LEUNG also declared that she was a Kowloon City District Council member.
9. With the aid of Powerpoint, the MTRCL briefed members on the latest progress of the KTE project.
10. Members in general welcomed the recent amendments made to the railway scheme, including the provision of a new station entrance at Fat Kwong Street near the Hon Man Tin East Service Reservoir Playground which would be connected to Ho Man Tin Station through a subway, and the extension of the proposed footbridge along Chung Yee Street beyond Hau Man Street to connect with Oi Man Estate. Moreover, a lift would be built on the podium near Kar Man House to provide convenient link between the station and Oi Man Estate.
11. Some members further requested that the proposed new station entrance at Fat Kwong Street be relocated nearer to Ho Man Tin Estate, say, within 500 meters of the Ho Man Tin Estate, in order to meet the needs of residents. The MTRCL undertook to consider the request.
12. Some members reiterated the need to provide enhanced pedestrian connection facilities between the Whampoa Station (WHA) and its neighbouring housing estates and Hung Hom old district. Dr Priscilla LEUNG said that residents of Whampoa Garden held divided views on the choice of the Tak On Street (a private road) for the construction of WHA. One of their concerns was about the implications on the management costs and legal responsibility borne by them. The Chairman requested the Administration/MTRCL to provide information to residents to address their concerns.

MTRCL

Admin/
MTRCL

Action

- Clerk 13. Members further agreed to hold a special meeting on 17 July 2010 to receive views from the public on the KTE project.

(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairman, the special meeting originally scheduled for 17 July 2010 was subsequently rescheduled for 14 July 2010 at 8:30 am.)

III Any other business

14. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:20 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
14 October 2010

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Proceedings of the special meeting on Tuesday, 6 July 2010, at 8:30 am in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Progress report on the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link project</i>			
000018 – 001519	Chairman Mr Jeffrey LAM Administration Ms Starry LEE Ms LI Fung-ying Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mr Ronny TONG Mr KAM Nai-wai	Mr Jeffrey LAM's declaration of interest. Discussion on scheduling a special meeting in September 2010 to receive public views on the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (XRL) project.	
001520 – 002807	Chairman Administration MTRCL	Powerpoint presentation by the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) and the Administration (LC Paper No. CB(1)2474/09-10(01)).	
002808 – 003334	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration MTRCL	Mr WONG Kwok-hing's enquiry and the Administration's confirmation that about 2 400 employment opportunities would be created by the project, and priority would be accorded to the employment of local construction workforce. Mr WONG's enquiry about measures to address local residents' concern about the ventilation shaft at Cheung Shan Estate, and progress of the agricultural resite and rehousing arrangements being made for Choi Yuen Tsuen (CYT) villagers. The Administration's response that about 20 applications for agricultural resite had been received and 10 villagers had been verified as genuine farmers. As for some villagers who had submitted preliminary information instead of formal applications, the Administration had rendered them assistance as far as possible in certifying their eligibility and had conducted preliminary assessment of their applications. These villagers had been informed of the outcome. The Transport and Housing Bureau would deal with the applications sympathetically under the existing mechanism, and would continue to work closely with the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department, Lands Department and the Heung Yee Kuk in facilitating the agricultural resite arrangements. The MTRCL's response that the tunnel of the Hong Kong section would run underneath the Cheung Shan Estate by around 100 meters. Communication with residents had started since 2008 and residents had been reassured at	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		discussions of the district councils, community liaison groups (CLG) and resident meetings that the proposed ventilation shaft would pose no adverse impact on the air quality and the living of residents. A site visit to a similar ventilation facility at Yau Ma Tei had also been conducted to facilitate residents' understanding on its operation.	
003335 – 003910	Mr Jeffrey LAM Administration MTRCL Chairman	<p>Mr Jeffrey LAM's enquiries on strengthening the dissemination of information on the project to the public, maintaining road and pedestrian safety in carrying out the road works, and the timing of completion of clearance of CYT.</p> <p>The Administration's response that it was operating in full swing the rehousing arrangements for affected CYT villagers with a view to vacating CYT in October 2010.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) communication with local residents had been made through CLG, media briefings and roving exhibitions; and (b) arrangements had been made with contractors of works on strengthening road safety when temporary traffic management schemes were implemented. <p>The Administration's advice that the Highways Department had also put in place measures to ensure the safety of the relevant works.</p>	
003911 – 004703	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's expression of concerns about the progress of agricultural resite for CYT villagers, the Administration's consideration of the request of Tai Kok Tsui (TKT) residents for a detailed structural integrity report, and the financial situation of the project.</p> <p>The Administration's response that the project had been implemented on schedule and within budget, and that applications for agricultural resite had been dealt with expeditiously.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) a summary of the building impact assessment report for each of the 19 TKT buildings inspected had been distributed to owners of these buildings. The full report was available at the Information Centre in New Kowloon Plaza for inspection by the owners; and (b) the condition surveys for common areas of 16 (out of 19) affected buildings in TKT and about 450 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>individual units had been completed and the survey reports were being delivered to the respective Incorporated Owners and individual owners.</p>	
004704 – 005236	Mrs Regina IP Administration MTRCL	<p>Mrs Regina IP’s enquiries on whether the Administration would have direct contacts and dialogue with the public on the projects, and whether the appreciation of Renminbi would have an impact on the construction costs.</p> <p>The Administration’s response that project leaflets would be distributed to the mailbox of all residents of the 19 affected buildings and a community ambassador team had been set up by MTRCL to communicate with the affected TKT residents.</p> <p>The MTRCL’s response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the communities of the districts affected by the tunnelling works had been consulted before gazettal of the project; and (b) the contracts under the project would basically be denominated in Hong Kong Dollars and contingencies had been provided in the project estimate to cater for price escalation as a result of currency appreciation. 	
005237 – 005741	Ms Starry LEE Administration MTRCL	<p>Ms Starry LEE’s requests for allowing affected TKT residents a choice in the selection of professionals to conduct condition surveys for their buildings, and introducing streamlined procedures for claiming damages under the Railways Ordinance (Cap. 519).</p> <p>The Administration’s response -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) professional engineering and surveying services from The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers (HKIE) and three other surveying consultants had been arranged to provide independent professional advice to TKT residents on the building impact assessment report; and (b) affected residents who had any compensable interest might submit, in accordance with the Railways Ordinance, a claim to the Secretary for Transport and Housing, which could often be settled by mutual agreement and did not necessarily involve judicial proceedings. <p>The MTRCL’s response that of the 19 buildings affected by strata resumption, condition surveys for respective common areas of the 16 buildings were completed. The surveys for some 3 000 individual units were ongoing, of which around 450 units had completed. The progress made so far was in line with the experiences of other</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		similar railway projects. The community ambassador team had also been in close touch with the affected residents to facilitate their understanding of the surveying work.	
005742 – 010423	Mr WONG Sing-chi MTRCL Administration	<p>Mr WONG Sing-chi's concerns on the supply of manpower to meet the peak of construction activities in 2013 and the difficulties faced in conducting the condition surveys.</p> <p>The MTRCL's reiteration of the deployment of ambassadors to facilitate the conduct of condition surveys. The MTRCL's advice that it had joined the pledge with the Construction Industry Council Training Academy (CICTA) to support its Enhanced Construction Manpower Training Scheme for encouraging young people to develop their career in the construction industry.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation that the Development Bureau played a role in planning for and coordinating the supply of construction workforce and had been working closely with the Construction Industry Council and CICTA in providing construction training in areas where manpower was in shortage locally.</p>	
010424 – 011111	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Administration MTRCL	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG's suggestion that the Secretary/Under Secretary for Transport and Housing should visit TKT to meet with the affected residents. Her request for provision of a simplified version of the impact assessment report, and giving the affected TKT residents a choice in the selection of professionals to conduct the condition surveys and to provide consultation service.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) a guidance note in Chinese had been included into the simplified building impact assessment reports and condition survey reports to help affected residents understand the reports; and</p> <p>(b) arrangements had been made for residents of the 19 affected buildings to attend a briefing to help them understand the content of the building impact assessment report.</p>	
011112 – 011632	Mr Ronny TONG Administration	<p>Mr Ronny TONG's concerns on measures to bridge the time gap between completion of the Mainland section of XRL and that of the Hong Kong section, the co-location of boundary control facilities in the West Kowloon Terminus, and the handling of concerns expressed by affected CYT and TKT residents.</p> <p>The Administration's response -</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(a) explanation on the special assistance granted to eligible CYT households under the special ex-gratia rehousing package and the setting up of an internal inter-disciplinary task force to study the co-location arrangements with relevant Mainland authorities; and</p> <p>(b) the XRL sections between Shibi and Longhua and Longhua and Futian were expected to come into operation in end 2010/early 2011 and 2012 respectively. Before the commissioning of the Hong Kong section, passengers who wished to travel by the Mainland section of XRL could take the Lok Ma Chau Spur Line and then Shenzhen Metro to reach the Futian terminus.</p>	
011633 – 011749	Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	Mr WONG Kwok-hing's request and the MTRCL's undertaking to strengthen the communication with affected residents of the Cheung Shan Estate.	
011750 – 011853	Dr Priscilla LEUNG MTRCL	Dr Priscilla LEUNG's reiteration of her request for the Secretary/Under Secretary for Transport and Housing to visit TKT to meet with the affected residents. Her further request and the MTRCL's undertaking to expand the composition of CLG to include Incorporated Owners of the affected TKT buildings.	
011854 – 011942	Ms Starry LEE	Ms Starry LEE's suggestion that representatives who were properly authorized by the affected TKT owners should also be allowed access to and inspect the full building impact assessment report.	
011943 – 012007	Chairman	Concluding remarks	
<i>Agenda item II – Progress of Kwun Tong Line Extension</i>			
012008 – 012312	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG	Discussion on scheduling a special meeting on 17 July 2010 to receive views from the public on the Kwun Tong Line Extension (KTE) project.	
012313 – 013426	Chairman Administration MTRCL	Powerpoint presentation by the Administration and the MTRCL (LC Paper No. CB(1)2474/09-10(02)).	
013427 – 014059	Ms Starry LEE MTRCL Chairman	<p>Ms Starry LEE's declaration of interest. Her requests for moving the proposed station entrance at Fat Kwong Street to within 500 meters of the Ho Man Tin Estate, and providing enhanced pedestrian connection facilities between the Whampoa Station (WHA) and the neighbouring residential areas.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) the existing footpath along the Hung Hom Road was on level ground and its width could cope with</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the growth of pedestrian flow in the future. It also provided a pleasant walking environment with the road side planting. Given that the alignments of the suggested subways were very similar to that of the existing footpath, the functions of both facilities would be duplicated; and</p> <p>(b) the MTRCL's agreement to consider moving the proposed entrance at Fat Kwong Street closer to the Ho Man Tin Estate.</p>	<p>MTRCL to consider member's request. (para. 11 of minutes)</p>
014100 – 015004	Dr Priscilla LEUNG MTRCL Chairman	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG's declaration of interest. Her concerns on the height of the proposed integrated emergency access with ventilation shaft near Harbour Landmark, and the choice of Tak On Street for construction of WHA.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) the integrated complex comprising ventilation shaft and emergency access would be around two to three-storey in height; and</p> <p>(b) measures would be in place to alleviate the disturbance of the works on Tak On Street, including setting up liaison groups by resident site staff to meet with local residents, implementing air and noise control measures, and effecting temporary traffic management schemes.</p> <p>The Chairman's request for the Administration and the MTRCL to consider the legal implications of providing a MTR station on a private road and the associated maintenance and legal responsibility borne by the residents.</p>	<p>Administration/ MTRCL to address residents' concerns. (para. 12 of minutes)</p>
015005 – 015010	Chairman	Closing remarks	