

# 立法會

## *Legislative Council*

LC Paper No. CB(1)47/10-11  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

### **Panel on Transport**

#### **Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

#### **Minutes of special meeting on Wednesday, 14 July 2010, at 8:30 am in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
Hon WONG Sing-chi  
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
- Members attending** : Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
- Members absent** : Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP  
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

**Public Officers  
attending**

**: Agenda item I**

Mr YAU Shing-mu  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr C W CHOW  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr CHAN Chi-yan  
Acting Principal Government Engineer / Railway  
Development  
Highways Department

**Attendance by  
invitation**

**: Agenda item I**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Henry LAM  
General Manager – SCL / KTE

Miss Maggie SO  
Senior Manager – Projects and Property Communications

Mr Lawrence CHUNG  
Design Manager – Kwun Tong Line Extension

黃埔新邨業主立案法團聯會

Mr CHAU Yu-kwan  
Chairman

Mr CHAN Chit-lun  
Secretary

Individual

Ir CHEUNG Yan-hong  
Kowloon City District Councillor

Estate Owners' Committee of Laguna Verde

Mr YUE Chee-wing  
Chairman

Miss CHENG Miu-shan  
Member

Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's  
Livelihood (Kowloon City Branch)

Mr Pius YUM  
Chairman

Office of District Councillor LUK King-kwong,  
Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress  
of Hong Kong

Mr LUK King-kwong  
Kowloon City District Councillor

Office of District Councillor CHO Wui-hung

Mr CHO Wui-hung  
Kowloon City District Councillor

Miss WU Hong-yi  
Councillor Assistant

Whampoa Garden Incorporated Owners Preparation  
Committee

Mr LAM Tze-chung  
Convener

Mr LAM Kong-shing  
Member

Individual

Mr YAU Leong-ming  
Resident of Ho Man Tin Estate

Harbourfront Landmark Residential Owners'  
Representative

Mr FONG Chau-kwai  
Vice Chairman

Mr WONG Chun-kit  
Representative

Individual

Ms YAU Suk-fong

Oi Man Estate Resident Association

Mr NG Fan-kam  
Chairperson

何文田居民協進會

Mr NG Chi-chung  
Vice Chairman

Individual

Mr LAU Wai-wing  
Kowloon City District Councillor

Owners' Representative of Whampoa Garden Site 12

Mr LO Tsai-hong  
Owners' Representative

Owners' Representative of Whampoa Garden Site 11

Mr LEUNG Yun-lam  
Owners' Representative

Whampoa Garden Owners Representatives'  
Committee

Mr LEUNG Fuk-chak  
Chairman

Whampoa Garden Site 9 Owners' Committee

Ms NG Mei-wah  
Chairman

Ms HO Yim-fong  
Vice Chairman

Whampoa Garden Site 10 Owners' Committee

Mr CHAN Kam-ying  
Owners' Representative

Mr YEUNG Chun-bui  
Owners' Representative

Individual

Mr LO Chiu-kit  
Kowloon City District Councillor

The Federation of Hong Kong & Kowloon Labour  
Unions Social Affairs Committee

Miss CHU Kam-wah  
Community Organizer

Ms YU Fung-mui  
Residents' Representative

Hung Hom Resident Service Organization

Mr YEUNG Ho-shing  
Executive Committee Member

**Clerk in attendance :** Ms Joanne MAK  
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

**Staff in attendance :** Mr Ken WOO  
Council Secretary (1)2

Miss Pauline NG  
Clerical Assistant (1)1

---

Action

- I Kwun Tong Line Extension**  
(LC Paper No. CB(1)2290/09-10(03) — Administration's paper on progress report on the Kwun Tong Line Extension
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2289/09-10 — Background brief on Kwun Tong Line Extension prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

- LC Paper No. CB(1)2498/09-10(01) — Submission from Harbourfront Landmark Residential Owners' Representative
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2498/09-10(02) — Submission from Ms SIU Yuen-sheung, Kowloon City District Councillor
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2537/09-10(01) — Submission from Office of District Councillor LUK King-kwong, Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2537/09-10(02) — Submission from Mr LO Chiu-kit, Kowloon City District Councillor
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2537/09-10(03) — Submission from Hung Hom Resident Service Organization
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2537/09-10(04) — Submission from Dr YANG Mo, Southern District Councillor
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2537/09-10(05) — Submission from Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(01) — Submission from Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's Livelihood (Kowloon City Branch)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(02) — Submission from Whampoa Garden Incorporated Owners Preparation Committee
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(03) — Submission from The Federation of Hong Kong & Kowloon Labour Unions Social Affairs Committee
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(04) — Submission from Harbourfront Landmark Residential Owners' Representative
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(05) — Submission from "黃埔新邨業主立案法團聯會"
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(06) — Submission from Ir CHEUNG Yan-hong, Kowloon City District Councillor
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(07) — Submission from Estate Owners' Committee of Laguna Verde

LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(08) — Submission from Mr LAU Wai-wing, Kowloon City District Councillor)

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. Ms Starry LEE and Dr Priscilla LEUNG both declared that they owned properties along the alignment of the Kwun Tong Line Extension (KTE).

3. The Subcommittee received views from 21 deputations, who expressed the following major concerns and requests -

*Ho Man Tin Station (HOM)*

- (a) to provide a station entrance at Oi Man Estate to facilitate access to HOM by residents of Oi Man Estate, Cascades and Chun Man Court; and
- (b) to relocate the proposed station entrance at Fat Kwong Street nearer to Ho Man Tin Estate and to improve the relevant pedestrian connection facilities.

*Whampoa Station (WHA)*

- (a) to provide additional station entrances and improve pedestrian connection facilities between WHA and Laguna Verde, Ka Wai Chuen, and Hung Hom Estate, etc;
- (b) to thoroughly consult residents of Wuhu Street and Tak Man Street on the use of the drill and blast method to construct the tunnels;
- (c) to put in place necessary noise and dust abatement measures during construction to minimize disturbance to the public;
- (d) to address concerns of residents of Whampoa Garden on locating WHA at Tak On Street, including the structural integrity of the buildings, impact on the pedestrian flow and traffic, and the legal responsibility and maintenance cost that might be borne by the residents concerned; and
- (e) to address residents' grave concern about the impact of the proposed integrated emergency access with ventilation shaft near Harbour Landmark on the environment and the traffic in the area, and consider alternative suggestions (e.g. building underground, instead of aboveground, ventilation shafts) put forward by residents.

Action

Admin/  
MTRCL

4. Ms LI Fung-ying suggested that the Administration/ MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) should hold residents' meetings to specifically address and follow up their concerns raised at this meeting. At the request of members, MTRCL agreed to explore the feasibility of constructing underground ventilation shafts as proposed by residents of Harbour Landmark. The Subcommittee requested the Administration to provide detailed response to the above concerns and requests raised by deputations and members.

**II Any other business**

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:00 am.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
14 October 2010



## Panel on Transport

## Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the special meeting  
on Wednesday, 14 July 2010, at 8:30 am  
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I – Kwun Tong Line Extension</i>			
000145 – 000418	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000419 – 000645	Mr CHAU Yu-kwan, 黃埔新邨業主立案法 團聯會	Expression of support for locating the Whampoa Station (WHA) at Tak On Street and a station entrance at Man Siu Street, and requested measures to minimize disturbance to the public during construction. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(05)]	
000646 – 000857	Ir CHEUNG Yan-hong, Kowloon City District Councillor	Supported locating WHA at Tak On Street, and requested for station entrances at Hok Yuen Street and Hung Hom South Road connecting WHA with subways. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(06)]	
000858 – 001201	Mr YUE Chee-wing, Miss CHENG Miu-shan, Estate Owners' Committee of Laguna Verde	Requested for providing a station entrance at Laguna Verde and a subway connecting the proposed entrance at Man Siu Street with the subway at the junction between Tai Wan Road and Hung Hom Road. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(07)]	
001202 – 001524	Ms NG Mei-wah, Whampoa Garden Site 9 Owners' Committee	Suggestion of relocating WHA at Dyer Avenue, Hung Hom Road or the Cross Border Coach Terminus.	
001525 – 001839	Mr Pius YUM, Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's Livelihood (Kowloon City Branch)	Requested for consulting residents of Wuhu Street and Tak Man Street on the use of drill and blast method in constructing the tunnels underground, and objected to the resumption of Fat Kwong Street Playground and Wuhu Street Temporary Playground for temporary work sites. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(01)]	
001840 – 002105	Mr LUK King-kwong, Office of District Councillor LUK King-kwong, Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Requested for providing station entrances and pedestrian connections for Laguna Verde, Hok Yuen district and the densely populated housing estates of Ho Man Tin, and consulting residents of Wuhu Street and Tak Man Street on the construction of the tunnels underground. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2537/09-10(01)]	
002106 – 002413	Mr CHO Wui-hung, Office of District Councillor CHO Wui-hung	Requested for an entrance at Oi Man Estate connecting the Ho Man Tin Station (HOM) to facilitate residents of the Estate, Cascades and Chun Man Court.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
002414 – 002809	Mr LAM Kong-shing, Whampoa Garden Incorporated Owners Preparation Committee	Expression of views that a wider public, including the Hung Hom district, could be served if WHA was to be located at Dyer Avenue instead of Tak On Street. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(02)]	
002810 – 003126	Mr YAU Leong-ming, Resident of Ho Man Tin Estate	Requested for better communication with residents affected by the Kwun Tong Line Extension (KTE) project and the provision of a travelator system connecting the proposed entrance at Fat Kwong Street with the Ho Man Tin Estate.	
003127 – 003518	Mr FONG Chau-kwai, Harbourfront Landmark Residential Owners' Representative	Elaborating five requests including removing the proposed ventilation shaft and emergency access at Wan Hoi Street away from the Harbourfront Landmark, and building underground ventilation shaft instead, as set out in their submission. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(04)]	
003519 – 003745	Ms YAU Suk-fong	Supported locating WHA at Tak On Street and requested for a station entrance at either the open space next to the Hung Hom Government Primary School or Hung Hom Fire Station to facilitate residents of Ka Wai Chuen.	
003746 – 004022	Mr NG Fan-kam, Oi Man Estate Resident Association	Requested for provision of a station entrance and passenger lift at Oi Man Estate to facilitate residents of the Estate, Chun Man Court and Cascades.	
004023 – 004151	Mr NG Chi-chung, 何文田居民協進會	Requested for enhancing the connection between Ho Man Tin Estate and HOM.	
004152 – 004502	Mr LAU Wai-wing, Kowloon City District Councillor	Requested for minimizing the occupancy of the carriageway of Tak On Street and Shung King Street for station entrances, avoiding tree cutting, taking noise and dust abatement measures during construction, and enhancing the pedestrian connections between WHA and the neighbouring housing estates. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(08)]	
004503 – 004758	Mr LO Tsai-hong, Owners' Representative of Whampoa Garden Site 12	Requested for controlling the noise of running trains, monitoring the noise level and air quality from ventilation shafts, and setting up a working group to closely monitor the implementation of the works.	
004759 – 005024	Mr LEUNG Yun-lam, Owners' Representative of Whampoa Garden Site 11	Requested for the following - (a) to demolish and reinstate the existing footbridge connecting Whampoa Garden Site 11 to Man Siu Street; (b) to relocate the proposed ventilation shaft, emergency access and passenger lift from Shung King Street to Tak Ting Street;	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) to relocate the proposed entrance at Shung King Street from the junction between Shung King Street and Tak On Street to the junction between Shung King Street and Tak Fung Street;</p> <p>(d) to reconsider the proposed ventilation shaft at the junction between Tak On Street and Tak Ting Street given their size and close proximity to residential blocks; and</p> <p>(e) to limit the height of the shafts to lower than the podium garden of the blocks nearby.</p>	
005025 – 005449	Mr LEUNG Fuk-chak, Whampoa Garden Owners Representatives' Committee	Expression of views on the design of ventilation shafts to make them less disturbing and more acceptable to the general public.	
005450 – 005816	Mr CHAN Kam-ying, Whampoa Garden Site 10 Owners' Committee	Expression of support for expeditious implementation of the project and wish for limiting the height of the shafts to lower than the podium garden of the residential blocks.	
005817 – 010131	Mr LO Chiu-kit, Kowloon City District Councillor	Supported locating WHA at Tak On Street and requested for providing station entrances with passenger lifts and travelators in the vicinity of the densely-populated Ka Wan Chuen and Hung Hom Estate. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2537/09-10(02)]	
010132 – 010521	Miss CHU Kam-wah, Ms YU Fung-mui, The Federation of Hong Kong & Kowloon Labour Unions Social Affairs Committee	Requested for a footbridge extending from the proposed entrance at Fat Kwong Street to either the section opposite to the Fat Kwong Street Sport Centre at Chung Hau Street or the Housing Authority Mock-up Centre. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2558/09-10(03)]	
010522 – 010815	Mr YEUNG Ho-shing, Hung Hom Resident Service Organization	Requested for strengthening the publicity and consultation of the project to residents of Hung Hom and keeping in close touch with residents whose building would be affected by the tunneling works. [LC Paper No. CB(1)2537/09-10(03)]	
010816 – 011836	Chairman Administration MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL)	<p>The Administration's response to views of deputations. The Administration undertook to minimize environmental nuisance during construction and engage in close dialogue with various stakeholders throughout the implementation of the project.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response to views of deputations -</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(a) ground investigation works would be conducted and pre-construction condition surveys and site monitoring would follow to ensure that the structural integrity of premises in close proximity to the alignment would not be affected; and</p> <p>(b) communication with affected residents would continue through the ambassador team who visited affected households, and the set up of community liaison groups and a resident site working group as the works commenced.</p>	
011837 – 012043	Ms LI Fung-ying MTRCL	Ms LI Fung-ying’s request and the Administration’s undertaking to address deputations’ concerns before the commencement of the works.	
012044 – 012257	Mr Andrew CHENG MTRCL Chairman	Mr Andrew CHENG’s concern and MTRCL’s undertaking to improve the design of ventilation shafts.	<b>Admin to consider relevant suggestions. (para. 4 of minutes)</b>
012258 – 012454	Ms Starry LEE Administration	<p>Ms Starry LEE’s declaration of interest and her requests for enhancing pedestrian connections with WHA for neighbouring developments and moving the proposed entrance at Fat Kwong Street closer to the Ho Man Tin Estate.</p> <p>The Administration’s undertaking to further consult the district council concerned and make regular reports to the Subcommittee.</p>	
012455 – 012802	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Administration	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG’s declaration of interest and requests for explaining gazetted amendments to the railway scheme in layman’s terms, better coordinating the views and requests of stakeholders, enhancing pedestrian connections for neighbouring developments with KTE stations, and addressing residents’ concern about the implications of locating WHA on a private road.</p> <p>The Administration’s response that detailed explanation of the gazetted amendments would be given at relevant district council meetings, and detailed response to concerns raised by deputations would be provided to the Subcommittee when the project was further discussed at a future meeting.</p>	<b>Admin to provide detailed response. (para. 4 of minutes)</b>
012803 – 012822	Chairman	Closing remarks	