

政府總部
運輸及房屋局
運輸科
香港花園道美利大廈



CB(1)2152/09-10(01)
Transport and
Housing Bureau
Government Secretariat
Transport Branch
Murray Building, Garden Road,
Hong Kong

本局檔號 Our Ref.
來函檔號 Your Ref.

Secretary to the Subcommittee on
Matters Relating to Railways
LegCo Secretariat of Panel on Transport
3/F Citicorp Tower
3 Garden Road
Hong Kong

(Attn.: Ms. Joanne Mak)

3 June 2010

Dear Madam,

**Panel on Transport
Sub-committee on Matters Relating to Railways
Meeting on 9 February 2010**

**South Island Line (East)
Proposed Temporary Barging Point and Temporary Magazine Site**

The Government would like to provide further information regarding the two motions passed at the LegCo Railway Sub-committee meeting held on 9.2.2010, as follows-

Mr KAM Nai-wai's motion "That this Subcommittee strongly requests the Government and the MTRCL not to choose Telegraph Bay as the site for the temporary barging point, so as to avoid causing substantial adverse impact on the residents of Pok Fu Lam, including those living in Baguio Villa and Residence Bel-Air as well as the schools nearby."

We note the Members' concern, the Government and the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) have maintained close contacts with the stakeholders regarding the proposed temporary barging point at Telegraph Bay

for the construction of South Island Line (East) (SIL(E)) throughout the consultation process. We attended a discussion forum on 26.2.2010 organised by the Southern District Council (SDC) to discuss and exchange views with the local residents and nearby stakeholders about the proposal of setting up a temporary barging point at Telegraph Bay. We consulted the SDC's South Island Line Focus Group meeting on 8.3.2010 on the proposal. Moreover, we also arranged a site visit with the local District Councillor and representatives of the local residents near Telegraph Bay on 17.3.2010 to Aberdeen Typhoon Shelter and Tai Shue Wan in the Ocean Park to explore the feasibility of setting up alternative locations of the proposed temporary barging point that have been suggested by the LegCo Members and the affected parties. We met with representatives of the Ocean Park on 4.3.2010 and 20.4.2010 to discuss in details the feasibility of setting up of a temporary barging point inside the Ocean Park. In early April, the MTRCL has issued a newsletter on the SIL (East) to all residents in Pokfulam area, explaining in details the considerations that have been taking into account in the proposal. On 27.4.2010, the Under Secretary for Transport and Housing met with the concerned group of "Setting up a temporary barging point in Telegraph Bay", to exchange views about the proposal.

In response to the above motion, the Government and the MTRCL have undertaken more in-depth feasibility study on the other alternative schemes or locations to replace the proposed barging point at Telegraph Bay. Details of the findings are as follows-

Various Locations within Aberdeen Typhoon Shelter

- The mooring of vessels within the typhoon shelter is already very congested and the fairways are very busy. Maneuvering of large barge within the typhoon shelter will occupy most of the fairway and will have adverse impact to the operation of the typhoon shelter and the fishery industry.
- Operation of large barge may endanger those small vessels operating within the typhoon shelter.
- No suitable site along the coast of typhoon shelter can be identified for erecting a tipping hall and the space for trucks to unload.

- This proposal is not feasible.

Tai Shue Wan of Ocean Park (3 Options)

Option 1 : The delivery trucks will deliver the spoil to the temporary barging point at Tai Shue Wan using Shum Wan Road

- Shum Wan Road is narrow, winding and busy road. Its capacity is inadequate to cater for the additional truck loads.
- The neighbourhood comprising residential buildings, shipyards and school buildings will be directly affected by the proposed haul route.

Option 2 : The delivery trucks will convey the spoil into the Ocean Park via Nam Long Shan Road, and the spoil will then be loaded onto a conveyor belt which connects to the temporary barging point at Tai Shue Wan

- The delivery trucks will have to pass through a 800 metre long section of Nam Long Shan Road which is narrow and winding and only has one traffic lane for two-way traffic. The road section is unable to cope with the anticipated truck loads. The proposed haul route will also pass by three international schools, an elderly home (requiring emergency ambulance service from time to time) and other buildings, which are considered sensitive receivers in the context of environmental issues.
- The Government and the MTRCL had discussions with the Ocean Park on the proposal, and were notified that Nam Long Shan Road is an emergency vehicular access (EVA) for the Ocean Express and the park facilities at the headland of Ocean Park. Having the proposed conveyor belt facility at the location would seriously undermine the EVA's function and seriously affect the evacuation of the Ocean Park's visitors during emergencies.

Option 3: To construct a 2 kilometres long conveyor belt system linking a barging point at Tai Shue Wan and the mucking out points at Nam Fung Path and Wong Chuk Hang

- There is insufficient space within the work sites at Nam Fung Path and Wong Chuk Hang for setting up the conveyor belt system.
- The conveyor belt will follow a winding course along the steep natural slope of Nam Long Shan and will require substantial supporting structures. Construction of the supporting structures would require substantial removal of existing trees and cause great disturbance to the natural terrain of Nam Long Shan, resulting in adverse visual and noise impacts. Operation of the conveyor belt will also seriously affect the Ocean Park, the community at Heung Yip Road and Nam Long Shan Road.
- In fact, after explaining the impacts of this option to the local residents of the Telegraph Bay, they generally concurred with our views that the proposed conveyor belt option is not viable.

The Government and the MTRCL fully appreciate that the local residents would like the setting up of a temporary barging point at Tai Shue Wan be thoroughly considered. However, after discussions with the Ocean Park, there is no possible way to make it a viable alternative.

The MTRCL has taken into account the concerns raised by the local residents and nearby stakeholders and made refinement to the Telegraph Bay barging point proposal accordingly:

Traffic Management – According to the initial findings of the construction traffic impact assessment (CTIA), the proposed temporary barging point at Telegraph Bay would only cause a slight increase to the existing traffic flow along the nearby roads. The increased traffic flow would still be far less than the capacity of existing road network. To address the residents' concerns, the MTRCL has revised that delivery routing of their trucks. Under the current proposal, the trucks would approach the barging point via Victoria Road and Sha Wan Drive and would take the return trip via the Cyberport Road to Pokfulam Road. Such arrangement would reduce the trips on each particular road. Meanwhile, the proposed daily operation period of the delivery trucks would be between 9:00 a.m. and 6:00 p.m. in order to avoid impact on the existing road network during the morning and afternoon peak

hours (to and from works or schools). The barging point would not operate on public holidays.

Safety Concern – The local residents have serious concern on the road safety issues caused by the delivery trucks, especially to the school children from the nearby schools. The MTRCL advised that after reviewing the proposed delivery route, the trucks would no longer travel in the vicinity of the schools near the Telegraph Bay. The future truck traffic operation will be directly monitored by the MTRCL to ensure all safety protocols are adhered to. In fact, the number of trucks of SIL(E) travelling to the temporary barging point at Telegraph Bay will not be more than 200 per day, and the delivery route and allowable speed of the trucks will be stated in the conditions of the contract between the MTRCL and the contractors.

Environmental Impact – MTRCL is now carrying out the environmental impact assessment for the setting up of the two proposed barging points (Lee Nam Road and Telegraph Bay). Mitigation measures such as covered delivery trucks, wheel washing facilities would be proposed. The MTRCL would also explore other materials handling measures in order to minimize the impacts on the environment and traffic.

The MTRCL anticipated the tunnel construction and the site formation of the SIL(E) would generate about 1.5 million cubic metres of excavated materials. The MTRCL thus proposed to establish two temporary barging facilities at seafront locations in the Southern District for proper disposal and reuse of the spoil via marine transport. Lee Nam Road in Ap Lei Chau and at Telegraph Bay are considered suitable locations for setting up temporary barging facilities. If suitable locations cannot be identified to set up two barging points within the Southern District, there would be adverse impact on the overall Southern District traffic during the construction period. The excavated materials arising from the construction work would inevitably be removed by road-based traffic using either Pokfulam Road or Aberdeen Tunnel, then via the Cross Harbour Tunnel to the public fill reception facilities outside the Southern District. This will cause adverse impacts, in particular to the main roads in the Southern District, and result in delay to the construction of SIL(E).

In view of no alternative location to replace the proposed barging point at Telegraph Bay and its location is reasonably distant from its immediate neighbourhood, we are of the view that the current proposal is the best option

after balancing the views of all stakeholders. The Government and the MTRCL will continue to consult the Southern District Council and explain to the stakeholders on the proposed temporary Telegraph Bay barging point, and hope they would understand and accept the scheme.

Mrs. Regina IP's motion: "That this Sub-committee strongly requests the Government and the MTRCL to abort the proposed setting up of a temporary magazine at Chung Hom Shan and to report other feasible alternatives to this Sub-committee as soon as possible."

To suit the SIL(E) works programme, the MTRCL will need to carry out two blasts per day together with other construction methods. Hence, there is a need for a temporary magazine for overnight storage of explosives. The MTRCL after studying of a number of the possible storage sites has proposed to set up a temporary magazine at a remote area at Chung Hom Shan.

In response to the above motion, the Government and the MTRCL has further studied the feasibility to deliver explosives from Kau Shat Wan to Shek O Quarry and to set up a temporary magazine at the quarry. The MTRCL has completed the Quantitative Risk Assessment (QRA) for the proposed temporary magazines at Chung Hom Shan and Shek O Quarry, and the risks associated with the storage and transportation of explosives. The results are as follow.

According to the requirements detailed in Annex 4 of the Technical Memorandum on Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Process to mitigate the risk "As Low As Reasonably Practicable" and the requirements laid down in the EIA Study Brief for the SIL(E) project issued by the Environmental Protection Department, all risks are to be assessed and mitigated by practicable and cost-effective measures, including due consideration to adopt the shortest feasible delivery route. As the delivery distance from the Chung Hom Shan site is shorter than that from the Shek O Quarry site, the proposed magazine site at Chung Hom Shan is more compatible with the EIA Study Brief. The MTRCL will enforce stringent control and safety measures to keep the risks associated with the storage, transportation and use of explosives to the minimum.

The QRA has also revealed that the individual risk and societal risk of the Shek O Quarry site are significantly higher than those of the Chung Hom Shan site. Although the Shek O Quarry is remote from residential areas, it is farther away from the works sites and the distance is about double of that

of the Chung Hom Shan site. Also, part of the delivery route overlaps with that of the Chung Hom Shan site.


Vehicles for transportation of explosives will need to pass by Shek O Road, Tai Tam Road and Stanley Gap Road, which are all narrow and winding. Moreover, the road section on Tai Tam Tuk Reservoir Dam is very narrow and the road width is inadequate to accommodate for two heavy vehicles running in parallel.

The proposed Chung Hom Shan site is about 200 metres from the nearby telecommunication facilities and is about 300 metres from the nearest residential areas with a natural hill in between. Hence, it is considered a suitable location for setting up a temporary magazine site for the SIL(E).

As there is no suitable alternative site to replace the Chung Hom Shan site, the Government and the MTRCL will continue to consult the Southern District on the proposal and explain to the stakeholders the need for overnight storage of a small quantity of explosives to facilitate a blast in the morning. If two blasts per day cannot be achieved, the completion of the SIL(E) would be delayed by about a year.

If the Councilors require any further information, please feel free to contact the undersigned or Mr Vitus NG (Tel: 2762 4088), Senior Engineer of the Highways Department.

Yours faithfully,



(C W Chow)

for Secretary for Transport and Housing

c.c. Director of Highways (Attn.: Mr. Henry C Y CHAN) 2714 5297
MTR Corporation Ltd (Attn.: Ms. C Y Wong) 2798 8822