

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(1)1016/09-10  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/08/1

**Panel on Transport**

**Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

**Extract from minutes of meeting on  
Friday, 4 December 2009, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP  
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP  
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
Hon IP Wai-ming, MH  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
- Members attending** : Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
- Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon WONG Sing-chi

**Public Officers  
attending**

**: Agenda item III**

Mr YAU Shing-mu  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mrs Hedy CHU  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport & Housing

Mr Albert YUEN  
Assistant Commissioner for Transport  
Transport Department

Miss Alice AU YEUNG  
Principal Transport Officer  
Transport Department

Mr K M WOO  
Assistant Director  
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

**Agenda item IV**

Mr YAU Shing-mu  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr C W CHOW  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport & Housing

Mr WAN Man-lung  
Principal Government Engineer/Railway Development  
Highways Department

Mr Henry CHAN Chi-yan  
Government Engineer/Railway Development  
Highways Department

**Attendance by  
invitation**

**: Agenda item III**

MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Jacob KAM  
Head of Operations Engineering

Mr T T CHOI  
Head of Operating

Mr Jeff LEUNG  
Senior Manager - External Affairs

**Agenda item IV**

**MTR Corporation Limited**

Mr Malcolm GIBSON  
Head of Project Engineering

Miss Maggie SO  
Senior Manager - Projects and Property Communications

**Clerk in attendance :** Ms Joanne MAK  
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

**Staff in attendance :** Mr Ken WOO  
Council Secretary (1)2

Miss Winnie CHENG  
Legislative Assistant (1)5

---

**Action**

\* \* \* \* \*

**III Recent railway incidents**

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)309/09-10(01) — Administration's paper on MTR Tseung Kwan O Line Signaling Equipment Fault incident on 9 October 2009 and Tsuen Wan Line Train Fault incident on 10 October 2009
- LC Paper No. CB(1)2607/08-09(01) — Administration's paper on MTR Tseung Kwan O Line signaling equipment fault incident on 21 August 2009

Action

LC Paper No. CB(1)522/09-10(03) — Information note on the notification system of MTRCL prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

LC Paper No. CB(1)522/09-10(04) — Press cuttings on relevant railway incidents)

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

4. Mr IP Wai-ming declared interest as a resident in Po Lam.

5. The Subcommittee was briefed on the following recent railway incidents at the meeting -

(a) Tseung Kwan O Line (TKL) signaling equipment fault incident on 21 August 2009 caused by the fault of a signaling equipment located north of the Tseung Kwan O Station for diverting trains to different locations;

(b) TKL signaling equipment fault incident on 9 October 2009 caused by the fault of a computer electronic control card in the signaling equipment room of the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL); and

(c) Tsuen Wan Line train fault incident on 10 October 2009 caused by the fault of the electricity supply equipment in the driving cab of a train.

6. Members in general expressed grave concerns about the frequency of railway incidents in the past six months and the monitoring mechanism. They questioned if the recent TKL incidents were caused by manpower shortage of MTRCL or the service outsourcing of MTRCL. Some members also considered that the Administration failed to monitor MTRCL's effectiveness in its handling of railway incidents. They considered that the Administration should step up monitoring effort and impose a penalty system on MTRCL, such as issuing warning letters to or imposing fines on MTRCL in case of substandard performance. While some members urged MTRCL to cease service outsourcing, Mr Albert CHAN and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung suggested that a mechanism for pay deductions should be introduced to the senior management staff of MTRCL for penalizing unsatisfactory performance.

7. MTRCL assured members that outsourced maintenance work was subject to the same standards of work and performance and regular checks as

Action

MTR in-house maintenance works. Relevant disciplinary measures were in place within the MTRCL and the overall performance of its management was subject to regular review. The Administration advised that it attached great importance to the maintenance of safety and reliability of the railway services. The Electrical and Mechanical Services Department and the Transport Department were responsible for monitoring the safety and service performance aspects of railway services provided by MTRCL respectively.

8. In response to members' enquiry, MTRCL advised that it had to test and examine the operational impact such as train frequency, equipment reliability and passenger safety of mechanical gap fillers (MGFs) to ensure passenger safety before commencing a study on the installation of such device. MGFs were installed at platforms in Lo Wu Station and the test was completed in mid-October 2009. MTRCL would complete its review in early 2010. Members agreed to follow up on the review outcome and include "Retrofitting of platform screen doors" in the "List of outstanding items for discussion".

Clerk

Admin/  
MTRCL

9. After discussion, the Administration/MTRCL were requested to provide -

- (a) information on railway incidents with delays of 8 minutes or more for the past five years;
- (b) a list of outsourced maintenance works, including those subject to regular inspections and checks by MTR staff; and
- (c) a paper on the incident of a West Rail Line last train departing Hung Hom Station on 29 November 2009 without following appropriate hand signal and whether there were any safety implications.

MTRCL

Mr Andrew CHENG further requested MTRCL to update the information on railway incidents with delays of 8 minutes or more each time when railway incidents were discussed by the Subcommittee. The Chairman requested MTRCL to follow up.

\* \* \* \* \*

## Panel on Transport

## Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting  
on Friday, 4 December 2009, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
* * * * *			
<i>Agenda item III – Recent railway incidents</i>			
000604 – 002056	Chairman MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL)	Powerpoint presentation on recent railway incidents.	
002057 – 002740	Mr Jeffrey LAM MTRCL	<p>Mr Jeffrey LAM's concerns on recent accidents involving platform gap and the result of the mechanical gap fillers (MGFs) trial, and his query on a recent incident where the door of a driving cab was left open and unattended.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) measures were in place to minimize accidents relating to platform gap, including the insertion of plastic strips to narrow down the gap, flashing lights from below the gap, protruding yellow lines on the ground, wailing of siren as the train doors close, CCTV surveillance, and live broadcast;</p> <p>(b) test data for MGFs trial were being analyzed and assessment was expected to complete in early 2010; and</p> <p>(c) the incident concerning the driving cab door had been looked into and appropriate disciplinary action taken.</p>	
002741 – 003528	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing's concern on the inadequate monitoring the Administration had on the MTRCL, and his queries on the maintenance responsibility of the faulty devices involved in recent incidents and the recent incident on train departure without following appropriate signal.</p> <p>The Administration's response that the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (EMSD) and the Transport Department monitored the MTRCL in respect of safety operation and reporting/notification respectively according to established mechanism. A rising trend in railway incidents was not detected.</p> <p>The MTRCL's explanation that the incident concerning the departure of a last train without following appropriate hand signal at the West Rail Line - Hung Hom Station on 29 November 2009 was caused by a misinterpretation of a hand signal by the driver concerned; an additional train service was arranged as a remedial action.</p>	

<p>003529 – 004038</p>	<p>Ms LI Fung-ying Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Ms LI Fung-ying's view that railway incidents might have to do with the outsourcing of maintenance activities by MTRCL, and her request for the Administration to step up monitoring of the MTRCL's service standard.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response that outsourced workers were mainly deployed for daily maintenance activities, while emergency maintenance and major maintenance on spot and at the depot would be carried out by MTR staff.</p>	
<p>004039 – 004556</p>	<p>Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming MTRCL Administration</p>	<p>Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming's comments -</p> <p>(a) whether the recent Tsueng Kwan O Line (TKL) incidents were attributable to manpower shortage or the outsourcing of work; and</p> <p>(b) whether the Administration would step up monitoring of MTRCL.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) regular maintenance had been in place to ensure proper functioning of the railway system, which measured at 99.9% in terms of service reliability; and</p> <p>(b) manpower employed by the MTRCL had been increased subsequent to the conversion of the Tseung Kwan O Station into an interchange.</p> <p>The Administration's response that an established mechanism and stringent requirements had been set out to ensure safe operation of the railway and efficient emergency and supporting services in times of incidents. There was no evidence of any decline in service level.</p>	
<p>004557 – 005250</p>	<p>Mr IP Wai-ming Administration Chairman MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr IP Wai-ming's concerns -</p> <p>(a) ineffective dissemination of information to affected passengers during recent TKL incidents; and</p> <p>(b) there was a need for re-evaluation of the "3+1" service pattern (an existing arrangement that for trains from North Point during peak hours, the first three out of every four trains would terminate at Po Lam Station while the fourth train would terminate at LOHAS Park Station).</p> <p>The Administration's response that there was no revelation on the degrading of the service level of the TKL after the commissioning of the LOHAS Park Station.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response that, for the signalling equipment fault incident occurred on 9 October 2009, MTRCL had issued Amber and later Red Alerts and arranged for emergency buses to serve the affected passengers. The buses arrived at the Tiu Keng Leng Station at 7 pm and provided half an hour service, with 100 passengers served.</p>	

005251 – 005805	Mr Andrew CHENG Chairman MTRCL	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's request for information on railway incidents for the last five years.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) some 3,000 minutes delay among 0.4 billion minutes of operations in the last five years were recorded; relevant updated information would be provided accordingly; and</p> <p>(b) the faulty parts associated with the recent TKL incidents had been included for daily maintenance instead of major maintenance.</p>	<b>MTRCL to provide information.</b> <b>(para. 9 of minutes)</b>
005806 – 010412	Ir Dr Raymond HO Administration MTRCL	<p>Ir Dr Raymond HO's views that monitoring was inadequate on the part of the Administration on MTRCL due to a lack of railway expertise.</p> <p>The Administration's response that a wide spectrum of engineering expertises were available within the EMSD in the proper monitoring of MTRCL's operations and maintenance work.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response that a proper mechanism had been in place to monitor the performance of outsourced contractors.</p>	
010413 – 010940	Mr Albert CHAN Administration	<p>Mr Albert CHAN's request for the Administration to review its monitoring regimes on the MTRCL and his suggestion that a mechanism on pay deduction be introduced to the senior management of the MTRCL for unsatisfactory performance.</p>	
010941 – 011458	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's suggestion for the MTRCL management to set out performance targets and have their pay deducted in case of failure to achieve the targets.</p> <p>The Administration's response that clear performance targets had been set out in the service agreement between the Administration and the MTRCL, and that the MTRCL had outperformed the targets in 2008.</p>	
011459 – 012026	Mr LAU Kong-wah MTRCL	<p>Mr LAU Kong-wah's query on the preliminary findings of the MGFs trial and his concern on the possible injuries to be caused by the level difference between the platform and the train car.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response -</p> <p>(a) trains running on the East Rail Line would need to stay for 15 to 20 seconds longer at each platform with the MGFs retrofitted; the signalling system and the functionality of trains were being studied to complement the time issue; assessment of the trial was expected to complete in early 2010; and</p> <p>(b) trains would be adjusted automatically to suit the ground level of the platform within a minute; passengers would continue to be reminded to mind the</p>	



		platform gap.	
012027 – 012323	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing's request that a paper on the incident concerning the departure of a train without following appropriate hand signal on 29 November 2009 be provided, and his criticism of the Administration for the ineffective monitoring.</p> <p>The Administration's clarification that the driver did not follow a manual indication on whether all passengers had boarded the train. It did not affect safety.</p>	
012324 – 012539	Mr IP Wai-ming MTRCL	<p>Mr IP Wai-ming's queries on the "3+1" service pattern and the possible safety implication with such pattern.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response that the existing arrangement had effectively catered for the passenger load during rush hours. Recent incidents were not linked to the "3+1" arrangement.</p>	
012540 – 012940	Mr Andrew CHENG Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's requests for update of the information on railway incidents with delays of 8 minutes or more and further discussion on platform screen doors by the Subcommittee.</p> <p>The Chairman's request for MTRCL to prepare the requested information and provide a paper on the incident concerning a last train departing the West Rail Line - Hung Hom Station on 29 November 2009 without following appropriate hand signal.</p>	<b>MTRCL to provide information. (para. 9 of minutes)</b>

\* \* \* \* \*