

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1274/09-10
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/08

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting
held on Friday, 22 January 2010, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon LEE Wing-tat (Deputy Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Members absent : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon WONG Yuk-man

Action

Dr Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Public Officers attending : Home Affairs Bureau

Mr TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

Miss Cathy CHU, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

Mr Danny LAU
Principal Assistant Secretary
(West Kowloon Cultural District)

Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Philip YUNG Wai-hung, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)1

Highways Department

Mr HO Wai-fu
Government Engineer (Railway Development)

Transport Department

Mr David TO
Assistant Commissioner (Planning)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Augustine NG
Project Director

Mass Transit Railway Corporation Limited

Mr Frank YUEN
Design Manager (Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express
Rail Link)

Clerk in attendance : Ms Betty FONG
Chief Council Secretary (2)2

Action

Staff in attendance : Miss Vivien POON
Senior Council Secretary (2)2

Miss Amy WONG
Legislative Assistant (2)2

Miss Monique TSEUNG
Clerical Assistant (2)2

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes

[LC Paper No. CB(2)780/09-10]

The minutes of the meeting held on 4 December 2009 were confirmed.

2. The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

II. Meeting with the Administration and representatives of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

LC Paper No. CB(2)785/09-10(01) -- Paper provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(2)785/09-10(02) -- A summary of discussions relating to the impact of the West Kowloon Terminus ("WKT") of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") on the development of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

Interface with the XRL project

3. Members noted that although Phase I of the WKCD development and the XRL-WKT were both scheduled for completion in 2015, the commencement of the former would hinge directly upon the timely handover of the temporary works sites at WKCD by the latter. Given such a constraint, members were worried that the development of WKCD would give way to XRL-WKT. Mr LEE Wing-tat further pointed out that the very tight development schedule of the two projects had failed to allow any room for contingency, such as possible slippage of the XRL-WKT project due to complications arising during the excavation works. He expressed concern as to whether the WKCD facilities could be completed within the intended timeframe in 2015. In the light of this concern, members urged the Administration to put in place a

Action

standing mechanism for regular communication and liaison between the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") and the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") with a view to ensuring better interface between the two projects, and to state clearly in the tender and contract documents the liability of the relevant parties in the event of work slippage arising from various interface problems.

4. The Administration responded that -

- (a) to ensure the smooth commissioning of the developments in WKCD and XRL-WKT, the Highways Department ("HyD") and MTRCL had maintained close liaison with the WKCD over matters concerning the interface between the two projects, including the progress of the projects, the design report of the WKT, as well as the area, size and occupation duration of any works sites within the WKCD required for the XRL project. In addition, a standing inter-departmental coordinating committee had been established, with participation of representatives from the relevant bureaux/departments, WKCD and MTRCL, to discuss and coordinate the planning and construction of the WKCD and its nearby infrastructural projects (including the XRL project). WKCD had also briefed the prospective Conceptual Plan Consultants and Project Consultant on information relating to the extension of the WKT into the WKCD during the tender exercise, and had from time to time arranged meetings to update the three Conceptual Plan Consultants and Project Consultant with the latest information on the planning and design of XRL after their appointment; and
- (b) the Government and local engineering/construction industry had ample experience in implementing large-scale projects involving complex interface and contract management issues. In accordance with the current timeframe, the excavation works of XRL-WKT should be substantially completed when the construction works of the WKCD commenced in early 2013. With the concerted efforts of WKCD, the XRL project team and the relevant government bureaux/departments, the timely completion of the two projects in 2015 should be attainable.

Traffic improvement works in the West Kowloon district

5. Referring to the Final Report of the West Kowloon Reclamation Development Traffic Study ("the Final Report") which set out the traffic improvement schemes to cope with the increasing traffic and pedestrian flow arising from developments in the West Kowloon Reclamation Areas, including WKCD and WKT, Ms Cyd HO requested the Administration to provide an estimate on the pedestrian and traffic flow generated by the future WKCD if the seating capacities of its arts and cultural facilities were fully occupied, and a breakdown of traffic improvement measures to cope with the anticipated increase in traffic flow generated by commissioning of the WKCD facilities and WKT. She considered that such information would enable the public to

Action

better understand the actual cost for the respective projects. Members also urged the Administration to ensure the adequacy and timely completion of infrastructural works for supporting the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD.

6. The Administration responded that -

- (a) the traffic improvement measures as recommended in the West Kowloon Reclamation Development Traffic Study ("the Study") were planned to address the traffic problems for the entire West Kowloon district (including the increasing traffic generated by the development of WKCD and XRL-WKT). The infrastructural works so built were regarded as communal facilities in accordance with standing practice adopted in the planning and budgeting of highway projects;
- (b) the core improvement schemes recommended in the Study (including the Lin Cheung Road – Austin Road West Underpass, seven footbridges and two subways at WKT) were structurally connected with WKT, and would be undertaken in conjunction with the XRL project. Details of these and other improvement schemes and their construction timetables were set out in the Study Report. Most of these improvement works (except for the Canton Road Underpass) would be in place by 2015, and should provide immediate relief to the traffic pressure in the district upon their completion; and
- (c) for information on the likely traffic volume to be generated by the future developments in the West Kowloon district (including the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD), reference could be made to Table 7.30 of the Final Report. The Table showed the future trip generations for different kinds of developments in the district at different times of a day and different days of a week.

7. In response to Ms Cyd HO's enquiry as to whether the public consultation on the transport arrangements to WKCD had included the XRL-WKT factor, the Administration advised that reference had been made to WKT in the Consultation Leaflet for the Stage 1 Public Engagement ("PE") exercise for the WKCD. The Administration also confirmed the Chairman's understanding that the budget for external infrastructural works relating to WKCD would be covered by separate funding under the Public Works Programmes.

Pedestrian linkages with the adjacent districts

8. Ms Starry LEE stressed the need to provide convenient and comfortable pedestrian connections between XRL-WKT and its adjacent districts/other major transport interchanges. She hoped that the Administration could expedite the

Action

construction of these linkages which was vital for the revitalization of old districts in West Kowloon. Professor Patrick LAU enquired about the linkage between WKT and the Austin Station.

9. The Administration responded that upon the completion of XRL, WKT would be developed into a new railway hub, with linkage to the Kowloon Station of the Airport Express and the Austin Station of the West Rail Line through at-grade pedestrian plaza, a number of footbridges and pedestrian subways. The Kowloon Station would be some eight to 10 minutes' walk from the XRL Terminus, while it would take about two to three minutes to walk from the Terminus to Austin Station. Travelators, escalators and lifts would be installed for most of these footbridges and subways to provide barrier-free access for the public. As regards members' concern about the pedestrian connection to the Jordan Station, the Administration advised that it would further study the feasibility of the Bowring Street link, which, based on the existing preliminary engineering information available, was the most preferred option in terms of technical feasibility, direct connectivity and cost effectiveness.

Marine transport to WKCD

10. Mr WONG Yung-kan enquired about the provision of marine transport linkage in WKCD, including measures to overcome the strong waves in the delivery of such service. The Administration responded that upon the recommendation of the WKCDA and the availability of further details from the consultants working on WKCD, the Transport Department and Marine Department would consider issues relating to the provision of such service, such as the scope and mode of its operation, the management of ferry terminals, and safety issues concerning the operation of passenger vessels in the surrounding waters. Moreover, the Conceptual Plan Consultants of the WKCDA were mindful of the need to strengthen WKCD's marine transport linkage in drawing up the future development plan of WKCD.

Noise and vibration mitigation measures

11. Mr LEE Wing-tat highlighted the needs to install adequate noise and vibration mitigation devices in the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD, if they were to be built on top of the WKT, and to engage independent specialists in assessing the effectiveness of these mitigating measures.

12. According to the Administration, the environmental impact assessment revealed that the residual ground borne noise induced by the operation of XRL-WKT would comply with the requirement stipulated under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (Cap.499) and the Noise Control Ordinance (Cap.400), as the design of the XRL had adopted vibration mitigation system (isolated slab track). Depending on the selected Conceptual Plan for the WKCD, if arts and cultural facilities were to be built on top of the WKT, the installation of appropriate vibration and noise mitigation devices in those facilities would comply with the relevant standards. Based on the assessment of the relevant consultants, the current target for the completion of Phase 1

Action

arts and cultural facilities in WKCD by 2015 (including construction works above WKT and the testing of the acoustic in the relevant facilities) should be achievable.

Other issues related to WKT

13. Members raised further questions/suggestions on the following issues relating to WKT: (a) integration of the design of WKT with WKCD and its adjacent environment; (b) measures to mitigate the environmental nuisance generated by the construction of WKT, which would affect programmes/activities conducted at the open space in the WKCD site; and (c) whether the Administration would moderate the development of the retail, dining and entertainment ("RDE") facilities in WKCD and XRL-WKT to avoid over-competition among these facilities, taking into account that WKCD was to ensure the financial sustainability of the operation of the arts and cultural facilities through the revenue generated by its RDE facilities.

14. The Administration advised that -

- (a) according to the information provided by MTRCL, the design of WKT would be subdued and neutral so that it would be able to blend in well with the adjacent developments, including the WKCD. WKCD's Conceptual Plan Consultants would also ensure the integration of WKCD with its environment, especially the harbourfront, in the design of the Conceptual Plan Options. Three-dimensional models would be used to present the relationship between WKCD and its adjacent infrastructures when public views on the three Conceptual Plan Options were sought in Stage Two PE exercise to be conducted in mid-2010;
- (b) prior to the construction of the WKCD, temporary programmes/activities would be held at the western part of the WKCD site which was separated from the WKT works areas in the east by an extensive buffer area. The construction works of XRL-WKT would be conducted in compliance with the relevant environmental legislation; and
- (c) the development of leisure and shopping facilities in WKCD and WKT would be subject to the approved planning parameters and provisions of the relevant Outline Zoning Plan. Moreover, the RDE facilities in WKCD would be implemented by phases, whereas those in WKT would serve mainly as ancillary facilities, and it was not the Government's intention to interfere with the operations of these commercial facilities.

Action

Appointment of Chief Executive Officer

15. Dr LAM Tai-fai enquired about the progress in the appointment of the Chief Executive Officer. In his view, the incumbent should be in place as soon as possible to oversee the coordination work in the development of WKCD and WKT. Mrs Regina IP asked how the Administration would ensure that the incumbent would be able to develop a working knowledge of the local culture, if a non-local candidate was appointed.

16. The Administration advised that while the global search for the Chief Executive Officer had reached its final stage, a decision had yet to be made. The selected candidate would assist the WKCD Board in taking forward the WKCD project based on the Government's cultural policy.

Cultural vision for Hong Kong

17. Mrs Regina IP expressed concern about the over-provision of cultural facilities upon the completion of WKCD, and asked the Administration for the estimated number of visitors from the Pearl Delta Region, overseas and the local community. She considered that the Administration should make more effort in identifying the unique features and characteristics of the local culture, for the development of a clear cultural vision and position for Hong Kong. Mrs Sophie LEUNG on the other hand considered that the Administration should adopt an open and accommodating attitude in the development of arts and culture.

18. SHA responded that -

- (a) the strategic objective of WKCD was to draw visitors beyond Hong Kong, particularly from the Pearl Delta Region and southern part of China. The estimated patronage to WKCD as requested by members would be available upon the completion of the consultancy studies on Market Analysis for the Performing Arts Facilities and the Museum; and
- (b) while Hong Kong could capitalise on the advantages of being both the convergent point of the eastern and western culture and an integral part of the Chinese culture in the development of its cultural position, it was the Government's policy to promote the freedom of artistic expression with a view to developing a vibrant and pluralistic arts and cultural scene in the local community.

Follow-up actions

19. Upon members' requests, the Administration agreed to provide information papers on the following subjects -

Action

- (a) analysis of financial viability of RDE facilities at WKCD in the context of concurrent operation of similar facilities in the WKT development;
- (b) plot ratios for developments at WKCD, as well as those on top of the XRL-WKT and the Austin Station; and
- (c) development timetables of the WKCD and WKT projects, including further details on the interface between the two projects at various construction stages, and a timeframe on the construction and implementation of pedestrian and traffic improvement schemes in relation to the WKCD development.

Admin &
WKCD

Meeting arrangements

20. Members agreed that the next meeting of the Joint Subcommittee should discuss the Report on Stage One PE exercise for the WKCD project and the development of cultural software to complement the project, on a date to be fixed with the Administration. Members also requested the attendance of the new CEO, if appointed, at the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: Members were informed vide CB(2)896/09-10 that the next meeting with the Administration would be held on 16 April 2010.)

III. Any other business

21. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:43 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 April 2010

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project
on Friday, 22 January 2010, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000001– 001159	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes [LC Paper No. CB(2)780/09-10] Opening remarks	
001200 – 001505	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(2)785/09-10(01)]	
001506 – 002049	Chairman Dr LAM Tai-fai Admin WKCDA	Communication channels between the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") and project team of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") for smooth coordination and interface between West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") and XRL projects; appointment of the Chief Executive Officer	
002050 – 002804	Chairman Mrs Regina IP Admin	Estimated patronage for WKCD facilities; the need to identify a clear cultural vision and position for Hong Kong	
002805 – 004206	Chairman Ms Cyd HO Admin	Monitoring of public expenditure on traffic improvement schemes relating to WKCD and XRL projects	
004207 – 004602	Chairman Mrs Sophie LEUNG Admin	Suggestion to adopt a more open attitude towards cultural positioning	
004603 – 005254	Chairman Mr WONG Yung-kan Admin	Planning of marine transport linkage to connect WKCD with other parts of Hong Kong	
005255 – 005846	Chairman Ms Starry LEE Admin	Provision of pedestrian connections between the West Kowloon Terminus ("WKT") of the XRL and its adjacent districts/transport interchanges	
005847 – 010821	Chairman Mr LEE Wing-tat WKCDA	Interface issues between WKCD and XRL-WKT; impact of the XRL-WKT on the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
010822 – 011546	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che Admin WKCD	Drafting of tender/contract documents for WKCD and WKT projects to cater for possible claims arising from project delay; the establishment of a coordinated mechanism for handling complaints relating to the two projects	
011547 -012631	Chairman Mr James TO Admin WKCD	Interface problems between WKCD and XRL-WKT; noise and vibration mitigation measures required and funding to cover such cost; planning of retail, dining and entertainment facilities in WKCD and its vicinity	
012632 – 013113	Chairman Dr Raymond HO WKCD	Local experience in implementing mega works projects with complicated interface and contract management issues; requirement and cost of noise and vibration mitigation facilities	
013114 – 013407	Chairman Admin	Integration of designs for the WKT and WKCD projects; provision of Government funding to support the infrastructural works relating to WKCD	
013408 – 014232	Chairman Prof Patrick LAU WKCD Admin	Presentation on WKCD's relationship with the surrounding infrastructural projects and environment; linkage between WKT and Austin Station; planning parameters for WKCD and developments on top of WKT and Austin Station	
014233 – 014832	Chairman Ms Cyd HO Admin	Public consultation on transport access to WKCD in Stage One Public Engagement exercise; request for timetable on implementation of traffic improvement schemes to complement the WKCD project	
014833 – 015537	Chairman Mr LEE Wing-tat WKCD	Request further details on interface arrangements between the WKCD and WKT at various project stages; impact of XRL-WKT on the use of open space at WKCD	
015538 – 015919	Chairman Admin Mr LEE Wing-tat	Arrangements for next meeting; request for information papers as set out in paragraph 19 of the minutes	Admin & WKCD to provide papers

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
 12 April 2010