

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)691/10-11
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/08

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting
held on Monday, 20 September 2010, at 2:30 pm
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Professor Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun
Dr Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon WONG Yuk-man

Members attending : Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

Action

Members absent : Hon LEE Wing-tat (Deputy Chairman)
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

Public Officers attending : Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Raymond YOUNG, JP
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Graham Sheffield
Chief Executive Officer

Dr CHAN Man-wai
Project Delivery Executive Director

Mr Louis YU
Performing Arts Policy & Management Services
Executive Director

Foster + Partners

Mr Colin Ward
Partner

Mr Kevin CHAN
Architect

Rocco Design Architects Limited

Mr Rocco YIM
Executive Director

Mr William TAM
Director

Office for Metropolitan Architecture

Mr David Gianotten
General Manager - Architect OMA Asia

Action

Ms Betty NG
Architect

Clerk in attendance : Ms Betty FONG
Chief Council Secretary (2)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Vivien POON
Council Secretary (2)2

Miss Cerry YU
Legislative Assistant (2)2

Miss Monique TSEUNG
Clerical Assistant (2)2

Action

I. Meeting with the Chief Executive Officer and other senior executives of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

LC Paper No. CB(2)2257/09-10(01) -- Paper provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. FS06(01)/09-10 -- Summary of local press reports on the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") project from 16 April to 14 September 2010 prepared by Research and Library Services Division of the Legislative Council ("LegCo") Secretariat

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs ("PSHA") gave a general introduction on the latest development of the WKCD project. The Chief Executive Officer ("CEO") of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") then briefed members on his vision for WKCD, the role of WKCD and the priority of WKCDA. This was followed by the presentation of the three

Action

Conceptual Plans ("CPs") by the respective CP Consultants (viz. Foster + Partners ("F&P"), Rocco Design Architects Limited ("RDA"), and Office for Metropolitan Architecture ("OMA")).

Discussion with the CP Consultants

3. Key issues/questions raised by members are summarized below -
 - (a) how the CP Consultants would cater for the needs of the local community in their respective plans;
 - (b) factors to be considered in merging the desirable features of the three CPs into the Development Plan;
 - (c) how WKCD should be designed and managed so that the public at large could enjoy the facilities in the district;
 - (d) whether the development cost of WKCD could be kept within the \$21.6 billion upfront endowment despite the anticipated escalation in construction costs; and
 - (e) whether the proposals for opening up public spaces at WKCD for various forms of leisure activities and artistic performances would contravene the stringent provisions in the current legislation.

4. Key responses of the CP Consultants are set out follows -
 - (a) all the proposed CPs were formulated within the approved budget and underpinned by the aspiration of the Hong Kong people;
 - (b) there was an overwhelming support from the community for more public open spaces, where people could have free admission and expression, in the design of WKCD;
 - (c) the facilities and open spaces in WKCD were planned for the enjoyment of people of different backgrounds; and free admission to these venues would facilitate the building of patronage for WKCD;
 - (d) the proposed design and activities in these open spaces might open up possibilities for more flexible use of open spaces in future; and

Action

- (e) crucial factors for merging the desirable features of the three CPs included the existence of an overriding and predominately strong concept; compatibility of concepts and designs among these features; and close collaboration among the three CP Consultants;

Discussion with the CEO

5. Key issues/questions raised by members are summarized as below -
- (a) the Administration should respect WKCDA's autonomy as the management of arts and cultural institutions was a highly specialized and professional task;
 - (b) WKCDA should initiate in-depth dialogues with the arts and cultural community with a view to formulating a clear direction for Hong Kong's cultural development;
 - (c) an accountability system to ensure the effective implementation of strategies and measures for the development of the arts and culture should be introduced;
 - (d) the construction of WKCD should bring about employment opportunities for local professionals and workers, as well as benefit the small to medium sized enterprises;
 - (e) WKCDA should actively engage district groups and stakeholders in the public engagement ("PE") exercise to ensure wide public support for the proposals put forward by the CPs;
 - (f) the Administration/WKCDA should take immediate action and collaborate with the Education Bureau and relevant organizations to promote the development of arts education, with a view to cultivating an audience/consumer base for the WKCD facilities, and in turn encouraging investments in cultural enterprises;
 - (g) the CEO should capitalize on his experience to formulate a clear cultural direction for Hong Kong, and take the full accountability for the promotion of the arts and culture in steering the work of WKCDA;
 - (h) how the CEO would apply his past experience in taking forward the WKCD project; and

Action

- (i) how the CEO would help the community reach a consensus over the development of WKCD in the face of the divergent views expressed in the PE exercises.
6. Key responses of the CEO and the Administration are set out as follows -
- (a) WKCD played a vital role in promoting the quality of life for the people of Hong Kong by serving their needs in arts and culture;
 - (b) the Administration would give due regard to the autonomy of WKCD and provide necessary support to the Authority in the development of WKCD;
 - (c) with the CEO's experience as the former Artistic Director of London Barbican Center in London, WKCD would help the fulfillment of the vision of developing WKCD into a place of vibrancy and diversity, and one that served the community and operated on a self-sustainable basis;
 - (d) the building of strong connectivity (such as transport links) within and beyond WKCD, and active engagement of district groups were crucial elements in the development of WKCD;
 - (e) the objective of the PE exercise was to listen to different views on the development of WKCD for the preparation of a Development Plan which reflected broadly these public views;
 - (f) WKCD had initiated dialogues with the arts and cultural community and relevant stakeholders with a view to fostering a close partnership in taking forward the WKCD project;
 - (g) the management of open spaces in WKCD would fall within the remit of WKCD, which allowed flexibility in the usage of public open spaces in WKCD;
 - (h) the Home Affairs Bureau would work in partnership with the Education Bureau, the Leisure and Cultural Services Department, WKCD and relevant organizations on the promotion of arts education; and the CEO would soon meet with the Education Bureau and stakeholders concerned to discuss collaborative measures in the promotion of arts education in the development of WKCD; and

Action

- (i) with the arts and culture becoming a global business, WKCDA would engage talents from around the world who might eventually help train up local experts. The WKCD project should provide ample employment opportunities for local construction/service industries.

7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:40 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
30 December 2010

J:\cb2\BC\TEAM2\HA\09-10\PS2-Joint-SC\Minutes\wkcd0920-min-e.doc

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project
on Monday, 20 September 2010, at 2:30 pm
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000001 - 000605	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000606 - 001854	Chairman Admin WKCDA Mr Alan LEONG	<p>Report of latest progress of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") development: the new management team was progressively in place; and a three-month public consultation on the three Conceptual Plans ("CP") (viz. Stage 2 of the Public Engagement ("PE") exercise) was launched on 20 August 2010.</p> <p><u>Briefing by Chief Executive Officer ("CEO") of West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA")</u></p> <p>WKCD development offered an unprecedented opportunity for the cultural development in Hong Kong and was destined to transform the reputation, profile and standing of Hong Kong internationally in the broad fields of arts and culture and creative learning, in addition to its positive impacts on the tourism industry, employment in the arts sector and creative industry.</p> <p>(a) Vision for WKCD: to be a leader in the world's arts and culture dedicated to the highest standards of performances, exhibitions and services. This vision was to be achieved by building the finest and the most flexible formal and informal arts spaces to serve the needs of the community, as well as local and international artists; putting together creative learning and active engagement and participation at the heart of all activities in WKCD; recruiting and training a team of highly professional and motivated staff to respond to the needs of the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>public and the arts community; and fostering a strong partnership with commercial/arts sectors to develop strategies on retail, dining and entertainment ("RDE") at WKCD for the generation of sustainable sources of income.</p> <p>(b) WKCDA's role: as the cultural ambassador for Hong Kong committed to facilitating artists and arts companies to realize their full potential in a supportive environment; and developing in partnership with the arts/education communities comprehensive programmes of learning and participation activities for people of all backgrounds.</p> <p>(c) WKCDA's priorities: to expedite the development of hardware, as well as complementary software for WKCD, including using WKCD as a platform for building arts audience of the future; promote arts education as a learning experience for life; and building up a strong and coherent team to take forward the WKCD project.</p>	
001855 - 003539	<p>Chairman Foster + Partners ("F+P") Mr James TO Dr Priscilla LEUNG</p>	<p><u>Presentation and discussion on Conceptual Plans ("CPs")</u></p> <p><u>Highlights of Powerpoint & movie presentation by F+P titled "City Park"</u> [LC Paper No. CB(2) 2303/09-10 (01)]</p> <p>(a) urban forest: development of a unique City Park at WKCD to provide "new lungs" for Hong Kong and a place to relax and have fun like the Central Park in New York;</p> <p>(b) integration: arts and cultural clusters in WKCD would be embedded in a rich city fabric of shops, cafes and hotels;</p> <p>(c) connectivity: WKCD would be an extension of Kowloon, well-connected with the adjacent districts and major transportation gateways and networks;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(d) zero-carbon design: WKCD would become the world's first carbon neutral cultural quarter with traffic kept below ground; and</p> <p>(e) flexible master plan: the proposed design would be capable of adapting to future developments and yielding extra 29 000 square meters of open space to propagate homegrown arts and culture.</p>	
003540 - 004900	Chairman Rocco Architects ("RDA") Design Limited	<p><u>Highlights of Powerpoint presentation by RDA titled "Cultural Connect"</u> [LC Paper No. CB(2) 2303/09- 10(03)]</p> <p>(a) WKCD would establish an un-impeded cultural-urban field that ensured fluidity and connectivity (viz. connectivity between art forms, life and culture, space and movement, inside and outside, arts and community, Hong Kong, China and overseas);</p> <p>(b) the design of WKCD, which was organized into the green terrain, the city link and the cultural core, would allow plenty open spaces for various forms of activities, as well as flexibility to accommodate the new requirements in respect of the cultural facilities in future; and</p> <p>(c) to generate energy which was conducive to a spirit of exploration and discovery, the master plan did not solely emphasize on architectural icons, but also highlighted the importance of streets, squares, black boxes embedded in the urban fabric. It also broke the district's isolation by forging pedestrians and transportation links to/from different directions.</p>	
004901 - 010229	Chairman Office for Metropolitan Architecture ("OMA")	<p><u>Highlights of Powerpoint & movie presentation by OMA titled "Project for a New Dimension"</u> [LC Paper No. CB(2)2303/09-10 (02)]</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(a) village model: WKCD would be organized into three centres of activity or "villages" each with a unique cultural identity emphasizing on sustainability, connectivity and accessibility;</p> <p>(b) interactive arts: arts production, appreciation and education would take place in the interactive setting of villages to engender cross-fertilization of different art forms. To create additional space for these interactive facilities, not all of the facilities stipulated in the brief for CP Consultants were proposed for construction;</p> <p>(c) landscape of parks: WKCD's landscape of parks would be linked with Kowloon Park to give a total of 51 hectares of green space for public enjoyment; and</p> <p>(d) injecting local cultural flavor – a Film Premier Theater was proposed for construction to highlight film as an integral part of the local culture.</p>	
010230 - 011402	<p>Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mr James TO F + P RDA OMA</p>	<p>Mr James TO sought the CP Consultants' views on the extent to which the desirable features of the three CPs could be merged into one plan.</p> <p>F + P: in order to take on the desirable features of other two plans, there should be an overriding and predominately strong concept in the selected plan.</p> <p>RDA: compatibility of concepts and designs was a crucial consideration in the merging of the desirable features of the three plans.</p> <p>OMA: the CP delivered by OMA could serve as a base plan to incorporate the desirable features of the other two plans, and this should be achieved through the collaboration among the three CP Consultants.</p> <p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG enquired as to how the CP Consultants would articulate their design concepts into more concrete plans,</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>and cater for the needs of the local community in their respective plans. She further asked about: (a) the duration and cost to plant the massive canopy of trees as proposed by F + P, and the bearing of local culture in its plan; (b) RDA's strategy to ensure coherence among the flexibly designed arts facilities and open spaces; and (c) the feasibility of OMA's design concepts/proposals relating to the RDE facilities and relaxation activities at the waterfront.</p> <p>F + P: the estimated cost for the WKCD development (including the proposed canopy of trees) was within the prescribed budget; and it would take about five years for the development of an abundant canopy of trees in WKCD.</p> <p>RDA: to achieve coherent design among the diversified art spaces, it would be useful to have specifications/guidelines on building height, building materials, and color schemes.</p> <p>OMA: RDE facilities and relaxation activities at the waterfront were proposed, drawing from the experiences at different parts of the world. These facilities and activities were to cater for the needs of people of different backgrounds.</p>	
011403 - 011913	Chairman Ms Emily LAU RDA OMA F + P	<p>Ms Emily LAU expressed concern that (a) WKCD might become an exclusive playground for high-end consumption/a lucrative project for private developers; and (b) water-taxis might not be the most affordable means of transport for patrons of the Xiqu Center. She sought the views of the CP Consultants as to how WKCD should be managed so that the public in large could enjoy the facilities in the district.</p> <p>RDA: the provision of facilities and open spaces with free admission would facilitate the building of patronage for WKCD;</p> <p>OMA: a management team should be put in place along side with the development of the facilities at WKCD, so as to decide on whether a policy to ensure wide public access to activities in WKCD should be</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>pursued; the proposal for the water taxis was intended to offer an additional means of transport for patrons of the Xiqu Center.</p> <p>F+P: all the proposed CPs were underpinned by the aspiration of the Hong Kong people, and designed with the public interest in mind. WKCD would be a place for all Hong Kong people.</p>	
011914 - 012459	<p>Chairman Mr Alan LEONG OMA F + P RDA</p>	<p>Mr Alan LEONG sought the views of the CP Consultants on: (a) whether the costs for the development of WKCD could be kept within the \$21.6 billion upfront endowment despite the anticipated escalation in construction costs; and (b) the disclosure of the financial and technical details for the development of WKCD under their respective CPs.</p> <p>CP Consultants advised that: (a) given the development of WKCD would be conducted by phases, the revenue generated from RDE rental and cultural activities, as well as the investment income should enable WKCD to operate on a self-sustainable basis according to their financial assessment; and (b) it was for WKCD to decide as to whether they could disclose the financial and technical details.</p>	
012500- 012837	<p>Chairman Mr WONG Yuk man Miss Tanya CHAN OMA</p>	<p>Extension of meeting according to House Rule 24A(a).</p> <p>In response to Miss Tanya CHAN, OMA advised that they noted the findings in the "Final Report on Market Analysis of Performing Arts Venues of WKCD" issued on 28 April 2010 in making the financial assessment for the WKCD development.</p>	
012838 - 013234	<p>Chairman Ms Cyd HO RDA F + P</p>	<p>On the Consultant's proposals for opening up the streets and public spaces at WKCD for various forms of leisure activities and artistic performances, Ms Cyd HO was worried that such proposals might contravene the stringent provisions in the relevant legislation.</p> <p>F + P advised that there was an overwhelming support from the community for more public open spaces, where people could have free admission and expression, in the design of WKCD. RDA and F + P advised that the proposed design and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		activities in these open spaces might open up possibilities for more flexible use of open spaces in future.	
013235 - 013912	Chairman Mr WONG Yuk-man WKCD	<p><u>Discussion with CEO (WKCD)</u></p> <p>Mr WONG Yuk-man expressed concern that WKCD might turn out to be a "white elephant" or a playground for the privileged. He considered that the resources could be better utilized to address more urgent social needs, such as construction of public housing. Mr WONG echoed Ms Cyd HO's concern that public funding to develop CPs would be wasted if the CP designs were bound by legal/technical limitations.</p> <p>CEO responded that WKCD played a vital role in promoting the quality of life for the people of Hong Kong by serving their needs in arts and culture.</p>	
013913 - 014417	Chairman Miss Tanya CHAN WKCD Admin	<p>Miss Tanya CHAN enquired about CEO's plan to promote the development of arts education, particularly WKCD's collaboration with the Education Bureau and the relevant stakeholders, and the resources to be devoted to such course.</p> <p>CEO acknowledged the importance of arts education in enhancing the quality of life, and assured members that the promotion of arts education would be implanted at the outset of WKCD's development. For instance, the CP Consultants had incorporated learning facilities in their respective CPs. He further advised that he would soon meet with the Education Bureau and stakeholders concerned to discuss the collaborative measures to take forward the initiative in the development of WKCD.</p> <p>The Administration advised the meeting of the scope of arts education, which included the promotion of the arts and culture to the public and students, and the training of artists and arts administrators. The Home Affairs Bureau would collaborate with the Education Bureau, the Leisure and Cultural Services Department and WKCD on the promotion of arts education.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
014418 - 014935	Chairman Ms Emily LAU WKCDA	<p>Ms Emily LAU enquired how the CEO would help the community reach a consensus over the development of WKCD in the face of the divergent views expressed in the PE exercises; and how he would apply his past experience in taking forward the project.</p> <p>CEO advised that the objective of the PE exercise was to listen to different views on the development of WKCD for the preparation of a master development plan which reflected broadly these public views. Although the facilities at WKCD had yet to be opened, WKCDA had started to plan performing arts and museum-related activities. He hoped that his experience as the former Artistic Director of Barbican Center in London would help him achieve the vision of developing WKCD into a place of vibrancy and diversity, and one that served the community and operated on a self-sustainable basis.</p>	
014936 - 015548	Chairman Mr Alan LEONG Admin WKCDA	<p>Mr Alan LEONG considered that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Administration should respect WKCDA's autonomy as the management of arts and cultural institutions was a highly specialized and professional task; (b) WKCDA should initiate in-depth dialogues with the arts and cultural community with a view to formulating a clear direction for Hong Kong's cultural development; and (c) an accountability system to ensure the effective implementation of strategies and measures to take forward the development of the arts and culture should be introduced. <p>CEO advised that he had initiated dialogues with the arts and cultural community, and had full confidence in fostering a close partnership with the Administration, the community and stakeholders in taking forward the WKCD project.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the management of parks and open spaces in WKCD would fall within the remit of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>WKCDA, which allowed flexibility in the usage of public open spaces in WKCD. The Administration assured members that it would give due regard to the autonomy of WKCDA in the development of WKCD.</p>	
015549 - 020150	<p>Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG WKCDA</p>	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG considered that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the construction of WKCD should create employment opportunities for local professionals and workers, as well as benefit the small to medium sized enterprises; (b) the Administration/WKCDA should take immediate action to promote the development of arts education, with a view to cultivating an audience/consumer base for the WKCD facilities, and in turn providing the incentive for more investment in cultural enterprises; and (c) WKCDA should actively engage district groups and stakeholders in the PE exercise to ensure wide public support for the proposals put forward in the CPs, in particular those involved innovative concepts such as water-taxis and loop bridge. <p>CEO assured members that the construction contracts for WKCD would be tendered on an equitable basis and opportunities would be given to local workforce in recognition of their ingenuity and spirit of enterprise. He further advised that for positions where local knowledge and skills were less strong or unavailable, foreign expertise would be engaged. These experts might eventually help training up local workforce. CEO further acknowledged the need for active engagement of district groups in the development of WKCD, and enhancing connectivity (such as transport links) within/beyond WKCD.</p>	
020151 - 020532	<p>Chairman Miss Tanya CHAN WKCDA</p>	<p>Miss Tanya CHAN requested for disclosure of financial assessment and technical details of individual CPs, and enquired about the rights to the land revenue generated from WKCD.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>CEO advised that: (a) land revenue issues in respect of WKCD were under the purview of the Government; and (b) a specialist panel would be appointed by WKCDA to assess the technical feasibility of the CP options, and the technical details as requested by members would be disclosed, with the consent of the CP Consultants, upon the conclusion of the selection process.</p>	
020533-021149	<p>Chairman Mr Alan LEONG Dr Priscilla LEUNG WKCDA</p>	<p>Mr Alan LEONG said that LegCo had high expectation on the proper use of the \$21.6 billion investment in WKCD, and had urged the Administration to formulate arts and cultural policy to complement the construction of hardware in WKCD. He cautioned that WKCD should not become a market-led venue rental operation. He hoped that CEO could capitalize on his experience to provide the much needed impetus to formulate a clear cultural direction for Hong Kong, and to take the full accountability for the development of the arts and culture in steering the work of WKCDA.</p> <p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG sought CEO's undertaking in promoting arts education and employment opportunities for locals with requisite skills for the development of WKCD.</p> <p>CEO responded that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) WKCD as a sustainable enterprise should be market-informed and the project should be managed from a business accountability perspective. In developing a cultural strategy for the project, it was essential to foster a close partnership with the Government and the community; (b) with the arts and culture becoming a global business, WKCDA should comprise an international mix of skills/talents; the WKCD project should bring about ample employment opportunities for local construction/service industries; and (c) WKCDA was firmly committed to the promotion of arts education. 	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
30 December 2010

J:\cb2\BC\TEAM2\HA\09-10\PS2-Joint-SC\Minutes\wkcd0920-min-e-annex.doc