

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 5

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 3 November 2010 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Development

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Human Organ Transplant (Amendment) Regulation 2010 (gazetted on 29.10.2010)	143/2010
2. Human Organ Transplant (Appeal Board) Regulation (gazetted on 29.10.2010)	144/2010

### **Questions**

1. Hon Paul CHAN asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

2. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

3. Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

4. Hon CHAN Kin-por asked Question 4 and declared that he was the Member from the Insurance Functional Constituency and also an adviser of an insurance company.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

5. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

6. Hon WONG Ting-kwong asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Members' Motions**

### **Releasing LIU Xiaobo**

Hon Albert HO drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon WONG Yuk-man moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as the award of the Nobel Peace Prize to LIU Xiaobo, who struggles for human rights in China through peaceful, rational and non-violent means, is a significant, epoch-making event that will definitely produce profound and far-reaching impact on the progress of democratization in China, this Council urges the Central Government to release LIU Xiaobo and all political dissidents immediately.

While Hon WONG Yuk-man was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:20 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Albert CHAN and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Ten Members and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:02 pm, while Hon LEE Wing-tat was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Twelve other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Yuk-man spoke on the amendments.

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion:

To delete "as" after "That," and substitute with "given that"; and to add " , appeals to the Central Government not to harass LIU Xiaobo's family members through various means, and demands that the Central Government, while pursuing economic development, should also converge with the world as far as possible on social, cultural and human rights issues, etc., understand and accept the universal values which are widely and internationally recognized, including respect for human rights and protection of the freedom of speech, so as to expedite the progress of democratization in China" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion proposed and put.

Hon WONG Yuk-man claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 19 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion:

To add “; this Council also appeals to the Communist Party of China to put an end to one-party dictatorship, hold national elections by universal suffrage and return the political power to the people, so as to facilitate the democratic development of China” immediately before the full stop.

Question on LEUNG Kwok-hung's amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 20 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Yuk-man replied.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion put.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, three were in favour of the motion, 19 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion and nine against it (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

#### Formulating an animal-friendly policy

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the keeping of pets among Hong Kong people has become increasingly common, and there is also a growing concern about the rights of animals; however, the animal welfare policy in Hong Kong lags far behind the standards of other developed places in the world, and cases of animal cruelty keep

occurring; tens of thousands of animals are euthanized every year, and there is still insufficient activity space for the integration of human beings and animals within the communities; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to formulate an 'animal-friendly policy' to ensure that the rights of animals can be safeguarded; the relevant policy measures should include:

- (a) by making reference to the present animal protection legislation in developed places, to review and amend the existing Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Ordinance for the purpose of catching up with international standards, and to classify the intentional abandonment of animals as animal cruelty, as well as to explore the provision of compulsory psychological counselling and courses on animal protection to convicted persons;
- (b) to establish 'animal police' teams specially tasked to investigate cases of animal cruelty and abandonment, enhance the training of frontline enforcement officers on handling cases of animal cruelty and their awareness of such cases, and set up a 'dedicated hotline for reporting animal cruelty', with a view to curbing the situation of animal cruelty and abandonment from becoming prevalent;
- (c) to request the Department of Justice to pay close attention to the sentencing for cases of animal cruelty, and where sentencing for the cases concerned cannot fully reflect their seriousness, to seek sentencing guidelines by applying for reviews of sentences to the relevant courts, so as to truly reflect the social concern about offences of animal cruelty;
- (d) to improve the existing management mechanism for the sale and registration of animals, including reviewing the licensing and regulatory mechanism for the sale and breeding of pets and stepping up the monitoring of the sources of animals, so as to combat problems such as unlicensed animal breeding and illicit animal import;
- (e) to improve the hygiene conditions in the animal management centres under the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department and enhance the transparency of stray animal management by allowing Members and animal rights organizations to conduct regular inspections, increase the number of qualified animal adoption organizations and expand the scope of animals for adoption to reptiles and amphibians, so as to facilitate the adoption of animals by a greater number of people and organizations;
- (f) to co-operate with District Councils and animal rights organizations to fully implement the 'Trap-Neuter-Return' programme, and use humane means to deal with the problem of stray cats and dogs;

- (g) to provide subsidy to the public for neutering their pets, and train more veterinary health care personnel to meet the social demand for the services concerned;
- (h) to introduce appropriate measures, including identifying sites for constructing more parks for pets, and exploring the opening of various recreational venues such as parks and beaches partially or at specific time slots, so that members of the public can bring in their pets;
- (i) to actively identify suitable locations for the provision of public toilets for dogs, increase the number of dog excreta collection bins on street side and step up the frequency of cleaning and washing, with a view to improving environmental hygiene;
- (j) to explore the regulation of hospice service for animals through licensing;
- (k) to step up publicity and education for the public on animal care and responsible pet ownership, and set up an 'animal protection fund', so that organizations can make applications for organizing more animal welfare activities; and
- (l) to enhance people's understanding of endangered animals and relevant regulatory systems, and require that animal traders must provide appropriate labels for identifying endangered species, as well as to provide buyers with points to note on keeping endangered species, with a view to strengthening the management of endangered animals.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion proposed.

The President stated that six Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the six amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Alan LEONG and Hon Cyd HO, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Nine Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion:

To add “, given that” after “That”; to add “, online sale” after “unlicensed animal breeding”; to add “, employ animal capture devices that inflict the least injury” after “the ‘Trap-Neuter-Return’ programme”; to add “in all districts in Hong Kong” after “including identifying sites”; to add “at the same time, to step up inspection and prosecution against owners who indiscriminately allow their animals to excrete anywhere;” after “improving environmental hygiene;”; to add “and adoption” after “more animal welfare”; to delete “and” after “activities;”; and to add “; (m) to examine the extension of the microchipping and licensing schemes to cats, so as to help owners reclaim their missing cats, prevent the abandonment of cats by irresponsible owners and institute prosecutions against them; (n) to examine the establishment of public animal hospitals or clinics to provide pet owners with affordable animal treatment services; and (o) to examine the setting up of a mechanism for monitoring food products for pets and relevant labels, so as to safeguard the quality and safety of food products for pets” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Miriam LAU's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Fred LI to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Fred LI moved the following further amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU:

To add “; (p) to establish a licensing system for professional breeders to ensure that commercial breeders have adequate breeding knowledge and ethical standards; (q) to permit eligible members of the public to directly adopt animals; and (r) to explore the provision of subsidy to recognized animal adoption organizations, so that they can have sufficient resources for keeping abandoned animals, thereby reducing the number of animals eventually euthanized” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Miriam LAU's and Hon Fred LI's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon WONG Kwok-hing to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following further amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU and Hon Fred LI:

To add “; (s) by making reference to and studying the successful experience of foreign places in protecting and conserving endangered wild animals, to adopt positive environmental conservation measures to salvage endangered wild animals in Hong Kong, such as Romer's tree frogs, black-faced spoonbills, common birdwings, Chinese grassbirds, Hong Kong newts, Chinese white dolphins and horseshoe crabs, so as to protect the precious ecological resources of Hong Kong; and (t) to join hands with the relevant District Councils, rural committees and conservation organizations to expeditiously explore various proper arrangements and measures on handling the miserable stray cattle in Hong Kong that are left to live or perish on their own, to provide support by allocating appropriate resources, and to tackle the relevant issues as early as possible through the following measures: (i) to actively and expeditiously explore the identification of suitable sites for stray cattle in Hong Kong, so as to enable them to live in a safe and natural environment without having to wander around any more, while at the same time ensure the maximum safety of both human beings and cattle in their co-existence; besides, to actively explore the development of the above-mentioned sites as green eco-tourism projects; (ii) to allocate resources for neutering the stray cattle in the New Territories, so as to avoid the incessant breeding of stray cattle; and (iii) to actively study the introduction of effective measures, including providing additional resources to support those volunteers and non-profit-making voluntary organizations which are keen on adopting stray cattle in Hong Kong, so that they can have sufficient means to provide the stray cattle adopted by them with basic nutrition and attention” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU and Hon Fred LI proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI and Hon WONG Kwok-hing had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following further amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI and Hon WONG Kwok-hing, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; (u) to review and amend the policy on managing wild animals, so as to provide them with reasonable and safe room for survival, and at the same time protect the public from being disturbed or hurt; and (v) to co-operate with neighbouring regions, and step up the studies on and the monitoring of zoonotic diseases, in particular those transmittable to human beings, thereby protecting the health of animals while enhancing epidemic prevention” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou’s amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI and WONG Kwok-hing proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Alan LEONG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following further amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou:

To add “; (w) to empower the court to issue orders forbidding repeated offenders or convicted persons involved in the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Ordinance and serious cases from keeping animals; (x) to set up animal shelters and adoption centres under the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department, so as to reduce the need for euthanizing animals; (y) to examine, on humanitarian grounds, the enactment of legislation on prohibiting the breeding and importation of animal species suffering from genetic diseases that cause them pain, such as Scottish Folds suffering from osteochondrodysplasia; (z) to foster co-operation among the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department, the Lands Department, the Housing Department and other relevant government departments, so that when clearing villages, they will pay attention to the fact that residents therein normally keep a number of animals, and hence they should make a detailed record of all animals in the villages concerned before clearance, and strive to make timely and appropriate arrangements for animals that cannot follow their owners upon moving homes; and (aa) to examine the practice of allowing animal owners who are adequately equipped to board public transport with their animals” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG’s amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Alan LEONG had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Cyd HO to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Cyd HO moved the following further amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Alan LEONG:

To add “; (ab) to advocate the responsibilities of keepers and owners, and ensure that both wild and domesticated animals can receive humane treatment; and (ac) to review the policy on the keeping of animals by public housing tenants” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Cyd HO's amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Alan LEONG proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan replied.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Alan LEONG and Hon Cyd HO put and agreed to.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 10 November 2010 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:32 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
9 December 2010

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 03/11/2010  
 時間 TIME: 04:30:47 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 陳偉業議員對黃毓民議員的「釋放劉曉波」議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT CHAN TO HON WONG YUK-MAN'S MOTION ON  
 "RELEASING LIU XIAOBO"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	29	
投票 Vote	23	28	
贊成 Yes	3	19	
反對 No	19	9	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Stary LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

*Vivian Chan*

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 03/11/2010  
時間 TIME: 04:35:23 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁國雄議員對黃毓民議員的「釋放劉曉波」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG KWOK-HUNG TO HON WONG YUK-MAN'S MOTION ON  
"RELEASING LIU XIAOBO"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	3	19	
反對 No	20	9	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 03/11/2010  
時間 TIME: 04:39:54 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「釋放劉曉波」議案  
MOTION ON "RELEASING LIU XIAOBO"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	29	
投票 Vote	23	28	
贊成 Yes	3	19	
反對 No	19	9	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩珍 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK