

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 8

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 24 November 2010 at 11:00 am  
and Thursday 25 November 2010 at 2:30 pm**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP (absent on 25.11.2010)

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 25.11.2010)

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP (absent on 25.11.2010)

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 25.11.2010)

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP (presiding as President on 25.11.2010)

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP (absent on 25.11.2010)

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP (absent on 25.11.2010)

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS , JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip (absent on 25.11.2010)

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Public officers attending:**

On 24.11.2010

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

On 24.11.2010 and 25.11.2010

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

**Clerks in attendance:**

On 24.11.2010

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 25.11.2010

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

## **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Census and Statistics (2011 Population Census) Order (gazetted on 19.11.2010)	152/2010
2. Hong Kong Airport (Control of Obstructions) (Exemption) (Amendment) Order 2010 (gazetted on 19.11.2010)	153/2010
3. Certification for Employee Benefits (Chinese Medicine) (Miscellaneous Amendments) Ordinance 2006 (Commencement) Notice 2010 (gazetted on 19.11.2010)	154/2010

## Other Papers

- No. 34 - Estate Agents Authority Annual Report 2009/10 (published on 19.11.2010)
- No. 35 - Annual Report 2009 to the Chief Executive by The Commissioner on Interception of Communications and Surveillance (together with a statement under section 49(4) of the Interception of Communications and Surveillance Ordinance) (published on 22.11.2010)
- No. 36 - Ocean Park Corporation Annual Report 2009-2010 (published on 24.11.2010)

Report No. 5/10-11 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 19.11.2010)

Report of the Bills Committee on Buildings Energy Efficiency Bill (published on 19.11.2010)

## Addresses

Prof Hon Patrick LAU, a board member of Ocean Park Corporation, addressed the Council on the Ocean Park Corporation Annual Report 2009-2010.

## Questions

Question permitted by the President under Rule 24(4) of the Rules of Procedure

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked an urgent question regarding the resumption of land by Government at Choi Yuen Tsuen.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Hon Abraham SHEK declared that he was an independent non-executive director of MTR Corporation Limited which was involved in a project concerning the resumption of land at Choi Yuen Tsuen. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

1. Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon WONG Kwok-kin asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

3. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Hon Frederick FUNG declared that he was a member of the Equal Opportunities Commission, and he was aware of the current discussion of the Commission with The Link Management Limited on the issue. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Another Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

4. Hon Fred LI asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

5. Hon IP Kwok-him asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

6. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### Buildings Energy Efficiency Bill

#### Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 9 December 2009 resumed.

Hon Audrey EU, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Buildings Energy Efficiency Bill, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

While Hon Audrey EU was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:51 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

After the address, Hon Audrey EU spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Ten Members and Hon Paul TSE spoke on the Bill.

At 3:53 pm, while Hon Paul TSE was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

#### Committee stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the Buildings Energy Efficiency Bill.

Question that clauses 1, 3, 5, 6, 7, 13 to 16, 19, 20, 21, 23 to 28, 30, 32, 33, 42, 44, 45, 46, 48, 49 and 51 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for the Environment had given notice to move amendments to clause 2 to amend the definitions of "common area", "composite building" and "residential building". Besides, Hon Audrey EU had also given notice to move an amendment to clause 2 to amend the definition of "lighting installation". He then ordered that the original provisions and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to clause 2 and spoke on the amendments.

Hon Audrey EU and three Members spoke on the clause and the amendments.

Hon Audrey EU spoke again.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Hon Audrey EU moved an amendment to clause 2.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's amendment put.

Hon Audrey EU claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 19 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 2 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for the Secretary for the Environment to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rules 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure in order that the committee of the whole Council could consider clause 4 together with Schedule 2.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into Committee again.

Question that Schedule 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for the Environment had given notice to move amendments to clause 4 and Schedule 2 to delete paragraph (b) of clause 4(1) and substitute with new proposals, and to delete paragraphs (a), (b) and (c) of item 6 of Schedule 2 and substitute with new proposals. Hon KAM Nai-wai had also given notice to move amendments to Schedule 2 to delete paragraph (b) of item 6 of Schedule 2 and to amend paragraph (d). In addition, Hon Cyd HO had given notice to move amendments to clause 4 and Schedule 2 to amend clause 4(3), and to delete paragraph (b) of item 6 of Schedule 2 and substitute with new proposals, as well as to add item 6A to the Schedule.

The Chairman further stated that as the provisions of clause 4 and Schedule 2 were concerned with the scope of application of the Bill, he ordered that clause 4, Schedule 2 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to clause 4 and Schedule 2 and spoke on the amendments.

Hon KAM Nai-wai spoke on the original provisions and the amendments.

Hon Cyd HO spoke on the original provisions and the amendments.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan spoke on the original provisions and the amendments.

While Hon CHAN Hak-kan was speaking, Hon Cyd HO raised a point of order that it was improper for Mr CHAN to speculate on the motives of other Members in proposing amendments to the motion.

The Chairman said that in his opinion, Hon CHAN Hak-kan had only expressed views on the amendments proposed by the other two Members. Furthermore, the Rules of Procedure did not prohibit Members from making any speculations on the motives behind why other Members expressed certain views. The Rules of Procedure only required that Members should not impute improper motives to another Member when making their speeches. The Chairman added that if Hon Cyd HO considered that Hon CHAN Hak-kan had imputed improper motive to her, she could point that out.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan continued to speak on the original provisions and the amendments.

While Hon CHAN Hak-kan was speaking, Hon KAM Nai-wai raised a point of order that Hon CHAN Hak-kan's speech had deviated from the question under debate, as the amendments were not about outdoor lighting.

The Chairman ruled that it was not a point of order. He added that if a Member spoke without listening clearly to or ignoring what other Members had said earlier, that Member himself would be responsible. The Chairman then asked Hon CHAN Hak-kan to continue to speak.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan continued to speak on the original provisions and the amendments.

Hon KAM Nai-wai spoke again.

Two Members spoke on the original provisions and the amendments.

A Member spoke again.

Two other Members spoke on the original provisions and the amendments.

Hon KAM Nai-wai spoke for the third time.

Hon Cyd HO spoke again.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

Question on the amendment to clause 4 moved by the Secretary for the Environment put.

Hon Cyd HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that there were 52 Members present, and 51 were in favour of the amendment (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Question on the amendments to Schedule 2 moved by the Secretary for the Environment put.

Hon KAM Nai-wai claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that there were 53 Members present, 31 were in favour of the amendments and 21 against them (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the amendments were passed.

Question that clause 4 as amended and Schedule 2 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that amendments to clauses 8 to 12, 17, 18, 22, 29, 31, 34 to 41, 43, 47, 50 and 52 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 8 to 12, 17, 18, 22, 29, 31, 34 to 41, 43, 47, 50 and 52 as amended stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that Schedule 5 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that Schedules 1, 3 and 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to Schedules 1, 3 and 4 and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that Schedules 1, 3 and 4 as amended stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### Third Reading

The Secretary for the Environment reported that

the Buildings Energy Efficiency Bill

had passed through the committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

## **Members' Bills**

### First Reading

University of Hong Kong (Amendment) Bill 2010

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

University of Hong Kong (Amendment) Bill 2010

Dr Hon David LI moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

## **Members' Motions**

### Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Cyd HO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

**Resolved** that in relation to the —

- (a) Human Organ Transplant (Amendment) Regulation 2010, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 143 of 2010; and
- (b) Human Organ Transplant (Appeal Board) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 144 of 2010,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 3 November 2010, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 5 January 2011.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Vincent FANG, mover of the motion on “Promoting the waste recycling industries”, was not in the Chamber, the President suspended the meeting at 6:52 pm.

The Council resumed at 6:56 pm.

### Promoting the waste recycling industries

Hon Vincent FANG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, over 90% of the recyclable waste currently recovered in Hong Kong is exported to other countries or places for recycling, yet owing to developed countries’ gradual tightening of their policies on waste import, the number of countries permitting waste import will decrease in the future; in order to resolve the problem of waste accumulation in Hong Kong in the long run, it is of utmost importance to extend the categories and proportion of recyclable waste recovery and expedite the development of Hong Kong’s environmental and recycling industries; in this connection, this Council proposes that:

- (a) the Government should conceive an overall waste policy on the 3R concept (i.e. reduce, reuse and recycle), so as to formulate a follow-through policy on reducing, recovering and recycling waste, implementing and promoting it in a well-planned manner, with a view to resolving the problem of waste accumulation in Hong Kong, encouraging the development of environment-related new industries, promoting sustainable economic development and creating more employment opportunities;
- (b) since waste recycling industries require considerable investments but yield relatively low returns, the Government should therefore, by making reference to the policies of developed countries on promoting environmental and waste recycling industries, formulate local preferential policies, including providing land and tax concessions, technology support, etc., so as to encourage the commercial sector to invest in waste recovery and recycling industries; and

- (c) while broadening the scope of product eco-responsibility, present efforts in recovering recyclable waste should be extended, and the use of green products by society should be encouraged; the Government should avoid making environmental levies prevalent in Hong Kong or charging to another kind of consumption tax, so as not to turn Hong Kong into a 'taxes and levies capital', tarnish Hong Kong's reputation as a shoppers' paradise, affecting people's daily habits and boosting inflation.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG's motion proposed.

The President stated that five Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the five amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon KAM Nai-wai, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon KAM Nai-wai was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:26 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Tanya CHAN, Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon Jeffrey LAM, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Six Members and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:54 pm, while Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Four other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Vincent FANG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

Hon IP Wai-ming moved the following amendment to Hon Vincent FANG's motion:

To add “, although the recovery rate of municipal solid waste in Hong Kong has risen to 49%” after “That”; to delete “in Hong Kong” after “recyclable waste currently recovered”; to delete “yet” after “places for recycling,” and substitute with “and”; to add “(a) the various policies and measures put forward in ‘A Policy Framework for the Management of Municipal Solid Waste (2005-2014)’ should be expeditiously fulfilled and implemented, so as to achieve the various targets proposed in the Policy Framework by 2014;” after “this Council proposes that.”; to delete the original “(a)” and substitute with “(b)”; to delete “sustainable economic development” after “new industries, promoting” and substitute with “a ‘circular economy’ capable of sustainable development”; to delete the original “(b)” and substitute with “(c)”; to delete “formulate local” after “environmental and waste recycling industries,” and substitute with “and having regard to the requirements and uniqueness of different recyclable products, formulate various”; to add “for developing local recycling industries” after “preferential policies”; to add “and operational” after “tax concessions, technology”; to delete “and” after “waste recovery and recycling industries;”; to delete the original “(c)” and substitute with “(d)”; to delete “and the use of” after “should be extended,” and substitute with “including implementing non-punitive measures to encourage members of the public to increase their awareness of waste recovery and expanding community waste recovery networks, and a more extensive use of various”; and to delete “the Government should avoid making environmental levies prevalent in Hong Kong or charging to another kind of consumption tax, so as not to turn Hong Kong into a ‘taxes and levies capital’, tarnish Hong Kong’s reputation as a shoppers’ paradise, affecting people’s daily habits and boosting inflation” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “(e) while developing recycling industries, the Government must also assist the industries concerned in integrating into the communities, and through various support measures ranging from community planning, improving recovery venue designs, improving transport networks to environmental hygiene, etc., enable recycling industries to have the acceptance and support of residents, thereby expanding community waste recovery networks; and (f) prohibition orders on landfill disposal should be made, and the separation and recovery of solid waste should be promoted, so as to reduce the disposal of recyclable materials at landfills, increase the volumes of waste recovery and prolong the lifespan of landfills; at the same time, for those landfills that are near the residential areas and close to saturation, timetables for their closure should be drawn up, so as to avoid the authorities lessening their efforts to develop recycling industries and related measures due to the reliance on landfills expansion to tackle the problem of solid waste”.

Question on Hon IP Wai-ming’s amendment to Hon Vincent FANG’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon IP Wai-ming's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon KAM Nai-wai to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved the following further amendment to Hon Vincent FANG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming:

To add “; (g) producer responsibility should be promoted, and producer responsibility schemes for waste electrical and electronic products should be expeditiously implemented; and under the ‘polluter pays’ principle, the Government should actively study various financial means, such as the provision of financial incentives or the imposition of levies, etc., to encourage and motivate the public to more proactively practise waste reduction at source, waste separation and recycling in their daily life; (h) studies should be conducted on the establishment of a licensing system for waste recovery operators and the allocation of space in some existing refuse collection points for use by waste recovery operators, so as to reduce nuisance to local communities; (i) studies should be actively conducted on the designation of test points in various districts and the provision of land and financial incentives to people and organizations of local communities and social enterprises, so as to encourage residents in various districts to participate in the development of waste recovery and recycling industries; (j) the development of the EcoPark should be expedited to provide waste recovery and recycling operators with supporting infrastructure facilities, so as to attract more interested operators to participate; and (k) the relevant publicity and public education work should be strengthened to increase the public awareness and understanding of the advantages and importance of waste reduction at source and the recovery, separation and recycling of waste” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's amendment to Hon Vincent FANG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming proposed and put.

Hon Vincent FANG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and three against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 16 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Promoting the waste recycling industries” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon IP Wai-ming’s and Hon KAM Nai-wai’s amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Tanya CHAN to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following further amendment to Hon Vincent FANG’s motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon KAM Nai-wai:

To add “; (l) the Government should allocate the proceeds from implementing the producer responsibility system to establish a special fund to support the development of the recycling industry and other environmental industries on a ‘dedicated-fund-for-dedicated-use’ basis; (m) studies should be conducted on the establishment of a certification system for manufacturers of environmental products to ensure that the raw materials and manufacturing procedures of the products concerned meet certain environmental standards, with a view to enhancing the recognition of environmental products, and the Government should consider taking the lead to fully use environmental products that meet certain environmental standards; and (n) the Government should review its existing policy on the provision of recycling bins, including providing recycling bins in all government buildings, hospitals and schools, and it should also consider installing a greater number of rubbish bins equipped with recycling bins to replace the existing ones on the street, so as to enhance the efficiency of waste recovery and separation” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN’s amendment to Hon Vincent FANG’s motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon KAM Nai-wai proposed and put.

Hon Vincent FANG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and three against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 16 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

As the amendments of Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon KAM Nai-wai and Hon Tanya CHAN had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Hak-kan to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following further amendment to Hon Vincent FANG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon KAM Nai-wai and Hon Tanya CHAN:

To add “; (o) a system of green products certification and labelling should be formulated; and (p) since 40% of the municipal solid waste at present is perishable waste such as food waste, the Government should devise an effective mechanism for the massive recovery of food waste, construct additional food waste recycling facilities, and encourage private organizations to engage in the food waste recovery and recycling industry” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan's amendment to Hon Vincent FANG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon KAM Nai-wai and Hon Tanya CHAN proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon KAM Nai-wai, Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon CHAN Hak-kan had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Jeffrey LAM to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Jeffrey LAM moved the following further amendment to Hon Vincent FANG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon KAM Nai-wai, Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon CHAN Hak-kan:

To add “; and (q) the Government should assist small and medium enterprises in applying for various types of environmental certification, so as to facilitate the development of environmental industries” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM's amendment to Hon Vincent FANG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon KAM Nai-wai, Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon CHAN Hak-kan proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Vincent FANG replied.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG's motion as amended by Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon KAM Nai-wai, Hon Tanya CHAN, Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon Jeffrey LAM put and agreed to.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:50 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 2:30 pm on 25 November 2010.

Alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That over the years, the seriously tilted social and economic policies of the Government, coupled with factors such as economic restructuring, have led to the deterioration of the disparity between the rich and the poor, the continuous increase in the poverty population and the gradual intensification of class conflicts in society; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to establish a high-level committee to comprehensively review and study in-depth various aspects ranging from the Government's concepts and principles of governance to the formulation of policies and implementation of measures, to formulate, through public engagement and consultation, comprehensive and sustainable social and economic development strategies that give consideration to all social strata, effectively allocate social resources and narrow the disparity between the rich and the poor, and at the same time implement appropriate poverty alleviation measures, so as to enable all social strata to truly share the fruit of economic success and promote the harmonious development of society.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHAN Kin-por and Hon WONG Kwok-hing, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Two Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LI Fung-ying spoke on the motion and the amendments, and declared that she was a non-official member of the Steering Committee on the Community Care Fund.

Fifteen other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon CHAN Kin-por moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion:

To delete "over the years, the seriously tilted social and economic policies of the Government" after "That" and substitute with ", as the Government has for a long time over-emphasized individual industries and there is a lack of comprehensive and balanced development strategy"; and to add "in particular issues such as the population policy causing a substantial increase in the demand for low-skill and low-qualification jobs and ways of creating large numbers of elementary posts," after "implementation of measures,".

Question on Hon CHAN Kin-por's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHAN Kin-por's amendment had been passed, the President's Deputy granted leave for Hon WONG Kwok-hing to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following further amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por:

To add ", fairly and impartially" after "effectively"; to add "and set targets on eradicating poverty" after "poverty alleviation measures"; and to add ", especially the socially disadvantaged," after "enable all social strata".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por and Hon WONG Kwok-hing put and agreed to.

**Next meeting**

The President's Deputy declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 1 December 2010 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 5:38 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
28 January 2011

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 24/11/2010  
時間 TIME: 05:08:59 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《建築物能源效益條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第2條  
BUILDINGS ENERGY EFFICIENCY BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE  
2

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇 Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	3	16	
反對 No	19	5	
棄權 Abstain	2	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 24/11/2010  
 時間 TIME: 06:31:38 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《建築物能源效益條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第4(1)(b)條  
 BUILDINGS ENERGY EFFICIENCY BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 4(1)(b)

動議人 MOVED BY: 環境局局長 Secretary for the Environment

出席 Present :52  
 投票 Vote :51  
     贊成 Yes :51  
     反對 No :0  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam			李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan			陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家騷	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	Li Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩珍	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	謝偉俊	Paul TSE	贊成	YES
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Andrew EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG		
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	LEUNG Kwok-hung	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

*Miriam Lam*

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 24/11/2010  
 時間 TIME: 06:35:53 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《建築物能源效益條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正附表2  
 BUILDINGS ENERGY EFFICIENCY BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO  
 SCHEDULE 2

動議人 MOVED BY: 環境局局長 Secretary for the Environment

出席 Present :53  
 投票 Vote :52  
     贊成 Yes :31  
     反對 No :21  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam			李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驊	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	謝偉俊	Paul TSE	贊成	YES
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG		
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	LEUNG Kwok-hung	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 24/11/2010  
時間 TIME: 09:43:21 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 甘乃威議員對方剛議員就「推動廢物循環再造產業」所提，經葉偉明議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON KAM NAI-WAI TO HON VINCENT FANG'S MOTION ON "PROMOTING THE WASTE RECYCLING INDUSTRIES" AS AMENDED BY HON IP WAI-MING

動議人 MOVED BY: 甘乃威KAM Nai-wai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	16	
投票 Vote	18	15	
贊成 Yes	15	15	
反對 No	3	0	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHIEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 24/11/2010  
時間 TIME: 09:46:16 下午-pm

動議 MOTION: 陳淑莊議員對方剛議員就「推動廢物循環再造產業」所提，經葉偉明議員及甘乃威議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON TANYA CHAN TO HON VINCENT FANG'S MOTION ON "PROMOTING THE WASTE RECYCLING INDUSTRIES" AS AMENDED BY HON IP WAI-MING AND HON KAM NAI-WAI

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	16	
投票 Vote	18	15	
贊成 Yes	15	15	
反對 No	3	0	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK