

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 9

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 1 December 2010 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Members absent:

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP
Secretary for Development

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

No. 37 - Director of Social Welfare Incorporated
Financial statements for the year ended 31 March 2010 together with the Report of the Director of Audit (published on 25.11.2010)

Report No. 6/10-11 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 24.11.2010)

Questions

1. Prof Hon Patrick LAU asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

2. Hon Cyd HO asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

3. Hon IP Wai-ming asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

4. Dr Hon Margaret NG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

5. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

6. Hon Abraham SHEK asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Hon Abraham SHEK asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Hon Paul TSE declared that he was a board member of the Equal Opportunities Commission. He then asked a supplementary question. The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Two other Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Education and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the District Councils Ordinance

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that the District Councils Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 3) Order 2010, made by the Chief Executive in Council on 21 September 2010, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon IP Kwok-him spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on District Councils Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 3) Order 2010.

While Hon IP Kwok-him was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:18 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon IP Kwok-him then spoke in his personal capacity as a Member.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung declared that he was a District Council member.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Comprehensively reviewing the Mandatory Provident Fund Scheme

Hon WONG Kwok-kin moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, according to the projection of the Census and Statistics Department, the ratio of persons who are aged 65 and above to the population in Hong Kong will substantially increase to 26% by 2036; this not only indicates the gravity of population ageing in Hong Kong in the future, but also foretells the public's urgent demand for comprehensive retirement protection; yet, there is at present no retirement protection system in Hong Kong that benefit all people, and after nearly 10 years since its implementation, the Mandatory Provident Fund ('MPF') Scheme is still unable to achieve the objective of protecting people's retirement life; in this connection, this Council urges the authorities to comprehensively review the MPF Scheme and further improve the relevant mechanisms, so as to protect the retirement life of all people; the relevant review should include:

- (a) to implement universal retirement protection, with tripartite contributions from the Government, employers and employees, so as to extend the coverage of protection to all Hong Kong people;

- (b) to abolish the mechanism whereby employers' contributions under the MPF Scheme are used to offset severance payments and long service payments, and retain Hong Kong employees' rights to severance payments or long service payments under the relevant provisions of the Employment Ordinance, so as to provide employees with better retirement protection;
- (c) to implement a system of 'one lifelong account', establish portability of MPF accounts, and require trustees to introduce a simple and easy to understand method to inspect accounts similar to that of 'bank books', so as to enable employees to peruse information on contributions, returns, etc. at any time;
- (d) to lower MPF management fees and administration fees, and at the same time enact legislation to require trustees to set out the actual amounts of management fees in the annual reports of the years concerned, so as to protect the actual amounts of MPFs received by employees upon retirement from not being drastically eroded;
- (e) to implement totally unrestricted choices for employees under the MPF Scheme, allowing employees to choose trustees for both employers' and employees' MPF contributions, and at the same time, through publicity and education, enable employees to understand that they may transfer their MPF contributions according to the levels of risks they can bear;
- (f) to strengthen the regulation of MPF investment products and regularly review the sales practices adopted by intermediaries;
- (g) to review the appropriateness of the existing minimum and maximum levels of income, including that the minimum level of income should be higher than the minimum wage;
- (h) to step up law enforcement to combat the situation of default in contributions, including sentencing employers who default on contributions to immediate imprisonment, and considering blacklisting the companies concerned in the tendering exercises for government services as a form of penalty, etc.; and
- (i) to reform the Occupational Retirement Schemes ('ORSO') system, requiring employers adopting ORSO schemes to provide their employees with accrued benefits not less than those under the MPF Scheme.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-kin's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that five Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the five amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHAN Kin-por, who intended to move an amendment, declared that he was a member of the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Advisory Committee and represented the Insurance Functional Constituency. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Paul TSE, who intended to move an amendment, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:09 pm, while Hon Paul TSE was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Ronny TONG, Hon Paul CHAN and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Five Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong declared that he was a non-executive director of the Management Board of the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Six more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LI Fung-ying declared that she was a non-executive director of the Management Board of the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority. She then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Ten other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-kin spoke on the amendments and declared that he was a non-executive director of the Management Board of the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke again.

Hon CHAN Kin-por moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-kin's motion:

To delete "according to the projection of the Census and Statistics Department," after "That," and substitute with "enormous changes will occur to the population structure of Hong Kong in the future, and"; to delete "in Hong Kong" after "to the population"; to add "by, for example, streamlining the management and administrative procedures of MPF schemes and reducing the operating costs of MPF on the premise of not affecting MPF scheme members' interests, so as to create room for lowering administration fees" after "administration fees"; and to add ", as well as the percentages of contributions, so as to ensure that the amounts of MPFs are adequate to meet post-retirement expenditure" after "minimum wage".

Question on Hon CHAN Kin-por's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-kin's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon CHAN Kin-por's amendment had been passed, Hon Paul TSE had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

As Hon CHAN Kin-por's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Ronny TONG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-kin's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por:

To add "; (j) to conduct comprehensive public consultation on the effectiveness and various aspects of the MPF Scheme, given that it has already been implemented for 10 years; and (k) when implementing universal retirement protection, to conduct public consultation on the specific proposal" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-kin's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHAN Kin-por's and Hon Ronny TONG's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Paul CHAN to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Paul CHAN moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-kin's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por and Hon Ronny TONG:

To add “; (l) to increase the ceiling of employers’ monthly contributions to employees’ MPFs to HK\$2,500 a month per person, so that employers can make more active commitment to employees’ retirement life; and (m) to correspondingly increase the maximum tax deduction for employees’ mandatory contributions to MPF schemes to HK\$30,000 each tax year, so as to strengthen employees’ protection” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Paul CHAN’s amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-kin’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por and Hon Ronny TONG proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Hon CHAN Kin-por, Hon Ronny TONG and Hon Paul CHAN had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon LEE Cheuk-yan to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following further amendment to Hon Wong Kwok-kin’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por, Hon Ronny TONG and Hon Paul CHAN:

To add “; (n) to allow employees to choose to deposit part of their contributions into the Exchange Fund, and compute the annual return rate based on the average return rate of the Exchange Fund investment portfolios over the past six years, plus a minimum return guarantee, so as to ensure that the annual return will not be lower than the average yield rate of Exchange Fund Bills of 3-year maturity in the preceding year; and (o) to provide low-income employees with a contribution supplement, so as to strengthen their retirement protection” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan’s amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-kin’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por, Hon Ronny TONG and Hon Paul CHAN proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon WONG Kwok-kin replied.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-kin's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kin-por, Hon Ronny TONG and Hon Paul CHAN put and agreed to.

Reviewing the operation of the Land (Compulsory Sale for Redevelopment) Ordinance

Hon Mrs Regina IP moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Administration, by publication of the Land (Compulsory Sale for Redevelopment) (Specification of Lower Percentage) Notice in the Gazette in January this year, specified that with effect from 1 April this year, in respect of three classes of land lot, the application threshold for compulsory sale shall be lowered from 90% to 80%; although the lowering of the threshold can help facilitate urban renewal, the existing old building acquisition mechanism lacks transparency, and owners of old buildings are unable to negotiate with developers on a more equal footing; in the half year since the implementation of the new legislation, the acquisition of old buildings for private redevelopment has mostly occurred in prime land lots or even the Mid-levels, while no one is interested in the dilapidated communities that are in great need of redevelopment, indicating that the legislation has failed to fully fulfil its objectives; in this connection, this Council urges the Administration to review the Land (Compulsory Sale for Redevelopment) Ordinance ('the Ordinance'), including:

- (a) to examine the operational problems in old building acquisition: when dealing with experienced developers or agents, individual flat owners often cope with very great mental stress, and many of them are even subject to harassment suspected to be acquisition-related, which causes anxiety and seriously affects the life of individual flat owners;
- (b) to review the compensation mechanism for old building acquisition: flat owners at present have to fight lone battles against developers or agents who are financially powerful and influential in sale price negotiations and, given their lack of help and support, the sale prices often fail to reach the price levels of similar properties they look for in nearby places of the same districts and even fall far short of many flat owners' expectation of 'flat for flat, shop for shop' for urban renewal; and

- (c) to conduct an overall review of the Ordinance: given that compulsory sale involves deprivation of private property rights and the Ordinance currently has various deficiencies, it is necessary to conduct an overall review of the Ordinance (including the administrative arrangements therein), in order to enhance the protection of the rights of flat owners.

Question on Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion proposed.

The President stated that seven Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the seven amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG, Dr Hon Margaret NG, Hon WONG Yuk-man, Hon Ronny TONG, Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che and Hon James TO, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Development spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While the Secretary for Development was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Seven Members and Hon KAM Nai-wai spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:32 pm, while Hon KAM Nai-wai was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Four other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that his family members owned some old properties in Tai Kok Tsui, which were purchased for investment before 1997. They were not developers and had no intention of acquiring the properties for redevelopment. Hon Paul CHAN also declared that he was an independent non-executive director of Wharf (Holdings) Limited. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Two more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Mrs Regina IP spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Development spoke again.

While the Secretary for Development was speaking, Dr Hon Margaret NG sought elucidation of a point raised by the Secretary in her speech. The Secretary for Development elucidated and continued to speak.

While the Secretary for Development was speaking, Hon Albert CHAN sought further elucidation of the same point raised by the Secretary. The Secretary for Development said that she had already elucidated.

In that regard, the President reminded Members that they should observe the Rules of Procedure and should not abuse the arrangement relating to elucidation under the Rules of Procedure. The President further stated that if Members kept making use of such an arrangement to express their views and criticize the points raised by the Secretary for Development in her speech, the debate would unnecessarily be prolonged.

The Secretary for Development continued to speak.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion:

To add “, in order to speed up the pace of redeveloping old districts,” after “That”; to delete “although” after “80%”; to delete “,” after “facilitate urban renewal” and substitute with “and is conducive to expediting the renewal development of old districts, improving the living environments therein and reducing the potential dangers posed to the community by old buildings in disrepair, but”; to delete “no one is interested in the dilapidated” after “while” and substitute with “such cases are comparatively rare in the”; to add “(b) to step up law enforcement by government departments: the relevant departments should step up law enforcement and prosecution to eradicate the unlawful nuisances caused by developers or agents in the course of property acquisition, so as to protect flat owners against any harassment;” after “life of individual flat owners;”; to delete the original “(b)” and substitute with “(c)”; to delete the original “(c)” and substitute with “(d)”; to delete “given that compulsory sale involves deprivation of private property rights and the Ordinance currently has various deficiencies,” after “Ordinance:” and substitute with “notwithstanding that compulsory sale is in line with the overall interest of society, at the same time it also undermines private property rights, and thus”; to add “continuously” after “is necessary to”; and to delete “enhance the protection of the rights of flat owners” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “ensure that on the premise of protecting the rights of flat owners, the redevelopment of old districts can be effectively facilitated”.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Reviewing the operation of the Land (Compulsory Sale for Redevelopment) Ordinance" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion:

To add ", amidst the concern of numerous owners of old buildings," after "That"; to delete "and" after "urban renewal;"; and to add "; and (d) to expeditiously conduct studies on establishing a mediation or arbitration mechanism for compulsory sale other than the Lands Tribunal, so that when flat owners are faced with developers or agents who resort to unreasonable prices or acts in the course of property acquisition, they can have a simple and legally binding channel for negotiations and appeal, thereby preventing them from being dragged into protracted lawsuits that may plunge them into bankruptcy and exert mental pressure on them" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion proposed and put.

Hon Ronny TONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion:

To add “, compelling flat owners to sell their property titles without the involvement of the public interest factor; besides contravening the principle of respecting private property rights, this in effect often compels flat owners to leave their original communities” after “80%”; to delete “has failed to fully fulfil its objectives” after “the legislation” and substitute with “runs counter to the policy of encouraging old district redevelopment”; to delete “which causes anxiety and seriously affects” after “to be acquisition-related,” and substitute with “apart from causing anxiety and seriously affecting”; to add “, it will also aggravate the dilapidation and disrepair of buildings, making such buildings even more dangerous and uninhabitable” after “life of individual flat owners”; and to add “, truly promote the redevelopment of old communities and enable affected flat owners to acquire other properties in the original districts” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon Margaret NG's amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment and six against it (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Yuk-man moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion:

To delete “although the lowering of the threshold can help facilitate urban renewal,” after “80%;”; and to add “including restoring the application threshold for compulsory sale to 90% of the undivided shares of a lot,” after “(including the administrative arrangements therein),”.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man’s amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP’s motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP’s motion:

To add “(a) to conduct studies on improving the existing adjudication system and reinforce the gate-keeping role of the Lands Tribunal: it is proposed that the Lands Tribunal should recruit professionals to conduct independent property valuations; if a flat owner is not satisfied with the acquisition price and requests a court ruling, the developer concerned should bear all the litigation fees; and the developer should also submit a ‘final development blueprint’ to the Lands Tribunal before property acquisition and use it as the basis of valuation;” after “including:”; to delete the original “(a)” and substitute with “(b)”; to delete the original “(b)” and substitute with “(c)”; and to delete the original “(c)” and substitute with “(d)”.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG’s amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Ronny TONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix VI**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion:

To delete "and" after "urban renewal;" and substitute with "(c) to review the mechanism for determining acquisition prices of old buildings: after the independent surveyors employed by flat owners have assessed the market values of the units, all professional valuation fees should be borne by the acquisition parties, and in assessing acquisition prices, the values of new buildings upon their completion should also be considered; and"; and to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che's amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix VII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion:

To delete "and" after "urban renewal;"; and to add "; (d) to explore the incorporation of various other elements, including the practice of mediation before application for compulsory sale, the actual timing of compulsory sale and independent valuation by the Lands Tribunal, etc., and require the Lands Tribunal to hand down judgments from the perspectives of protecting residents and public safety, while at the same time taking account of the ages and states of maintenance of the buildings concerned; (e) to enhance the Government's assistance for residents of old buildings, including making arrangement for professionals to explain the legislation and the mechanism for compulsory sale application and its operation, providing legal or other kinds of advice on individual cases, and assisting in organizing flat owners to increase their bargaining power when dealing with acquisition companies or developers, so as to prevent residents from being easily misled and lured to sell their flats at low prices, or from suffering losses of rights and interests due to their unfamiliarity

with the legislation; and (f) to step up the effort of monitoring the management and safety problems of old buildings susceptible to the impact of the Ordinance; if necessary, the Government should intervene in a timely manner, lest the reluctance of those owners holding the majority titles, after acquiring the majority of fragmented titles, to participate in building management and maintenance works, resulting in the deterioration of the safety and environmental hygiene of the buildings and making them unfit for human habitation, thereby protecting flat owners' rights and interests and ensure building safety" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon James TO's amendment to Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix VIII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Mrs Regina IP replied.

Question on Hon Mrs Regina IP's motion put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, nine were in favour of the motion, six against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 18 were in favour of the motion, two against it and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix IX**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 8 December 2010 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 10:00 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
9 February 2011

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 01/12/2010
 時間 TIME: 05:52:49 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 李卓人議員對黃國健議員就「全面檢討強制性公積金計劃」所提，經陳健波議員、~~及~~湯家驊議員~~及~~陳茂波議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEE CHEUK-YAN TO HON WONG KWOK-KIN'S MOTION ON "COMPREHENSIVELY REVIEWING THE MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEME" AS AMENDED BY HON CHAN KIN-POR, ~~AND~~ HON RONNY TONG ~~AND~~ HON PAUL CHAN

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	28	
投票 Vote	25	27	
贊成 Yes	9	20	
反對 No	11	7	
棄權 Abstain	5	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家騷 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 01/12/2010
 時間 TIME: 09:38:14 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 陳鑑林議員對葉劉淑儀議員的「檢討《土地（為重新發展而強制售賣）條例》的運作」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHAN KAM-LAM TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE OPERATION OF THE LAND (COMPULSORY SALE FOR REDEVELOPMENT) ORDINANCE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳鑑林CHAN Kam-lam

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	24	
投票 Vote	20	23	
贊成 Yes	11	7	
反對 No	6	16	
棄權 Abstain	3	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 01/12/2010
 時間 TIME: 09:41:09 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁美芬議員對葉劉淑儀議員的「檢討《土地（為重新發展而強制售賣）條例》的運作」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON PRISCILLA LEUNG TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE OPERATION OF THE LAND (COMPULSORY SALE FOR REDEVELOPMENT) ORDINANCE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	10	12	
反對 No	3	8	
棄權 Abstain	7	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 01/12/2010
時間 TIME: 09:43:06 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 吳靄儀議員對葉劉淑儀議員的「檢討《土地（為重新發展而強制售賣）條例》的運作」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY DR HON MARGARET NG TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE OPERATION OF THE LAND (COMPULSORY SALE FOR REDEVELOPMENT) ORDINANCE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	7	18	
反對 No	11	6	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄧家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
日期 DATE: 01/12/2010
時間 TIME: 09:45:01 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 黃毓民議員對葉劉淑儀議員的「檢討《土地（為重新發展而強制售賣）條例》的運作」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG YUK-MAN TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE OPERATION OF THE LAND (COMPULSORY SALE FOR REDEVELOPMENT) ORDINANCE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	3	16	
反對 No	14	6	
棄權 Abstain	3	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6
日期 DATE: 01/12/2010
時間 TIME: 09:47:02 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員對葉劉淑儀議員的「檢討《土地（為重新發展而強制售賣）條例》的運作」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON RONNY TONG TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE OPERATION OF THE LAND (COMPULSORY SALE FOR REDEVELOPMENT) ORDINANCE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	6	16	
反對 No	11	6	
棄權 Abstain	3	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 7
 日期 DATE: 01/12/2010
 時間 TIME: 09:49:00 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張國柱議員對葉劉淑儀議員的「檢討《土地（為重新發展而強制售賣）條例》的運作」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG KWOK-CHE TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE OPERATION OF THE LAND (COMPULSORY SALE FOR REDEVELOPMENT) ORDINANCE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張國柱CHEUNG Kwok-che

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	8	18	
反對 No	9	2	
棄權 Abstain	3	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 8
日期 DATE: 01/12/2010
時間 TIME: 09:50:56 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 涂謹申議員對葉劉淑儀議員的「檢討《土地（為重新發展而強制售賣）條例》的運作」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON JAMES TO TO HON MRS REGINA IP'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE OPERATION OF THE LAND (COMPULSORY SALE FOR REDEVELOPMENT) ORDINANCE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	10	18	
反對 No	8	2	
棄權 Abstain	2	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 9
 日期 DATE: 01/12/2010
 時間 TIME: 09:58:36 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「檢討《土地（為重新發展而強制售賣）條例》的運作」議案
 MOTION ON "REVIEWING THE OPERATION OF THE LAND (COMPULSORY SALE FOR REDEVELOPMENT) ORDINANCE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	9	18	
反對 No	6	2	
棄權 Abstain	5	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 IP LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK