

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 11

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 15 December 2010 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Members absent:

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBM, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Public Health and Municipal Services (Designation of Public Swimming Pools) Order 2010 (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	162/2010
2. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Amendment of Fourteenth Schedule) Order 2010 (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	163/2010
3. Public Health and Municipal Services (Setting Aside Places for Use as Public Pleasure Grounds) Order 2010 (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	164/2010
4. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Amendment of Fourth Schedule) (No. 2) Order 2010 (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	165/2010
5. Hong Kong Science and Technology Parks Corporation Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1) Notice 2010 (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	166/2010
6. Buildings Energy Efficiency Ordinance (Commencement) Notice 2010 (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	167/2010
7. Business Registration (Amendment) Ordinance 2010 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	168/2010
8. Companies (Amendment) Ordinance 2010 (Commencement) (No. 2) Notice 2010 (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	169/2010
9. Genetically Modified Organisms (Control of Release) Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	170/2010
10. Genetically Modified Organisms (Documentation for Import and Export) Regulation (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 10.12.2010)	171/2010

Other Papers

- No. 40 - Secretary for Home Affairs Incorporated
Audited financial statements together with the Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 March 2010 (published on 9.12.2010)
- No. 41 - Sir Edward Youde Memorial Fund
Signed and audited financial statements together with the Auditor's Report and the Report of the Board of Trustees for the period 1 April 2009 to 31 March 2010 (published on 9.12.2010)
- No. 42 - Social Work Training Fund
Forty-ninth Annual Report by the Trustee for the year ending on 31 March 2010 (published on 9.12.2010)
- No. 43 - Hong Kong Tourism Board Annual Report 2009/10 (published on 9.12.2010)
- No. 44 - Annual Report of the Equal Opportunities Commission 2009/10 (published on 10.12.2010)
- No. 45 - Queen Elizabeth Foundation for the Mentally Handicapped
Report and Accounts 2009-2010 (published on 10.12.2010)
- No. 46 - Report by the Controller, Government Flying Service on the Administration of the Government Flying Service Welfare Fund for the year ended 31 March 2010 and the audited financial statements together with the Director of Audit's report (published on 10.12.2010)
- No. 47 - The Accounts of the Lotteries Fund 2009-10 (published on 13.12.2010)
- No. 48 - The Board of Governors of the Prince Philip Dental Hospital
Annual Report 2009/10 (published on 13.12.2010)
- No. 49 - Police Welfare Fund Annual Report 2009/2010 (published on 13.12.2010)
- No. 50 - Annual Report on the Police Children's Education Trust and the Police Education and Welfare Trust 2009/2010 (published on 13.12.2010)

- No. 51 - The Sir Murray MacLehose Trust Fund
Signed and audited financial statements together with the Auditor's Report and Trustee's Report for the year 1 April 2009 to 31 March 2010 (published on 14.12.2010)
- No. 52 - General Chinese Charities Fund
Signed and audited financial statements together with the Auditor's Report and the Report on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2010 (published on 14.12.2010)
- No. 53 - Chinese Temples Fund
Signed and audited financial statements together with the Auditor's Report and the Report on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2010 (published on 15.12.2010)
- No. 54 - Grantham Scholarships Fund
Signed and audited financial statements together with the Auditor's Report and the Report by the Grantham Scholarships Fund Committee on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 August 2010 (published on 15.12.2010)
- No. 55 - Brewin Trust Fund
Audited financial statements together with the Auditor's Report and the Report by the Brewin Trust Fund Committee on the Administration of the Fund for the year ended 30 June 2010 (published on 15.12.2010)

Report No. 8/10-11 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 8.12.2010)

Report of the Bills Committee on Matrimonial Proceedings and Property (Amendment) Bill 2010 (published on 13.12.2010)

Questions

1. Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

2. Hon Albert CHAN asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

4. Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

5. Hon WONG Sing-chi asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Transport and Housing and the Secretary for Development replied.

6. Hon Paul TSE asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Chief Executive Election (Amendment) Bill 2010
Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2010

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Chief Executive Election (Amendment) Bill 2010
Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2010

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the Second reading and spoke on each of the above two Bills.

Question on the motion for the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debates on the above Bills were adjourned and the Bills were referred to the House Committee.

Matrimonial Proceedings and Property (Amendment) Bill 2010

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 30 June 2010 resumed.

Dr Hon Margaret NG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Matrimonial Proceedings and Property (Amendment) Bill 2010, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

While Dr Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:16 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

After the address, Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Two Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Justice replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the Matrimonial Proceedings and Property (Amendment) Bill 2010.

Question that clauses 1, 2 and 4 to 16 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 3 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Justice moved amendments to clause 3 and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clause 3 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Justice reported that

Matrimonial Proceedings and Property (Amendment) Bill 2010

had passed through the committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Justice replied.

Question on the Third Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Report of the Select Committee

Hon LI Fung-ying moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council endorses the Report of the Select Committee to Inquire into Matters Relating to the Post-service Work of Mr LEUNG Chin-man.

At 2:06 pm, while Hon LI Fung-ying was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Hon LI Fung-ying's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, who would move an amendment, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong had spoken, Hon Mrs Regina IP sought elucidation of a point raised by Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong in his speech. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong elucidated.

Hon Audrey EU, Hon Albert CHAN and Hon Ronny TONG, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Ronny TONG was speaking, Hon Albert CHAN sought elucidation of a point raised by Hon Ronny TONG in his speech. Hon Ronny TONG elucidated and continued to speak.

Twelve Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung declared that he was a member of the Committee on Review of Post-service Outside Work for Directorate Civil Servants. He then spoke on the motion.

Three other Members and Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Dr Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:25 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that he was a member of the Committee on Review of Post-service Outside Work for Directorate Civil Servants. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Two more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LI Fung-ying spoke on the amendments.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:39 pm, while the Chief Secretary for Administration was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Abraham SHEK declared that he was an independent non-executive director of NWS Holdings Limited.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU declared that he was a member of the Housing Authority while Mr LEUNG Chin-man was the Director of Buildings.

Hon IP Kwok-him declared that he was a member of the Housing Authority while Mr LEUNG Chin-man was the Permanent Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Housing).

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon LI Fung-ying's motion:

To add “, as the LEUNG Chin-man incident has aroused public concern,” after “That”; and to add “, and demands that the Chief Executive follow up the Report's criticisms against the relevant government officials and the Secretary for the Civil Service by taking disciplinary actions, assume responsibility for the grave errors committed by the various government departments in the LEUNG Chin-man incident, and review the disciplinary mechanism under the accountability system for principal officials, so as to allay public resentment” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendment to Hon LI Fung-ying's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Fred LI rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Report of the Select Committee” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following amendment to Hon LI Fung-ying’s motion:

To add “, as the LEUNG Chin-man incident has aroused strong public concern,” after “That”; and to add “, and urges the Chief Executive to take punitive action against Mr LEUNG Chin-man, and the relevant organizations to investigate the incident and take follow-up actions” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU’s amendment to Hon LI Fung-ying’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Audrey EU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 17 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following amendment to Hon LI Fung-ying's motion:

To add “, and expresses strong condemnation at LEUNG Chin-man's dishonest acts, such as his attempt to play down his role and participation in the Hunghom Peninsula case in the course of giving evidence to the Select Committee; this Council deeply regrets that when making the application to the Civil Service Bureau for employment with New World China Land Limited, LEUNG Chin-man gave the evasive answer of ‘a family friend’ to hide the fact that the job offer had come directly from the top management of New World Development Company Limited (‘NWDCL’); this Council also requests the Independent Commission Against Corruption to conduct a fresh investigation into LEUNG Chin-man's employment with NWDCL; moreover, given that in the incident of LEUNG Chin-man's employment with NWDCL, the Secretary for the Civil Service made a grave error of judgment, there was an obvious gap between her assessment and the views of the public, and she also failed to grasp public sentiments and understand public expectations and concerns, failed to discharge her role as the final gatekeeper of the Control Regime, failed to give precedence to the protection of the public interest and failed to uphold the approval criteria of the Control Regime, resulting in the Government's credibility being damaged; and that in handling the incident of LEUNG Chin-man's employment with NWDCL, the Secretary for the Civil Service and various senior officials had problems such as collective memory loss, which is unacceptable, this Council demands that the Secretary for the Civil Service assume political responsibility, take the blame and resign” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's amendment to Hon LI Fung-ying's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 23 against the amendment and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, one was in favour of the amendment, 22 against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following amendment to Hon LI Fung-ying's motion:

To add “, and urges the Chief Executive to review the control measures governing the post-service work of the officials under the accountability system on the basis of the Report's recommendations on the control measures regarding the post-service work of civil servants” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon LI Fung-ying's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and six against it (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LI Fung-ying replied.

Question on Hon LI Fung-ying's motion put and agreed to.

Seizing the opportunity presented by the Cross-Straits Economic Co-operation Framework Agreement and actively participating in the development of the Economic Zone on the West Coast of the Taiwan Strait

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Cross-Straits Economic Co-operation Framework Agreement has come into force, and the Twelfth Five-Year Plan of the Central Authorities have clearly stated the need to fully fulfil the function of early and pilot implementation of the Economic Zone on the West Coast of the Taiwan Strait ('the West Coast Economic Zone') in promoting cross-strait exchanges and co-operation, cross-strait economic relations will enter a new stage of development with a rapid rise of the West Coast Economic Zone, which will create profound and far-reaching impact on Hong Kong's economy; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to seize the opportunity through active participation and catch the 'West Coast Economic Zone express', so as to expand the scale of Hong Kong's services industries; the relevant measures should include:

- (a) to expeditiously formulate Hong Kong's regional development policy, and include the West Coast Economic Zone as a sub-core area of Hong Kong-Mainland economic co-operation, with a view to fostering closer co-operation between Hong Kong and the West Coast Economic Zone;
- (b) to set up a joint-conference mechanism for Hong Kong-Fujian co-operation, and establish a government office in the West Coast Economic Zone, so as to upgrade the level of co-operation between Hong Kong and the West Coast Economic Zone;
- (c) to strive for the inclusion of Fujian Province as an 'early and pilot implementation zone' under the Mainland and Hong Kong Closer Economic Partnership Arrangement, so as to intensify Hong Kong's co-operation with the West Coast Economic Zone;
- (d) to make strenuous efforts in building a 'Taiwan Strait tourism circle' comprising Fujian, Hong Kong, Macao and Taiwan;
- (e) to proactively take part in the development of Pingtan Island, and establish a Hong Kong services park on the island; and
- (f) to enhance the economic co-operation between Hong Kong and Taiwan, and include the development of the West Coast Economic Zone as part of Hong Kong-Taiwan economic co-operation.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's motion and spoke on the motion and the amendment:

To add “, as” after “That”; to delete “and” after “island;”; and to add “; and (g) to step up Hong Kong's investment promotion activities in the West Coast Economic Zone and offer concessionary initiatives to induce the enterprises there, such as those engaged in testing and certification, environmental industries and innovation and technology, to establish their bases in Hong Kong, with a view to promoting the development of Hong Kong's six industries with competitive edge and increasing employment opportunities for local workers” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Seven Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's motion put and agreed to.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam replied.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 5 January 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 10:10 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
9 February 2011

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 15/12/2010
時間 TIME: 07:58:17 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張文光議員對李鳳英議員的「專責委員會報告」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG TO HON LI FUNG-YING'S MOTION ON
"REPORT OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	26	
投票 Vote	25	25	
贊成 Yes	6	16	
反對 No	15	7	
棄權 Abstain	4	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	出席 PRESENT	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 15/12/2010
時間 TIME: 08:01:01 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 余若薇議員對李鳳英議員的「專責委員會報告」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON AUDREY EU TO HON LI FUNG-YING'S MOTION ON "REPORT OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	26	
投票 Vote	25	25	
贊成 Yes	3	17	
反對 No	17	6	
棄權 Abstain	5	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	棄權	ABSTAIN	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan			梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU			劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	出席	PRESENT	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	反對	NO	李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	反對	NO	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對	NO
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權	ABSTAIN	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	棄權	ABSTAIN
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP		
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	反對	NO	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 15/12/2010
時間 TIME: 08:03:01 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 陳偉業議員對李鳳英議員的「專責委員會報告」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT CHAN TO HON LI FUNG-YING'S MOTION ON "REPORT OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	0	1	
反對 No	23	22	
棄權 Abstain	2	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	出席 PRESENT	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 15/12/2010
 時間 TIME: 08:05:06 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員對李鳳英議員的「專責委員會報告」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON RONNY TONG TO HON LI FUNG-YING'S MOTION ON "REPORT OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	26	
投票 Vote	25	25	
贊成 Yes	9	19	
反對 No	15	6	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	棄權	ABSTAIN	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan			梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU			劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	出席	PRESENT	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	反對	NO	李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對	NO
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
梁家駒	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP		
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	反對	NO	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

秘書 CLERK