

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 15

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 19 January 2011 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Development

Dr Kitty POON Kit, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

## **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Building (Construction) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 14.1.2011)	3/2011
2. Building (Oil Storage Installations) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 14.1.2011)	4/2011
3. Shipping and Port Control (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 14.1.2011)	5/2011
4. Merchant Shipping (Seafarers) (Fees) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 14.1.2011)	6/2011
5. Dangerous Drugs Ordinance (Amendment of First Schedule) Order 2011 (gazetted on 14.1.2011)	7/2011
6. Control of Chemicals Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 2) Order 2011 (gazetted on 14.1.2011)	8/2011

### Other Paper

No. 58 - Legal Aid Services Council Annual Report 2009-2010 (published on 13.1.2011)

## **Questions**

1. Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon IP Wai-ming asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

3. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

4. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Development and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

5. Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

6. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Motions**

### **Proposed resolution under the Pharmacy and Poisons Ordinance**

The Secretary for Food and Health moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

**Resolved** that the following Regulations, made by the Pharmacy and Poisons Board on 28 December 2010, be approved —

- (a) the Pharmacy and Poisons (Amendment) (No. 5) Regulation 2010; and
- (b) the Poisons List (Amendment) (No. 5) Regulation 2010.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

## **Members' Motions**

### **Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance**

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

**Resolved** that in relation to the —

- (a) Minimum Wage (Criteria for Approved Assessors) Notice, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 1 of 2011; and
- (b) Minimum Wage (Assessment Methods) Notice, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 2 of 2011,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 12 January 2011, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 2 March 2011.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

### Reviewing public finances policies

Hon Paul CHAN moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That in the Budgets of the HKSAR Government in recent years, there have been big discrepancies in the forecasts of government revenue, budget surpluses and fiscal reserves, resulting in the incessant accumulation of fiscal reserves, but there are no clear criteria on what an appropriate level of fiscal reserves should be; at the same time, there are substantial accumulations in the Exchange Fund year over year, and the Government has set up, in different forms (e.g. fund), quite a number of 'small vaults' and owns many valuable assets (e.g. the shares of the MTR Corporation Limited and the Airport Authority), and that the financial strength of the Government can be described as enormous; however, despite the sustained economic growth of Hong Kong in the past decade or so, quite a number of low-income earners and the grassroots are completely unable to enjoy the benefits, giving rise to the phenomenon of the poor getting poorer and even the emergence of 'three have-nots' and 'five have-nots' in the society; in the past, the Government usually adopted across-the-board and one-off measures to return part of the surpluses to members of the public, but the relevant measures lacked long-term policy objectives and specific focuses, resulting in those who need help finding the measures insufficient to address their needs, and those who do not need help simply treating the measures as nice-to-haves and not caring at all; the increasing hardship of the livelihood of low-income persons has created social grievances and conflicts; with the Mainland's acceleration of full scale opening up and intensification of reforms as well as economic globalization, the economy of Hong Kong needs to be restructured, but the tax policy of Hong Kong has lagged behind the changes in business and competitive environment, thus threatening Hong Kong's competitiveness as an international financial, commercial and trade centre; moreover, Hong Kong's narrow tax base and the Government's over-reliance on land-related revenue poses the risk of instability to public finances; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to conduct a comprehensive and in-depth review of Hong Kong's policies and measures on taxation, social welfare and public finances, to clearly set an appropriate level of fiscal reserves, and to set up within the government structure a tax policy group with the employment of full-time tax experts to study the use of tax measures to dovetail with the Government's policies on economy and industries, upgrade Hong Kong's competitiveness as an international financial, commercial and trade centre, address the problem of poverty and eradicate social and economic inequalities.

While Hon Paul CHAN was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:16 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Paul CHAN's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che and Hon Ronny TONG, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Thirteen Members and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:30 pm, while Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Paul CHAN spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke again.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon Paul CHAN's motion:

To add “, as” after “That”; to add “causing the poverty population to continue to grow substantially and” after “benefits,”; to add “as well as the rich getting richer,” after “the poor getting poorer”; to add “intensifying” after “created”; to add “: (a)” after “this Council urges the Government”; to delete “and measures on taxation,” after “Hong Kong's policies” and substitute with “on taxation and expenditure, such as expediting the introduction of a progressive tax system, so that while the problem of narrow tax base can be ameliorated, the wealth of Hong Kong can also be reasonably and evenly redistributed, thereby narrowing the disparity between the rich and the poor in the society; (b) to review Hong Kong's policies and measures on”; to add “including the establishment of a universal retirement protection system, so as to lessen the drastic increases in the Government's welfare expenditure caused by the ageing population in the future; (c)” after “public finances,”; and to delete “, and” after “set an appropriate level of fiscal reserves” and substitute with “; (d) to review Hong Kong's high land-price policy, so as to reverse the Government's over-reliance on land auctions as the main revenue source, thus preventing exorbitant land prices and rents from hindering Hong Kong's industrial and commercial development and the development of individual industries; and (e)”.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Paul CHAN's motion proposed and put.

Hon Paul CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, six against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 21 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Reviewing public finances policies" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che moved the following amendment to Hon Paul CHAN's motion:

To add ", given that" after "That"; to add "tax regime, and especially in respect of profits tax, to consider computing the tax based on a progressive rate with a view to achieving a fairer distribution of social wealth, while at the same time reviewing the relationship between the present tax regime and the various contributory schemes, including the Mandatory Provident Fund schemes and the health insurance schemes currently under consultation, and considering counting the contributions concerned as tax already paid; moreover, this Council also hopes that the Government will review the" after "review of Hong Kong's"; to delete "taxation," after "and measures on"; to delete "to clearly set" after "public finances," and substitute with "including clearly setting"; and to delete "to set" after "fiscal reserves, and" and substitute with "setting".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che's amendment to Hon Paul CHAN's motion proposed and put.

Hon Paul CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, six against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 22 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following amendment to Hon Paul CHAN's motion:

To add "the existing high land-price policy as well as" after "review of"; and to delete "set an appropriate level of fiscal reserves" after "clearly" and substitute with "specify that generally, it will already be sufficient to only maintain fiscal reserves at a level of not exceeding 15 months of government expenditure, to study relaxing the restriction that the Government's recurrent expenditure shall not exceed 20% of the Gross Domestic Product".

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon Paul CHAN's motion proposed and put.

Hon Andrew LEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and seven abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon Paul CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Paul CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Ronny TONG put and agreed to.

### Improving primary health care

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the World Health Organization affirms in the Declaration of Alma-Ata on primary health care published in 1978 that the definition of health is not merely about the absence of diseases, but also refers to the state of complete physical, mental and social well-being, and primary health care seeks to attain the target of health for all; however, the health care system in Hong Kong at present is still based mainly on disease treatment and prevention, with a serious shortage of resources for primary health care work, and primary health care work is mainly confined to primary medical care, thereby failing to attain the target of promoting health for all; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to take measures to give effect to the Declaration of Alma-Ata, including:

- (a) to comprehensively improve primary health care and allocate additional resources for primary health care;
- (b) to set up a fund for promoting primary health care reform;
- (c) to formulate a co-ordination mechanism to facilitate full co-operation between relevant government departments and local organizations in making improvements in areas such as labour, education, housing, public facilities and food safety, etc., so as to promote public health;
- (d) focusing on various areas of health, to set 'Healthy People 10-year Indicators' and formulate work plans for individual health indicators;
- (e) to promote a campaign on healthy community and, through community organizations and government departments, mobilize community members to take part in planning and improving primary medical care in their communities, and fully utilize community resources to promote residents' health; and
- (f) having regard to the health problems and needs of different population groups, such as elderly persons, women, men, working people, youth and children, to devise various strategies and services and increase resources allocation, with a view to enhancing health education and services for disease prevention and control.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed.

The President stated that Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Alan LEONG, Hon CHAN Kin-por and Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau would move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move an amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Alan LEONG, Hon CHAN Kin-por, Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau and Hon WONG Kwok-hing, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Nine Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO declared that he had participated in different areas of medical services. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion:

To add “, as” after “That”; to add “, and the World Health Report 2008 emphasizes once again that primary health care should be positioned to attach equal importance to both prevention and treatment as well as the development of comprehensive health care” after “target of health for all”; to delete “and” after “promote residents' health;”; and to add “; (g) to make estimates on the resources and manpower required for the provision of primary health care, so as to establish its way forward and related details; (h) to enhance the communication, co-operation and co-ordination among medical professionals in the public sector and private sector, with a view to more comprehensively finding out and meeting people's needs; (i) to expand health services teams for enhancing health care in schools, residential care homes for the elderly, etc., with a view to further implementing community-based health care and promoting holistic health; and (j) to encourage the general public to take part in caring for their own health, so as to strengthen their initiative and self-management in caring for their own health” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon Joseph LEE's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Dr Hon Joseph LEE's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Hak-kan to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE:

To add “; (k) to improve the modes of provision of primary medical care, with a view to providing person-centred and community-based multi-disciplinary team services; (l) to improve public primary medical care and provide adequate resources to ensure that the socially disadvantaged and the elderly can more easily receive comprehensive primary medical care and nursing care; (m) to increase the amount of Elderly Healthcare Vouchers to \$1,000 and lower the eligibility age to 65; (n) to provide elderly persons with public dental services; (o) to introduce a cervical cancer vaccination programme and a breast cancer screening programme for the suitable women; (p) to provide adequate services to attain the goal of early detection and early intervention, thereby assisting children with learner diversity problems; and (q) to launch a colon cancer screening programme for people from age groups with higher risks” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE proposed, put and agreed to.

As Dr Hon Joseph LEE's and Hon CHAN Hak-kan's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE and Hon CHAN Hak-kan:

To add “; (r) to promote territory-wide participation so as to forge a consensus on formulating a strategy and direction for promoting health for all; (s) to establish a database, and through scientific surveys, to find out the health conditions of people in various districts and groups; (t) to conduct exchanges with other cities on the Mainland and overseas, with a view to learning and drawing lessons from their experience in promoting health for all; (u) to negotiate and collaborate with neighbouring places to establish a regional framework, so as to resolve the health problems of public concern; and (v) to extend the School Dental Care Service to secondary school students, so as to strengthen students' dental health care” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE and Hon CHAN Hak-kan proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Miriam LAU to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou:

To add “; (w) to explore the provision of appropriate assistance to encourage all people to undergo physical check-up, thereby achieving the targets of upgrading public health and lessening health care expenditure in the long run; and (x) to increase allocation of resources to shorten elderly persons' waiting time for day surgery on diseases such as cataract and hernia” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Miriam LAU had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Alan LEONG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Miriam LAU:

To add “; (y) to make the social environment much healthier through efforts in different policy areas, such as expediting air quality improvement, strengthening the promotion of sports for all and setting maximum working hours, etc.; (z) to establish additional elderly health centres and woman health centres, etc., so as to reduce the present waiting time of more than 24 months for elderly health centre services, explore the provision of regular physical check-up for grassroots, and provide a greater variety of vaccination programmes, such as 13-valent pneumococcal conjugate vaccination; and (aa) to more actively promote and advocate the importance of mental health among members of the public, increase funding for psychiatric service and set up a mental health council with members comprising medical workers, patients, patients' family members and other stakeholders, and expeditiously formulate a mental health policy, so as to co-ordinate primary mental health services and provide patients with basic, comprehensive, sustained and co-ordinated treatment and nursing care” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Miriam LAU proposed.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's amendment:

To add "health centres for men," after "establishing additional".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's amendment proposed and put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG's amendment, as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Miriam LAU put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Alan LEONG and Hon WONG Kwok-hing had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Kin-por to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHAN Kin-por moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Alan LEONG and Hon WONG Kwok-hing:

To add "; and (ab) to allocate additional resources for members of the public to undergo health risk assessments and distribute health check vouchers to those aged 50 or above, so as to enable them to find out the changes in their physical health and seek early treatment, or to improve their health through physical exercises" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Kin-por's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Alan LEONG and Hon WONG Kwok-hing proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Alan LEONG, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon CHAN Kin-por had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Alan LEONG, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon CHAN Kin-por:

To add “; (ac) to promote public-private partnership and expand the existing health care voucher scheme, so as to assist the elderly and low-income earners in receiving better primary medical care; and (ad) to promote health screening programmes which have been medically proven to be effective, such as fecal occult blood test, etc.” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Alan LEONG, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon CHAN Kin-por proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LEE Wing-tat replied.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion as amended by Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Alan LEONG, Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon CHAN Kin-por and Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau put and agreed to.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 26 January 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:46 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
16 February 2011

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 19/01/2011  
時間 TIME: 04:19:09 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對陳茂波議員的「公共財政政策的檢討」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON PAUL CHAN'S MOTION ON  
"REVIEWING PUBLIC FINANCES POLICIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	24	
投票 Vote	18	23	
贊成 Yes	8	21	
反對 No	6	1	
棄權 Abstain	4	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 19/01/2011  
時間 TIME: 04:22:06 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張國柱議員對陳茂波議員的「公共財政政策的檢討」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG KWOK-CHE TO HON PAUL CHAN'S MOTION ON  
"REVIEWING PUBLIC FINANCES POLICIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張國柱CHEUNG Kwok-che

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	25	
投票 Vote	18	24	
贊成 Yes	8	22	
反對 No	6	1	
棄權 Abstain	4	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 19/01/2011  
 時間 TIME: 04:24:05 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員對陳茂波議員的「公共財政政策的檢討」議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON RONNY TONG TO HON PAUL CHAN'S MOTION ON "REVIEWING  
 PUBLIC FINANCES POLICIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	25	
投票 Vote	18	24	
贊成 Yes	11	16	
反對 No	1	1	
棄權 Abstain	6	7	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉焯發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK