

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 16

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 26 January 2011 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS , JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Member absent:**

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Miss Adeline WONG Ching-man, JP  
Under Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

## **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Schedule of Routes (Citybus Limited) Order 2011 (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	12/2011
2. Schedule of Routes (Citybus Limited) (North Lantau and Chek Lap Kok Airport) Order 2011 (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	13/2011
3. Schedule of Routes (Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited) Order 2011 (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	14/2011
4. Schedule of Routes (Long Win Bus Company Limited) Order 2011 (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	15/2011
5. Schedule of Routes (New Lantao Bus Company (1973) Limited) Order 2011 (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	16/2011
6. Schedule of Routes (New World First Bus Services Limited) Order 2011 (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	17/2011
7. Buildings Energy Efficiency (Fees) Regulation (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	18/2011
8. Buildings Energy Efficiency (Registered Energy Assessors) Regulation (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	19/2011
9. Travel Industry Compensation Fund (Amount of Ex gratia Payments and Financial Penalty) (Amendment) Rules 2011 (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	20/2011
10. Factories and Industrial Undertakings (Loadshifting Machinery) Regulation (Commencement) Notice 2011 (gazetted on 21.1.2011)	21/2011

### Other Papers

- No. 59 - Samaritan Fund  
Financial statements, Report of the Director of Audit and  
Report on the Samaritan Fund for the year ended 31 March  
2010 (published on 21.1.2011)
- No. 60 - Hospital Authority Annual Report 2009-2010 (published on  
21.1.2011)

Report No. 11/10-11 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary  
Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 20.1.2011)

### Questions

1. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for  
Food and Health replied.

2. Hon Ronny TONG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for  
Labour and Welfare replied.

3. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for  
Transport and Housing replied.

4. Hon Fred LI asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

5. Hon Vincent FANG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

6. Hon WONG Yuk-man asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### First Reading

#### Companies Bill

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

#### Companies Bill

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.



Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

### **Members' Motions**

#### Equal Opportunities Commission's Formal Investigation Report on Accessibility in Publicly Accessible Premises

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council notes the Equal Opportunities Commission's Formal Investigation Report on Accessibility in Publicly Accessible Premises and the Government's response to and follow-up action on the 23 recommendations in the Report.

While Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:24 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion.

Four Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Frederick FUNG declared that he was a board member of the Equal Opportunities Commission. He then spoke on the motion.

Two other Members and Hon IP Wai-ming spoke on the motion.

At 3:05 pm, while Hon IP Wai-ming was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon IP Wai-ming declared that one of his family members needed to use a wheelchair after suffering from a stroke.

Thirteen more Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

### The centenary of the Xinhai Revolution

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Chinese people successfully toppled the monarchy in the Xinhai Revolution 100 years ago and established the first democratic republic in Asia; unfortunately, after the passage of 100 years, with the exception that the people in Taiwan can, through a democratic electoral system which is fair, open, impartial and based on the principles of universality and equality, choose their own government and return their elected representative assemblies, the people in Mainland China, Macao and Hong Kong are still unable to enjoy direct and full electoral rights; in view of this, on this day which is almost 100 years after the Xinhai Revolution, this Council urges the Chinese people all over the world to adhere to the teachings of the Founding Father and strive to promote nationalism, livelihood and democracy, so that democratization, human rights and the rule of law can be expeditiously realized on the soil of China.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon IP Kwok-him, who intended to move an amendment, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon IP Kwok-him was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:58 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon WONG Yuk-man, who intended to move an amendment, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, Hon Albert CHAN sought elucidation on the contents of the Secretary's speech. The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs did not accede to the request and continued to speak.

Hon Albert CHAN stood up and interrupted the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs by speaking aloud. Hon Albert CHAN then left the Chamber.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung drew the attention of the President's Deputy that the expression used by Hon Albert CHAN was in breach of the Rules of Procedure.

The President's Deputy stated that she would suspend the meeting, so that the President could watch the video tape recording of the relevant proceedings and make a ruling on whether the expression in question had breached the Rules of Procedure.

The President's Deputy suspended the meeting at 7:15 pm.

The Council resumed at 7:32 pm.

The President resumed the chair and stated that Hon TAM Yiu-chung considered that Hon Albert CHAN had used offensive language, and therefore had breached Rule 41(4) of the Rules of Procedure. The President further stated that although the expression concerned had been used in Council by other Members and had not been questioned by Members, it did not mean that such an expression was not offensive. The President said that after watching the video recording, he ruled that the expression used by Hon Albert CHAN about the public officer concerned was offensive. Members should not use this expression about other Members or public officers during Council meetings. The President then asked the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs to continue with his speech.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eleven Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon IP Kwok-him raised a point of order on whether Hon Albert CHAN would be required to withdraw the expression concerned.

The President stated that his ruling sought to ask Members not to use such an offensive expression again in the future. There was no provision in the Rules of Procedure for dealing with Members using offensive language.

Two others Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Hon IP Kwok-him moved the following amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion:

To delete "first democratic republic in Asia; unfortunately, after the passage of 100 years, with the exception that the people in Taiwan can, through a democratic electoral system which is fair, open, impartial and based on the principles of universality and equality, choose their own government and return their elected representative assemblies, the people in Mainland China, Macao and Hong Kong are still unable to enjoy direct and full electoral rights; in view of this," after "established the" and substitute with "republican form of government;"; to delete "teachings of the Founding Father and" after "adhere to the" and substitute with "unfulfilled aspirations of Dr SUN Yat-sen and other revolutionary vanguards, continue to"; to delete "so that" after "livelihood and democracy," and substitute with "foster the grand unity of all Chinese people of the Mainland and overseas, and join hands to promote the peaceful reunification of the Motherland, so as to bring forth the rejuvenation of the Chinese nation and continuous improvements to"; and to delete "can be expeditiously realized" after "rule of law".

Question on Hon IP Kwok-him's amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and four against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Yuk-man moved the following amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion:

To add “the Xinhai Revolution was first nurtured in Hong Kong, and during Dr SUN Yat-sen’s early revolutionary career, Hong Kong was the base of his revolutionary campaign; while studying in Hong Kong, he witnessed the perverse and evil politics of the Qing on Mainland China, thus forming the revolutionary ideas underpinned by the question ‘Why can we not reform the evil politics in China?’;” after “full electoral rights;” and to add “; and this Council also urges the HKSAR Government to incorporate the history and impact of the Xinhai Revolution and its relationship with Hong Kong into the curriculum guide of national education under the subject of Liberal Studies, so as to cultivate young people’s democratic qualities” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man’s amendment to Hon Albert CHAN’s motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN’s motion put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, four were in favour of the motion, seven against it and nine abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and eight against it (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

**Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 16 February 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 9:28 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
23 February 2011

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 26/01/2011  
時間 TIME: 09:16:59 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 葉國謙議員對陳偉業議員的「辛亥革命百周年」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON IP KWOK-HIM TO HON ALBERT CHAN'S MOTION ON "THE CENTENARY OF THE XINHAI REVOLUTION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 葉國謙 IP Kwok-him

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	25	
投票 Vote	21	24	
贊成 Yes	17	8	
反對 No	4	16	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 26/01/2011  
時間 TIME: 09:20:52 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 黃毓民議員對陳偉業議員的「辛亥革命百周年」議案作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG YUK-MAN TO HON ALBERT CHAN'S MOTION ON "THE CENTENARY OF THE XINHAI REVOLUTION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	25	
投票 Vote	21	24	
贊成 Yes	6	16	
反對 No	8	8	
棄權 Abstain	7	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK





投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 26/01/2011  
時間 TIME: 09:26:34 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「辛亥革命百周年」議案  
MOTION ON "THE CENTENARY OF THE XINHAI REVOLUTION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	25	
投票 Vote	20	24	
贊成 Yes	4	16	
反對 No	7	8	
棄權 Abstain	9	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

