

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 19

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 2 March 2011 at 11:00 am,
Thursday 3 March 2011 at 9:00 am, Friday 4 March 2011 at 9:00 am
and Saturday 5 March 2011 at 9:00 am**

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 5.3.2011)

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS , JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Public officers attending:

On 2.3.2011

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, GBS, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Julia LEUNG Fung-yee, JP
Under Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Mr LAI Tung-kwok, SBS, IDSM, JP
Under Secretary for Security

On 2.3.2011, 3.3.2011, 4.3.2011 and 5.3.2011

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Miss Adeline WONG Ching-man, JP
Under Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

On 2.3.2011, 4.3.2011 and 5.3.2011

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

On 2.3.2011 and 5.3.2011

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

Clerks in attendance:

On 2.3.2011

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

On 2.3.2011, 3.3.2011 and 4.3.2011

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

On 2.3.2011, 3.3.2011, 4.3.2011 and 5.3.2011

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

On 3.3.2011, 4.3.2011 and 5.3.2011

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Public Revenue Protection (Dutiable Commodities) Order 2011 (gazetted on 23.2.2011)	32/2011
2. Public Revenue Protection (Motor Vehicles First Registration Tax) Order 2011 (gazetted on 23.2.2011)	33/2011
3. Rating (Exemption) Order 2011 (gazetted on 23.2.2011)	34/2011
4. Legal Aid (Assessment of Resources and Contributions) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 25.2.2011)	35/2011
5. Protection of Endangered Species of Animals and Plants Ordinance (Amendment of Schedules 1 and 3) Order 2011 (gazetted on 25.2.2011)	36/2011

Other Papers

- No. 68 - The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts Annual Report 2009-2010, and Financial statements and Auditor's report for the year ended 30 June 2010 (published on 25.2.2011)
- No. 69 - Hong Kong Arts Development Council Annual Report 2009/10 (published on 25.2.2011)
- No. 70 - Audited financial statements together with the Auditor's report and Report on Activities of the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority for the year ended 31 August 2010 (published on 24.2.2011)

- No. 71 - Estimates
for the year ending 31 March 2012
General Revenue Account
- Consolidated Summary of Estimates
- Revenue Analysis by Head (published on 25.2.2011)

Report No. 14/10-11 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 23.2.2011)

Report of the Bills Committee on Chief Executive Election (Amendment) Bill 2010 and Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2010 (published on 28.2.2011)

Report of the Bills Committee on Motor Vehicle Idling (Fixed Penalty) Bill (published on 25.2.2011)

Questions

1. Hon Starry LEE asked Question 1 and sought the President's ruling on whether Question 1 could be postponed as the majority of Members had not yet received the Administration's reply to the question.

The President asked Secretariat staff to immediately distribute the Administration's reply to Members and stated that Members would have time to read it when the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied to Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury explained that the reply was sent to the Legislative Council Secretariat at around 10 am⁽¹⁾, as extra time was required to finalize the details contained in the reply. The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury apologized for being a bit late in providing the reply. The Secretary then replied to Question 1.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

⁽¹⁾ The Director of Administration sent a letter to the Legislative Council Secretariat on 14 March 2011 clarifying that the reply was sent to the Legislative Council Secretariat at 10:46 am.

2. Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG asked a supplementary question and declared that she was a property owner in Hunghom. The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Four other Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

3. Hon CHIM Pui-chung asked Question 3.

While Hon CHIM Pui-chung was speaking, the President left the chair at 11:51 am temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Hon Abraham SHEK declared that he was a non-executive director of SJM Holdings Limited. He then asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

4. Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

At 12:17 pm, while the Secretary for the Civil Service was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

5. Hon CHAN Kin-por asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

6. Hon Paul CHAN asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Motion for the adjournment of the Council

Hon Jeffrey LAM moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council do now adjourn for the purpose of debating the following issue: acts of violence against the Chief Executive and public officers.

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Security said that he would reply after Members had spoken on the motion.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the motion.

While Hon WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three Members and Hon WONG Yuk-man spoke on the motion.

At 2:09 pm, while Hon WONG Yuk-man was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Seven Members and Hon Paul TSE spoke on the motion.

While Hon Paul TSE was speaking, the President left the chair at 3:38 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Four other Members and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke on the motion.

At 4:33 pm, while Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Four more Members and Hon KAM Nai-wai spoke on the motion.

While Hon KAM Nai-wai was speaking, Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai interrupted to elucidate a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon KAM Nai-wai. The President asked Dr LAM to be seated.

Hon KAM Nai-wai continued to speak on the motion.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the motion.

While the Secretary for Security was speaking, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung interrupted to request the Secretary for Security to elucidate a point made in his speech. The Secretary for Security did not accede to the request and continued to speak.

The President reminded Members that if the motion for the adjournment was passed, he would adjourn the meeting in accordance with the Rules of Procedure and the unfinished business would not be dealt with.

Question on the motion put and negatived.

Bills

Chief Executive Election (Amendment) Bill 2010

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 15 December 2010 resumed.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Chief Executive Election (Amendment) Bill 2010, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Three Members and Hon Ronny TONG spoke on the Bill.

While Hon Ronny TONG was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:48 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Seven other Members and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the Bill.

At 8:00 pm, while Hon LEE Wing-tat was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

One more Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that there were 45 Members, 35 were in favour of the motion and nine against it (voting record in **Appendix 1**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Chief Executive Election (Amendment) Bill 2010.

Question that clauses 2, 4 and 8 to 14 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1 and 7 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved amendments to clauses 1 and 7 and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1 and 7 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 3 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that Dr Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move an amendment to clause 3 to amend the amendment proposed in the Bill in respect of section 16 of the Chief Executive Election Ordinance.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved an amendment to clause 3 and spoke on the amendment.

A Member spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendment.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question on the amendment to clause 3 moved by Dr Hon Margaret NG put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it (voting record in **Appendix 2**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the other provisions of the Chief Executive Election (Amendment) Bill 2010 or amendments thereto, the committee do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 14 were in favour of the motion and seven against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, seven were in favour of the motion and 15 against it (voting record in **Appendix 3**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Question that clause 3 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clause 5 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that Dr Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move amendments to subclauses (3), (4) and (6) to (34) of clause 5 to amend the amendments proposed in the Bill in respect of Tables 1 to 3 in section 2 of the Schedule to the Chief Executive Election Ordinance.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved amendments to subclauses (3), (4) and (6) to (34) of clause 5 and spoke on the amendments.

Two Members spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendments.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

A Member spoke on the amendments.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke for the third time.

Question on the amendments to subclauses (3), (4) and (6) to (34) of clause 5 moved by Dr Hon Margaret NG put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, three were in favour of the amendments, 20 against them and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendments and eight against them (voting record in **Appendix 4**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendments were negatived.

Dr Hon Margaret NG referred to the voting results and clarified that she was in favour of the amendments.

The Chairman stated that Dr Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move amendments to subclauses (36), (37), (39) and (41) of clause 5 to amend the amendments proposed in the Bill in respect of Table 4 in section 2 of the Schedule to the Chief Executive Election Ordinance.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved amendments to subclauses (36), (37), (39) and (41) of clause 5 and spoke on the amendments.

A Member spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendments.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question on the amendments to subclauses (36), (37), (39) and (41) of clause 5 moved by Dr Hon Margaret NG put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, four were in favour of the amendments, 16 against them and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendments, seven against them and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix 5**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendments were negatived.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong referred to the voting results and clarified that he was against the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved an amendment to subclause (42) of clause 5 and spoke on the amendment.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Question that clause 5 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 9:59 pm.

* * * * *

The committee resumed at 9:00 am on 3 March 2011.

Question that clause 6 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that Dr Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move an amendment to clause 6 to amend the proposal made in the Bill in respect of adding section 2A of the Schedule to the Chief Executive Election Ordinance.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved an amendment to clause 6 and spoke on the amendment.

A Member spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendment.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question on the amendment to clause 6 moved by Dr Hon Margaret NG put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

After the division bell had been rung for three minutes, the Chairman noted the absence of a quorum and directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present and Members proceeded to vote.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 13 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and eight against it (voting record in **Appendix 6**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 6 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

New clauses 2A, 3A, 3B and 3C read the first time.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the Second Reading of new clauses 2A, 3A, 3B and 3C and spoke on the new clauses.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 2A, 3A, 3B and 3C proposed.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the new clauses.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 2A, 3A, 3B and 3C put and agreed to.

New clauses 2A, 3A, 3B and 3C read the second time.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the addition of new clauses 2A, 3A, 3B and 3C to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the motion moved by the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs to add new clauses 2A, 3A, 3B and 3C had been passed, he had given leave for Dr Hon Margaret NG to renumber the new clause 3A proposed by her as new clause 3D.

New clause 3D read the first time.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved the Second Reading of new clause 3D and spoke on the new clause.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 3D proposed.

Fifteen Members and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou spoke on the new clause.

While Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 12:15 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

A Member spoke on the new clause.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke for the second time.

With the permission of the Chairman's Deputy, Hon TAM Yiu-chung elucidated a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon LEE Wing-tat.

Another Member and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the new clause.

At 1:16 pm, while Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung, Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG and Hon Audrey EU spoke for the second time.

The Chairman reminded Members that they should make good use of their speaking time and avoid repeating the points which they had already made in their earlier speeches.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke for the third time.

Hon Albert CHAN spoke for the second time.

Another Member spoke on the new clause.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the new clause.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 3D put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, 13 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion, four against it and six abstained (voting record in **Appendix 7**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

New clause 10A read the first time.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved the Second Reading of new clause 10A and spoke on the new clause.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 10A proposed.

Three Members spoke on the new clause.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the new clause.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 10A put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, four were in favour of the motion, 20 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and nine against it (voting record in **Appendix 8**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs reported that

the Chief Executive Election (Amendment) Bill 2010

had passed through Committee stage with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed.

A Member and Hon Cyd HO spoke on the motion.

While Hon Cyd HO was speaking, the President stated that the purpose of Members speaking at Third Reading was for them to state briefly how they would vote. The President reminded Members that as they had already discussed the policy or political issues of the Bill during its Second Reading debate, Members should make good use of their speaking time at Third Reading.

Hon Cyd HO continued to speak on the motion.

A Member and Hon Andrew CHENG spoke on the motion.

While Hon Andrew CHENG was speaking, the President reiterated that Members should not repeat the points which had already been made during the Second Reading debate on the Bill.

Hon Andrew CHENG continued to speak.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President reminded him not to repeat the points which he had ample opportunities to make earlier.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to speak.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Question on the Third Reading put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that there were 54 Members present, 42 were in favour of the motion and 11 against it (voting record in **Appendix 9**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2010

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 15 December 2010 resumed.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2010, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Three Members and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the Bill.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs sought elucidation of a point raised by Hon Frederick FUNG in his speech. Hon Frederick FUNG elucidated and continued to speak.

Four Members and Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the Bill.

While Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, Hon WONG Yuk-man drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Albert CHAN continued to speak on the Bill.

With the President's permission, Hon Frederick FUNG elucidated a point raised by Hon Albert CHAN in his speech which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon Albert CHAN.

Five Members and Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO spoke on the Bill.

While Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:21 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Four Members and Hon Alan LEONG spoke on the Bill.

At 8:31 pm, while Hon Alan LEONG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that there were 47 Members present, 36 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix 10**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2010.

Question that clauses 2, 4, 5, 10, 11, 13, 16, 19 to 28, 31, 38 to 42, 44, 45 and 47 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 6, 14, 29, 30 and 37 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved amendments to clauses 1, 6, 14, 29, 30 and 37 and spoke on the amendments.

Question that amendments moved by the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 6, 14, 29, 30 and 37 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 7, 8, 9 and 32 to 36 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Dr Hon Margaret NG to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure in order that the committee of the whole Council might consider clauses 3, 7, 8, 9 and 32 to 36 together with new clauses 5A, 5B, 5C, 6B, 6C, 6H, 6I, 8A, 8B, 9A and 36A.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into committee again.

New clauses 5A, 5B, 5C, 6B, 6C, 6H, 6I, 8A, 8B, 9A and 36A read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Dr Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move the addition of new clauses 5A, 5B, 5C, 6B, 6C, 6H, 6I, 8A, 8B, 9A and 36A, as well as the amendments to clauses 7, 8, 9 and 32 to 36. She also intended to amend clause 3 to add the definition of “working persons”. In addition, the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs had given notice to move amendments to clauses 9, 33, 34 and 35.

The Chairman further stated that if Dr Hon Margaret NG's motion to add new clauses 5A, 5B, 5C, 6B, 6C, 6H, 6I, 8A, 8B, 9A and 36A was passed, she would forthwith move amendments to clauses 7, 8, 9 and 32 to 36. If Dr Hon Margaret NG's motion to add new clauses and the abovementioned amendments were passed, the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs might not move his amendments.

The Chairman said that there would be a joint debate on the original provisions of clauses 3, 7, 8, 9 and 32 to 36 and the amendments thereto as well as the proposed new clauses. Whether Dr Hon Margaret NG would be invited to move amendments to clause 3 would depend on the voting results in this debate session and the next debate session.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved the Second Reading of new clauses 5A, 5B, 5C, 6B, 6C, 6H, 6I, 8A, 8B, 9A and 36A and spoke on the new clauses.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 5A, 5B, 5C, 6B, 6C, 6H, 6I, 8A, 8B, 9A and 36A proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the new clauses.

A Member spoke on the new clauses.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 9:57 pm.

* * * * *

The committee resumed at 9:00 am on 4 March 2011.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the new clauses and declared that in the 1995 Legislative Council election, she was returned from the Transport and Communication Functional Constituency, which was one of the "nine new functional constituencies" added under the proposal made by the then Governor, Mr Christopher Patten.

Eight Members spoke on the new clauses.

After Hon Ronny TONG had spoken, Dr Hon Margaret NG raised a point of order on whether the Chairman would remind Members that their speeches should focus on the contents of the new clauses, as her amendments were to replace corporate votes by votes of "working persons".

The Chairman reminded Members again that their speeches should focus on the contents of the new clauses proposed by Dr Hon Margaret NG.

Three Members spoke on the new clauses.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke for the second time.

Another Member spoke on the new clauses.

Hon Paul TSE spoke for the second time.

While Hon Paul TSE was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 12:10 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon WONG Yuk-man spoke for the second time.

Four Members spoke on the new clauses.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke for the second time.

Another Member and Hon CHIM Pui-chung spoke on the new clauses.

At 1:33 pm, while Hon CHIM Pui-chung was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Hon Audrey EU and Hon Albert CHAN spoke for the second time.

Hon Paul TSE spoke for the third time.

After Hon Paul TSE had spoken, the Chairman reiterated that Members should be concise if they wished to speak more than once to respond to the points made by other Members.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke for the second time.

Another Member spoke on the new clauses.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the new clauses.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke for the third time.

After Dr Hon Margaret NG had spoken, the Chairman stated that two Members had requested to speak. The Chairman reminded Members again that they should be concise and indicated that he would invite Dr Hon Margaret NG, who was the mover of the amendments, to speak again after Members had spoken.

Four other Members spoke on the new clauses.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke for the fourth time.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 5A, 5B, 5C, 6B, 6C, 6H, 6I, 8A, 8B, 9A and 36A put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, four were in favour of the motion and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 11 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix 11**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the other provisions of the Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2010 or amendments thereto, the committee do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

After the division bell had been rung for three minutes, the Chairman suspended the meeting at 3:37 pm due to a malfunction in the Electronic Voting System.

The committee resumed at 3:43 pm.

The Chairman ordered that the division bell be rung for three minutes again.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, four were in favour of the motion and 11 against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were against the motion and seven abstained (voting record in **Appendix 12**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

The Chairman stated that as Dr Hon Margaret NG's motion to add new clauses had been negated, she might not move amendments to clauses 7, 8, 9 and 32 to 36.

Question that clauses 7, 8, 32 and 36 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved amendments to clauses 9, 33, 34 and 35.

Question that amendments moved by the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 9, 33, 34 and 35 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Dr Hon Margaret NG to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure in order that the committee of the whole Council could consider clause 3 together with new clauses 6D, 6E, 6F and 6G.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into committee again.

New clauses 6D, 6E, 6F and 6G read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Dr Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move the addition of new clauses 6D, 6E, 6F and 6G, as well as the amendment to clause 3 to add the definition of “relevant persons”. The Chairman further stated that if Dr Hon Margaret NG’s motion to add new clauses was passed, she might later move amendments to clause 3.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved second reading of new clauses 6D, 6E, 6F and 6G and spoke on the new clauses.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 6D, 6E, 6F and 6G proposed.

A member spoke on the new clauses.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the new clauses.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question that new clauses 6D, 6E, 6F and 6G be read the second time put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, 17 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, nine were in favour of the motion, seven against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix 13**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Dr Hon Margaret NG’s motion to add new clauses had been negatived, she might not move amendments to clause 3.

Question that clause 3 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Dr Hon Margaret NG to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure in order that the committee of the whole Council might consider new clause 6A ahead of other clauses.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into committee again.

New clause 6A read the first time.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved second reading of new clause 6A and spoke on the new clause.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 6A proposed.

A member spoke on the new clause.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the new clause.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 6A put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, four were in favour of the motion, 19 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, seven against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix 14**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Question that clause 12 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Dr Hon Margaret NG to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure in order that the committee of the whole Council might consider clause 12 together with new clause 3A.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into committee again.

New clause 3A read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Dr Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move an amendment to clause 12, as well as the addition of new clause 3A. If Dr Hon Margaret NG's amendment to clause 12 was passed, she might move the addition of new clause 3A.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved an amendment to clause 12 and spoke on the amendment.

Six Members spoke on the amendment.

Hon Ronny TONG and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke for the second time.

After Hon LEE Wing-tat had spoken, the Chairman reminded Members that their speeches should focus on the contents of the amendment.

A Member spoke on the amendment.

Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon Alan LEONG spoke for the second time.

While Hon Alan LEONG was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 6:18 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke for the third time.

While Hon LEE Wing-tat was speaking, Dr Hon Margaret NG raised a point of order that she hoped that the Chairman's Deputy could remind Members again that their speeches should focus on the contents of the amendment.

The Chairman's Deputy stated that she had been waiting for Hon LEE Wing-tat to make his point. The Chairman's Deputy reminded Hon LEE Wing-tat to focus his speech on the contents of the amendment.

Hon LEE Wing-tat continued to speak on the amendment.

Another Member spoke on the amendment.

Hon Alan LEONG spoke for the third time.

One more Member spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendment.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

The Chairman's Deputy reminded Members that if Dr Hon Margaret NG's amendment to clause 12 was negatived, the committee would not deal with new clause 3A.

Question that the amendment to clause 12 moved by Dr Hon Margaret NG put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman's Deputy then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 7:16 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, one was in favour of the amendment and 23 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it (voting record in **Appendix 15**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Dr Hon Margaret NG's amendment had been negatived, the committee would not deal with new clause 3A.

Question that clause 12 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 15, 17, 18 and 46 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that Dr Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move amendments to clause 15 and the deletion of clauses 17 and 18. Hon WONG Kwok-kin had also given notice to move amendments to clause 15. Besides, Hon Paul TSE had given notice to move amendments to clauses 15 and 46. The Chairman further stated that if Dr Hon Margaret NG's amendments were passed, Hon WONG Kwok-kin might not move his amendments. Besides, if Dr Hon Margaret NG's or Hon WONG Kwok-kin's amendments were passed, Hon Paul TSE would withdraw his amendments to clauses 15 and 46.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved amendments to clause 15 and the deletion of clauses 17 and 18 and spoke on the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-kin spoke on the amendments.

Hon Paul TSE spoke on the amendments.

Three Members spoke on the amendments.

Hon Paul TSE spoke for the second time.

Another Member spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-kin spoke again.

Hon Paul TSE spoke for the third time.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question that amendments to clause 15 and the deletion of clauses 17 and 18 moved by Dr Hon Margaret NG put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, four were in favour of the amendments, 17 against them and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendments, eight against them and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix 16**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendments were negatived.

Question that clauses 17 and 18 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Kwok-kin moved amendments to clause 15.

Question that amendments moved by Hon WONG Kwok-kin put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, six were in favour of the amendments and 16 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendments and eight against them (voting record in **Appendix 17**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendments were negatived.

Hon Paul TSE moved amendments to clauses 15 and 46.

Question that amendments moved by Hon Paul TSE put.

Hon Abraham SHEK claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 18 were against the amendments and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 14 were against the amendments and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix 18**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendments were negatived.

Question that clauses 15 and 46 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clause 43 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that Hon Emily LAU and Dr Hon Margaret NG had respectively given notice to move an amendment to clause 43.

Hon Emily LAU moved an amendment to clause 43 and spoke on the amendment.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the amendment.

Four Members spoke on the amendment.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 9:54 pm.

* * * * *

The committee resumed at 9:00 am on 5 March 2011.

Hon Albert HO spoke on the amendment.

Before the Chairman called upon Members to speak on clause 43 and the amendments, he reminded Members that Rule 41(1) of the Rules of Procedure provided that Members should restrict their observations to the subject under discussion and should not introduce matter irrelevant to that subject. The Chairman further stated that he was obliged to direct any Member to discontinue his speech if the matter raised therein was not related to the contents of the amendments.

Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the amendment. While Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, he played an audio recording.

The Chairman asked Hon Albert CHAN to switch off the audio playing device.

Hon Albert CHAN then switched off the audio playing device and continued to speak.

Hon WONG Yuk-man, Hon Albert CHAN and Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke for the second time.

The Chairman stated that according to the Rules of Procedure, Members were allowed to speak more than once during Committee stage, and they might speak for up to 15 minutes each time. The Chairman reiterated that allowing Members to speak more than once during Committee stage was to enable Members to respond appropriately to the points which were made by other Members in their earlier speeches. The Chairman stated that Members should not make use of this arrangement to speak for several times in order to deliver a lengthy speech or to repeatedly express the same views.

Hon WONG Yuk-man spoke for the third time.

Hon Albert HO spoke for the second time.

Three other Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendment.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Hon Emily LAU spoke again.

Another Member spoke on the amendment.

Dr Hon Margaret NG and Hon Emily LAU said that they had nothing to supplement.

Question that amendment to clause 43 moved by Hon Emily LAU put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it (voting record in **Appendix 19**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved an amendment to clause 43.

Question that the amendment moved by Dr Hon Margaret NG put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix 20**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 43 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs reported that

the Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2010

had passed through Committee stage with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed.

Four Members spoke on the motion.

Question on the Third Reading put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that there were 51 Members present, 43 were in favour of the motion and seven against it (voting record in **Appendix 21**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motor Vehicle Idling (Fixed Penalty) Bill

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 28 April 2010 resumed.

Hon Audrey EU, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Motor Vehicle Idling (Fixed Penalty) Bill, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Four Members spoke on the Bill.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the Bill and declared that she was a driver and had proactively promoted and responded to the campaign for motor vehicle idling.

Hon Cyd HO spoke on the Bill.

While Hon Cyd HO was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three Members and Hon CHAN Kin-por spoke on the Bill.

At 1:20 pm, while Hon CHAN Kin-por was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Motor Vehicle Idling (Fixed Penalty) Bill.

Question that clauses 1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 10, 12, 13, 16, 22 and 24 to 32 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 6, 8, 9, 11, 14, 15, 17 to 21 and 23 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and spoke on the amendments.

A Member spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 6, 8, 9, 11, 14, 15, 17 to 21 and 23 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 33 read the first time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the Second Reading of new clause 33 and spoke on the new clause.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 33 proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 33 read the second time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the addition of new clause 33 to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that Schedule 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that Schedule 1 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved an amendment to Schedule 1 and spoke on the amendment.

Two Members spoke on the amendment.

Question that the amendment moved by the Secretary for the Environment put and agreed to.

Question that Schedule 1 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for the Environment reported that

the Motor Vehicle Idling (Fixed Penalty) Bill

had passed through Committee stage with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

Question on the Third Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Motion under Rule 49E(2) of the Rules of Procedure

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council takes note of Report No. 14/10-11 of the House Committee laid on the Table of the Council on 2 March 2011 in relation to the subsidiary legislation and instrument(s) as listed below:

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Title of Subsidiary Legislation or Instrument</u>
(1)	Minimum Wage (Criteria for Approved Assessors) Notice (L.N. 1/2011)
(2)	Minimum Wage (Assessment Methods) Notice (L.N. 2/2011).

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Minimum Wage (Criteria for Approved Assessors) Notice and Minimum Wage (Assessment Methods) Notice, and then in his personal capacity as a Member.

Three Members spoke on the motion.

Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion.

The President stated that under Rule 49E(9) of the Rules of Procedure, he would not put any question on the motion.

Public Accounts Committee's Report on 'Administration of the Direct Subsidy Scheme and Governance and Administration of Direct Subsidy Scheme Schools'

Dr Hon Philip WONG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council notes Chapter 1 of the Public Accounts Committee Report No. 55 on 'Administration of the Direct Subsidy Scheme and Governance and Administration of Direct Subsidy Scheme Schools'.

Question on Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Education spoke on the motion.

Six Members and Hon Abraham SHEK spoke on the motion.

While Hon Abraham SHEK was speaking, the President left the chair at 5:00 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that his daughter was studying in an international school. Also, he was a Council member of Caritas Hong Kong and the former Chairman of Friends of Caritas. Hon Paul CHAN further stated that Caritas Hong Kong ran schools, including Direct Subsidy Scheme schools. He then spoke on the motion.

Another Member and Hon Starry LEE spoke on the motion.

At 5:30 pm, while Hon Starry LEE was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai declared that he was the supervisor of Lam Tai Fai College and also the person in charge of a school sponsoring body. He then spoke on the motion.

One more Member spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Education spoke again.

Dr Hon Philip WONG replied.

Question on Dr Hon Philip WONG's motion put and agreed to.

Promoting personal financial management education

Hon CHAN Kin-por moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That Hong Kong is an international financial and commercial centre, the atmosphere of investment and consumption in society is very strong, and people are facing a lot of financial management problems in their daily life; yet, on the other hand, there is a lack of comprehensive financial management education in Hong Kong, and whenever there is any turmoil in the financial market, some people may not have sufficient risk management knowledge to cope with it and are thus easily plunged into financial crises or even bankruptcy; some young people may have to default or are even unable to make repayment of their credit card debts due to over-spending; as a matter of fact, if the general public have good financial management habits, it will be of

immense benefits to the whole society: for example, parents who have good financial management habits can help their families and children develop healthily, thus reducing the occurrence of family problems, and if working persons of means can as early as possible make good financial preparations before retirement, they will have appropriate protection upon their retirement, thus lessening their dependence on social resources in the future; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to adopt effective measures to promote personal financial management education, so as to educate people to acquire proper financial management skills and concepts; the relevant measures should include:

- (a) to study making knowledge on comprehensive personal financial management, including investment, consumption, banking and insurance principles, etc., a formal subject in school, or expand the present section of personal financial management under subjects such as Liberal Studies into an independent and major module, so as to systematically educate students on basic financial management concepts and principles;
- (b) in respect of the Investor Education Council which will be established soon, to introduce more comprehensive personal financial management elements to the original scope of investor education, with a view to instilling proper personal financial management values into the general public;
- (c) to encourage parents to participate in parent-child financial management activities so that they can instill proper concepts on money into their children through the relevant skills;
- (d) to encourage people of means to make good financial management plans for their retirement life as early as possible; and
- (e) to organize regular publicity and educational activities to encourage young people to spend money sensibly, so as to avoid plunging into debt crises.

Question on Hon CHAN Kin-por's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion.

Seven Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke again.

Hon CHAN Kin-por replied.

Question on Hon CHAN Kin-por's motion put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 9 March 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:13 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
20 September 2011

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 02/03/2011
時間 TIME: 08:38:45 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年行政長官選舉（修訂）條例草案》- 二讀
CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 政制及內地事務局局長 Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

出席 Present :45
投票 Vote :44
 贊成 Yes :35
 反對 No :9
 棄權 Abstain :0
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
涂謹申	James TO			甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家駒	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi		
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 02/03/2011
時間 TIME: 09:06:51 下午-pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年行政長官選舉（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第3條
CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE -
AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 3

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	19	
投票 Vote	21	18	
贊成 Yes	4	11	
反對 No	17	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉卓發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	WONG Sing-chi	
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 02/03/2011
時間 TIME: 09:12:20 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 根據《議事規則》第49(4)條動議縮短表決鐘聲至一分鐘
MOTION UNDER RULE 49(4) OF THE RULES OF PROCEDURE TO SHORTEN THE DIVISION BELL TO ONE MINUTE

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	23	
投票 Vote	21	22	
贊成 Yes	14	7	
反對 No	7	15	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 02/03/2011
時間 TIME: 09:39:58 下午-pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年行政長官選舉（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第5（3）、（4）及（6）至（34）條
CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 5(3), (4) AND (6) TO (34)

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	22	
投票 Vote	24	21	
贊成 Yes	3	13	
反對 No	20	8	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pcy-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
日期 DATE: 02/03/2011
時間 TIME: 09:53:46 下午pm

動議 MOTION: (2010年行政長官選舉(修訂)條例草案) - 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第5(36)、(37)、(39)及(41)條
CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 5(36), (37), (39) AND (41)

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	22	
投票 Vote	22	21	
贊成 Yes	4	13	
反對 No	16	7	
棄權 Abstain	2	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	出席 PRESENT	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
梁家騷 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6
 日期 DATE: 03/03/2011
 時間 TIME: 09:08:35 上午 am

動議 MOTION: (2010年行政長官選舉(修訂)條例草案) - 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第6條
 CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE -
 AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 6

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	13	
投票 Vote	18	12	
贊成 Yes	3	4	
反對 No	15	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
梁家驪 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

投票 VOTE: 7
日期 DATE: 03/03/2011
時間 TIME: 03:00:12 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年行政長官選舉（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第3D條，予以二讀
CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSE 3D BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	8	16	
反對 No	13	4	
棄權 Abstain	5	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 8
 日期 DATE: 03/03/2011
 時間 TIME: 03:38:25 下午-pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年行政長官選舉（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第10A條，予以二讀
 CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSE 10A BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	4	15	
反對 No	20	9	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 9
 日期 DATE: 03/03/2011
 時間 TIME: 04:06:11 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年行政長官選舉（修訂）條例草案》- 三讀
 CHIEF EXECUTIVE ELECTION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 政制及內地事務局局長 Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

出席 Present :54
 投票 Vote :53
 贊成 Yes :42
 反對 No :11
 棄權 Abstain :0
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驛	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	IP Wai-ming	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	Li Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	謝偉俊	Paul TSE	贊成	YES
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM		
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

投票 VOTE: 10
日期 DATE: 03/03/2011
時間 TIME: 09:17:47 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 二讀
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 政制及內地事務局局長 Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

出席 Present :47
投票 Vote :46
贊成 Yes :36
反對 No :10
棄權 Abstain :0
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO			甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家駒	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHIENG			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	Paul TSE			
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

投票 VOTE: 11
日期 DATE: 04/03/2011
時間 TIME: 03:32:44 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第5A、5B、5C、6B、6C、6H、6I、8A、8B、9A及36A條，予以二讀
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSES 5A, 5B, 5C, 6B, 6C, 6H, 6I, 8A, 8B, 9A AND 36A BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	22	
投票 Vote	25	21	
贊成 Yes	4	11	
反對 No	21	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			何秀蘭	Cyd HO		
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	反對	NO	李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO
陳茂波	Paul CHAN			梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對	NO
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	反對	NO
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP		
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對	NO	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	反對	NO	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

Wai-an Lam

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 12
日期 DATE: 04/03/2011
時間 TIME: 03:45:45 下午 pm

動議 MOTION: 根據《議事規則》第 49(4) 條動議縮短表決鐘聲至一分鐘
MOTION UNDER RULE 49(4) OF THE RULES OF PROCEDURE TO SHORTEN THE DIVISION BELL TO ONE MINUTE

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	23	
投票 Vote	25	22	
贊成 Yes	4	0	
反對 No	11	15	
棄權 Abstain	10	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies:	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩珍 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

Miriam Lau

投票 VOTE: 13
日期 DATE: 04/03/2011
時間 TIME: 04:03:52 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第6D、6E、6F及6G條，予以二讀
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSES 6D, 6E, 6F AND 6G BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	19	
投票 Vote	27	18	
贊成 Yes	8	9	
反對 No	17	7	
棄權 Abstain	2	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃直弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	鄭慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 14
 日期 DATE: 04/03/2011
 時間 TIME: 04:15:50 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第6A條，予以二讀
 LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSE
 6A BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	18	
投票 Vote	27	17	
贊成 Yes	4	8	
反對 No	19	7	
棄權 Abstain	4	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國賢 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Stary LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 15
日期 DATE: 04/03/2011
時間 TIME: 07:19:02 下午-pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第12條
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT
TO CLAUSE 12

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	21	
投票 Vote	24	20	
贊成 Yes	1	4	
反對 No	23	16	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國賢 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 16
日期 DATE: 04/03/2011
時間 TIME: 09:00:27 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第15條，以及刪去第17及18條
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 15 AND DELETION OF CLAUSES 17 AND 18

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	22	
投票 Vote	23	21	
贊成 Yes	4	11	
反對 No	17	8	
棄權 Abstain	2	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
梁家騷 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 17
 日期 DATE: 04/03/2011
 時間 TIME: 09:04:47 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第15條
 LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS
 TO CLAUSE 15

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	19	
投票 Vote	22	18	
贊成 Yes	6	10	
反對 No	16	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 18
日期 DATE: 04/03/2011
時間 TIME: 09:09:00 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第15及46條
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS
TO CLAUSES 15 AND 46

動議人 MOVED BY: 謝偉俊 Paul TSE

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	19	
投票 Vote	21	15	
贊成 Yes	0	0	
反對 No	18	14	
棄權 Abstain	3	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	棄權	ABSTAIN	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	出席	PRESENT	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	棄權	ABSTAIN	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			余若薇	Audrey EU	出席	PRESENT
方剛	Vincent FANG			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	反對	NO
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			何秀蘭	Cyd HO		
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN	李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO
林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai			陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO
陳茂波	Paul CHAN	反對	NO	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	反對	NO	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi		
梁家騷	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau			黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	反對	NO
張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	反對	NO
葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	反對	NO	Alan LEONG	Alan LEONG	出席	PRESENT
葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對	NO	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	出席	PRESENT
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	反對	NO	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 19
日期 DATE: 05/03/2011
時間 TIME: 10:35:45 上午-am

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第43條
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT
TO CLAUSE 43

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿 Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	7	13	
反對 No	17	9	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 20
日期 DATE: 05/03/2011
時間 TIME: 10:39:38 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第43條
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT
TO CLAUSE 43

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	24	
投票 Vote	25	23	
贊成 Yes	3	13	
反對 No	22	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家騷 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 21
日期 DATE: 05/03/2011
時間 TIME: 10:57:53 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《2010年立法會（修訂）條例草案》- 三讀
LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2010 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 政制及內地事務局局長 Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

出席 Present :51
投票 Vote :50
 贊成 Yes :43
 反對 No :7
 棄權 Abstain :0
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	反對	NO
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驊	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	贊成	YES
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	贊成	YES
李鳳英	Li Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pcy-chyou	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	謝偉俊	Paul TSE	贊成	YES
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		