

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 27

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 18 May 2011 at 11:00 am**

---

### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP

Secretary for Transport and Housing

Prof Gabriel Matthew LEUNG, JP  
Under Secretary for Food and Health

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

## **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income) (Japan) Order (gazetted on 13.5.2011)	64/2011
2. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income and Capital) (French Republic) Order (gazetted on 13.5.2011)	65/2011
3. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income and Capital) (Principality of Liechtenstein) Order (gazetted on 13.5.2011)	66/2011
4. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income) (New Zealand) Order (gazetted on 13.5.2011)	67/2011
5. Specification of Arrangements (Government of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Income and Capital and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion) (Amendment) Order 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011)	68/2011
6. Road Traffic (Public Service Vehicles) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011)	69/2011
7. Professional Accountants (Amendment) Bylaw 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011)	70/2011
8. Electoral Affairs Commission (Registration) (Electors for Legislative Council Functional Constituencies) (Voters for Election Committee Subsectors) (Members of Election Committee) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011)	71/2011

9. Electoral Affairs Commission (Nominations Advisory Committees (Legislative Council)) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 72/2011
10. Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (Legislative Council) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 73/2011
11. Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (District Councils) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 74/2011
12. Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (Election Committee) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 75/2011
13. Electoral Procedure (Chief Executive Election) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 76/2011
14. Electoral Procedure (Village Representative Election) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 77/2011
15. Particulars Relating to Candidates on Ballot Papers (Legislative Council and District Councils) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 78/2011
16. Electoral Affairs Commission (Financial Assistance for Legislative Council Elections and District Council Elections) (Application and Payment Procedure) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 79/2011
17. Pension Benefits Ordinance (Established Offices) (Amendment) Order 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 80/2011
18. Places for Autopsies (Amendment) Order 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 81/2011
19. Buildings Energy Efficiency Ordinance (Commencement) Notice 2011 (gazetted on 13.5.2011) 82/2011

- |     |   |         |
|-----|---|---------|
| 20. | Legal Aid Ordinance — Resoluton of the Legislative Council (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 13.5.2011)                        | 83/2011 |
| 21. | Legal Aid (Assessment of Resources and Contributions) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 13.5.2011) | 84/2011 |

### Other Papers

- No. 91 - Early Retirement Ex-gratia Payment Fund for Aided Secondary School Teachers  
Financial statements together with the Director of Audit's report for the year ended 31 August 2010 (published on 12.5.2011)
- No. 92 - The Government Minute in response to the Report of the Public Accounts Committee No. 55 of February 2011 (published on 18.5.2011)

Report No. 22/10-11 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 12.5.2011)

### Addresses

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to the Report of the Public Accounts Committee No. 55 of February 2011.

### Questions

1. Hon Miriam LAU asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

2. Hon Starry LEE asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Three Members and Dr Hon Margaret NG asked supplementary questions.

When replying to Dr Hon Margaret NG's supplementary question, the Secretary for Transport and Housing said that it was more appropriate for the Secretary for the Environment (who was not the designated public officer for answering Question 2) to respond to the issues raised by Dr Hon Margaret NG.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung interrupted by requesting the Secretary for Transport and Housing to respond to the issues raised by Dr Hon Margaret NG.

The President stated that the public officers designated by the Administration to answer oral questions at Council meetings should, as far as possible, respond to the issues raised by Members in their supplementary questions. If designated public officers were unable to respond to such issues at the meeting, the Administration should provide written replies after the meeting.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing continued with her reply.

3. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

4. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Development and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

5. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Hon LEE Wing-tat asked a supplementary question in which the names of a number of Members were referred to. The Secretary for Development replied.

The President reminded Members that under Rule 25(1)(a) of the Rules of Procedure, a question should not include the names of persons.

Two other Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

6. Hon Albert HO asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Members' Motions**

### Motion under Rule 49E(2) of the Rules of Procedure

The President stated that in accordance with the relevant debate procedure, he would call upon Hon Miriam LAU, mover of the motion, to move the motion first. The debate on the motion would be divided into two sessions. The first session was for debating the Declaration of Constituencies (District Councils) Order 2011, and the second session was for debating the Fisheries Protection (Specification of Apparatus) (Amendment) Notice 2011.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion:

That this Council takes note of Report No. 22/10-11 of the House Committee laid on the Table of the Council on 18 May 2011 in relation to the subsidiary legislation and instrument(s) as listed below:

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Title of Subsidiary Legislation or Instrument</u>
(1)	Declaration of Constituencies (District Councils) Order 2011 (L.N. 44/2011)
(2)	Fisheries Protection (Specification of Apparatus) (Amendment) Notice 2011 (L.N. 45/2011).

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed.

The President announced the commencement of the first debate session on the Declaration of Constituencies (District Councils) Order 2011.

Hon IP Kwok-him spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Declaration of Constituencies (District Councils) Order 2011.

While Hon IP Kwok-him was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:32 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Five Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion.

The President's Deputy announced the commencement of the second debate session on the Fisheries Protection (Specification of Apparatus) (Amendment) Notice 2011.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Fisheries Protection (Specification of Apparatus) (Amendment) Notice 2011.

At 2:31 pm, while Hon TAM Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Nine Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion.

The President stated that under Rule 49E(9) of the Rules of Procedure, he would not put any question on the motion.

Alleviating the impact of food price inflation on the public

Hon WONG Yung-kan moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, given that the majority of foods in Hong Kong rely on import, and due to the impact of factors such as global fluctuations in food prices and Renminbi appreciation, etc., the local food prices have remained persistently high; besides, given Mainland residents' trust in foods which are sold in Hong Kong, particularly after the occurrence of melamine-tainted formula incidents involving Mainland milk products, their demand for infant and follow-up formulas which are sold in Hong Kong has soared, leading to an upsurge in the prices and shortage of stocks; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to adopt effective measures to alleviate the impact of food price inflation on the public; the relevant measures should include:

- (a) to conduct studies on bringing infant and follow-up formulas within the regulatory ambit of the Reserved Commodities Ordinance to ensure their stable supply and enable the Government to effectively monitor their stocks, and to formulate jointly with suppliers a code of sales for the industry as soon as possible, so as to ensure the supply of milk formulas to local users;
- (b) to rebuild the local agriculture and fisheries industry, so as to supplement food supply in Hong Kong;
- (c) to assist local food importers and food establishments, etc., in identifying a wider variety of food materials and expanding the sources of supply, so as to diversify the risks of unstable food supply from individual places;
- (d) to enhance the tests on Mainland and Japanese foods, and to actively seek to establish closer co-operation with the Mainland Government and the Japanese Government on food safety matters, so as to restore public confidence and increase the quantity of safe foods available on the market;
- (e) to formulate a policy on rental and facility improvement which is conducive to the development of public markets to enhance their competitiveness, so as to meet the function of supplying fresh provisions to the general public;
- (f) to further increase the transparency of essential food supply and price information, with a view to facilitating the dissemination of market information and preventing stockpiling and hoarding by unscrupulous traders; and

- (g) to relax the eligibility requirements for short-term food assistance service projects and the period of receiving assistance, and to conduct studies on providing support to the grassroots through the Community Care Fund, etc., in coping with the food price inflation problem.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion proposed.

The President stated that five Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the five amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon IP Wai-ming, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Vincent FANG and Hon Ronny TONG, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Five Members and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:25 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Six other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Yung-kan spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion:

To delete “,” after “That” and substitute with “inflation is fiercer than a tiger;”; and to delete “to formulate a policy on rental and facility improvement which is conducive to the development of public markets to enhance their competitiveness, so as to meet the function of supplying fresh provisions to the general public” after “(e)” and substitute with “to make timely use of the rare 18-month period when the rental of all public markets in Hong Kong continues to be frozen, and set up a government-led working group comprising representatives of market tenants and groups, council representatives and academic representatives for conducting a comprehensive review of the policy

on public markets as well as formulating long-term policies and measures which are conducive to the development of public markets; to abolish the unrealistic practice of charging market-level rental and rates, and on the basis of fully consulting the industries, formulate afresh a reasonable and feasible charging policy for rental, air-conditioning fees and electricity tariffs; to allocate additional resources for installing air-conditioning facilities in all public markets to further improve the business environment of public markets, thereby fundamentally enhancing the competitiveness of existing public markets as well as further increasing occupancy rates and reducing vacancy rates, so as to fulfill their function of providing the general public with fresh, inexpensive and quality foods and non-staple foods; on the other hand, the Government must construct public markets in new towns (for example, Yat Tung Estate in Tung Chung and Tin Shui Wai New Town, etc.), so as to assist new town residents in combating market monopolization and alleviate the heavy burden of goods prices on the grassroots in new towns; and under the programme for planning new development areas (for example, Hung Shui Kiu and Kwu Tung, etc.), reserve land for constructing public markets in advance, so as to enable new town residents to improve their basic living”.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon IP Wai-ming to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon IP Wai-ming moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan’s motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; and (h) set up dedicated counters in all maternal and child health centres in Hong Kong for selling milk formulas, and enable parents of infants to buy milk formulas at fixed sales outlets; at the same time, the Government should proactively promote breast feeding by stepping up publicity on the advantages of breast milk on the one hand, and on the other hand, providing greater protection in legislation for pregnant women and mothers of new-born infants, setting up baby-sitting rooms in all public sector organizations and facilities, and encouraging the business sector to follow suit” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon IP Wai-ming’s amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan’s motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing proposed and put.

Hon Ronny TONG claimed a division. The President's Deputy then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 7:33 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the President resumed the chair.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, two against it and eight abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and four abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Alleviating the impact of food price inflation on the public" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing:

To delete "and" after "unscrupulous traders;"; to add ", consider providing Comprehensive Social Security Assistance households, low-income persons and poor elderly persons, etc., with additional food subsidies or food vouchers" after "receiving assistance"; and to add"; (h) through various media such as the radio, television and the Internet, etc., as well as through professionals such as dieticians, etc., to promote inexpensive but nutritious foods to the public, and to encourage the public to buy foods within their means, so as to avoid any public misconception that expensive foods will be exceptionally beneficial to their health; (i) to provide poor students with inexpensive lunch in school, so as to ensure students' intake of sufficient nutrients during their development and growth; and (j) to encourage and facilitate mutual co-operation among community groups, non-government organizations, merchants' associations and food suppliers for organizing short-term anti-inflation bargain bazaars for the public in the 18 districts in turn, with the Government providing venues and necessary support, so as to put together some non-staple foods, such as rice, cooking oil and canned food, etc., for sale at cost, with a view to assisting the public in combating inflation" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Vincent FANG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Vincent FANG moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou:

To add“; (k) to step up negotiations with the Mainland authorities on how to ensure stable supply of foods to Hong Kong, especially for the stable supply of live and fresh foods such as live pigs and cattle, and to make efforts to enhance competition so as to avoid drastic fluctuations in food prices; and, on the premise of declining avian influenza risks, to appropriately increase the Mainland's supply of live chickens to Hong Kong according to market demand during major traditional Chinese festivals, so as to reduce the negative impact of food price inflation on the public; (l) to lower the various registration fees and application fees imposed on food industries by the Government, including the registration fees for applying for small volume exemption under the food nutrition labelling scheme and the registration fees for food importers and food distributors under the Food Safety Ordinance, etc., so as to reduce the extra administrative fees borne by these industries; and (m) to establish a mechanism for providing food industries with immediate assistance, such as providing certification for unpolluted foods, whenever there are any major food pollution emergencies such as those involving malachite green, melamine as well as nuclear radiation pollution in Japan, etc., so as to ensure that it will not affect the market supply” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Vincent FANG had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Ronny TONG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Vincent FANG:

To add“; and (n) in respect of the supply of staple foods, to introduce more suppliers to increase competition, so as to prevent individual major merchants’ associations from monopolizing the food market” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG’s amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan’s motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou and Hon Vincent FANG proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Yung-kan replied.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan’s motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon Vincent FANG and Hon Ronny TONG put and agreed to.

#### The 4 June incident

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council urges that: the 4 June incident be not forgotten and the 1989 pro-democracy movement be vindicated.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan’s motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Albert HO would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan’s motion and spoke on the motion and the amendment:

To add “, and also urges the Central Government to refrain from taking actions of unlawful and arbitrary surveillance, detention and suppression of dissidents and human rights activists, including LIU Xiaobo and AI Weiwei, etc., expeditiously ratify, through the National People’s Congress, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights signed in 1998, and effect its full implementation, so as to make good preparation for the vindication of the 1989 pro-democracy movement” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to LEE Cheuk-yan's motion proposed.

Nineteen Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the amendment.

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to LEE Cheuk-yan's motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Cyd HO stated that she had mistakenly voted against Hon Albert HO's amendment; her intent was to vote in favour of it. She would like to have her actual voting intent recorded in the verbatim record of the proceedings.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan replied.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion put.

Hon Cyd HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che said that his voting device could not function. The President asked him to verbally indicate his voting intent. Mr CHEUNG stated that he was in favour of the motion.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, four were in favour of the motion, nine against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion and nine against it (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

**Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 19 May 2011 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 10:27 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
23 September 2011

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 18/05/2011  
時間 TIME: 07:36:09 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 葉偉明議員對黃容根議員就「減輕食品通脹對市民的影響」所提，經王國興議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON IP WAI-MING TO HON WONG YUNG-KAN'S MOTION ON "ALLEVIATING THE IMPACT OF FOOD PRICE INFLATION ON THE PUBLIC" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG KWOK-HING

動議人 MOVED BY: 葉偉明IP Wai-ming

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	25	
投票 Vote	19	24	
贊成 Yes	9	19	
反對 No	2	1	
棄權 Abstain	8	4	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 18/05/2011  
 時間 TIME: 10:20:25 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 何俊仁議員對李卓人議員的「六四事件」議案作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT HO TO HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S MOTION ON "THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	27	
投票 Vote	18	26	
贊成 Yes	4	16	
反對 No	11	10	
棄權 Abstain	3	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 18/05/2011  
時間 TIME: 10:25:53 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「六四事件」議案  
MOTION ON "THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18 17	29	
投票 Vote	18 17	28	
贊成 Yes	34 <i>me</i>	19	
反對 No	9	9	
棄權 Abstain	6	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHIEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHIEUNG Kwok-che	<i>yes</i>	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK