

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 31

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 8 June 2011 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Members absent:

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBM, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Ms Julia LEUNG Fung-yee, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP
Secretary for Development

Dr Kitty POON Kit, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Assumption of Responsibility for Markets Notification 2011 (gazetted on 3.6.2011)	99/2011
2. Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (India) Order (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 3.6.2011)	100/2011

Other Papers

No. 96 - Securities and Futures Commission Annual Report 2010-11 (published on 8.6.2011)

Report No. 24/10-11 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 1.6.2011)

Questions

1. In accordance with Rule 26(6A) and (6B) of the Rules of Procedure, Hon Fred LI, Deputy Chairman of the House Committee, asked Question 1 on behalf of Hon WONG Yuk-man, who was not present to ask his question.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

A Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon Paul TSE asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Hon Paul TSE declared that his apartment had a problem which was being dealt with but the one displaying a signboard with the words “superman lawyer” as reported by some magazines was not where he lived. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Development replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

3. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

4. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

5. Hon KAM Nai-wai declared that he had a family member who would be 18 years of age by the end of the year and another family member of his had just passed away. He then asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

6. Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai asked Question 6.

After Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai had asked his question, the President left the chair at 12:51 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for the Environment and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Legislative Council (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Shortly after the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs started his speech, Hon Albert CHAN stood up and spoke aloud. The President's Deputy told Hon Albert CHAN that it was not the time for him to express his views and ordered him to sit down. Hon Albert CHAN ignored the President's Deputy's order and continued to stand up and speak aloud. Ignoring the President's Deputy's repeated orders, the President's Deputy ordered Hon Albert CHAN to withdraw from the Council. Hon Albert CHAN then left the Chamber. The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs continued to speak.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, Hon WONG Yuk-man entered the Chamber and spoke aloud to the Secretary. He then rushed to the Secretary, intending to snatch his script. The President's Deputy ordered Hon WONG Yuk-man to withdraw immediately from the Council. Pursuant to the President's Deputy's order, security staff tried to assist Hon WONG Yuk-man in leaving the Chamber. As Hon WONG Yuk-man refused to leave the Chamber and kept speaking aloud, the President's Deputy suspended the meeting at 1:21 pm.

The Council resumed at 1:22 pm.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs continued with his speech.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President's Deputy stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No. 3) Bill 2011

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 4 May 2011 resumed.

A Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No. 3) Bill 2011.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 5 and 6 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 4 and 7 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved amendments to clauses 3, 4, and 7 and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 4 and 7 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the Inland Revenue (Amendment) (No. 3) Bill 2011

had passed through Committee stage with amendments. She moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under Article 73(7) of the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China and section 7A of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that the appointment of —

- (a) the Right Honourable The Lord Collins of Mapesbury; and
- (b) the Right Honourable The Lord Clarke of Stone-cum-Ebony,

as judges of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal from other common law jurisdictions pursuant to section 9 of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance (Cap. 484) be endorsed.

Question on the motion proposed.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Proposed Senior Judicial Appointments, and then in her personal capacity as a Member.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under Article 73(7) of the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that the appointment of the Honourable Mr. Justice Andrew Cheung Kui-nung as the Chief Judge of the High Court of Hong Kong be endorsed.

At 1:57 pm, while the Chief Secretary for Administration was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon James TO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that in relation to the Professional Accountants (Amendment) Bylaw 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 70 of 2011, and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 18 May 2011, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 6 July 2011.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Motion under Rule 49E(2) of the Rules of Procedure

Hon Miriam LAU drew the President's attention that the public officer designated to attend this debate was not in the Chamber. The President suspended the meeting at 2:04 pm.

The Council resumed at 2:07 pm.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council takes note of Report No. 24/10-11 of the House Committee laid on the Table of the Council of 8 June 2011 in relation to the subsidiary legislation and instrument(s) as listed below :

<u>Item Number</u>	<u>Title of Subsidiary Legislation or Instrument</u>
(1)	Tramway Ordinance (Alteration of Fares) (Amendment) Notice 2011 (L.N. 63/2011).

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion.

The President stated that under Rule 49E(9) of the Rules of Procedure, he would not put any question on the motion.

Setting out a five-year plan for elderly services

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, given that the trend of the ageing of the society in Hong Kong is accelerating, this Council urges the Government to plan in full speed and formulate as early as possible a more comprehensive elderly policy, and also set out a five-year plan for elderly services, so as to set specific development objectives and pledges for elderly services every five years, with a view to rectifying the serious problems of imbalance between supply of and demand for services, a large number of persons waiting for services and prolonged waiting time, as well as strengthening the care for the needs of elderly persons' living, and vigorously improving people's livelihood; the relevant measures should include:

- (a) to establish a five-year plan and service pledges in respect of residential care services for the elderly and community care for the elderly, and strive to increase the number of residential care places for the elderly and community care places for the elderly; to review the Standardized Care Need Assessment Mechanism for Elderly Services; to provide elderly services subsidies for elderly persons by making reference to the mode of the existing education voucher scheme; and to enhance complementary measures for the elderly policy of 'ageing in place';
- (b) to abolish the absence limit in respect of application for Old Age Allowance ('OAA') to enable elderly persons to spend their twilight years on the Mainland without worries, and allow elderly recipients of Disability Allowance to also receive OAA, so as to improve their living;
- (c) to intensify the policy of portable elderly welfare benefits; to provide allowances to elderly persons who return to their hometowns to live, enabling those elderly persons who choose to spend their twilight years in their hometowns to receive a monthly living supplement; to proactively study in conjunction with the relevant Mainland departments the introduction of medical insurance schemes for Hong Kong elderly persons living on the Mainland, and consider collaborating with the Mainland to run hospitals or provide out-patient services, so as to serve the Hong Kong people living on the Mainland;
- (d) to propose the introduction of an entirely new 'elderly maintenance grant scheme' in addition to OAA and Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ('CSSA') Scheme, so as to provide financial assistance to elderly persons who are not eligible for applying CSSA to help them improve their living;

- (e) to increase the amount of Elderly Healthcare Vouchers to \$1,000, lower the age requirement to 65, streamline administrative arrangements, and encourage the participation of more doctors; and to relax the elderly drug subsidization policy;
- (f) to expedite resource allocation from the Community Care Fund for providing tooth filling and restoration allowances to the elderly, and strengthen elderly dental care services, including the establishment of dental clinics in the 18 districts, introduction of elderly dental care services and opening public dental clinics for elderly persons' use, etc.;
- (g) to expedite the establishment of public Chinese medicine clinics in the 18 districts, and establish additional elderly health centres and increase their membership;
- (h) to devote resources to strengthen occupational training related to the elderly care service industries, so as to increase manpower for elderly services and care and enhance practitioners' professional knowledge and quality;
- (i) to formulate a comprehensive and long-term elderly housing policy, examine afresh the current land planning for earmarking sites for elderly housing purposes, proactively study the introduction of the 'mixed use development' concept in private and public housing, and design a residence model which integrates elderly housing and complementary facilities;
- (j) to expedite the implementation of a 'mortgage scheme for the elderly' (i.e. 'reverse mortgage'), so as to assist elderly persons with private properties in enhancing their finances and improving living environment and lives in twilight years, and launch a scheme on 'making use of residential properties to provide for the twilight years of the elderly' for elderly property owners who have no means of living and do not have any children;
- (k) to implement the elderly-friendly policy in all public places, effectively enforce the requirements of barrier-free facilities, and provide various types of facilities for elderly persons to facilitate their entry and exit; and
- (l) to motivate various transport operators to offer comprehensive and permanent fare concessions to elderly persons; to enrich elderly persons'

retirement life by introducing ‘recreation and sports vouchers for the elderly’ and waiving admission fees for elderly persons in all exhibition halls under the Leisure and Cultural Services Department, and set up an ‘elderly employment fund’, so as to assist healthy elderly persons in sustaining their employment and giving full play to their abilities.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung’s motion proposed.

The President stated that five Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the five amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Sing-chi, Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che, Hon Vincent FANG, Hon Alan LEONG and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eleven Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung’s motion:

To delete “given that” after “That,” and substitute with “at present,”; to delete “and” after “exit;”; and to add “; and (m) to ensure that the elderly will be able to maintain a reasonable standard of living, and establish a universal retirement protection system” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that as Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment had been passed, Hon Vincent FANG had withdrawn his amendment.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che moved the following further amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi:

To add “; and (n) to conduct a review every five years thereafter, and allow the relevant stakeholders to participate in the planning and review process for elderly services; (o) by first address issues relating to the relevant services received by all waiting applicants and then increasing, according to the ratio of elderly population growth, the number of residential care places for the elderly and community care places for the elderly; to review the financing system for long-term elderly care services; (p) to immediately review the existing experimental Pilot Project on Outreach Primary Dental Care Services for the Elderly in Residential Care Homes and Day Care Centres, and extend the scheme to all elderly persons in Hong Kong who are in need of the relevant services; (q) to establish additional elderly health centres and increase fully open their membership, so as to benefit all elderly persons in Hong Kong; (r) to link the elderly care service industries with the Qualifications Framework; (s) to enhance the Elderly Persons Priority Scheme and Harmonious Families Priority Scheme, which are currently implemented by the Hong Kong Housing Authority, and relax their restrictions, so as to encourage more children to live with their elderly parents; (t) with a view to giving the elderly a sense of worthiness, the Government should comprehensively review the elderly employment policy, including the promotion of flexible retirement age, and the Government may also take the lead in reviewing the retirement age of civil servants and encouraging enterprises to extend the years of services for their employees or even to adopt flexible retirement schemes, such as employing them on a half-time or contract basis after their formal retirement” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 11 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Setting out a five-year plan for elderly services” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Alan LEONG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following further amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung’s motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi:

To add “; (n) to abolish the requirement that family members of elderly persons should submit a declaration on their financial conditions (commonly known as a ‘statement on non-provision of financial support’ or ‘bad son statement’) before elderly persons can become eligible for applying for Comprehensive Social Security Assistance on their own, so that elderly persons can spend their twilight years in contentment; and (o) to alleviate the basic livelihood problems faced by the working poor and unpaid homemakers in their retirement lives, and when the labour force in the society is still sufficient at present, to enable the three sides of employees, employers and the Government to implement community savings plans, so as to properly prepare for the crisis arising from the peak of population ageing in the future” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG’s amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung’s motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed and put.

Hon Vincent FANG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, four against it and 11 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and eight abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following further amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi:

To add “; (n) focusing on the varying quality of private residential care homes for the elderly at present, to take the operating conditions of the sector seriously, and study providing the market with venues which are suitable for operating private residential care homes for the elderly by perfecting the land planning and housing policy; at the same time, to ensure that purchase prices are able to meet the costs of providing quality services; and to promote the voluntary accreditation system for private residential care homes for the elderly, so as to encourage the sector to upgrade its quality; (o) focusing on the continuous increase in the number of dementia patients in the society and the impact on the healthcare, social welfare, law, public order and ethics, etc., to take the gravity of the problem seriously and formulate corresponding proposals, so as to protect dementia patients and their family members; (p) to encourage local radio stations to provide dedicated channels for the elderly, and also to encourage television stations to produce more elderly programmes, so as to provide senior citizens with more free audio-visual entertainment; (q) through publicity and education, to proactively advocate the spirit of respecting, loving and caring for the elderly; and (r) focusing on the incessant return of Hong Kong elderly persons from the Mainland to Hong Kong in recent years, to formulate a more comprehensive strategy so as to assist such poor and helpless elderly persons in settling down in Hong Kong again and living their twilight years without worries” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung replied.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou put and agreed to.

The inability of the Government's measures to help people acquire their homes

Hon James TO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, regarding people's problem of acquiring homes, the public and this Council have long since forged the consensus that the Government should resume the construction of Home Ownership Scheme flats and reinstate the Tenants Purchase Scheme, and the relevant motions were passed by this Council, but the Government has turned a deaf ear and disregarded public opinion; after the series of measures launched by the Government, including allocating lands for constructing 'flats with limited floor area', introducing My Home Purchase Plan and the special stamp duty for combating property speculation, as well as putting up more land lots for sale by auction, property prices in Hong Kong have continued to rise, reflecting that these government measures are unable to help people acquire their homes; in this connection, this Council expresses grave dismay at Chief Executive Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, and urges the Chief Executive to make serious reflection and respect public opinion.

Question on Hon James TO's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Cyd HO intended to move amendments to the motion. In addition, Hon Fred LI and Hon LEE Wing-tat intended to move amendments to the amendments of Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon WONG Kwok-hing respectively. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon WONG Kwok-hing, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The President left the chair at 6:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Cyd HO, who intended to move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Fred LI and Hon LEE Wing-tat, who intended to move amendments to amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

A Member and Hon Ronny TONG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:16 pm, while Hon Ronny TONG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Five other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Abraham SHEK declared that he represented the real estate sector. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Two more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke again.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following amendment to Hon James TO's motion:

To delete “regarding people’s problem of” after “That,” and substitute with “focusing on the problems of property price increases and people’s difficulties in”; to delete “, and the relevant motions were passed by this Council, but the Government has turned a deaf ear and disregarded public opinion;” after “Tenants Purchase Scheme” and substitute with “; yet,”; to add “recently” after “by the Government”; to add “, etc.” after “sale by auction”; to delete “in Hong Kong” after “, property prices”; to delete “these government” after “reflecting that” and substitute with “the relevant”; to add “curb property price increases and” after “unable to”; and to delete “expresses grave dismay at Chief Executive Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, and urges the Chief Executive to make serious reflection and respect public opinion” after “connection, this Council” and substitute with “urges the SAR Government to act appropriately having regard to the circumstances, and proactively respond to public aspirations by formulating a land and housing supply strategy to restore the healthy development of the real estate market, including resuming the construction of Home Ownership Scheme flats, reinstating the Tenants Purchase Scheme and enhancing My Home Purchase Plan, as well as building additional public rental housing flats, and rolling out middle-class public rental housing scheme and youth rental housing scheme to assist people in saving money for acquiring their homes”.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam’s amendment to Hon James TO’s motion proposed.

As Hon Fred LI, who intended to move an amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam’s amendment, was not in the Chamber at this juncture, the President suspended the meeting at 8:24 pm.

The Council resumed at 8:25 pm.

Hon Fred LI moved the following amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment:

To delete "by formulating" after "public aspirations" and substitute with"; and regarding the Government's repeated failure to proactively respond to the consensus of the public and this Council, this Council expresses grave dismay and calls upon Hong Kong people to make continuous efforts in expressing their strong aspirations to Chief Executive Donald TSANG Yam-kuen to strive for the formulation of"; and to add "to provide Hong Kong people with opportunities for acquiring affordable homes" after "enhancing My Home Purchase Plan".

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 14 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "The inability of the Government's measures to help people acquire their homes" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon James TO's motion put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 14 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, three against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing move the following amendment to Hon James TO's motion:

To delete "Government has turned a deaf ear and disregarded public opinion" after "this Council, but the" and substitute with "Government's various corresponding strategies and their intensity have failed to achieve any result, causing growing public discontent"; to add "to levels comparable to those in 1997" after "continued to rise"; to delete "these" after "reflecting that" and substitute with "the aforesaid"; to delete "help people acquire" after "unable to" and substitute with "resolve people's difficulties in acquiring"; and to delete "expresses grave dismay at Chief Executive Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, and urges the Chief Executive to make serious reflection and respect public opinion" after "connection, this Council" and substitute with "urges Chief Executive Donald TSANG Yam-kuen to respect the consensus of the Legislative Council and the community to formulate appropriate measures to assist local people in acquiring their homes and draw up timetables for their implementation, including expeditiously resuming the construction of an appropriate quantity of Home Ownership Scheme flats annually and reinstating the Tenants Purchase Scheme, enhancing My Home Purchase Plan, introduce more housing and home acquisition measures to assist the sandwich class, striving to further increase the supply of potential sites and disposed sites for constructing residential buildings, and expeditiously formulating a long-term housing policy for Hong Kong, with a view to enabling Hong Kong people to live and work in contentment".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon James TO's motion proposed.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kowk-hing's amendments:

To delete “by formulating” after “the community” and substitute with“; and regarding the Government’s repeated failure to respect the consensus of the the Legislative Council and the community, this Council expresses grave dismay and calls upon Hong Kong people to make continuous efforts in expressing their strong aspirations to the Chief Executive to strive for the formulation of”.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat’s amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s amendment proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 14 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing’s amendment to Hon James TO’s motion put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 14 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, three against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix VI**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Cyd HO moved the following amendment to Hon James TO’s motion:

To add “at the same time, the Administration has all along refused to build more public rental housing flats to alleviate people’s demand for private residential flats;” after “acquire their homes;”.

Question on Cyd HO’s amendment to Hon James TO’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Cyd HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 13 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix VII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO replied.

Question on Hon James TO's motion put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 13 were present, three were in favour of the motion, eight against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion, six against it and two abstained (voting record in **Appendix VIII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 15 June 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:47 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
23 September 2011

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 08/06/2011
時間 TIME: 05:53:11 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張國柱議員對譚耀宗議員就「訂立安老服務5年規劃」所提，經黃成智議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG KWOK-CHE TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S MOTION ON "SETTING OUT A FIVE-YEAR PLAN FOR ELDERLY SERVICES" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG SING-CHI

動議人 MOVED BY: 張國柱CHEUNG Kwok-che

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	24	
投票 Vote	22	23	
贊成 Yes	11	17	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	11	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 08/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 05:56:28 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁家傑議員對譚耀宗議員就「訂立安老服務5年規劃」所提，經黃成智議員~~張國柱議員~~
~~方剛議員~~修正的議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALAN LEONG TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S MOTION ON "SETTING
 OUT A FIVE-YEAR PLAN FOR ELDERLY SERVICES" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG SING-
 CHI /~~HON CHEUNG KWOK CHE / HON VINCENT FANG~~

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	24	
投票 Vote	22	23	
贊成 Yes	7	14	
反對 No	4	1	
棄權 Abstain	11	8	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩珍 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 08/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 08:28:51 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 李華明議員就陳鑑林議員對涂謹申議員的「政府措施無助市民置業」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
 HON FRED LI'S AMENDMENT TO HON CHAN KAM-LAM'S AMENDMENT TO HON JAMES TO'S MOTION ON "THE INABILITY OF THE GOVERNMENT'S MEASURES TO HELP PEOPLE ACQUIRE THEIR HOMES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明Fred LI

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	14	23	
投票 Vote	14	22	
贊成 Yes	3	13	
反對 No	9	7	
棄權 Abstain	2	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家騶 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 08/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 08:31:29 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 陳鑑林議員對涂謹申議員的「政府措施無助市民置業」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHAN KAM-LAM TO HON JAMES TO'S MOTION ON "THE
 INABILITY OF THE GOVERNMENT'S MEASURES TO HELP PEOPLE ACQUIRE THEIR
 HOMES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳鑑林CHAN Kam-lam

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	14	24	
投票 Vote	14	23	
贊成 Yes	8	8	
反對 No	3	15	
棄權 Abstain	3	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
日期 DATE: 08/06/2011
時間 TIME: 08:34:12 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 李永達議員就王國興議員對涂謹申議員的「政府措施無助市民置業」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
HON LEE WING-TAT'S AMENDMENT TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S AMENDMENT TO HON JAMES TO'S MOTION ON "THE INABILITY OF THE GOVERNMENT'S MEASURES TO HELP PEOPLE ACQUIRE THEIR HOMES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	14	24	
投票 Vote	14	23	
贊成 Yes	3	15	
反對 No	10	8	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 6
 日期 DATE: 08/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 08:36:04 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對涂謹申議員的「政府措施無助市民置業」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON JAMES TO'S MOTION ON "THE
 INABILITY OF THE GOVERNMENT'S MEASURES TO HELP PEOPLE ACQUIRE THEIR
 HOMES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	14	24	
投票 Vote	14	23	
贊成 Yes	7	7	
反對 No	3	15	
棄權 Abstain	4	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 7
 日期 DATE: 08/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 08:38:07 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 何秀蘭議員對涂謹申議員的「政府措施無助市民置業」議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CYD HO TO HON JAMES TO'S MOTION ON "THE INABILITY OF
 THE GOVERNMENT'S MEASURES TO HELP PEOPLE ACQUIRE THEIR HOMES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何秀蘭Cyd HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	13	24	
投票 Vote	13	23	
贊成 Yes	3	15	
反對 No	7	6	
棄權 Abstain	3	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 8
日期 DATE: 08/06/2011
時間 TIME: 08:45:53 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「政府措施無助市民置業」議案
MOTION ON "THE INABILITY OF THE GOVERNMENT'S MEASURES TO HELP PEOPLE ACQUIRE THEIR HOMES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	13	24	
投票 Vote	13	23	
贊成 Yes	3	15	
反對 No	8	6	
棄權 Abstain	2	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK