

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 32

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 15 June 2011 at 11:00 am
and Thursday 16 June 2011 at 9:00 am**

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

(absent on 16.6.2011)

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

(absent on 16.6.2011)

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

(absent on 16.6.2011)

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

(absent on 16.6.2011)

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Public officers attending:

On 15.6.2011

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Mr LAI Tung-kwok, SBS, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Prof Gabriel Matthew LEUNG, JP
Under Secretary for Food and Health

On 16.6.2011

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

On 15.6.2011 and 16.6.2011

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP
Secretary for Development

Clerks in attendance:

On 15.6.2011

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

On 16.6.2011

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

On 15.6.2011 and 16.6.2011

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instrument</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
Prevention and Control of Disease Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1) Notice 2011 (gazetted on 10.6.2011)	101/2011

Other Papers

Report No. 25/10-11 of the House Committee on Consideration of Subsidiary Legislation and Other Instruments (published on 9.6.2011)

Report of the Bills Committee on Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2011 (published on 7.6.2011)

Report of the Bills Committee on Motor Vehicles (First Registration Tax) (Amendment) Bill 2011 (published on 13.6.2011)

Report of the Bills Committee on Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Bill (published on 13.6.2011)

Questions

1. Hon IP Kwok-him asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Development and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

2. Hon Miriam LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

3. Dr Hon Margaret NG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

4. In accordance with Rule 26(6) of the Rules of Procedure, Hon Albert HO asked Question 4 on behalf of Hon James TO, who was not present to ask his question.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

5. Hon Jeffrey LAM asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

6. Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Labour and Welfare as well as the Secretary for Security replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Guardianship of Minors (Amendment) Bill 2011
Supplementary Appropriation (2010-2011) Bill
Copyright (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading under Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Guardianship of Minors (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Supplementary Appropriation (2010-2011) Bill

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

While the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:27 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President's Deputy stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Copyright (Amendment) Bill 2011

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President's Deputy stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2011

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 13 April 2011 resumed.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2011, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

Ten Members and Hon WONG Sing-chi spoke on the Bill.

At 4:02 pm, while Hon WONG Sing-chi was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Eleven other Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Mrs Regina IP claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 58 Members were present, 35 were in favour of the motion, 11 against it and 11 abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2011.

Question that clauses 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 3 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that Hon Mrs Regina IP had given notice to move an amendment to clause 3.

Hon Mrs Regina IP moved an amendment to clause 3 and spoke on the amendment.

The Chairman ordered that clause 3 and the amendment thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

Eight Members spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the amendment.

Hon Mrs Regina IP replied.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon Mrs Regina IP put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 18 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, one was in favour of the amendment, 24 against it and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 3 stand part of the Bill put.

Hon Vincent FANG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 54 Members were present, 33 were in favour of the motion, six against it and 14 abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Food and Health reported that

the Dutiable Commodities (Amendment) Bill 2011

had passed through Committee stage without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 54 Members were present, 33 were in favour of the motion, eight against it and 12 abstained (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motor Vehicles (First Registration Tax) (Amendment) Bill 2011

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 13 April 2011 resumed.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Motor Vehicles (First Registration Tax) (Amendment) Bill 2011, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

While Hon WONG Ting-kwong was speaking, the President left the chair at 8:30 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two Members and Hon KAM Nai-wai spoke on the Bill.

At 9:15 pm, while Hon KAM Nai-wai was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two other Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon KAM Nai-wai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

While the division bell was ringing, Hon Jeffrey LAM declared that he had placed an order for a car before the Bill was introduced into the Council.

The President announced that 39 Members were present, 25 were in favour of the motion and 13 against it (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Motor Vehicles (First Registration Tax) (Amendment) Bill 2011.

Question that clauses 1, 2 and 3 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Transport and Housing reported that

the Motor Vehicles (First Registration Tax) (Amendment) Bill 2011

had passed through Committee stage without amendment. She moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon Miriam LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 39 Members were present, 25 were in favour of the motion and 13 against it (voting record in **Appendix VI**). Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, he declared that the motion was passed.

Bill read the third time and passed.

The President suspended the meeting at 10:11 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 16 June 2011.

Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Bill

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 30 June 2010 resumed.

Hon WONG Sing-chi, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Bill, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Six Members spoke on the Bill.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU spoke on the Bill and declared that he had designed many residential care homes and also served in many of these organizations.

Two other Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee stage

The Council went into committee and considered the Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Bill.

Question that clauses 1, 3 to 7, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15, 18, 21 to 33, 35 to 38 and 40 to 47 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 8, 9, 12, 16, 17, 19, 20, 34 and 39 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Labour and Welfare put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 8, 9, 12, 16, 17, 19, 20, 34 and 39 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 41A and 41B read the first time.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved the Second Reading of new clauses 41A and 41B, and spoke on the new clauses.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 41A and 41B proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 41A and 41B read the second time.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved the addition of new clauses 41A and 41B to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare reported that

the Residential Care Homes (Persons with Disabilities) Bill

had passed through Committee stage with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon James TO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that in relation to the —

- (a) Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income) (Japan) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 64 of 2011;
- (b) Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income and Capital) (French Republic) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 65 of 2011;
- (c) Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income and Capital) (Principality of

Liechtenstein) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 66 of 2011;

- (d) Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income) (New Zealand) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 67 of 2011; and
- (e) Specification of Arrangements (Government of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Income and Capital and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion) (Amendment) Order 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 68 of 2011,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 18 May 2011, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 6 July 2011.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon IP Kwok-him moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

Resolved that in relation to the —

- (a) Electoral Affairs Commission (Registration) (Electors for Legislative Council Functional Constituencies) (Voters for Election Committee Subsectors) (Members of Election Committee) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 71 of 2011;
- (b) Electoral Affairs Commission (Nominations Advisory Committees (Legislative Council)) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 72 of 2011;
- (c) Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (Legislative Council) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 73 of 2011;
- (d) Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (District Councils) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 74 of 2011;

- (e) Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (Election Committee) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 75 of 2011;
- (f) Electoral Procedure (Chief Executive Election) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 76 of 2011;
- (g) Electoral Procedure (Village Representative Election) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 77 of 2011;
- (h) Particulars Relating to Candidates on Ballot Papers (Legislative Council and District Councils) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 78 of 2011; and
- (i) Electoral Affairs Commission (Financial Assistance for Legislative Council Elections and District Council Elections) (Application and Payment Procedure) (Amendment) Regulation 2011, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 79 of 2011,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 18 May 2011, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 6 July 2011.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Perfecting tree management system

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That planting trees may achieve the effects of improving air quality, alleviating the greenhouse effect and lowering the temperature in urban areas, and improve the urban environment; greening may also improve community landscape as well as people's living environment, thereby upgrading quality of life; a comprehensive system of tree preservation and management is an indispensable segment of the greening process; while proper tree management may strike a balance between conserving trees and protecting people's lives and properties, it can also reduce the chances of the Administration having to handle tree risk management and hazardous trees in the future and reduce expenditures; in this

connection, in order to further perfect Hong Kong's tree preservation and management system, this Council urges the Government to:

Establishment of a framework and perfecting resource allocation —

- (a) set up an independent and dedicated department to co-ordinate the work of green planning, tree preservation and tree risk management, which is at present scattered among various government departments;
- (b) set up an advisory framework comprising tree and greening experts as well as community members for advising the relevant policy bureaux and government departments on policies and specific measures relating to green planning as well as tree preservation and management;
- (c) increase resources for green planning, tree preservation and tree risk management;
- (d) study enacting specific legislation on tree management, establish a comprehensive legal framework, and formulate various policies and measures on tree preservation and management, so as to ensure that trees can receive comprehensive and appropriate protection;

Perfection of green planning —

- (e) add green elements to various large-scale public and private works projects as well as new development areas, and formulate a tree preservation and management mechanism;
- (f) formulate a comprehensive green planning system, and comprehensively examine the greening arrangements in Hong Kong;

Perfection of the training and regulation of talents —

- (g) formulate a licensing and regulatory system for tree management personnel and tree management contractors;
- (h) strengthen the training of tree preservation and management personnel, and encourage various organizations to offer courses on tree preservation and management as well as green planning;

Strengthening of community work —

- (i) conduct tree surveys in the various communities, so as to identify trees of conservation value, and include such trees in a specific register, and conserve them through specific legislation on tree management; and
- (j) strengthen public education on tree preservation and management, and organize the participation of interested people and groups in tree preservation and management work in the districts.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon KAM Nai-wai and Prof Hon Patrick LAU, who would move amendments, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Prof Hon Patrick LAU was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:21 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Development spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Three Members and Hon Audrey EU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 1:17 pm, while Hon Audrey EU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Tanya CHAN spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Development spoke again.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion:

To add "with the presence of high-rise buildings everywhere, air pollution and the heat island effect are very serious in Hong Kong, and" after "That"; to add "and establish a demerit point system and a penalty mechanism for the Government's outsourcing contractors for tree management work, so as to

strengthen the monitoring of outsourcing contractors' quality" after "tree management contractors"; to add "establish a comprehensive database of trees in the communities for recording the basic information of trees, their health conditions and locations, etc., to facilitate the Government to carry out tree management and the public to access the relevant information, and" after "(i)"; to delete "and" after "on tree management;"; to add "set up a complaints hotline operated by a dedicated department, make use of various channels such as smart phone or the Internet, etc., to facilitate the reporting of problematic trees by the public," after "on tree preservation and management,;"; and to add "and (k) allocate funds for encouraging the community to organize research projects and activities in relation to greening management and tree preservation, so as to enhance public awareness towards tree conservation" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan's amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHAN Hak-kan's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon IP Wai-ming to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon IP Wai-ming moved the following further amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan:

To add "and (j) Establishment of a framework and perfecting resource allocation— (l) as the urban Greening Master Plans have been in implementation for quite some time, consolidate the relevant experience in a timely manner, take on board the community opinions, and promote public engagement, so as to further develop and upgrade the effectiveness of the urban Greening Master Plans on the basis of collective wisdom and concerted efforts, thus enabling more effective tree management; (m) drawing on the experience of implementing the urban Greening Master Plans, incorporate the features and characteristics of New Territories districts and seriously heed and take on board the views of District Councils and the community, so as to formulate a clear timetable on drawing up the Greening Master Plans for the New Territories and an implementation schedule as part of perfecting tree management; and Strengthening of community work— (n) adopt proactive and effective measures for strengthening the conservation of local plants of economic value, such as Buddhist pines and incense trees, etc., so as to eradicate these plants from being stolen and felled by people, and educate the public about caring of trees with local characteristics as well as relevant conservation knowledge, so as to protect Hong Kong's green environment" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon IP Wai-ming's amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHAN Hak-kan's and Hon IP Wai-ming's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon KAM Nai-wai to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved the following further amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon IP Wai-ming:

To add “; Establishment of a framework and perfecting resource allocation— (o) study establishing a trees and greening conservation fund to offer funding on a ‘dedicated-funds-for-dedicated-uses’ basis for application by various types of organizations or institutions, including civil society institutions, so as to conserve trees and valuable trees which are beneficial to the community and which are grown on non-government land (for example, the land under the Hong Kong Housing Authority, the Hong Kong Housing Society and public organizations, as well as private land of public welfare purposes) and not managed by the Government; this fund may also be used to increase resources for green planning, tree preservation, tree risk management, public education and the promotion of green tourism; (p) set penalties for prohibiting any persons from felling, transplanting, trimming or damaging trees without authorization, so as to ensure that trees can receive comprehensive and appropriate protection; Perfection of green planning — (q) review and increase the green belts as provided in the statutory town plans of Hong Kong (especially the urban areas); Strengthening of community work— (r) study establishing a tree protection and observation team in various districts; and (s) implement a tree adoption scheme to put community-wide tree observation into action; at the same time, invite relevant professionals to provide the public with tree protection knowledge and training” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon IP Wai-ming proposed, put and agreed to.

As the amendments of Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon KAM Nai-wai had been passed, the President granted leave for Prof Hon Patrick LAU to revise the terms of his amendment.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU moved the following further amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon KAM Nai-wai:

To add “; Perfection of green planning—(t) undertake extensive greening in the vicinity of residential areas and on urban structures, including wall faces, slopes, pavements and rooftops, etc.; (u) formulate strategic green planning with special landscape design features for various districts and the planting of theme trees in selected streets and places for showing various shades of colours in different seasons, so as to create beautified streets and scenic spots to attract tourists and stop any haphazard planting from ruining the beauty of trees; and Strengthening of studies on sustainable development—(v) through conducting studies on planting bamboo groves or other plants, develop a green economy to dovetail with sustainable urban development; in particular, as bamboo grows quickly and its photosynthetic rate is three times that of other plants, it can convert more carbon dioxide into oxygen, thereby helping to alleviate greenhouse effect; at the same time, bamboo has the property of tightly gripping the surface of the soil and is safer than other trees; bamboo can also provide substantial natural construction materials and can be used for manufacturing bamboo products; planting bamboo can even increase employment opportunities in the fields of research, planting, landscaping, manufacturing, design and certification, etc.; with the economic benefits of sustainable development, put in more resources to perfect tree preservation and management work” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU’s amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Hon IP Wai-ming and Hon KAM Nai-wai proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Tanya CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Hon IP Wai-ming, Hon KAM Nai-wai and Prof Hon Patrick LAU put and agreed to.

Moral and National Education Curriculum

Hon Albert HO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Education Bureau earlier proposed to make Moral and National Education a compulsory subject arousing public concern; HAO Tiechuan, Director-General of the Publicity, Culture and Sports Department of the Liaison Office of the Central People’s Government in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, made a high-profile remark on the Internet that the new

subject is a type of ‘necessary brainwashing’ and queried that ‘any education in defiance of the Central Government’ was not regarded as national education; subsequently, officials from Hong Kong’s Education Bureau even commented at a consultation seminar on the curriculum guide that ‘universal values (such as democracy and freedom, etc.) are equal to western values’, and rebuked teachers for ‘obstinately discussing the country’s state of affairs from a negative perspective’; in order to allay public concern and ensure that the introduction of the new subject will not be utilized as a tool for instilling political ideas, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) face up to the concern of the education sector and the public, and ensure that the introduction of the new subject is based on open and impartial public consultation, rather than a fake consultation exercise conducted in a top-down manner; the scope of consultation should cover whether the new subject is to be introduced in September 2012;
- (b) instil elements relating to universal values such as democracy, freedom and human rights, etc., into national education, and enhance the existing civic education, so as to establish recognition of national and citizenship identity;
- (c) give teachers a free hand so that they can adopt rational, objective and diversified pedagogical approaches to cultivate students’ independent critical thinking;
- (d) through the new subject, teach students to understand the relationship of the state, the nation, the Government and political parties with the people, and to differentiate love for the country and care for the nation from support for the Government, political parties, the ruling regime and political figures, so that they will understand that love for the country and the people is not equal to love for a political party and support for the leadership; and
- (e) ensure that the new subject can comprehensively and truly depict the state of affairs in China; and using Chinese history, particularly contemporary Chinese history, as teaching materials, including the 4 June incident, the rights defending movement and even the suppression of political dissidents such as LIU Xiaobo and AI Weiwei, etc., to enable students to understand the problems faced by China as a result of the socio-political development since its economic reform and liberalization.

Question on Hon Albert HO’s motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Cyd HO and Hon Audrey EU would move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong would move an amendment to Hon Cyd HO's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Cyd HO, Hon Audrey EU and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Education spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Twelve Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert HO spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Education spoke again.

Hon Cyd HO moved the following amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion:

To add “, given that” after “That”; to delete “face up to the concern of the education sector and the public, and ensure that the introduction of the new subject is based on open and impartial public consultation, rather than a fake consultation exercise conducted in a top-down manner; the scope of consultation should cover whether the new subject is to be introduced in September 2012” after “(a)” and substitute with “replace Moral and National Education proposed in the consultation document with the subject of Liberal Studies and Civic Education”; to delete “instil elements relating to universal values such as democracy, freedom and human rights, etc., into national education, and enhance the existing civic education, so as to establish recognition of national and citizenship identity” after “(b)” and substitute with “examine in the new subject the gains and losses of China's modernization process, and explore the reasons for democracy, freedom, human rights and the rule of law lagging behind in China”; to delete “nation” after “care for the” and substitute with “various nationalities”; to delete “China” after “problems faced by” and substitute with “the People's Republic of China”; and to delete “socio-political development since its economic reform and liberalization” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “social, cultural, political and economic development since its founding”.

Question on Hon Cyd HO's amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion proposed.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon Cyd HO's amendment:

To delete "replace Moral and National Education proposed in the consultation document" before "with the subject" and to add "as the basis, increase the contents of national history education" after "Civic Education".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendment to Hon Cyd HO's amendment proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix VII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon Cyd HO's amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 18 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix VIII**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion:

To add ", given that" after "That"; to add "and human rights education in primary and secondary schools by incorporating them into the formal curricula to enable students to learn the basic values of human rights and cultivate civic awareness when small" after "civic education"; to delete "and" after

“leadership;” and to add “; and (f) as Chinese history is an important element in cultivating the next generation’s sense of belonging to the country and national identity, enhance students’ knowledge of Chinese history and make Chinese History as a compulsory subject in junior secondary school, so that through learning history, especially contemporary Chinese history, students can better understand the state of affairs in China, and the curriculum contents should also focus on conducting objective analyses of the actual situation in China, so as to increase students’ understanding of the state of affairs in the country” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU’s amendment to Hon Albert HO’s motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix IX**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert HO replied.

Question on Hon Albert HO’s motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, three were in favour of the motion, 16 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 12 were in favour of the motion, nine against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix X**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 22 June 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 4:38 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
23 September 2011

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 15/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 06:36:49 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2011年應課稅品（修訂）條例草案》- 二讀
 DUTIABLE COMMODITIES (AMENDMENT) BILL 2011 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 食物及衛生局局長 Secretary for Food and Health

出席 Present :58
 投票 Vote :57
 贊成 Yes :35
 反對 No :11
 棄權 Abstain :11
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN	李慧琼	Starry LEE	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驊	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	棄權	ABSTAIN
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	棄權	ABSTAIN
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	反對	NO
李鳳英	Li Fung-ying	反對	NO	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 15/06/2011
時間 TIME: 08:19:10 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2011年應課稅品（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第3條
DUTIABLE COMMODITIES (AMENDMENT) BILL 2011 - COMMITTEE STAGE -
AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 3

動議人 MOVED BY: 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	29	
投票 Vote	25	28	
贊成 Yes	4	1	
反對 No	18	24	
棄權 Abstain	3	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 15/06/2011
時間 TIME: 08:23:22 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2011年應課稅品（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 第3條納入條例草案
DUTIABLE COMMODITIES (AMENDMENT) BILL 2011 - COMMITTEE STAGE - CLAUSE 3
STAND PART OF THE BILL

動議人 MOVED BY: 食物及衛生局局長 Secretary for Food and Health

出席 Present :54
投票 Vote :53
贊成 Yes :33
反對 No :6
棄權 Abstain :14
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN	李慧琼	Starry LEE	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家駒	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	棄權	ABSTAIN
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	棄權	ABSTAIN
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權	ABSTAIN
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權	ABSTAIN
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 15/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 08:27:37 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2011年應課稅品(修訂)條例草案》- 三讀
 DUTIABLE COMMODITIES (AMENDMENT) BILL 2011 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 食物及衛生局局長 Secretary for Food and Health

出席 Present :54
 投票 Vote :53
 贊成 Yes :33
 反對 No :8
 棄權 Abstain :12
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN	李慧琼	Starry LEE	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對	NO
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	梁家驊	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	贊成	YES
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	棄權	ABSTAIN
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	棄權	ABSTAIN
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權	ABSTAIN
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE		
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM	贊成	YES
余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	贊成	YES
李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES	Albert CHAN	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 15/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 10:06:08 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2011年汽車（首次登記稅）（修訂）條例草案》 - 二讀
 MOTOR VEHICLES (FIRST REGISTRATION TAX) (AMENDMENT) BILL 2011 - SECOND
 READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 運輸及房屋局局長 Secretary for Transport and Housing

出席 Present :39
 投票 Vote :38
 贊成 Yes :25
 反對 No :13
 棄權 Abstain :0
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			梁家驊	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming		
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP		
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩璆	Dr PAN Pey-chyau		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM		
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing			陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

秘書 CLERK 

投票 VOTE: 6
 日期 DATE: 15/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 10:10:57 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2011年汽車（首次登記稅）（修訂）條例草案》- 三讀
 MOTOR VEHICLES (FIRST REGISTRATION TAX) (AMENDMENT) BILL 2011 - THIRD
 READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 運輸及房屋局局長 Secretary for Transport and Housing

出席 Present :39
 投票 Vote :38
 贊成 Yes :25
 反對 No :13
 棄權 Abstain :0
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	出席	PRESENT	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
吳靄儀	Dr Margaret NG	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	甘乃威	KAM Nai-wai	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	何秀蘭	Cyd HO	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	林大輝	Dr LAM Tai-fai		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	陳茂波	Paul CHAN		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			梁家驩	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	張國柱	CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU			黃成智	WONG Sing-chi	反對	NO
鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES	黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES	葉偉明	IP Wai-ming		
譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	葉國謙	IP Kwok-him	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES	葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP		
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	潘佩珍	Dr PAN Pey-chyou		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO
馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES	譚偉豪	Dr Samson TAM		
余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing			陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN	反對	NO
李永達	LEE Wing-tat			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	黃毓民	WONG Yuk-man		

投票 VOTE: 7
 日期 DATE: 16/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 04:23:16 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張文光議員就何秀蘭議員對何俊仁議員的「德育及國民教育科課程」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
 HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG'S AMENDMENT TO HON CYD HO'S AMENDMENT TO HON ALBERT HO'S MOTION ON "MORAL AND NATIONAL EDUCATION CURRICULUM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	2	10	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	6	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 8
日期 DATE: 16/06/2011
時間 TIME: 04:27:05 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 何秀蘭議員對何俊仁議員的「德育及國民教育科課程」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON CYD HO TO HON ALBERT HO'S MOTION ON "MORAL AND NATIONAL EDUCATION CURRICULUM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何秀蘭Cyd HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	3	12	
反對 No	18	9	
棄權 Abstain	3	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 9
日期 DATE: 16/06/2011
時間 TIME: 04:31:04 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 余若薇議員對何俊仁議員的「德育及國民教育科課程」議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON AUDREY EU TO HON ALBERT HO'S MOTION ON "MORAL AND NATIONAL EDUCATION CURRICULUM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇 Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	3	12	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	5	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 10
 日期 DATE: 16/06/2011
 時間 TIME: 04:37:40 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「德育及國民教育科課程」議案
 MOTION ON "MORAL AND NATIONAL EDUCATION CURRICULUM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	3	12	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	5	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK