

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC39/10-11
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 5th meeting
held in Room A of Legislative Council Building
on Wednesday, 19 January 2011, at 8:30 am**

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP (Chairman)
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Members absent:

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

Public officers attending:

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| Ms Doris HO Pui-ling | Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³ |
| Mr WAI Chi-sing, JP | Permanent Secretary for Development (Works) |
| Mr Thomas CHOW Tat-ming, JP | Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) |
| Ms Anissa WONG, JP | Permanent Secretary for the Environment |
| Ms Joyce HO Kwok-shan | Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Works) |
| Miss Vivian LAU Lee-kwan, JP | Deputy Secretary for the Environment |
| Miss Katharine CHOI Man-yee | Principal Assistant Secretary (Energy) for the Environment |
| Mr Stephen CHAN Hung-cheung, JP | Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services |
| Mr LI Kwok-keung | Assistant Director (Electricity and Energy Efficiency) Electrical and Mechanical Services Department |
| Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP | Under Secretary for Transport and Housing |
| Ms Maisie CHENG Mei-sze, JP | Deputy Secretary (Transport) ¹ Transport and Housing Bureau |
| Mr CHOW Chun-wah | Principal Assistant Secretary (Transport) ⁷ Transport and Housing Bureau |
| Mr Peter LAU Ka-keung, JP | Director of Highways |
| Mr Henry CHAN Chi-yan | Principal Government Engineer (Railway Development) Highways Department |
| Mr Henry LAM | General Manager (SCL/KTE) MTR Corporation Limited |

| | |
|---------------|---|
| Mr James CHOW | Project Manager (SCL/KTE Civil) MTR Corporation Limited |
| Ms Maggie SO | Senior Manager (Projects and Property Communications) MTR Corporation Limited |

Clerk in attendance:

| | |
|---------------|------------------------------|
| Ms Debbie YAU | Chief Council Secretary (1)6 |
|---------------|------------------------------|

Staff in attendance:

| | |
|------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Mrs Constance LI | Assistant Secretary General 1 |
| Mrs Mary TANG | Senior Council Secretary (1)2 |
| Mr Ken WOO | Council Secretary (1)2 |
| Mr Frankie WOO | Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3 |
| Ms Christy YAU | Legislative Assistant (1)1 |

The Chairman advised that a total of 15 projects costing \$20,356.01 million, in which capital works projects amounted to \$17,289.01 million, had been endorsed by the Public Works Subcommittee (PWSC) in the 2010-2011 session so far.

Head 705 – Civil Engineering

PWSC(2010-11)31 45CG District Cooling System at the Kai Tak Development

2. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to increase the approved project estimate (APE) of 45CG by \$190.8 million from \$1,671 million to \$1,861.8 million in money-of-the-day (MOD) prices for implementing Phases I and II of the District Cooling System (DCS) at the Kai Tak Development (KTD). The Panel on Environmental Affairs (EA Panel) had been consulted on the proposal on 20 December 2010.

Project estimates

3. Mr LEE Wing-tat said that Members belonging to the Democratic Party found it difficult to support the project given the high project cost

of Phases I and II, which had exceeded the original APE of the entire DCS project. He said that the procurement strategy had since been changed from the original Design-Built-Operate approach under a single contract to the present phased approach to be taken forward by Government. While he had requested for a cost breakdown on the different phases of DCS at the meeting of the EA Panel on 20 December 2010, such information had not been provided in the PWSC paper. In the absence of information on the capital and recurrent expenditure, he would have difficulty in supporting the proposed funding. He hoped that a more detailed breakdown on expenditure could be provided before the proposal was submitted to the Finance Committee (FC). While noting that implementation of DCS at KTD would bring about substantial reduction in carbon dioxide emission, Mr LEE considered it necessary to assess its cost-effectiveness given the total project cost for DCS would amount to over \$3.6 billion.

4. The Deputy Secretary for the Environment (DS/ENB) said that the justifications for the significant increase in the estimate project cost as well as the expenditure for the DCS project had been set out in paper PWSC(2010-11)31. The estimated recurrent cost of the DCS project from 2012-2013 to 2026-2027 (based on the assumed subscription rate of 100%) was given in Enclosure 6 to the paper. She highlighted that DCS would bring about significant environmental benefits. Although the project cost had exceeded the original estimates, the project was expected to be able to break even within 25 years, which was well before the end of its service life of 30 years.

5. Mr LEE Wing-tat enquired if an independent assessment could be made on the estimated expenditure of the DCS project. The Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services (DEMS) said that in the light of members' suggestion that all private non-domestic projects in KTD should be obliged to subscribe to the DCS services, the Administration had actively explored the feasibility of pursuing this through incorporating appropriate conditions in the land sale. The Department of Justice had confirmed that the proposed requirement was legally in order. Therefore, with the mandatory requirement for connection to DCS, the assessment on estimated expenditure and revenue would be reasonably accurate based on the best information available. A sensitivity analysis conducted had indicated that if the total project cost increased by 10%, 20% and 25%, the project would break even within 26, 29 and 30 years respectively. On the other hand, if the revenue reduced by 5%, 10% and 14%, the project would break even within 26, 28 and 30 years respectively. Mr LEE enquired about the break even period if

the project cost increased by 20% to 30% and the revenue reduced by 10%. DEMS said that with the mandatory requirement for connection to DCS, the project should be able to break even within a period of 30 years, unless there were very exceptional circumstances which were beyond the scope of the sensitivity analysis. Overseas experience had shown that DCS was a cost-effective air-conditioning system.

6. Mr LEE Wing-tat questioned the reliability of the current project estimates which had far exceeded the original APE. He was concerned that with the commitment of funds for Phases I and II, there would be no choice but to proceed with Phase III. DEMS said that as the DCS project was the first of its kind to be built in Hong Kong, the original estimate was made with reference to the DCS experience in Singapore and Guangdong. Although the original estimate had been set at 40% higher than that of DCS in Singapore and Guangdong, it was subsequently found to have been under-estimated. The present estimate, including cost estimate for Phase III, should be more accurate because it had taken into account the returned tender prices for Phases I and II works and the current development programme.

7. Mr WONG Kwok-kin questioned why a phased approach would be a more cost-effective procurement strategy. DEMS said that as the DCS project would span over a period of 17 years, a phased approach would enable more reasonable cost estimates to be made and would have greater flexibility to cater for changes in the development schedule of KTD so that adjustments could be made. In fact, comparing the results of the tenders for Phases I and II against the result of the original tender exercise carried out in late 2009, it was estimated that the alternative procurement strategy had rendered a reduction in capital cost by \$164.7 million and a significant reduction in the operating cost by \$284 million for the operation period of DCS from 2012-2013 to 2026-2027. He explained that Phase I pipe laying works would have to proceed first to match the ongoing roadwork construction programme in North Apron to avoid delay in the roadwork construction programme or the need of re-opening the newly completed road. Phase II works would mainly provide core services including the construction of chiller plants and pump houses and the laying of seawater pipelines and chilled water distribution pipe networks. Phases I and II works would cater for Package 1 users of KTD such as the Cruise Terminal and non-domestic areas of a public housing estate and a number of schools. Phase III works would provide for electrical and mechanical (E&M) installations and pipe laying for Package 2 and 3 users such as the Tourism Node, hotels, private commercial and residential developments. As the

moving in of Package 2 and 3 users was not certain at this stage, a phased approach would minimize unnecessary idling of early investment in pipe laying and E&M equipment installations.

Admin 8. Mr Alan LEONG enquired if there would be flexibility in the adjustment of project cost in the event that the subscription rate was lower than expected. DEMS said that with the mandatory requirement for connection to DCS being included in the land lease, all private non-domestic projects in KTD would have to connect to DCS. The Permanent Secretary for the Environment (PS(Env)) explained that the present funding proposal was meant to implement Phases I and II of the DCS project, which covered the costs for the core structures and the laying of pipes to serve the early developments at KTD. To allow flexibility in timing and alignment of the pipes to serve the needs of Packages 2 and 3 users, tenders would be invited for Phase III works in due course and funding approval would be sought from FC. Mr LEONG requested the Administration to provide information on the flexibility in undertaking construction works for Phase III, which was subject to the progress and development programme in KTD.

9. Mr KAM Nai-wai expressed concern that, given the scale of KTD, there might be adjustments to the design and implementation schedule of various projects, which might vary the cost of works under Phase III. DEMS said that the latest development programme of KTD was broadly grouped into three packages with reference to their scheduled completion dates, with Package 1 scheduled for completion in 2013, and Packages 2 and 3 in 2016 and thereafter. The commencement date of the works under Phase III would match with the implementation timetables for projects under KTD Packages 2 and 3.

Financial viability

10. Mr Albert CHAN commented that the rising cost of major public projects far exceeding the original APE had caused serious concerns. Given the substantial financial commitment of DCS and the concern about its viability, he enquired about the overseas experience in the implementation of DCS. He said that members would need to be convinced about the financial viability as well as the reliability of assumptions on the cost recovery of the project. DEMS said that DCS had been successfully implemented in many countries including Singapore. The estimate on expenditure should be reliable as it had taken into account the returned tender prices for Phases I and II works. As regards revenue, the Principal Assistant Secretary (Energy) for the

Environment (PAS(E)) said that a consultancy study was being conducted on the setting of tariff levels and reference would be made to overseas experience in this regard. There were very few places where mandatory requirement was imposed on connection to DCS. As overseas experience had revealed that DCS was financially viable even under a voluntary subscription model, there should not be a problem in cost recovery if mandatory requirement for connection to the proposed DCS was imposed.

11. Mr IP Kwok-him considered that in order to achieve the environmental benefits, non-domestic users of KTD would need to subscribe to the DCS services. As such, he would support the mandatory requirement which would also help ensure the financial viability of the project. Given the need to provide for underground DCS pipes and to interface with other underground utilities, he opined that an underground tunnel should be provided for in KTD, which was a new development area, to house all such facilities to facilitate future repairs and maintenance works so as to reduce road excavations. The Assistant Director (Electricity and Energy Efficiency), Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (AD/EE) said that underground tunnels for facilities provided in overseas countries like Japan were usually provided on a much larger scale. Nevertheless, the Civil Engineering and Development Department had planned to provide some similar underground tunnels in a smaller scale for housing utilities crossing certain trunk roads at KTD where feasible.

Mandatory connection requirement

12. In response to members' enquiries, DS/ENB said that Government had started to gauge views from relevant stakeholders on the proposal to require private non-domestic projects in KTD to connect to DCS by way of appropriate provisions in the land lease conditions. It had since consulted the Lands Sub-Committee of the Land and Development Advisory Committee. Members of the Sub-Committee had no objection to the proposed requirement in land lease. They had provided valuable views on the detailed arrangements, for example, the service and stability of DCS and the tariff issues.

13. Mr TAM Yiu-chung said that while he accepted that the DCS project would bring about significant environmental benefits, he was concerned about the possible contention arising from the mandatory requirement for subscription and the tariff levels. He urged the Administration to make accurate assessments of costs and tactfully

proceed with the mandatory requirements for connection to DCS to avoid disputes.

14. Professor Patrick LAU said that there would be more certainty on the cost recovery of the project, with the mandatory requirement for connection to DCS. If the subscription was mandatory, it was necessary to apprise developers of the benefits associated with the connection to DCS. He asked about the scope of DCS project. DEMS said that the non-domestic areas of public and private projects would account for 35% and 65% respectively of the 1.7 million square metres of air-conditioned floor areas in KTD. DCS was expected to break even within its service life of 30 years with an overall subscription rate of about 73%. Apart from the public projects which were mandated to subscribe to the DCS service, subscription rate of about 58% of the air-conditioned floor area of private non-domestic developments in KTD would be required. Therefore, with 100% subscription rate for the DCS service under the mandatory requirement, it was expected that the break even period would be reduced to 25 years. Even though the project cost had increased, the DCS project would still be able to break even under the mandatory requirement.

15. Mr WONG Kwok-kin enquired whether residential premises could subscribe to the DCS service. DEMS said that DCS was an energy-efficient system for high demand users such as commercial buildings. As most residential premises would prefer to use window-type air-conditioners, the mandatory requirement would only apply to non-domestic users.

16. Mr James TO sought clarification on whether the mandatory requirement to be included in the land lease conditions was to "connect" to DCS or to "use" DCS, as they had different meanings. DS/ENB confirmed that it would be set out in the land lease that private non-domestic projects in KTD would be required to connect to DCS. Once connected to DCS, private non-domestic users would unlikely change to use other kinds of cooling services because it would increase costs, and additional building space would be required to accommodate other forms of cooling facilities.

17. Mr James TO asked about the impact of the mandatory requirement on land prices at KTD, i.e. whether DCS would increase the land price on account of its energy efficiency. DS/ENB said that it would be difficult to make an assessment as land prices were determined by prevailing market conditions. The legislation for Government to

charge tariff for the DCS service would be introduced in 2012, well before the sale of land at KTD.

Environmental benefits

18. Ms Starry LEE noted that the implementation of a DCS in KTD would bring about significant environmental benefits as it was 35% more energy-efficient than traditional air-cooled air-conditioning system, and that DCS was the first of its kind to be implemented in a new development and on a district basis. In view of the environmental benefits and in an attempt to ensure financial viability of the DCS project, she would support the proposal to include a mandatory requirement for connection to DCS in the land lease conditions for private non-domestic projects in KTD. She sought information on the environmental benefits brought about by DCS and the outcome of consultation with relevant stakeholders on the mandatory requirement for connection to DCS. DS/ENB advised that the maximum annual saving in electricity consumption would be 85 million kilowatt-hour, with a corresponding reduction of 59 500 tonnes of carbon dioxide emission per annum for the planned total public and private non-domestic air-conditioned floor area of about 1.7 million square metres. As such, DCS could contribute to air quality improvement and the vision of achieving low carbon economy. Besides, as user buildings within KTD would not have to install their own chillers, the nuisances associated with noise and the heat island effect would be significantly reduced. The Department of Justice and relevant departments were working out the provisions to be introduced in the land lease for the mandatory requirement to connect to DCS for private non-domestic projects at KTD.

19. Ms Cyd HO enquired whether the proposed change in fuel mix for power generation with an increased reliance on nuclear energy would impact on the cost recovery of the DCS project. DS/ENB said that consultation on climate change had just ended and the implications of change in fuel mix on electricity tariff had yet to be assessed. As electricity would be consumed irrespective of the type of cooling services, the change in fuel mix would not have affected the cost recovery of the project. Besides, DCS was more worthy of support as it was 20% more energy efficient than conventional water-cooled air-conditioning systems using cooling towers.

Tariff rates

20. Mr KAM Nai-wai considered that the tariff rates should be set at a

competitive level as users were mandated to subscribe to the DCS service. However, he was concerned that if the tariff level was set too low, tax payers might have to subsidize users of DCS service. DEMS said that the tariff for the use of DCS would be set at a competitive level comparable to the cost of individual water-cooled air-conditioning systems using cooling towers, which was one of the most cost-effective air-conditioning systems available in the market. Legislation for the Government to charge tariff for the DCS service would be introduced. It was expected that the DCS project would be able to recover the capital and operating cost within its service life of 30 years. DS/ENB added that subject to the Legislative Council's approval of the relevant legislation, the recurrent costs arising from the proposal, including the service fee payment to the contractor and other operating costs, would be offset by the DCS tariff charges to users. Details on collection arrangements, tariff levels and adjustment mechanism would be provided in the legislation to be introduced at a later stage.

Admin

21. Ms Miriam LAU said that while DCS was worth supporting on account of its environmental benefits, there were concerns about the project cost, the subscription rate and the setting of tariff levels. She noted that while the Administration had been asserting that tariff levels would be competitive and comparable to the cost of individual water-cooled air-conditioning systems, it had also indicated that it would be aiming at cost recovery. There were concerns that if the tariff rates were high, users might opt to set up their own cooling systems. Therefore, the Administration should explain the basis for setting the tariff levels. She also questioned the legal basis for the mandatory requirement for connection to DCS and charging a higher tariff.

Admin

22. Ms Cyd HO also expressed concern about the mandatory requirement for connection to DCS, and the need for legislation on the requirement. DS/ENB clarified that legislation would not be required for the mandatory requirement, which would be set out in the land lease. Legislation for Government to charge tariff for DCS services would have to be introduced, similar to the existing arrangement for the charging of tariff for other public utilities services. Ms HO requested that information on the scope of legislation to be introduced be provided for members' reference.

Contingency arrangements

23. Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired about the back-up arrangements in the event of a breakdown of DCS. AD/EE said that according to the

current planning, the DCS project would have altogether 28 chillers which were being housed centrally. In the event of breakdown of one of these major E&M equipment, the other chillers would be able to make up for the lost service and users would not be able to detect any difference in the cooling service. In the case of leakage or failure of distribution pipes, the valves in the ring distribution network could be used to re-route the flow such that the cooling service would not be disrupted. Such would not be normally possible with the use of individual water-cooled air-conditioning systems. Therefore, DCS would provide for a more stable and reliable cooling service.

24. As regards arrangements in the event of electricity outage, AD/EE said that cooling service would likely be disrupted in the event of electricity outage, as the back-up electricity generators might not be sufficient to operate the entire cooling system. To cater for such emergency situation, the power company would be supplying electricity to KTD through an electricity network which comprised two major power stations at the northern and southern part of KTD. This arrangement had been confirmed to be reliable by consultants and would help avoid a total suspension of electricity supply to DCS plants of KTD.

Admin

25. Mr KAM Nai-wai shared the concern about the need for measures to cope with emergency situations and deliberate destructive activities. He requested for information on the measures to be adopted to cope with DCS failure due to suspension of electricity supply, leakage of chilled water distribution pipes, equipment breakdown at the chiller room or seawater pump house, and the malfunctioning of E&M equipment etc.

26. The item was voted on and endorsed. Members requested that the item be voted on separately at the relevant FC meeting.

Head 706 – Highways

PWSC(2010-11)32 60TR Kwun Tong Line Extension — essential public infrastructure works

27. The Chairman advised that the proposal was to upgrade 60TR to Category A at an estimated cost of \$826.9 million in MOD prices for the essential public infrastructure works for the Kwun Tong Line Extension (KTE) project. The Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways (the Railways Subcommittee) under the Panel on Transport had been consulted on the proposal on 6 and 16 December 2010. At the request of the Railways Subcommittee, the Administration had provided

supplementary information on 13 January 2011.

28. The Chairman advised that he had declared that he was an independent non-executive director of a construction company when the KTE, South Island Line (East) and Shatin to Central Link projects were discussed at recent meetings of the Railways Subcommittee. Ms Starry LEE declared that she was a member of Kowloon City District Council and she owned properties along the alignment of KTE. Mr Abraham SHEK also declared that he was an independent non-executive director of the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL).

Providing a station entrance at Ho Man Tin Estate

29. Ms Starry LEE referred to the proposed entrance at Fat Kwong Street which would connect to the Ho Man Tin Station (HOM) by a subway, and asked if it was possible to move the entrance further northwards closer to the Ho Man Tin Estate to facilitate access of residents of Ho Man Tin Estate. The Principal Assistant Secretary (Transport)⁷ (PAS(T)) advised that the proposed request would make it necessary to construct a subway of around 300 to 400 metres in length which required a prolonged construction time, and that the risks associated with necessary construction works underneath the existing service reservoirs in Ho Man Tin would be significant. In addition, a deep underground lift tower near Ho Man Tin Estate would also need to be provided to reach the subway at Ho Man Tin Estate as the Estate was situated on raised terrain, and this would pose safety concerns in case of evacuation in times of fire and rendered the proposal technically infeasible. PAS(T) explained that the pedestrian connections as currently proposed already sufficed to facilitate residents of Ho Man Tin Estate to access to the said entrance as they could travel along Fat Kwong Street or make use of the proposed footbridge system to commute between the two destinations. Ms Starry LEE requested the Administration to explain in writing, before the relevant FC meeting, the reasons for not providing direct subway connection from HOM to the Ho Man Tin Estate.

Admin

Providing greening and artwork display on the proposed footbridges

30. Ms Starry LEE considered it important to make good use of public open space for greening purposes and displaying artworks, such as at the proposed footbridges under the KTE project, in line with the Governments' objective to make Hong Kong the Asia's Creative Capital. The General Manager (SCL/KTE), MTRCL (GM(SCL/KTE)) advised

MTRCL that greening measures had been incorporated into the design of the relevant footbridges, and the proposed aesthetic design of the structures had been accepted by the Advisory Committee on the Appearance of Bridges and Associated Structures. He undertook to consider the request for displaying artworks on the proposed footbridges.

31. Noting that some overseas infrastructural projects had set aside a proportion of the works area, say 0.1% or even 1%, for artworks display, Mr Albert CHAN expressed disappointment that similar practice was rarely adopted in Hong Kong. He also criticized MTRCL for displaying mega advertisements at the MTR stations but making little efforts in promoting the works of local artists. He urged the Administration and MTRCL to make reference to the Taiwan experience, and display more artworks at public areas and MTR stations for the appreciation of local people and to add to the artistic flavour of the city.

MTRCL 32. In response, the Senior Manager (Projects and Property Communications), MTRCL advised that MTRCL had been displaying artworks at some 40 MTR stations and would continue to partner with local artists in displaying different artworks at different MTR stations. Mr Albert CHAN and Ms Starry LEE requested MTRCL to provide the details of its plan to display artworks at the footbridges as well as stations to be built under the KTE project, and the costs involved.

The proposed Whampoa Station

Covered walkways

33. Pointing out that all entrances of the future Whampoa Station (WHA) were all situated within the Whampoa Garden, Ms Starry LEE said that residents in other developments in Hung Hom had been urging for enhancement of the connectivity linking WHA with Laguna Verde, Harbour Place and other residential developments in the vicinity by providing covered walkways between them. PAS(T) responded that the proposed WHA was located at a flat terrain and there were already good pedestrian road networks and ancillary facilities.

Admin 34. Ms Starry LEE said that there was genuine need for enhancing the connectivity links with other developments, given the very small costs involved, and that the topside development of HOM would bring about a very lucrative profit to MTRCL. Ms LEE requested the Administration to explain in writing reasons for not providing the proposed covered walkways.

35. Ms Miriam LAU considered the request for covered walkways justified. She recalled that the Railways Subcommittee had conducted a site visit in the summer and found that the walkway connecting Laguna Verde and the location of a future WHA station was quite bare without trees which would be unpleasant for pedestrians especially in hot weather. She urged the Administration to consider providing covered walkways or planting more trees along the walkways. The Deputy Secretary (Transport)1 (DS(T)) advised that as the costs for providing pedestrian link systems under the project would be borne by the Government, it would be necessary to exercise prudence in the use of public monies for the provision of pedestrian subways or covered walkways. Nevertheless, DS(T) undertook to explore the feasibility of enhancing greening along the walkways concerned. Residents' views and concerns would be taken into account in considering the types of trees to be planted in order to provide comfortable shades.

36. Ms Cyd HO said that it was quite common for district councils and government departments to use any unspent funds towards the end of a fiscal year to undertake greening works. She urged for co-ordinated efforts among different departments and district councils for such greenings works. She also advised against the use of plastic covers for walkways as it would affect ventilation. The Under Secretary for Transport and Housing (USTH) took note of Ms HO's suggestion. DS(T) added that the relevant planting and greening works at the proposed station could be entrusted to MTRCL.

37. While expressing appreciation for undertaking greenings works along walkways, Ms Starry LEE urged the Administration/MTRCL to continue discussion with relevant stakeholders on the request for covered walkways between WHA and residential developments. Ms Miriam LAU requested the Administration to provide information on the improvement measures, such as greenings, to be adopted to further improve the walkways. USTH said that the Administration and MTRCL would continue to discuss with the local community and consider the request having regard to the overall pedestrian flow in the area.

Admin/
MTRCL

Location of station entrances

38. Ms Starry LEE said that the local residents had requested for provision of a WHA entrance connected to the basement of commercial arcades in Whampoa Garden. PAS(T) advised that MTRCL had been liaising with the owners of the shopping malls, and initially found the

proposal feasible. MTRCL would continue active discussions with the respective parties to further explore the viability and technical feasibility of the proposal, as well as land ownership and fire safety requirements, etc. It was hoped that the discussion could be concluded soon and the implementation of such entrance would not affect the commissioning of KTE.

39. As regards request of some residents of the Whampoa Garden to locate an entrance from the Man Siu Street back to Man Tai Street as originally proposed under the KTE project, PAS(T) explained that Man Siu Street was the preferred location to avoid interfering with the underground public utilities.

Design of ventilation shafts

40. Regarding the concern about the design of the proposed ventilation shafts, Ms Starry LEE said that some residents of Whampoa Garden requested to further reduce the height and width of the shafts and to enhance their appearance to blend in with the surrounding environment. In reply, GM(SCL/KTE) advised that MTRCL was aware of the residents' concerns and the height of the shaft at Shung King Street had been reduced from over 10 metres to approximately 8 to 9 metres. GM(SCL/KTE) undertook to enhance the appearance of the shafts to reduce the visual impact.

41. The item was voted on and endorsed. Ms Starry LEE requested that the item be voted on separately at the relevant FC meeting.

42. The Chairman reminded members that a special meeting had been scheduled for 25 January 2011 at 10:45 am for the discussion of two railway projects.

43. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:35 am.