

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)3075/10-11
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/CI/1

Panel on Commerce and Industry

Minutes of special meeting
held on Tuesday, 14 June 2011, at 2:30 pm
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

- Members present** : Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon CHIM Pui-chung
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP
Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP
Dr Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
- Members attending** : Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou
- Members absent** : Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

**Public officers
attending**

: Agenda item I

Mr Andrew Lai
Deputy Commissioner for Innovation and
Technology

Dr Cecilia Pang
Biotechnology Director
Innovation and Technology Commission

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda Item I

Hong Kong Jockey Club

Ms Imelda Chan
Executive Manager, Charities

Mr Benson Luk
Public Affairs Officer

Hong Kong Applied Science and Technology
Research Institute Company Limited

Dr Cheung Nim-kwan
Chief Executive Officer

Ms Monisa Wan
Director, Human Resources

Hong Kong Jockey Club Institute of Chinese
Medicine

Professor Sarah HUI
Executive Director

Board of Directors of Hong Kong Jockey Club
Institute of Chinese Medicine

Mr LAU Man-wai, BBS, JP
Chairman

Individual

Ms KUNG Chun-fai

The Hong Kong Medicine Dealers' Guild

Mr WONG Ping-ming
Chairman

Modernized Chinese Medicine International
Association

Mr Albert WONG
Founding President

Triple Kings' Research and Pharmaceutical
Company

Mr LAU Sai-ming
Director

濟世中醫專科學院

Mr LI Ying-fai
院長

Hong Kong Registered Chinese Medicine
Practitioners Association

Mrs FUNG Jiu
Chairperson

中國祖傳香港中醫急救協會

Mr TING Shui-yan
會長

Chinese Ancient Healings Medicines Conservation
Association

Mr YU Hung-chiu
Chairman

Hong Kong Chinese Medicine Industry Association

Mr Thomson LI Chun-man
Executive Director

HK Ophthal Center in Chinese Medicin

Mrs LI Kam-fung
Chinese Medicine Practitioner

Hong Kong Chinese Medicine Practitioners' Rights
General Union

Mr YU Kwok-wai
Chairman

陶棉暉醫務診所

Ms TAO Min-fai
Owner

New York U.S.A. Yee Hing Pak Fow Oil Mfy

Mr CHEUNG Yin-chuen
Owner

The Hong Kong Professional Institute of Chinese
Medicine Medicated Meal and Food

Mr Jack PANG Cheung-hi
Chairman

Tsz Yan Tong

Mr CHAN Sau-kut
Chairman

南方天然中草藥保健堂

Mr LAU Pak-chun
Chinese Medicine Practitioner

The Society of HK Professional Registered Chinese
Medicine Practitioners Limited

Mr LAM Ching
Chairman

Kowloon Chamber of Commerce

Mr CHENG Kwan-suen
Chairman

Individual

Mr YU Wai-lung

Chinese Medicine Informatics (HK) Ltd

Mr KWONG Ping-nam
Director

The Hong Kong Society of Chinese Medicines Ltd

Mr NG Wo-mau
Executive Councilor

Luen Yick Pharmaceutical Co Ltd

Mr Martin CHOW
Director

International General Chinese Herbalists and
Medicine Professionals Association Ltd

Mr Gary WONG Kai-cheong
監事長

Clerk in attendance : Ms YUE Tin-po
Chief Council Secretary (1)3

Staff in attendance : Miss Rita YUNG
Council Secretary (1)3

Ms May LEUNG
Legislative Assistant (1)3

Action

I. The future direction of the Hong Kong Jockey Club Institute of Chinese Medicine in developing and promoting Chinese medicine

Meeting with the Administration and deputations/individuals

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2099/10-11(01) -- Executive summary of the consultancy report of the review of the Hong Kong Jockey Club Institute of Chinese Medicine and the supplementary information provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(01) -- Extract of minutes of CI Panel meeting on progress report on the promotion of innovation and technology development in Hong Kong held on 19 April 2011

LC Paper No. CB(1)2438/10-11(01) -- Referral from the Complaints Division dated 10 June 2011 regarding views on the Hong Kong Jockey Club Institute of Chinese Medicine (Restricted to Members)

Submissions from individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(10) -- Submission from Professor Karl TSIM, Director of Centre for Chinese Medicine R&D, The Hong Kong University of Science and Technology

LC Paper No. CB(1)2438/10-11(05) -- Submission from Professor HAN Yi-fan and Professor WU Jian-yong, Department of Applied Biology and Chemical Technology, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University)
(*Chinese version only*)

Welcoming remarks by the Chairman

The Chairman welcomed representatives of the deputations and individuals to the meeting. He said that written submissions from deputations and individuals received before the meeting had been circulated to members, and deputations and individuals which had not provided written submission were requested to do so as soon as possible after the meeting. He reminded the deputations and individuals that when addressing the Panel at the meeting, they were not covered by the protection and immunity under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382), and their written submissions were not covered by the said Ordinance.

Briefing by the Administration

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, Deputy Commissioner for Innovation and Technology (DCIT) briefed members on the comprehensive review of the operation of the Hong Kong Jockey Club Institute of Chinese Medicine (HKJCICM). Having explored three options on the future direction of HKJCICM, the Administration considered that HKJCICM should be disbanded and that a new Government-led committee would be more effective in coordinating the collaboration of all parties concerned in promoting the research and development (R&D) and testing of Chinese medicine (CM) in the interest of the community. The Administration welcomed public views on the subject and would forward them to the two shareholders of HKJCICM for consideration.

Presentation by deputations

Hong Kong Jockey Club Institute of Chinese Medicine
(LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(02) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(01) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))
(*tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011*)

3. Professor Sarah HUI of HKJCICM expressed regret about the Administration's recommendation to disband HKJCICM. She said that since she joined HKJCICM as the Executive Director in January 2010,

HKJCICM had focused its work in providing relevant testing services to assist the CM industry to meet the requirements under the regulations of the Hong Kong proprietary CM, providing technical support services to facilitate testing laboratories to obtain accreditation for identification of Chinese herbal medicines, thereby promoting the use of testing and certification services in CM, and providing CM chemical markers to support quality control, ingredient verification and natural product applied research in CM. She considered that the Administration should allow two to three years for HKJCICM to complete the above tasks and to revise its roles, functions and modes of operation as well as develop new directions.

Board of Directors of Hong Kong Jockey Club Institute of Chinese Medicine
(LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(02) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))
(tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011)

4. Mr LAU Man-wai of Board of Directors of HKJCICM opined that the consultancy report of the comprehensive review of the operation of HKJCICM was unprofessional and lack of independence. He raised objection to the disbandment of HKJCICM, and requested that the Administration should allow two to three years for HKJCICM to revise its present roles, functions and modes of operation, so that it could continue to contribute to the development and promotion of CM.

The Hong Kong Medicine Dealers' Guild
(LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(03) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

5. Mr WONG Ping-ming of The Hong Kong Medicine Dealers' Guild opined that HKJCICM should provide assistance to the CM industry in meeting the requirements under the regulations of the Hong Kong proprietary CM. He raised objection to the disbandment of HKJCICM as it would hinder the development of CM in Hong Kong.

Modernized Chinese Medicine International Association
(LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(04) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

6. Mr Albert WONG of Modernized Chinese Medicine International Association was of the view that there was a lack of an independent professional organization specialized in developing and promoting CM in Hong Kong. He also opined that HKJCICM should revise its present roles, functions and modes of operation so that it could be revitalized to better promote the development of CM.

濟世中醫專科學院

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2438/10-11(02) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

7. Mr LI Ying-fai of 濟世中醫專科學院 opined that HKJCICM should not be disbanded since it had an important role in the development and promotion of CM in Hong Kong.

Hong Kong Registered Chinese Medicine Practitioners Association

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(05) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

8. Mrs FUNG Jiu of Hong Kong Registered Chinese Medicine Practitioners Association considered that HKJCICM should step up its effort in R&D of the compound prescriptions of CM. While reviewing the operation of HKJCICM, it would also be opportune for the Administration to re-examine its strategy and policy in developing CM in Hong Kong.

中國祖傳香港中醫急救協會

9. Mr TING Shui-yan of 中國祖傳香港中醫急救協會 opined that HKJCICM should continue its operation.

Chinese Ancient Healings Medicines Conservation Association

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(03) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))
(*tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011*)

10. Mr YU Hung-chiu of Chinese Ancient Healings Medicines Conservation Association was of the view that HKJCICM had an important role in the development and promotion of CM, and that more similar organizations should be established to develop and promote CM in Hong Kong.

Hong Kong Chinese Medicine Industry Association

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(06) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

11. Mr Thomson LI Chun-man of Hong Kong Chinese Medicine Industry Association welcomed the Administration's proposal of setting up a new Government-led committee including representatives from the Government, the industry, academic and research institutions in the CM sector to promote the development of CM in Hong Kong. He suggested that the Administration should gauge the views of the relevant stakeholders when setting up the new committee.

HK Ophthal Center in Chinese Medicin

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(07) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

12. Mrs LI Kam-fung of HK Ophthal Center in Chinese Medicin opined that the Administration should set up a CM testing institute to assist the CM industry to meet the requirements under the regulations of the Hong Kong proprietary CM.

Hong Kong Chinese Medicine Practitioners' Rights General Union

13. Mr YU Kwok-wai of Hong Kong Chinese Medicine Practitioners' Rights General Union expressed that HKJCICM had an important role in the development and promotion of CM. Although the overall performance of HKJCICM might not be satisfactory over the last 10 years, he strongly objected to the disbandment of HKJCICM.

陶棉暉醫務診所

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(08) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

14. Ms TAO Min-fai of 陶棉暉醫務診所 raised objection to the disbandment of HKJCICM.

New York U.S.A. Yee Hing Pak Fow Oil Mfy

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2419/10-11(09) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(04) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*)
(*tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011*)

15. Mr CHEUNG Yin-chuen of New York U.S.A. Yee Hing Pak Fow Oil Mfy expressed dissatisfaction with the Administration for failing to consult the CM industry adequately on the future direction of HKJCICM. He objected to the disbandment of HKJCICM.

The Hong Kong Professional Institute of Chinese Medicine Medicated Meal and Food

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(05) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*)
(*tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011*)

16. Mr Jack PANG Cheung-hi of The Hong Kong Professional Institute of Chinese Medicine Medicated Meal and Food raised objection to the disbandment of HKJCICM. He was of the view that HKJCICM should continue its operation and suggested that the Administration should set up a task force to assist the CM industry in meeting the testing requirements for the registration of proprietary CM.

Tsz Yan Tong

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(06) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))
(*tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011*)

17. Mr CHAN Sau-kut of Tsz Yan Tong strongly objected to the disbandment of HKJCICM. He considered that HKJCICM should revise its present roles, functions and modes of operation so that it could be revitalized to meet present day needs.

南方天然中草藥保健堂

18. Mr LAU Pak-chun of 南方天然中草藥保健堂 expressed that HKJCICM had provided support to the CM industry to facilitate the development of the CM industry and assist the industry to meet the requirements of the regulatory framework. He was of the view that the organization structure and management of HKJCICM could be revamped to improve its performance.

The Society of HK Professional Registered Chinese Medicine Practitioners Limited

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(07) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))
(*tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011*)

19. Mr LAM Ching of The Society of HK Professional Registered Chinese Medicine Practitioners Limited raised objection to the disbandment of HKJCICM as it would hinder the development of CM in Hong Kong. He opined that the Administration should allocate more resources for developing and promoting CM in Hong Kong.

Kowloon Chamber of Commerce

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(08) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))
(*tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011*)

20. Mr CHENG Kwan-suen of Kowloon Chamber of Commerce objected to the disbandment of HKJCICM as it would hinder the development of CM in Hong Kong. He was of the view that HKJCICM should be expanded to cater for the long term development of the CM industry.

Mr YU Wai-lung

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(09) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))
(*tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011*)

21. Mr YU Wai-lung raised objection to the disbandment of HKJCICM.

Chinese Medicine Informatics (HK) Ltd

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2438/10-11(03) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

22. Mr KWONG Ping-nam of Chinese Medicine Informatics (HK) Ltd opined that the consultancy report of the comprehensive review of the operation of HKJCICM was completed by persons without any knowledge of CM. He was of the view that HKJCICM should not be disbanded as it could provide technical support service to the CM industry. He also opined that the proposed new Government-led committee, as compared with a substantive organization such as HKJCICM, would not be more effective in promoting the R&D and testing of CM.

The Hong Kong Society of Chinese Medicines Ltd

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2438/10-11(04) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))

23. Mr NG Wo-mau of The Hong Kong Society of Chinese Medicines Ltd raised objection to the disbandment of HKJCICM. He considered that HKJCICM should revise its present roles, functions and modes of operation so that it could meet present day needs and provide better support to the CM industry in Hong Kong.

Luen Yick Pharmaceutical Co Ltd

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2461/10-11(10) -- Submission (*Chinese version only*))
(*tabled at the meeting and subsequently issued via email on 21 June 2011*)

24. Mr Martin CHOW of Luen Yick Pharmaceutical Co Ltd said that HKJCICM was the only organization set up by the Administration which could provide technical support service to the CM industry, and therefore should not be disbanded.

International General Chinese Herbalists and Medicine Professionals Association Ltd

25. Mr Gary WONG Kai-cheong of International General Chinese Herbalists and Medicine Professionals Association Ltd expressed dissatisfaction with the Administration for failing to consult the CM industry adequately before deciding to disband HKJCICM. He was of the view that HKJCICM should focus its effort in assisting the CM industry in meeting the testing requirements for the registration of proprietary CM.

Discussion

26. Dr Priscilla LEUNG opined that the Administration should consult the CM industry adequately before deciding on the future direction of HKJCICM. She added that it was unfair to disband HKJCICM because of the personnel issues and disputes among the staff. As regards the Administration's proposed new Government-led committee, she was concerned about the lack of representatives with sufficient knowledge and experience in CM from the industry.

27. Mr Vincent FANG opined that sufficient resources should be deployed to the development of CM as there were huge business opportunities for CM made in Hong Kong, particularly for the Mainland market. Noting that the majority of views received considered that HKJCICM should continue its operation, he urged the Administration to take note of these views. Mr FANG also added that the Board membership of HKJCICM should be enhanced with more representatives from the CM industry. The Administration should also provide more assistance and support to the industry in relation to the testing of CM.

28. In response, DCIT advised that the proposed disbandment of HKJCICM did not suggest that the Administration would stop supporting and promoting the R&D and testing of CM or reduce the resources deployed for these purposes. He said that the Administration's key consideration to disband HKJCICM was also not due to the personnel issues and disputes among the staff of HKJCICM occurred in the past year. The key consideration was that while HKJCICM had made some achievements in the past 10 years, its overall cost effectiveness was not satisfactory and the achievements were limited. On project funding, HKJCICM had supported 18 projects with total funding amount of \$108 million over the last 10 years. It only amounted about one-fifth of the Hong Kong Jockey Club Charities Limited's \$500 million pledged funding support to HKJCICM. It had a low profile of its R&D activities as most of the R&D work was conducted by universities in these projects. After the proposed disbandment of HKJCICM, the Administration would identify suitable organizations for the provision of CM chemical markers and other technical support services to assist the CM industry.

29. Noting that the Administration had not set a target of cost effectiveness to be achieved by HKJCICM from the outset, Mr Ronny TONG opined that it was not appropriate for the Administration to disband HKJCICM based on the conclusion that the latter's overall cost effectiveness was not satisfactory.

30. In response to Mr Ronny TONG's enquiry, DCIT advised that one of the key areas of the comprehensive review of the operation of HKJCICM was to take stock of the work and achievements of HKJCICM since its establishment. The Board of HKJCICM had therefore engaged two experienced administrators to conduct the review. The two consultants had rich administrative experience though they were not from the CM industry.

31. Dr LAM Tai-fai, Mr Albert CHAN and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung raised objection to the disbandment of HKJCICM. They suggested that the Administration should revise the present roles, functions and modes of operation of HKJCICM so that it could be revitalized to meet present day needs. The Board membership should also be enhanced to make it more representative and new staff of the right skill-set should be recruited. The Administration should allow some time for HKJCICM to reform and develop new directions, the future of HKJCICM could be reviewed at a later time.

32. Sharing a similar view, Dr LEUNG Ka-lau suggested that while HKJCICM should be allowed some time to reform, the Administration could also set up another organization for promoting the development of CM at the same time.

33. Dr PAN Pey-chyou noted that HKJCICM had focused its work in providing relevant testing services to assist the CM industry to meet the requirements under the regulations of the Hong Kong proprietary CM, while there was no other organization providing similar services at the juncture. He considered that HKJCICM should not be disbanded and that it could coexist with the new Government-led committee in developing and promoting CM in Hong Kong. He was keen to ensure that the performance of HKJCICM would improve after its personnel issues and disputes among the staff were resolved.

Motion moved by Mr Albert CHAN

34. Mr Albert CHAN proposed the following motion which was seconded by Ms Tanya CHAN:

"本事務委員會認為政府當局不應解散香港賽馬會中藥研究院。"

(Translation)

"That, this Panel considers that the Administration should not disband the Hong Kong Jockey Club Institute of Chinese Medicine."

35. The Chairman considered that the proposed motion was directly related to the agenda item under discussion and members agreed that the motion should be dealt with at the meeting. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Of the members present, five voted for and no member voted against the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was passed.

(Post-meeting note: The wording of the motion was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)2489/10-11 on 15 June 2011.)

II. Any other business

36. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:32 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
6 October 2011