

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)2926/10-11
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/2/08/1

Panel on Development

Subcommittee on Harbourfront Planning

**Minutes of ninth meeting held on
Tuesday, 19 July 2011, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Tanya CHAN
- Members absent** : Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Public officers attending : Agenda item I

Mr Thomas CHOW Tat-ming, JP
Permanent Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)

Ms Gracie FOO Siu-wai, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)¹

Mr Chris FUNG Pan-chung
Principal Assistant Secretary (Harbour) (Acting)
Development Bureau

Ms Phyllis LI Chi-miu
Assistant Director of Planning/Special Duties
Planning Department

Clerk in attendance : Ms Connie SZETO
Chief Council Secretary (1)⁴

Staff in attendance : Ms Sharon CHUNG
Senior Council Secretary (1)⁴

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)⁴

Action

I Meeting with the Administration

Update on harbourfront enhancement initiatives and the way forward

(LC Paper No. CB(1)2726/10-11(01) -- Administration's paper on update on harbourfront enhancement initiatives and the way forward)

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

II. Any other business

Way forward of the Subcommittee

2. The Chairman said that since the establishment of the Subcommittee in late 2008, it had held nine meetings, three informal exchanges with the Harbour-front Enhancement Committee/Harbourfront Commission and conducted an overseas duty visit. The Chairman suggested and members agreed that the Subcommittee should wind up its work and the Panel on Development ("the Panel") should follow up issues, if any, about harbourfront planning in future. The Clerk would prepare a report on the Subcommittee's deliberations for submission to the Panel.

Clerk

3. Ms Cyd HO proposed arranging an exchange with three District Councils in Hong Kong Island, namely, the Central and Western District Council, the Wan Chai District Council and the Eastern District Council, on the harbourfront initiatives and programmes in their respective areas. The Chairman welcomed the proposal and requested the Clerk to follow up the arrangements.

Clerk

4. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 11:45 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
24 August 2011

Panel on Development

Subcommittee on Harbourfront Planning

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Tuesday, 19 July 2011, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000001 – 000347	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000348 – 000812	Administration	<p><u>Update on harbourfront enhancement initiatives and the way forward</u> (LC Paper No. CB(1)2726/10-11(01))</p> <p>Briefing by the Administration on the paper</p> <p>Appreciation to the Chairman for his presentation made on 9 July 2011 at the informal exchange with the Harbourfront Commission ("HC") on the observations of the Subcommittee's overseas duty visit to the USA and Canada in April 2011, and to members of the Subcommittee for attending the informal exchange</p>	
000813 – 001423	Mr KAM Nai-wai Administration Chairman	<p>Mr KAM's support in principle for the proposal to establish a statutory and dedicated authority for harbourfront planning ("the harbourfront authority"), and enquiry on -</p> <p>(a) whether the harbourfront authority would have adequate legal power to undertake its work, for example, to order the relevant Government departments to relocate incompatible facilities away from the harbourfront areas;</p> <p>(b) the time-table for setting up the harbourfront authority; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) the time-table for developing a connected harbourfront promenade on both sides of Victoria Harbour</p> <p>The Administration's response as follows -</p> <p>(a) The Chief Secretary for Administration issued a General Circular in July 2010 stating that, as a matter of principle, the occupation of harbourfront land by new public facilities should not be supported unless there were no better alternatives or when their operations required a waterfront location. Under such circumstances, bureaux and departments should take the initiative to provide a harbourfront passageway for public use and have suitable beautification works to ensure the facilities would mix well with the harbourfront environment.</p> <p>(b) As the Secretary for Development indicated at the motion debate about perfecting harbourfront planning and management at the Legislative Council meeting of 13 July 2011, the Administration would conduct a study with HC on the establishment of the harbourfront authority with a view to formulating a framework in the next 12 months in order to lay down the basis for further work.</p> <p>(c) The Administration has been making a lot of efforts in connecting the harbourfront promenades on both sides of Victoria Harbour under the 22 action areas for harbourfront enhancement. Examples included the projects in Sheung Wan and the Hong Kong Island East Harbour-front Study.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Chairman's comments that adequate statutory power and a sustainable financial model were important elements of the harbourfront authority</p>	
001424 – 002043	Ms Starry LEE Administration	<p>Ms Starry LEE's enquiry on -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) measures to enhance public-private collaboration ("PPC") in pursuing harbourfront projects; (b) how to tackle problems associated with private land ownership in enhancing public accessibility to the harbourfront, for instance, a private pier at Hung Hom had caused difficulties in developing a harbourfront walkway connecting To Kwa Wan and Tsim Sha Tsui; and (c) the Administration's plans to facilitate the development of sight-seeing and leisure activities at certain harbourfront operation sites, such as the Yau Ma Tei Typhoon Shelter, through collaboration with the concerned industry, so that more harbourfront areas would be made available for public enjoyment <p>The Administration's response as follows -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) The PPC model would be applied in the development of Site 4 and Site 7 (in whole or in part) of the new Central harbourfront with a view to adopting a suitable business model for the development. A market sounding exercise had been completed with seven submissions from the private sector received. The submissions were being analyzed. The PPC model could also 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>be adopted in the development of a harbourfront promenade at Hoi Yu Street, Quarry Bay, together with two adjoining sites.</p> <p>(b) There was discussion with the owner of the pier at Hung Hom, but such discussion would take time, as complicated issues were involved.</p> <p>(c) On facilitating public activities at harbourfront operation sites, the Administration and the Central and Western District Council had organized a Flea Market cum Carnival at the Western Wholesale Food Market with encouraging outcome. The Administration would continue with these efforts where appropriate.</p> <p>(d) The Administration would explore with users of the Yau Ma Tei Typhoon Shelter the feasibility of facilitating public access in the vicinity.</p> <p>(e) Applying the PPC model to suitable sites would be implemented in an open, transparent and fair manner.</p>	
002044 – 002543	Miss Tanya CHAN Administration	<p>Miss Tanya CHAN's enquiry on the Administration's initial thinking about the jurisdiction of and funding for the harbourfront authority</p> <p>The Administration's response as follows -</p> <p>(a) Study on the proposal to establish the harbourfront authority had just commenced. The Administration had an open attitude towards suggestions on the authority's jurisdiction, management and financing models.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) HC had already asked the Harbour Business Forum to conduct a study on overseas waterfront management authorities to better understand the success factors of these authorities and the challenges they faced. The study would also include statutory bodies in Hong Kong, which would be of reference value.</p> <p>(c) The Administration would draw up a framework for the establishment of the harbourfront authority in the next 12 months.</p> <p>Miss Tanya CHAN's views that the Administration should take reasonable time to study matters related to the establishment of the harbourfront authority. The framework laid down by the Secretary for Development during her term of office would be followed up by the next term of the Government. If the Subcommittee would wind up its work, harbourfront planning issues would be followed up by the Panel on Development in future.</p>	
002544 – 002723	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman's comments that planning was of utmost importance to the enhancement of harbourfront development and there should be ongoing actions, and the Administration should continue to work on the 22 action areas for harbourfront enhancement</p> <p>The Administration's response that it had been working on the 22 action areas conscientiously, and some projects had been successfully completed and the efforts would continue</p>	
002724 –	Ms Starry LEE	Ms Starry LEE's views that she supported	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
003244	Administration	<p>the Administration's study on the establishment of the harbourfront authority, and the new authority must have concrete objectives to convince Legislative Council ("LegCo") Members and the public that its establishment would bring substantive benefits to the development of the harbourfront</p> <p>Ms Starry LEE's comment that activities to attract visitors was a contributing factor in creating a vibrant harbourfront and her suggestion that the Administration should work out with HC an action plan in this regard</p> <p>The Administration's response as follows -</p> <p>(a) If the proposal of establishing a harbourfront authority was to be pursued, the Administration would work out the missions, objectives and financial arrangements of the authority. The authority would be vested with sufficient power to perform its tasks effectively. A bill on the establishment of the authority would be introduced to LegCo for Members' scrutiny.</p> <p>(b) The Administration recognized the importance of enhancing both the hardware and software in harbourfront planning, i.e. the provision of facilities and organization of activities in creating a vibrant harbourfront. To this end, the Task Forces established under HC had been making various suggestions on activities to be held at harbourfront areas, and the Administration welcomed suggestions from LegCo Members, District Council members and the public. For instance, the Administration had</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>organized a number of successful activities at harbourfront areas in collaboration with other organizations, and would seek to ensure that such efforts would be sustainable.</p> <p>Ms Starry LEE's comments that to achieve sustainable vibrancy at harbourfront areas, the Administration and HC should keep up their efforts and engage stakeholders including District Councils, in working out new initiatives and organizing activities</p>	
003245 – 004055	Mr James TO Chairman Administration	<p>Mr TO's enquiry on whether the harbourfront authority would have statutory power to resume land for harbourfront enhancement such as improving the connectivity of and public's accessibility to the harbourfront, while the Administration might be able to achieve such purpose under the Land Resumption Ordinance (Cap. 124) ("LRO"). His view that it would be desirable for the resumption of land for harbourfront enhancement to be covered by LRO. This would avoid creating a separate legal framework for the purpose given that complicated issues would be involved and the drafting and scrutiny of such legislation might take years.</p> <p>The Chairman's enquiry on the Administration's policy for applying LRO to resumption of land for public use</p> <p>The Administration's response as follows -</p> <p>(a) It maintained an open attitude on the power and terms of reference of the harbourfront authority and welcomed views of LegCo Members in this aspect.</p> <p>(b) To enhance the accessibility of the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>harbourfront, other than taking legal action to resume land alone, approaches such as negotiation with parties and making adjustments to the project design could also be considered. For example, in the Hoi Yu Street Temporary Promenade project, accessibility to the harbourfront had been improved with the support of the New Hong Kong Tunnel Company Limited in giving up the rights over a waterfront land strip for development of a passageway.</p> <p>(c) The application of LRO would be determined on a case-by-case basis. There were cases that LRO had been applied to resume land for recreational purpose.</p>	
004056 – 004512	Ms Starry LEE Administration	<p>Ms Starry LEE's enquiries on the departments/organizations responsible for the management of different harbourfront areas</p> <p>The Administration's reply as follows -</p> <p>(a) There was a mechanism for the management of harbourfront areas. For areas at which there were Government facilities such as parks and pump stations, the relevant departments, such as the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") and the Water Services Department, were responsible for the management of the facilities. For areas without public facilities, the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department and the Police were responsible for the cleanliness and the public order respectively.</p> <p>(b) As regards areas owned by private</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>entities, such as the harbourfront areas in Tsing Yi, the management responsibilities were stipulated in the respective land lease conditions. While in some cases the management responsibilities vested with the developers; in other cases there were lease conditions requiring LCSD to take up the management duties of public open spaces and waterfront promenades built by the developers.</p> <p>(c) The Administration issued the Public Open Space in Private Developments Design and Management Guidelines in early 2011 setting out guiding principles for the management of open spaces, including waterfront areas, in private developments.</p> <p>Ms Starry LEE's view that, to bring vibrancy to the harbourfront, the Administration, together with HC, should work out a mechanism to facilitate the public in making applications for organizing public activities at harbourfront areas and widely publicize the procedures and channels involved, and consider opening up harbourfront areas step by step for street performances</p>	
004513 – 005403	Mr Paul TSE Chairman Administration	Mr TSE's views that the Administration should facilitate the wider application of PPC and commercial investments in bringing out the full potentials of Hong Kong's valuable harbourfront areas for the benefits of Hong Kong, especially for the promotion of tourism. It was necessary for the Administration to consider relocating certain facilities at harbourfront areas, such as the pump station of the Drainage Services Department ("DSD") near the Hong Kong	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Academy for Performing Arts ("HKAPA") in Wan Chai, so as to release the valuable land at strategic locations for better use.</p> <p>The Administration's response that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li data-bbox="576 521 1260 734">(a) The Commissioner for Tourism, being a member of HC, would consult HC's views on tourism facilities at the harbourfront and convey the views of the tourism industry to HC.<li data-bbox="576 786 1260 1211">(b) The Administration and HC had successfully co-organized a Victoria Harbour icon design competition. The winning design, announced in July 2011, would be used for the Harbourfront Signage Scheme to be implemented in six pilot districts to guide locals and tourists to nearby harbourfront promenades and open spaces.<li data-bbox="576 1263 1260 1476">(c) As an initiative to make use of Hong Kong's waterfront in promoting tourism, the Administration would put up a site at the waterfront of Sai Kung for sale for developing a hotel.<li data-bbox="576 1563 1260 1944">(d) Where possible, consideration would be given to relocating Government facilities currently situated at the harbourfront. For those which must be located at harbourfront areas, bureaux and departments should take the initiative to set back the facilities to provide passageway for public access to the harbourfront.<li data-bbox="576 1995 1260 2074">(e) DSD's sewage screening plant near HKAPA would be relocated in the long	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>term to vacate the site for cultural and recreational use.</p> <p>Mr TSE's views that instead of implementing trivial items in a piecemeal manner, it was more important to formulate strategic plans for the further development of tourism which had become a vital economic pillar of Hong Kong. It was not effective only to have the Commissioner for Tourism to sit in HC to make the best use of the harbourfront for promoting tourism in Hong Kong. From the observations of the Subcommittee's overseas duty visit in April 2011, the success of harbourfront development hinged on, inter alia, strategic planning involving the participation of both the Administration and the business sector.</p> <p>The Chairman's enquiry on whether the Administration would support making use of defunct piers for tourism purposes</p> <p>The Administration's advice that it would listen to the views of the public on the best use of defunct harbourfront facilities including piers. For instance, four of the five piers near the Western Wholesale Food Market had stopped operation and public views were being invited on the future uses for these piers. While recreational use was among the various suggestions, there were concerns about the safety of users. The design of the new facilities should address such issues.</p>	
005404 – 005905	Ms Cyd HO Administration Chairman	<p>Ms Cyd HO's views as follows -</p> <p>(a) In planning the use of harbourfront areas, it was important to include different uses to cater users with different needs and purposes. For</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>example, besides providing places for retails, dinning and entertainment at the harbourfront, separate areas without business activities should be provided for people to enjoy the tranquility of the waterfront and the breeze.</p> <p>(b) The Administration should consider reserving the eastern and western ends of the harbourfront in Hong Kong Island for visitors who preferred tranquility and developing the central section into a more bustling area.</p> <p>(c) HC should listen to public views to understand their aspirations.</p> <p>The Administration's response that it would endeavour to strike a balance between vibrancy and tranquility in the planning of harbourfront promenades. HC and the Administration would continue to gauge public views in the process of harbourfront planning.</p> <p>The Chairman's views that local characteristics and historical features should be preserved and highlighted in the planning and development of different harbourfront areas. The Administration should work closely with HC to enhance harbourfront planning and development.</p>	
005910 – 010445	Chairman Members Ms Cyd HO	<p><u>Way forward of the Subcommittee</u></p> <p>The Chairman's remarks that during the past three years, the Subcommittee had held nine meetings with the Administration, three informal exchanges with Harbour-front Enhancement Committee/HC, and conducted an overseas duty visit. The Subcommittee should consider winding up its work and the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Panel on Development should follow up issues, if any, about harbourfront planning in future</p> <p>Members' consent to wind up the work of the Subcommittee</p> <p>Ms Cyd HO's suggestion that the Subcommittee arrange an exchange with three District Councils in Hong Kong Island, namely the Central and Western District Council, the Wan Chai District Council and the Eastern District Council, on the harbourfront initiatives and programmes in their respective areas</p> <p>The Chairman's request that the Clerk look into the arrangements</p>	