

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1330/10-11(03)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/08

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Updated background brief prepared by the Legislative Council
Secretariat for the meeting on 29 March 2011**

**Stage Two public engagement exercise
for the West Kowloon Cultural District project**

Purpose

This paper provides updated information on Stage Two public engagement ("PE") exercise for the development of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") project.

Background

2. Since its establishment in October 2008 under the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") Ordinance (Cap. 601), the WKCDA Board has been preparing a Development Plan ("DP") for WKCD. The main purpose of DP is to lay out the WKCD area and set apart the land for various arts and cultural facilities; for other land uses such as commercial, hotel, retail and public open spaces; and for internal infrastructural projects. To obtain support from the community in its preparation of DP, the Board has decided to conduct a three-stage PE exercise.

3. Stage One PE exercise lasted from 8 October 2009 to 7 January 2010. It gauged the community's aspiration for and expectations on the planning of WKCD as a whole, and the stakeholders' views on the requirements of the facilities in the arts and cultural venues in WKCD. In this connection, WKCDA appointed in July 2009 three consultants, viz. Foster+Partners ("F+P"), Rocco Design Architects Limited ("RDA") and Office for Metropolitan Architecture ("OMA"), to prepare Conceptual Plan Options ("CPOs"), which showed the layout of the arts and cultural facilities as well as other land uses. The CPOs had to take into consideration the views collected during Stage One PE exercise.

4. Stage Two PE exercise was conducted from 20 August to 20 November 2010 on the following CPOs -

- (a) City Park ("CP") designed by F + P;
- (b) Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality ("CC") designed by RDA; and
- (c) Project for a New Dimension ("PND") designed by OMA.

5. The public and stakeholders were asked to comment on –

- (a) the extent to which CPOs had addressed the mainstream comments on planning aspects received in Stage One PE exercise;
- (b) the individual features of each CPO; and
- (c) the phasing of core arts and cultural facilities and the type of additional facilities.

6. During Stage Two PE exercise, WKCDA commissioned the Public Policy Research Institute ("PPRI") of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University to conduct a questionnaire survey on the public's views on CPOs in the three aspects mentioned in paragraph 5 above. The questionnaire survey collected data from two sources, namely, self-returned completed questionnaires and face-to face exit polls interviews with visitors to the roving exhibitions of CPOs. The questionnaire was developed by PPRI in consultation with WKCDA, reviewed and agreed to by the Consultation Panel established under section 20 of Cap. 601, and endorsed by the WKCDA Board. In addition, PPRI was responsible for collating and analyzing all the written responses on CPOs, including completed questionnaires.

7. A total of 7 948 written responses were received by WKCDA during Stage Two PE exercise, of which 7 310 were completed questionnaires and the remaining were records of PE events, written submissions, letters, emails, online discussions and media reports, etc. On 25 February 2011, WKCDA released the Report on the Analysis of Views for the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District submitted by PPRI (PPRI's Report) (LC Paper No. CB(2)1180/10-11(01)).

Results of Stage Two PE exercise

8. PPRI's Report showed that all CPOs in general received a high degree of support from respondents. Each CPO recorded an average score of more than three out of five for almost all of the multiple choice questions in the questionnaire.

9. According to PPRI, a total of 629 self-returned completed questionnaires were received via mail from 15 to 23 November 2010. These questionnaires had the following common features: (a) photocopies of the questionnaire, instead of the printed version distributed by WKCDA, were used; (b) most of them did not provide demographic information; (c) all except 25 did not provide written comments; and (d) the responses appeared to be similar. PPRI decided that these cases needed to be flagged and the results should be presented with and without the flagged cases (Annex 4 to PPRI's Report has provided the details). According to PPRI, while the inclusion of these cases had resulted in an increase in the average score of a particular CPO for all questions, the rank order of the three CPOs remained unchanged for nine out of the 13 questions. A summary of the quantitative results of the questionnaire survey is in **Appendix I**.

10. Based on the quantitative results and the qualitative data collected, PPRI's Report concluded that CP was the most preferred CPO under both categories of "Addressing the main concerns from Stage One PE exercise" and "Degree of liking for the essential features", as shown in **Appendix II**. In addition, there was general support for the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD to be developed in phases in order to achieve organic growth. Other issues concerning talent nurturing, audience building programmes, WKCD's overall design principles and WKCDA's management and operation also received significant public concerns.

11. On 4 March 2011, the WKCDA Board announced its selection of CP as the foundation for preparing the detailed DP. Its selection process and justification have been provided in LC Paper No. CB(2)1330/10-11(04). Stage Three PE exercise, scheduled for summer 2011, will seek views of the public and stakeholders on the detailed DP. Taking into account the views collected, the detailed DP would be finalised for submission to the Town Planning Board ("TPB") for consideration by 2012. Once TPB agrees to gazette DP for public inspection under the Town Planning Ordinance (Cap. 131), WKCDA will proceed with the design stage of the facilities at WKCD. Once the Chief Executive in Council approved DP under the provisions of Cap. 131, WKCDA will proceed with the construction stage of WKCD.

Concerns raised by members

12. At the meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project on 20 September 2010, the three consultants were invited to present their respective CPOs. The concerns raised by members are highlighted below.

Merging of conceptual plans

13. Some members were concerned about the extent to which the desirable features of the three CPOs could be merged into one plan. F+P considered that in order to take on the desirable features of the other two CPOs, there should be an overriding and predominately strong concept in the selected CP. RDA pointed out that compatibility of concepts and designs was a crucial consideration in the merging of the desirable features of the three CPOs. OMA believed that its CPO could serve as a base plan to incorporate the desirable features of the other CPOs, and this should be achieved through the collaboration among the consultants.

Cost implication

14. Some members were concerned about whether the costs for the development of WKCD could be kept within the \$21.6 billion upfront endowment for WKCD despite the anticipated escalation in construction costs. They also requested the disclosure of the financial and technical details for the development of WKCD under each CPO. The consultants of CPOs advised that according to their financial assessments, as the development of WKCD would be conducted by phases, the revenue generated from retail, dining and entertainment rentals, cultural activities and the investment income should enable WKCD to operate self-sustainably. They advised that it was for WKCD to decide whether they could disclose the financial and technical details of their respective CPOs.

15. In response to an enquiry about the duration and cost of planting the massive canopy of trees under CP, F+ P advised that the estimated cost for the WKCD development (including the proposed canopy of trees) was within the prescribed budget, and the development of an abundant canopy of trees at WKCD would take about five years.

Public access to WKCD

16. Some members were worried that WKCD might become an exclusive playground for high-end consumption or a lucrative project for private developers. They also urged the consultants of CPOs to cater for the needs of

the local community in their respective CPOs. On the consultants' proposals for opening up the streets and public spaces in WKCD for various forms of leisure activities and artistic performances, there was a worry that such proposals might contravene the existing stringent provisions in the relevant legislation.

17. In response, RDA advised that the provision of facilities and open spaces with free admission would facilitate the building of patronage for WKCD. OMA suggested that a management team be established to monitor the development of facilities at WKCD and to consider whether a policy to ensure wide public access to WKCD should be pursued. F+P pointed out that there was an overwhelming support from the community for more public open spaces, where people could have free admission and expression, in the design of WKCD.

Relevant papers

18. A list of relevant papers with their hyperlinks at the LegCo website is in **Appendix III**.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
28 March 2011

A summary of the quantitative results of the questionnaire survey on the public's views on the three Conceptual Plan Options

	Questions	Self-returned questionnaires (including flagged cases)	Self-returned questionnaires (excluding flagged cases)	Exit poll
Q.1 – Addressing the main concerns from Stage 1 PE exercise				
(a)	Green setting	CP[4.30] CC[3.48] PND[3.27]	CP[4.28] CC[3.49] PND[3.33]	CP[4.23] CC[3.66] PND[3.26]
(b)	Environmental friendliness	CP[4.01] CC[3.45] PND[3.20]	CP[3.98] CC[3.50] PND[3.28]	CP[3.99] CC[3.59] PND[3.22]
(c)	Hong Kong's uniqueness	PND[3.62] CC[3.40] CP[3.14]	PND[3.76] CC[3.47] CP[3.01]	PND[3.78] CC[3.61] CP[2.87]
(d)	Relax atmosphere	CP[4.04] CC[3.47] PND[3.37]	CP[4.02] CC[3.56] PND[3.48]	CP[4.03] CC[3.74] PND[3.47]
(e)	Public open space	CP[4.03] CC[3.57] PND[3.55]	CP[4.01] CC[3.71] PND[3.68]	CP[4.02] CC[3.85] PND[3.68]
(f)	Connectivity with neighbouring districts	CP[3.64] PND[3.60] CC[3.54]	PND[3.73] CC[3.66] CP[3.58]	PND[3.76] CC[3.75] CP[3.53]
(g)	Needs of different users	CP[3.61] PND[3.51] CC[3.47]	PND[3.67] CC[3.60] CP[3.57]	CC[3.72] PND[3.68] CP[3.51]
Q.2a – Degree of liking for essential features				
(i)	Open space	CP[3.88] CC[3.49] PND[3.44]	CP[3.84] CC[3.57] PND[3.54]	CP[3.87] CC[3.77] PND[3.50]
(ii)	Core arts and cultural facilities	CP[3.70] PND[3.60] CC[3.53]	PND[3.72] CP[3.63] CC[3.62]	CC[3.79] PND[3.74] CP[3.55]
(iii)	Retail, dining and entertainment facilities	CP[3.74] PND[3.49] CC[3.42]	CP[3.69] PND[3.62] CC[3.52]	No significant difference
(iv)	Hotel, office and residential facilities	CP[3.71] CC[3.55] PND[3.37]	CP[3.66] PND[3.48] CC[3.45]	CP[3.59] CC[3.55] PND[3.33]
Q.2b				
	Connectivity	CP[3.77] PND[3.53] CC[3.51]	CP[3.72] PND[3.65] CC[3.61]	CC[3.76] CP[3.69] PND[3.67]
Q.2c				
	Accessibility	CP[3.93] PND[3.60] CC[3.55]	CP[3.90] PND[3.72] CC[3.64]	CP[3.89] PND[3.75] CC[3.74]

Remarks: "CP" stands for City Park; "CC" stands for Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality; and "PND" stands for Project for a New Dimension and the figure inside [] indicates the average score for the respective Conceptual Plan Option.

Source: Page vii of the Report on the Analysis of Views for the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District (LC Paper No. CB(2)1180/10-11(01))

Appendix II

A summary of the consolidated results of the public's views on the three Conceptual Plan Options

Conceptual Plan Options Questions	City Park	Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality	Project for a New Dimension
Q.1 - Addressing the main concerns from Stage One public engagement exercise			
(a)	Green setting	Preferred	
(b)	Environmental friendliness	Preferred	
(c)	Hong Kong's uniqueness		Preferred
(d)	Relax atmosphere	Preferred	
(e)	Public open space	Preferred	
(f)	Connectivity with neighbouring districts	No single Option receives significantly more support than the other two	
(g)	Needs of different users		
Q.2a - Degree of liking for the essential features			
(i)	Open space	Preferred	
(ii)	Core arts and cultural facilities		Preferred
(iii)	Retail, dining and entertainment facilities	No single Option receives significantly more support than the other two	
(iv)	Hotel, office and residential facilities	Preferred	
Q.2b			
	Connectivity	No single Option receives significantly more support than the other two	
Q.2c			
	Accessibility	Preferred	

Source: Pages ix - x of the Report on the Analysis of Views for the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District (LC Paper No. CB(2)1180/10-11(01))

**Relevant documents on
Results of the Stage Two public engagement exercise
for the West Kowloon Cultural District project**

Committee	Date of meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project	13.1.2009	Administration's paper on the current position of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project.	CB(2)612/08-09(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd0113cb2-612-1-e.pdf
		Paper on the summary of views and suggestions made in the Phase III Study Report of the Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development for future monitoring of the project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat.	CB(2)612/08-09(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd0113cb2-612-2-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(2)943/08-09 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd20090113.pdf
	27.2.2009	Administration's response to the recommendations in the Phase III Study Report of the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development, public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project and mechanism for timely monitoring of the financial position of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority.	CB(2)944/08-09(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd0227cb2-944-1-e.pdf

Committee	Date of meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project	27.2.2009	Minutes of meeting	CB(2)1283/08-09 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/minutes/wkcd20090227.pdf
	14.4.2009	Administration's paper on the Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority and the public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project and responds to the questions raised by the Subcommittee at the meeting on 27 February 2009.	CB(2)1285/08-09(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0414cb2-1285-1-e.pdf
		Paper on summary of past deliberations on public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District Project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat.	CB(2)1285/08-09(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0414cb2-1285-2-e.pdf
	14.4.2009	Minutes of meeting	CB(2)1867/08-09 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/minutes/wkcd20090414.pdf
		Administration's paper on the masterplanning of the West Kowloon Cultural District public engagement exercise, the planning and development of M+.	CB(2)1869/08-09(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0619cb2-1869-1-e.pdf

Committee	Date of meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project	4.12.2009	Administration's paper on the progress of the Stage 1 Public Engagement exercise as well as the recruitment of senior executives of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority.	CB(2)426/09-10(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd1204cb2-426-1-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(2)780/09-10 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd/minutes/wkcd20091204.pdf
	16.4.2010	Administration's paper on report on Stage One Public Engagement Exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project.	CB(2)1283/09-10(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd0416cb2-1283-1-e.pdf
		Summary of issues/suggestions raised by the Joint Subcommittee on public engagement exercise and development of cultural software in relation to the West Kowloon Cultural District project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat.	CB(2)1283/09-10(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd0416cb2-1283-2-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(2)2066/09-10 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd/minutes/wkcd20100416.pdf

Committee	Date of meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project	20.9.2010	Administration's paper on Meeting with the Chief Executive Officer and other senior executives of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority.	CB(2)2257/09-10(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0920cb2-2257-1-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(2)691/10-11
	14.1.2011	Administration's paper on Update on Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise	CB(2) 795/10-11(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr10-11/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0114cb2-795-2-e.pdf
		Background brief prepared by the LegCo Secretariat on Stage Two public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project	CB(2)795/10-11(03) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr10-11/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0114cb2-795-3-e.pdf

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
 28 March 2011