

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1330/10-11(05)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/08

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the
West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Background brief prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat
for the meeting on 29 March 2011**

**Selection of Conceptual Plan Options
for the West Kowloon Cultural District project**

Purpose

This paper provides background information on the selection of Conceptual Plan Options ("CPOs") for the development of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD"), and highlights the relevant concerns expressed by members of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project ("the Joint Subcommittee") at its meeting on 14 January 2011. The views of members of the Joint Subcommittee on the subject before the aforesaid meeting have been summarized in LC Paper No. CB(2)795/10-11(03).

Background

2. In July 2009, the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") appointed three consultants, viz. Foster+Partners ("F+P"), Rocco Design Architects Limited ("RDA") and Office for Metropolitan Architecture ("OMA"), to prepare CPOs, which showed the layout of the arts and cultural facilities as well as other land uses in WKCD. The CPOs were required to address the main concerns raised by the public and stakeholders during Stage One public engagement ("PE") exercise conducted by WKCDA from 8 October 2009 to 7 January 2010.
3. During Stage Two PE exercise conducted between 20 August to 20 November 2010, WKCDA invited the public and stakeholders to give views on the following CPOs -

- (a) City Park ("CP") designed by F+P;
- (b) Cultural Connect: Key to Sustained Vitality ("CC") designed by RDA; and
- (c) Project for a New Dimension ("PND") designed by OMA.

4. According to the Report on the Analysis of Views for the Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District (LC Paper No. CB(2)1180/10-11(01) prepared by the WKCDA-commissioned Public Policy Research Institute of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University and released by WKCDA on 25 February 2011, CP was the most preferred CPO. Key findings of the Report have been highlighted in LC Paper No. CB(2)1330/10-11(03).

Selection of CPOs

Selection Panel

5. To facilitate the selection of a preferred CPO and to ensure that WKCDA had the requisite expertise to help guide the selection process, the WKCDA Board appointed in November 2010 a Selection Panel ("SP") led by Mr Ronald Arculli, Chairman of the WKCDA Development Committee, to assess the three CPOs with the objective to recommend a preferred CPO to the WKCDA Board. Its membership list is in **Appendix I**.

Selection criteria

6. According to WKCDA, while public opinion played a key role in the selection process, SP also took into consideration the following six criteria approved by the WKCDA Board -

Criteria	Weight
(a) Meeting planning design principles	30%
(b) Meeting community and stakeholders aspirations	20%
(c) Design and phasing flexibility	20%
(d) Technical strengths and weaknesses	15%
(e) Financial implications	10%
(f) Fulfilling the key planning and development requirements	5%

Decision and justification

7. On 4 March 2011, the WKCDA Board announced its endorsement of SP's recommendation of CP as the preferred option, with its detailed justification in **Appendix II**. Its main reasons for selecting CP are as follows -

- (a) the balanced mix of land uses integrating arts and cultural facilities with other uses would improve visitor experience and enhance vibrancy in WKCD;
- (b) the city park concept, relaxing atmosphere and various green features earned the most public support in Stage Two PE exercise;
- (c) the clustering concepts would minimize footprint and create greater synergy between different facilities;
- (d) F+P's proposals to support arts education and cultural software development would facilitate WKCDA's work in nurturing arts talents and building audience;
- (e) the high flexibility would allow not only swapping of sites to facilitate earlier development of core arts and cultural facilities but also public enjoyments of some of such facilities amid ongoing construction programmes; and
- (f) the park and open space would allow room to accommodate temporary arts and cultural facilities prior to the commissioning of phase one facilities in WKCD.

8. According to WKCDA, based on CP, it will prepare a detailed Development Plan ("DP") for WKCD and unveil it to the public in summer 2011 before submitting it to the Town Planning Board for consideration by 2012. In preparing the DP, WKCDA will take note of public preferences on individual features of the other two CPOs and incorporate them if they are technically feasible and financially viable with due regard to the integrity of the preferred CP.

Members' concerns

9. The concerns raised by members of the Joint Subcommittee at the meeting on 14 January 2011 are highlighted below.

Resignation of Chief Executive Officer

10. Some members were concerned about the impact of Mr Graham Sheffield's resignation from the post of Chief Executive Officer of WKCD on the selection of a CPO for WKCD. The Administration advised that Mr Sheffield had been a member of SP, which also included some members of the WKCD Board and professionals. Notwithstanding Mr Sheffield's departure, SP would continue to scrutinize the three CPOs as scheduled. The preferred CPO would be selected in the first quarter of 2011. The first phase of WKCD was expected to be completed by 2015.

Selection of preferred CPO

11. There was a view that WKCD had to keep the selection process of a preferred CPO transparent and to make public the reasons for the selection. There was also a worry that while Stage Three PE exercise would be kicked off on the preferred CPO, excessive consultation might lead to indecision, which might slow down the implementation of the WKCD project. The Administration stressed that the selection process would be kept transparent and objective. WKCD was confident that with a management team consisting of experienced and outstanding professionals, the WKCD project would proceed as planned and as scheduled.

Merging of features of CPOs

12. Some members expressed concern about the extent to which the desirable features of the three CPOs could be merged into a DP as they each had distinct characteristics. There was a view that the DP should combine the best desirable features of the three CPOs, so as to open up a new horizon for Hong Kong's cultural development. The Administration advised that instead of combining the three CPOs, one CPO would be selected and might incorporate the desirable features of other CPOs (e.g. the design relating to the management of visitor flows) under the principle that the integrity of the design of the preferred CPO would not be compromised.

Relevant papers

13. A list of relevant papers with their hyperlinks at the LegCo's website is in **Appendix III**.

The Selection Panel

Objective

Tasked to make recommendation on the preferred Conceptual Plan to the Board of West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("the Board") based on the selection criteria approved by the Board.

Membership

Chairman: Hon. Ronald ARCULLI, Chairman, Development Committee

Members: (in alphabetical order)

Mr. Edmond CHUNG Kong-mo, Board Member

Mr. Raymond FUNG Wing-kee, Board Member

Mr. Andrew LAM Siu-lo, Board Member

Mr. LEE Shing-see, Member, Development Committee

Mr. Victor LO Chung-wing, Chairman, Museum Committee

Mr. MA Fung-kwok, Board Member

Professor Jenny SO Fong-suk, Board Member

Mr. Raymond YOUNG Lap-moon, Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Dr. Allan ZEMAN, Chairman, Performing Arts Committee

Justifications for selecting "City Park" as the preferred option

Fulfilling the Key Planning and Development Requirements

- Full compliance with the statutory planning requirements of WKCD stipulated under the approved Outline Zoning Plan such as plot ratio, building height restriction and provision of public open space.
- Development mix proposed for WKCD consistent with the recommendations of the former Consultative Committee.

Meeting Planning Design Principles

- Enhanced vibrancy and diverse activities in WKCD through a good mix of land uses integrating arts and cultural facilities with other uses. The scheme will increase people flow in WKCD and improve visitor experience.
- Minimize footprint and create greater synergy between different facilities such as placing the Mega Performance Venue on top of the Exhibition Centre to enhance people flow round the clock, and to incorporate a black box theatre within M+ to strengthen crossovers among performing arts and visual arts venues.
- Stronger identities of M+ and Exhibition Centre through physical and conceptual separation between the two venues.

Meeting Community and Stakeholders Aspirations

- The city park concept, relaxing atmosphere, together with various green initiatives earned the most support in the Stage Two PE exercise.

Technical Strengths and Weakness

- Strong co-ordination among arts and cultural facilities, public spaces and land uses.
- A good range of transportation options to enhance the accessibility of the district.

- Great emphasis on environmental friendly features reduces carbon footprint and contributes to the development of a green and sustainable district.

Design and Phasing Flexibility

- High degree of flexibility through swapping of sites to allow earlier development of core arts and cultural facilities.
- More room for accommodating temporary arts and cultural activities for public enjoyment before commissioning of Phase 1 arts and cultural facilities.

Financial Implications

- Supporting organic and evolutionary growth taking into account the financial budget of WKCDA.
- The positioning of the Mega Performance Venue and the Exhibition Centre near the hotel will help create convention business opportunities for the district.
- The proposed location of the Mega Performance Venue is not affected by interface issues and this venue could be included in the Phase 1 construction with a view to bringing in revenue generating business upon its commissioning.

**Relevant documents on
Selection of Conceptual Plan options
for the West Kowloon Cultural District project**

Committee	Date of meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project	13.1.2009	Administration's paper on the current position of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project.	CB(2)612/08-09(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd0113cb2-612-1-e.pdf
		Paper on the summary of views and suggestions made in the Phase III Study Report of the Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development for future monitoring of the project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat.	CB(2)612/08-09(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd0113cb2-612-2-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(2)943/08-09 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/minutes/wkcd20090113.pdf
	27.2.2009	Administration's response to the recommendations in the Phase III Study Report of the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development, public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project and mechanism for timely monitoring of the financial position of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority.	CB(2)944/08-09(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd0227cb2-944-1-e.pdf

Committee	Date of meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project	27.2.2009	Minutes of meeting	CB(2)1283/08-09 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/minutes/wkcd20090227.pdf
	14.4.2009	Administration's paper on the Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority and the public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project and responds to the questions raised by the Subcommittee at the meeting on 27 February 2009.	CB(2)1285/08-09(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0414cb2-1285-1-e.pdf
		Paper on summary of past deliberations on public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District Project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat.	CB(2)1285/08-09(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0414cb2-1285-2-e.pdf
	14.4.2009	Minutes of meeting	CB(2)1867/08-09 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/minutes/wkcd20090414.pdf
		Administration's paper on the masterplanning of the West Kowloon Cultural District public engagement exercise, the planning and development of M+.	CB(2)1869/08-09(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0619cb2-1869-1-e.pdf

Committee	Date of meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project	4.12.2009	Administration's paper on the progress of the Stage 1 Public Engagement exercise as well as the recruitment of senior executives of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority.	CB(2)426/09-10(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd1204cb2-426-1-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(2)780/09-10 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd/minutes/wkcd20091204.pdf
	16.4.2010	Administration's paper on report on Stage One Public Engagement Exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project.	CB(2)1283/09-10(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0416cb2-1283-1-e.pdf
		Summary of issues/suggestions raised by the Joint Subcommittee on public engagement exercise and development of cultural software in relation to the West Kowloon Cultural District project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat.	CB(2)1283/09-10(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0416cb2-1283-2-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(2)2066/09-10 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd/minutes/wkcd20100416.pdf

Committee	Date of meeting	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project	20.9.2010	Administration's paper on Meeting with the Chief Executive Officer and other senior executives of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority.	CB(2)2257/09-10(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/papers/wkcd/papers/wkcd0920cb2-2257-1-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(2)691/10-11
	14.1.2011	Administration's paper on Update on Stage 2 Public Engagement Exercise	CB(2) 795/10-11(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr10-11/english/papers/wkcd0114cb2-795-2-e.pdf
		Background brief prepared by the LegCo Secretariat on Stage Two public engagement exercise for the West Kowloon Cultural District project	CB(2)795/10-11(03) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr10-11/english/papers/wkcd0114cb2-795-3-e.pdf