

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 4

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 26 October 2011 at 11:00 am,
Thursday 27 October 2011 at 9:00 am and Friday 28 October 2011 at 9:00 am**

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 27.10.2011)

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP (absent on 27.10.2011)

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 27.10.2011)

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP (absent on 27.10.2011)

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, GBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS , JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, JP

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yea, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon Tanya CHAN

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

Public officers attending:

26.10.2011, 27.10.2011 and 28.10.2011

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, GBM, JP
The Financial Secretary

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, GBS, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Eva CHENG, GBS, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

The Hon Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

26.10.2011 and 27.10.2011

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

26.10.2011 and 28.10.2011

Miss Adeline WONG Ching-man, JP
Under Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

27.10.2011

Ms Florence HUI Hiu-fai, JP
Under Secretary for Home Affairs

27.10.2011 and 28.10.2011

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

Mr LAI Tung-kwok, SBS, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, GBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, GBS, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Environment

28.10.2011

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-ye, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Prof LAU Siu-kai, JP
Head, Central Policy Unit

Clerks in attendance:

26.10.2011

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

26.10.2011 and 27.10.2011

Miss Odelia LEUNG Hing-ye, Assistant Secretary General (2)

26.10.2011, 27.10.2011 and 28.10.2011

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (4)

27.10.2011 and 28.10.2011

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table under Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Banking (Capital) (Amendment) Rules 2011 (gazetted on 21.10.2011)	137/2011
2. Banking (Disclosure) (Amendment) Rules 2011 (gazetted on 21.10.2011)	138/2011
3. Air Navigation (Hong Kong) Order 1995 (Amendment) Order 2011 (gazetted on 21.10.2011)	139/2011
4. Air Navigation (Hong Kong) Order 1995 (Amendment of Schedule 16) Order 2011 (gazetted on 21.10.2011)	140/2011
5. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) (Amendment) Regulation 2011 (gazetted on 21.10.2011)	141/2011
6. Declaration of Geographical Constituencies (Legislative Council) Order 2011 (gazetted on 21.10.2011)	142/2011
7. Companies Ordinance (Exemption of Companies and Prospectuses from Compliance with Provisions) (Amendment) Notice 2011 (gazetted on 21.10.2011)	143/2011

Other Papers

- No. 16 - Construction Workers Registration Authority Annual Report 2010-2011 (published on 20.10.2011)
- No. 17 - Electrical and Mechanical Services Trading Fund Annual Report 2010/11 (published on 20.10.2011)
- No. 18 - Office of the Telecommunications Authority Trading Fund Report 2010-11 (published on 20.10.2011)

- No. 19 - Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Fund Annual Report for the year from 1 April 2010 to 31 March 2011 (published on 24.10.2011)
- No. 20 - The Legislative Council Commission Annual Report 2010-2011 (published on 24.10.2011)
- No. 21 - Hongkong Post Annual Report 2010/11 (published on 26.10.2011)

Questions

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Motion of Thanks

The President stated that Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon LEE Wing-tat, Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, Hon WONG Sing-chi and Hon Emily LAU would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council thanks the Chief Executive for his address.

Question on the motion proposed.

The President announced the commencement of the first debate session on the theme of "Developing the Infrastructure for Economic Growth". The session covered seven policy areas: commerce and industry; development (planning, lands and works); economic development (other than energy); financial affairs; housing; information technology and broadcasting (other than creative industry); and transport.

The President also stated that Members' speeches should be confined to the policy areas specified for a particular debate session. Such an arrangement, which had been agreed by the House Committee, sought to achieve a more focused debate in each session and facilitate the relevant public officers to give immediate response to Members' views in the respective debate session.

Five Members and Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke.

After Hon WONG Kwok-hing had spoken, the President reminded Members that as agreed by the House Committee, the motion under debate was divided into five debate sessions. The President further said that if Members did not confine their speeches to the specified policy areas in the respective debate session, such an arrangement would serve no real purpose.

Hon CHIM Pui-chung spoke.

While Hon CHIM Pui-chung was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:00 noon temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Five Members and Hon WONG Ting-kwong spoke.

At 12:34 pm, while Hon WONG Ting-kwong was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Eleven Members and Hon CHAN Kam-lam spoke.

While Hon CHAN Kam-lam was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:32 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Six other Members and Dr Hon Samson TAM spoke.

At 8:20 pm, while Dr Hon Samson TAM was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two more Members spoke.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:06 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 27 October 2011 to continue the first debate session of the Motion of Thanks.

Four Members spoke.

The Financial Secretary, the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development, the Secretary for Development, the Secretary for Transport and Housing, the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury as well as the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke.

The President announced the end of the first debate session and the commencement of the second debate session on the theme of “Quality City and Quality Life”. The session covered six policy areas: development (other than planning, lands and works); economic development (energy); environmental affairs; food safety and environmental hygiene; home affairs (other than district administration and civic education); and information technology and broadcasting (creative industry).

A Member spoke.

Hon Fred LI spoke and declared that he was a customer of CLP Power Hong Kong Limited, but the current discussion did not involve his personal interests.

A Member and Hon IP Kwok-him spoke.

While Hon IP Kwok-him was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:15 pm temporarily and the President’s Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another Member spoke.

Hon Audrey EU spoke.

While Hon Audrey EU was speaking, Hon WONG Yung-kan sought elucidation of a point raised by Hon Audrey EU in her speech. Hon Audrey EU elucidated and continued to speak.

At 12:56 pm, while Hon Audrey EU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Six more Members spoke.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke.

While the Secretary for the Environment was speaking, the President left the chair at 2:10 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Development, the Secretary for Home Affairs and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke.

At 2:56 pm, while the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke.

The President announced the end of the second debate session and the commencement of the third debate session on the theme of "Investing for a Caring Society". The session covered three policy areas: manpower; security (anti-drug policy); and welfare services (including social enterprise and family matters).

Fourteen Members spoke.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke.

While the Secretary for Labour and Welfare was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:05 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Under Secretary for Home Affairs and the Secretary for Security spoke.

The President's Deputy announced the end of the third debate session and the commencement of the fourth debate session on the theme of "Optimising our Demographic Structure and Attracting Talent". The session covered three policy areas: education; health services; and security (immigration policy).

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke.

At 6:58 pm, while Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Eight other Members spoke.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:04 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 28 October 2011 to continue the fourth debate session of the Motion of Thanks.

A Member spoke.

Hon Andrew LEUNG declared that he was the Chairman of the Vocational Training Council. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Nine other Members spoke.

Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai declared that he was the Supervisor of Lam Tai Fai College, a Member of the Council of The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, as well as the Chairman of the Clothing Industry Training Authority. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

One more Member spoke.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke and declared that he joined the Hong Kong Medical Association 40 years ago and was a senior member of the Association.

The Secretary for Education spoke.

While the Secretary for Education was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:01 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Security spoke.

The President's Deputy announced the end of the fourth debate session and the commencement of the fifth debate session on the theme of "Developing Democracy and Enhancing Governance". The session covered five policy areas: administration of justice and legal services; constitutional affairs; home affairs (district administration and civic education); public service; and security (other than immigration and anti-drug policies).

Seven Members and Hon Ronny TONG spoke.

At 1:52 pm, while Hon Ronny TONG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Seven other Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, Hon IP Kwok-him raised a point of order on whether Mr LEUNG had used offensive language in his speech.

The President said that he had previously stated that Members should not use offensive language to express their views. Yet, he noticed that the expression in question used by Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung had been used by other Members for more than once in this debate. The President ruled that the use of the expression by Mr LEUNG did not contravene the Rules of Procedure.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to speak.

Seven more Members spoke.

At 4:59 pm, the President suspended the meeting for 10 minutes.

The Council resumed at 5:09 pm.

The Secretary for Justice, the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs, the Secretary for Home Affairs, the Secretary for the Civil Service, the Secretary for Security and the Chief Secretary for Administration spoke.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add “, but expresses deep regret that the Policy Address fails to put forward measures to effectively resolve the disparity between the rich and the poor, and even rationalizes such disparity, does not make thorough reflection on past errors in governance and adamantly refuses to change the existing imbalance in governance philosophy” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division.

Hon LAU Wong-fat stated that he intended to vote against the amendment but he failed to press the “No” button. The President ordered that the voting record be amended accordingly.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 30 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 12 against it and 13 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment; 12 against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix I**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the Motion of Thanks or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add “, and urges the Government to provide more housing land for building additional public rental housing units to assist the grassroots, including those living in cage homes, cubicle apartments and sub-divided units, in securing public rental housing allocation more expeditiously, construct more Home Ownership Scheme (‘HOS’) flats, re-launch the Tenants Purchase Scheme, and relax the purchase restrictions in the secondary market of HOS flats to allow eligible white form HOS applicants to make purchase applications, with a view to helping people to live and work in contentment” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 30 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and 16 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and six abstained (voting record in **Appendix II**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add “, but expresses regret at his lack of commitment to education and failure to make earnest efforts to take forward major education policies, such as 15 years of free education, small-class teaching in secondary schools and increasing the number of university places” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 30 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and 17 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix III**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add “, but expresses regret at his rejection of universal retirement protection, as well as his failure to face up to the disparity between the rich and the poor and make earnest efforts to alleviate poverty, and to help the socially disadvantaged” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi amendment's to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon WONG Sing-chi claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 30 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and 16 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and three abstained (voting record in **Appendix IV**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Emily LAU moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add “, but as the political appointment system (also known as the ‘accountability system for principal officials’) turns out to be a complete failure after all these years of implementation, the officials under the accountability system do not have to bear any political responsibility for making so many blunders in implementing policies, the Under Secretaries and Political Assistants appointed by the Administration are unable to help improve the Government's governance, and the public knows nothing about the relevant government officials, this Council expresses anger and regret at the Administration's intention of continuing with the implementation of the political appointment system, and urges the Administration to comprehensively review the system's effectiveness and not to expand it before completing the review” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 30 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and 12 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, 12 against it and one abstained (voting record in **Appendix V**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 30 were present, 25 were in favour of the motion; two against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 30 were present, 10 were in favour of the motion; 11 against it and eight abstained (voting record in **Appendix VI**). Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 2 November 2011 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 6:37 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
Legislative Council

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

6 January 2012

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 28/10/2011
時間 TIME: 06:21:35 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對劉健儀議員的致謝議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION OF THANKS

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	30	30	
投票 Vote	30	29	
贊成 Yes	6 5	16	
反對 No	11 12	12	
棄權 Abstain	13	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 贊成 YES NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 28/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 06:25:19 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 李永達議員對劉健儀議員的致謝議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEE WING-TAT TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION OF THANKS

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達 LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	30	30	
投票 Vote	30	29	
贊成 Yes	7	19	
反對 No	7	4	
棄權 Abstain	16	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹中 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 28/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 06:27:26 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 張文光議員對劉健儀議員的致謝議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION OF THANKS

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	30	30	
投票 Vote	30	29	
贊成 Yes	4	17	
反對 No	9	9	
棄權 Abstain	17	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 28/10/2011
時間 TIME: 06:29:30 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 黃成智議員對劉健儀議員的致謝議案作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG SING-CHI TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION OF THANKS

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃成智 WONG Sing-chi

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	30	30	
投票 Vote	30	29	
贊成 Yes	4	17	
反對 No	10	9	
棄權 Abstain	16	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 28/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 06:31:36 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 劉慧卿議員對劉健儀議員的致謝議案作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON EMILY LAU TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S MOTION OF THANKS

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿 Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	30	30	
投票 Vote	30	29	
贊成 Yes	4	16	
反對 No	14	12	
棄權 Abstain	12	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 6
 日期 DATE: 28/10/2011
 時間 TIME: 06:36:30 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 致謝議案
 MOTION OF THANKS

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	30	30	
投票 Vote	30	29	
贊成 Yes	25	10	
反對 No	2	11	
棄權 Abstain	3	8	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家駒 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK